PROTECTING CHILDREN FROM VIOLENCE

A SYNTHESIS OF EVALUATION FINDINGS
PROTECTING CHILDREN FROM VIOLENCE:

A SYNTHESIS OF EVALUATION FINDINGS
This independent evaluation was commissioned by UNICEF Evaluation Office engaging inter-divisional reference group that provided overall direction and support to the evaluation process. The synthesis report is based on 52 evaluations commissioned by UNICEF Offices in recent years that examined the issue of protecting children against violence. The synthesis report was prepared by an independent consultant Zosa De Sas Kropiwnicki. Krishna Belbase, Senior Evaluation Officer in the Evaluation Office, managed the process in close collaboration with Child Protection Section, Programme Division (lead counterparts Theresa Kilbane, Senior Advisor Child Protection, and Karin Heissler, Child Protection Specialist).

The purpose of the report is to facilitate the exchange of knowledge among UNICEF personnel and its partners. The content of this report does not necessarily reflect UNICEF’s official position, policies or views.

The designations in this publication do not imply an opinion on legal status of any country or territory, or of its authorities, or the delimitation of frontiers.

For further information, please contact:

Evaluation Office
United Nations Children’s Fund
Three United Nations Plaza
New York, NY 10017, United States
evalhelp@unicef.org
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The substantive analytical work and writing of this report was done by an independent consultant, Dr. Zosa De Sas Kropiwnicki (Senior Lecturer in Development Studies at the University of Johannesburg) who demonstrated an exceptional level of hard work and patience while undertaking this complex assignment which required several rounds of reviews and revisions. Chelsey Wickmark did the major first phase work in identifying, quality screening and summarising the general content of the reports. Suzanne Lee and Caroline Banquet-Walsh made significant contributions by synthesising the findings of the evaluation reports that were in Spanish and French language.

The project was supported by a Reference Group comprised of members from the Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section, Programme Division. The continuous involvement of Theresa Kilbane, Karin Heissler, Clarice Da Silva e Paula and Jennifer Keane through the project was a crucial factor in both its successful completion and quality.

Krishna Belbase in the Evaluation Office managed the project including engagement with the Reference Group and supervision of various consultants who were involved in various phases of the report. Sheila Reiss helped to review and edit the report.
## CONTENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary</th>
<th>i</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1: Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1: Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1 Objectives and Scope</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.2 Background and Rationale</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.3 Key Concepts and Terms</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2: Methodology and Analysis</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 Selection of Reports</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 Analytic Methods</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 Limitations</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.4 Quality of Evaluation Reports</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.5 Ethics</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.6 Report Structure</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2: Findings on Dominant Child Protection Strategies</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Scope</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Relevance and Appropriateness</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Dominant Strategies by Child Protection Issue</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3: Findings on Specific Child Protection Strategies</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Strengthening Child Protection Systems</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.1 Introduction</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.2 Incorporating Child Protection into National and Decentralized Planning Processes</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3 Strengthening the Social Welfare Sector</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.4 Strengthening the Justice Sector in the Child Protection System</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.5 Strengthening the Education Sector in the Child Protection System</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.6 Strengthening health and psycho-social services in the child protection system</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.7 Strengthening Coordination amongst Child Protection System Actors</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section 3.2. Supporting Social Change</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Conceptual Frameworks</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 Strengthening the Protective Role of Families</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 Strengthening the Protective Role of Communities</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Child Participation</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.5 Encouraging private sector collaboration</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4: Programming Principles and Cross-cutting Issues/OECD/DAC</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Evidence-based Programming</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Activities and Processes</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Results-based Management</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Activities and Methods</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Development or Strengthening of Information Management Systems (IMS)</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5. Information and Communications</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.2 Lessons</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.3 Multi-partner Guidance</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Participatory Programming</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.1 Introduction</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6.2 Consultation of beneficiaries, partners and stakeholders</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Efficiency</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.1 Introduction</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.2 Timeliness</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7.3 Cost</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1: Distribution by programmatic areas/ focus ................................................................. 13
Table 2: Relevance and appropriateness .................................................................................. 15
Table 3: Effectiveness by child protection issue ........................................................................... 24
Table 4: Effectiveness of programmes addressing harmful practices ........................................ 24
Table 5: Effectiveness of programmes addressing residential care .......................................... 28
Table 6: Effectiveness of programmes addressing child migration and trafficking .................... 31
Table 7: Programmes addressing street children ........................................................................ 35
Table 8: Programmes addressing child labour ............................................................................ 36
Table 9: Programmes addressing child abuse ............................................................................ 39
Table 10: Programmes addressing ‘children in conflict with the law’ ........................................... 41
Table 11: Programmes targeting violence in schools ................................................................. 43
Table 12: Programmes targeting child injury prevention ............................................................. 44
Table 13: Programmes targeting national systems strengthening ............................................. 45
Table 14: Programmes targeting CAAFAG ................................................................................. 47
Table 15: Programmes targeting MRE ....................................................................................... 52
Table 16: Programmes targeting natural disasters ...................................................................... 56
Table 17: Advocacy strategies and findings .................................................................................. 61
Table 18: Legal policy technical assistance by strategy and finding ........................................... 70
Table 19: Strengthening decentralized levels of governance: strategies and findings.................. 76
Table 20: Strengthening the social welfare sector by strategy and finding ................................... 84
Table 21: Gaps in training, guidelines and materials for social workers ........................................ 92
Table 22: Investments in social work infrastructure, communication and transportation ............. 95
Table 23: Social welfare response services to children by strategy and finding ............................ 96
Table 24: Strengthening families in order to improve response by strategy and finding .............. 102
Table 25: Family strengthening activities in the context of return and reintegration by strategy and finding .................................................................................................................. 103
Table 26: Family strengthening in the context of alternative care by strategy and finding ............ 109
Table 27: Synthesized results for strengthening families .............................................................. 110
Table 28: Income generation, vocational training and job counseling by strategy and finding ........ 113
Table 29: Micro credit schemes by strategy and finding ............................................................. 122
Table 30: Cash transfers by strategy and finding ......................................................................... 124
Table 31: Programmes centered on child victims and witnesses by strategy and finding ............. 130
Table 32: Programmes centered on children in conflict with the law by strategy and finding ........ 131
Table 33: Programmes targeting perpetrators of violence by strategy and finding ...................... 133
Table 34: Birth registration by strategy and finding ..................................................................... 135
Table 35: Strengthening the education sector by strategy and finding .......................................... 138
Table 36: Education response services by strategy and finding .................................................. 147
Table 37: Strengthening mental health/psycho-social wellbeing services by strategy and findings 151
Table 38: Psychosocial response services by strategy and finding ............................................... 154
Table 39: Strengthening health care by strategy and finding ....................................................... 162
Table 40: National coordination structures by strategy and finding ........................................... 168
Table 41: Decentralized coordination mechanisms by strategy and finding ................................. 175
Table 42: Family strengthening in prevention and early intervention programmes by strategy and finding .................................................................................................................. 185
Table 43: Public education and social dialogue by strategy and finding ....................................... 191
Table 44: Engaging the media in public education by strategy and findings ................................. 208
Table 45: Outreach and community development strategies and finding .................................... 209
Table 46: Collaboration with local leaders and stakeholders by strategy and finding .................... 213
Table 47: Volunteers and community-based child protection committees by strategy and finding 215
Table 48: Synthesized findings emerging from community strengthening .................................. 224
Table 49: Child participation in policy and programming by strategy and finding ....................... 229
Table 50: Peer-to-peer counseling by strategy and finding .......................................................... 236
Table 51: Private sector collaboration by strategy and finding .................................................... 241
Table 52: Examples of monitoring activities ................................................................................. 255
Table 53: Multi-partner guidance .................................................................................................. 272
## ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

- **ADB**: Asian Development Bank
- **ACWF**: All China Women’s Federation
- **AET**: Abuse, exploitation and trafficking
- **AKAP**: Awareness, Knowledge, Attitude and Performance
- **ARC**: American Red Cross
- **ATC**: The Association of Rural Workers
- **ATRO**: Anti-Trafficking and Reintegration Office
- **BITA**: Bangladesh Institute of Theatre Arts
- **BP**: British Petroleum
- **BSST**: Basic Social Service Training
- **BWCCW**: The Beijing Working Committee for Children and Women
- **CAAFAG**: Children Associated with Armed Forces and Armed Groups
- **CAFF**: Children Associated with Fighting Forces
- **CAMP**: Child Abuse Mitigation Project
- **CB**: Camp Bustamante
- **CC**: Inter-ministerial Coordination Council
- **CCF**: Christian Children’s Fund
- **CEDAW**: Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
- **CEIP**: Community Education Investment Programme
- **CIDA**: Canadian International Development Agency
- **CIP**: Child Injury Prevention
- **CLPT**: Child Labor Prevention Team (CLPT)
- **CMC**: Center Management Committee
- **CO**: Country Office
- **CNEPTI**: National Commission for the Eradication of Child Labor and Protection of Young Workers
- **CPA**: Child Protection Advocates
- **CPC**: Child Protection Committees
- **CPCM**: Child Protection Community Mobilization
- **CPIE**: Child Protection in Emergencies
- **CPMS**: Child Protection Monitoring System
- **CPN-M**: Communist Party of Nepal/Maoist
- **CPS**: Child Protection Secretariat
- **CRD**: Child Rights Departments
- **CSO**: Civil society organization
- **CTFMRM**: Country Task Force on Children Affected by Armed Conflict
- **CWS**: Centers for Social Work
- **CWPC**: Commission for the Welfare and Protection of Children (China)
- **DAC**: Development Assistance Committee
- **DGFPS**: Department of Gender and Family Services
- **DINAS SOSIAL**: Provincial Office of Social Welfare
- **DLA**: Department of Local Administration
- **DCPC**: District Child Protection Committee
- **DPCGS**: Department of Probation and Child Care Services
- **DOE**: Department of Education
- **DRC**: Democratic Republic of the Congo
- **EMAO**: Ethiopian Mine Action Office
- **ERD**: Evaluation and Research Database
- **ERW**: Explosive Remnants of War
- **FCPU**: Family and Child Protection Unit
- **FCSC**: Family and Child Service Centers
- **FGM/C**: Female genital mutilation/cutting
- **FGM/CAP**: FGM/C Abandonment Programme
FPU: Family Protection Unit
FS&FC: Family Support and Foster Care Project
FTR: Family Tracing and Reunification
GEROS: UNICEF Global Evaluation Report Oversight System
GoM: Government of Mali
GTZ: German Cooperation Agency
HIV/AIDS: Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
HTTP: Ethiopia Harmful Traditional Practices
HPPD: Health Promotion and Protection Division
HRU: Human Rights Unit
IASC: Inter-Agency Standing Committee
IBHI: Independent Bureau for Humanitarian Issues
INGO: International non-governmental organization
ICC: Interdisciplinary Consultative Committee
ICRC: International Committee of the Red Cross
IDP: Internally displaced persons
IEC: Information Education Communication
ILO: International Labor Organization
IMS: Information Management System
IMEP: Integrated Monitoring and Evaluation Plan
KPAID: Indonesian Child Protection Commission
LGOS: Local NGOs
LL: Lihlombe Lekukhalela Child protectors
LogFrame: Logical Framework
LPAs: Child Protection Body
LRA: Lord’s Resistance Army
LSBE: Life Skills Basic Education
JJC: Juvenile Justice Committee
MBT: Mine Ban Treaty
MMBs: Municipal Management Boards
MDG: Millennium Development Goal
MOET: Ministry of Education and Training
MoH: Ministry of Health
MOLISA: The Ministry of Labor, War Invalids and Social Affairs
MOI: Ministry of Interior
MOU: Memorandum of Understanding
MOV: Means of Verification
MoPME: Ministry of Primary and Mass Education
MPS: Maldives Police Service
MRE: Mine Risk Education
MSANS: Ministry of Social Action and National Solidarity
MST: Multi-sectoral teams
MECD: Ministry of Education
MoES: Ministry of Education and Science
MoLSP: Ministry of Labour and Social Policy
MLH&SA: Ministry of Labor, Health and Social Affairs
MTSP: Mid-Term Strategic Paper
NABW: National Association of Business Women
NAD: Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam
N-CPAN: A National Child Protection Action Network
NGO: Non-governmental organization
NCCM: National Council for Motherhood and Childhood
NCAPA: National Child Protection Authority
NFDC: New Family Development Centers
NNCB: National Narcotics Control Board
NPSC: National Project on Street Children
WHO: World Health Organization
WFP: Work and Financial Planning
SUMMARY

1. Background

In June 2011, UNICEF Evaluation Office engaged an independent consultant to undertake a synthesis of evaluation findings on recent UNICEF-supported programmes that seek to address violence against children. This meta-synthesis provides an evidence-base for guiding effective advocacy and programming for protecting children against violence, as outlined in the Terms of Reference. This report is based on a review of findings of 52 evaluations commissioned by various UNICEF Offices from 2005 to 2010. These evaluations are focused on the issue of ‘violence’, which herein is broadly defined as sexual abuse and exploitation, child trafficking, child labour, children working and/or living on the street, children in residential care, children in conflict with the law, harmful practices and injuries to children. The evaluations focus on developing and transitional contexts, including countries transitioning from an emergency situation (e.g. armed conflict or natural disaster) to a recovery and early development phase.

A qualitative approach was used to synthesize findings from the evaluation reports, addressing the key criteria of programme relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability. The UNICEF Child Protection Strategy (2008) was the basis for the initial synthesis framework that focused on the broad strategic themes of ‘child protection systems strengthening’ and ‘social change’, specific programme areas (e.g. child-trafficking prevention, mine risk education, and reintegration of child soldiers), and cross-cutting issues (e.g. reaching the most vulnerable children and communities, expansion and scaling up, sustainability, and ethical considerations). Because the strategic themes or action areas are intertwined and complementary in practice, it was difficult to classify any child protection intervention under a single strategic category.

The Child Protection Strategy serves only as guidance to the Country Offices when designing and planning their programmes and therefore may not reflect fully the programmes that are being implemented at regional and country levels, many of which were designed and implemented prior to 2008. The meta-synthesis was thus open to the inclusion of other concepts and variables that were not in the initial analytical framework and focused on the effectiveness of specific child protection strategies and interventions (including cross-cutting strategies) used by the country programmes.

In addition, it is important to note this assessment does not cover all child protection work completed in UNICEF Country Offices between 2005 and 2010. Child protection programmes in Country Offices that lacked adequate resources to conduct evaluations and post them on to the EO website were thus not captured in this report. Further, the report could not draw conclusions about impact, as many evaluations did not examine impact.

2. Quality of Evaluations

UNICEF regularly conducts quality assessments of its evaluations. UNICEF ratings were available for 46 reports and the remaining six reports were reviewed and rated by the consultant, yielding the following distribution of quality scores: 27% were classified as poor, 48% as satisfactory, 23% as very good and 2% as excellent. The meta-synthesis examined all 52 evaluations but, in synthesizing findings, gave greater weight to the evaluations that were of better quality and rigour compared to the poor quality or incomplete reports.

Most of the evaluations focused on relevance and appropriateness, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and equity, although their scope, quality and methodology varied. The data collection methods employed by evaluators tended to include a desk review and in-depth interviews with programme managers, staff, stakeholders and donors. Some evaluations used qualitative interviews and focus group discussions with beneficiaries, while others included a quantitative component that involved surveys and use of control groups to measure impact and derive conclusions about attribution. The use of diverse and appropriate methodologies should be seen as a strength in the evaluations.
In many reports, evaluators were open about their limitations and the challenges they encountered in the field: The scarcity of programme data for many evaluations made it difficult to assess certain elements of the programmes, such as cost efficiency or cost-effectiveness issues. In addition, the failure of some programmes to use management and planning tools and/or develop comprehensive monitoring and evaluation frameworks had a negative impact on the analysis in evaluations. Similarly, the lack of baseline data hindered attempts at measuring change in target communities. In some programmes, objectives were too loosely defined for achievements to be measured. Related to this, the absence of coherent internal programme logic in some cases, made it difficult for evaluators to determine whether programmes were meeting their objectives. As some evaluations were conducted during the implementation phase, evaluators could highlight only potential, not actual, impacts; in addition, when the evaluations were conducted upon completion of the programme, in some cases, evaluators could not observe or evaluate ongoing activities, or trace beneficiaries. Rapidly changing socio-economic and political conditions also made it difficult for evaluators to make conclusions about attribution. Finally, the lack of adequate support provided from some UNICEF offices during the evaluations also emerged as an overarching challenge.

By extension, these challenges have made it difficult to synthesize the findings of the 52 evaluation reports. In some reports, activities and processes were described with no reference to results. In other reports, results were conflated with activities. Some reports failed to discuss issues pertaining to relevance and sustainability in any depth, or made scant reference to equity and ethical soundness. Further, some evaluators failed to critically examine the programmes under review, while others were overly critical. Many evaluators failed to sufficiently contextualize their findings. Despite these limitations and challenges, the findings provide reasonably good evaluative evidence and lessons learned for further strengthening UNICEF and its partner’s efforts to addressing violence against children.

3. Findings

a) Brief summary of programmes
‘Violence’ is a broad issue with many overlapping features and characteristics, as defined by Article 19 of the UN CRC (1989) and related articles. The scope of this meta-synthesis was to look at child protection issues not strictly considered to be ‘violence’ but that cause harm to children. Accordingly, the evaluations that UNICEF included in the sample (52 in total) look at a wide variety of interventions from the seven UNICEF programming regions. It is important to note, however, that many other aspects of UNICEF Child Protection work, were not included in this review, such as efforts to increase birth registration, capacity building of social welfare workers and legal reform initiatives that do not pertain to violence.

b) Overall relevance and effectiveness
The overall strategic goal of all UNICEF child protection interventions is to protect children from harm; this includes both prevention and response components. However, each programme should be driven by an objective that is relevant to the beneficiary (child, family, and community) requirements, country needs, global priorities, and partner’s and donors’ policies. In the 43 reports that explicitly discussed relevance, 23 programmes were found to be completely relevant, 19 partly relevant, and 1 not relevant.

In terms of overall effectiveness, the programmes were rated on the basis of whether they were not effective, partly effective or effective in meeting their programme objectives. Thirteen percent were deemed not effective, 67% partly effective, and 19% effective. It is important to note that these ratings were, however, tempered by the variable quality of the evaluations as discussed above. Further, some evaluation analyses were overly or under-critical toward the programmes, thereby skewing the results. Detailed analysis of overall relevance and effectiveness can be found in the main report.

1 This includes programmes that addressed harmful practices (5), children in residential care (5), recovery and transition from armed conflict (10), mine action (5), natural disasters (4), child labour (4), child trafficking and child migration (4), child abuse and exploitation (3), children living on the streets (3), violence in schools (3), and other topics (6).
2 WCARO (9), ESARO (8), ROSA (8), EAPRO (11), MENA (4), TACRO (5) and CEECIS (7).
c) Findings on appropriateness and effectiveness of programme strategies and interventions used

Multi-sectoral approaches to capacity building and system strengthening that also target harmful social norms are effective.

The findings suggest that a multi-pronged approach that targets norms and values, while strengthening legal policy frameworks and the capacity of service providers is effective in eradicating harmful practices in transition and developing contexts. For example, many communities were empowered to advocate for justice, question harmful social norms and stand up against perpetrators of harmful practices due to the creation of decentralized justice structures; however, when system strengthening was not promoted, despite community empowerment, some programmes were thwarted by the absence of protective policies and procedures, and capacitated institutions and individuals in meaningfully protecting the rights of women and children.

In the education sector, programmes that sought to raise the awareness of school children about child protection issues were effective because they incorporated these lessons into the teaching curricula and strengthened the education sector’s capacity to respond to child protection issues. In capacity building interventions, the effective programmes directed technical support to multiple sectors, levels of governance, and government and civil society actors. Standalone programmes that were not embedded in government and community structures were not sustainable.

A multi-pronged approach was also found to be effective in post-emergency programmes. It was found that in order to effectively and efficiently transition from an emergency to recovery and early development phase, two concurrent work strands should be adopted to (a) respond to immediate needs, while (b) building the child protection system. This requires building on the approaches and elements of ongoing service provision, while investing in policy development, capacity strengthening efforts and supporting social change interventions to address harmful attitudes and practices.

Integrating child protection into intersectoral programmes that combine longer term social change with short term tangible ‘entry points’ is a viable strategy.

Awareness-raising programmes that are not integrated into intersectoral (e.g. health or education) programmes implemented by UNICEF and other organisations were found to be less effective because they are not perceived to address the communities’ immediate needs. As a result, some programmes sought to promote social change through community development activities. For example, some programmes centered on harmful practices (e.g. female genital mutilation/cutting [FGM/C] and early marriage) expanded their focus to also address violence against women and children and other developmental issues such as sexual reproductive health, hygiene, birth registration, human rights, literacy, and good governance. This strategy was identified as being particularly effective because it addressed the tangible, pressing needs of communities.

Similarly, for Mine Risk Education (MRE) interventions, children and adults were found to continually engage in risky behaviour primarily for socio-economic reasons, despite their awareness of the dangers. Evaluators therefore argued that programmes centred exclusively on awareness-raising and community mobilization are not effective, unless they are strategically linked to intersectoral education and livelihood programmes. Likewise, in the context of child injury prevention, evaluators described the ‘environmental modifications’ (e.g. erecting railings on small bridges and fencing off public ponds, installing traffic signs, putting up danger warning signs, and providing commune road lighting) as more effective in changing norms and behaviour than awareness-raising because they were more ‘tangible’, visible and appreciated by community members.

Across specific child protection programmatic areas, social protection interventions (e.g. vocational training, micro-credit and cash transfers) were used as a strategy to enhance the receptiveness of communities to child protection messages. However, it is important to note that this strategy had to be coupled with the provision of an integrated package of services (including shelter, employment support, day care services, inclusive education, and centres and services for children living with disabilities) in order to meet a wide range of beneficiaries’ needs. In cases where material or cash handouts were
provided to families without other forms of support (e.g. parenting skills training, conflict management, bereavement counselling, and psychosocial support), the evaluators found that these families remained ambivalent or hesitant about changing harmful practices and were easily swayed by peer pressure and confusing religious, health and media messages. Similarly, interventions seeking to support the socio-economic integration of children who were affected by armed conflict or on the move were only effective when they addressed beneficiaries’ immediate and tangible needs in an integrated and holistic manner. Taken alone, social protection interventions were not sufficient or effective in this regard.

Addressing both prevention and response in the continuum of services is an effective strategy in protecting children.

The findings also suggested the need to focus on both prevention and response in child protection programming to effectively protect children. In the context of residential care, many programmes adopted a narrow definition of deinstitutionalization that centred on the closure of institutions, family reunification and alternative care, without seeking to ‘prevent the need for alternative care’. A small number of programmes interpreted deinstitutionalization more broadly to include prevention components. These evaluations found that the numbers of children entering and living in residential institutions were reduced due to the provision of material and psychosocial support to families. It was also found that children were less likely to leave home or be abandoned if they received assistance with counselling, medical care, small business development grants, income generation activities, life skills education and short-term food support. Secondary separation was often avoided by the provision of livelihood support and family kits to foster families.

Some programmes targeting children in conflict with the law failed to develop an adequate strategy around prevention as emphasis was placed on legal education through schools, rather than the strengthening of the protective role of communities and families. Similarly, many of the programmes targeting child labour centred on advocacy, awareness-raising, removing children from hazardous situations and directing them into formal and informal education instead of prevention. However, many children work out of necessity, and the evaluators noted that these programmes failed to address the reasons, be they macro (cultural, socio-economic, or political), interpersonal, or individual, that resulted in child labour. Likewise, programmes targeting child migration and child trafficking defined prevention narrowly as awareness-raising, rather than addressing the reasons why many children choose to migrate. This is partly due to a failure to recognize children’s agency in the process of migration. The same trend applies to programmes assisting children associated with the armed forces. Evaluators argued that strategically more emphasis needs to be placed on addressing the reasons many children decide to engage with armed groups. Intersectoral linkages with education, water and sanitation sectors were recommended in this regard.

Isolated and vertical programmatic responses are ineffective and inefficient as compared to more holistic interventions.

A key finding is that it is important to adopt a holistic approach to child protection that moves beyond vertical or isolated programmatic responses. A number of evaluators questioned the tendency to focus on a specific child protection issue, instead of advocating for wider systemic reform. Some programmes interpreted the concept ‘justice for children’ narrowly to refer only to children in conflict with the law. This vertical approach to addressing issues of justice fails to recognize the manner in which the categories of child victims, witnesses, and children in conflict with the law, overlap in terms of experiences, institutions, professionals and services. Similarly in the context of child migration, emphasis was placed on child trafficking issues rather than on the broader concept ‘children on the move’. The latter concept encompasses a wide range of children (e.g. those who have been trafficked, child migrants, asylum-seeking children, children who migrate in order seek family reunification, and children who migrate in order to find employment and education opportunities, etc.) who might have similar reasons for migrating, whose situation might change over time, and who might share contact with a limited pool of service providers. These complexities are overlooked by focusing exclusively on child trafficking.

Understanding and considering underlying socio-economic, cultural and political determinants is critical in designing child protection programmes.
The programmes under review have been informed previously by evidence from literature reviews, needs assessments/situational analysis, piloting, and operational research otherwise known as formative evaluations during the course of a project. The evidence suggests that effective programmes must be flexible and adaptable to the changing situation on the ground and, to achieve this, require up-to-date evidence of local realities. Evidence also suggests that an ecological framework is useful in terms of gaining an understanding of the macro (e.g. socio-economic, cultural, and political) context, the interpersonal context (e.g. children’s relationships with their parents, peers, and community members) and the needs of vulnerable and marginalized children.

By gathering local level information, programmes were better able to identify and meet the needs of vulnerable children, families, and communities in an appropriate, relevant, and effective manner. With this evidence, programmes were able to respond rapidly to changing circumstances. For example, in Upper Egypt, a programme used research to adapt its focus from FGM/C to hygiene awareness and Avian Flu awareness campaigns, which also gave credibility to local NGOs working on this programme at community level.

Social protection programmes were generally more effective when they accounted for local contexts such as local markets, the value attached to work and cash in different communities, and children and families' access to shelter and services. Evaluators argued that some vocational training projects were not relevant because they were not based on market assessments, they duplicated existing skills training activities, and they did not contribute to broader development plans. In other cases, they were not appropriate for children in the short term considering their age, gender, educational needs and so forth. At a design level, evaluators argued that micro-credit loans were not appropriate or effective in many loan-averse, poverty-stricken communities. Similarly, it was found that the appropriateness of cash transfers needs to be considered within particular socio-economic and cultural contexts. For instance, the decision to use cash transfers should be considered in terms of what the cash would mean to communities, families, and children themselves. Anecdotal evidence suggests that individuals, families, and collectives may interpret cash in different ways and that cash transfers may even threaten family and community unity.

Relevance emerged as an issue of concern across strategic areas, largely because at times there was a failure to undertake comprehensive needs assessments and situational analysis. This points to a larger issue of planning and programme management. For instance, it was found that some municipal and provincial development plans were not relevant to the socio-economic context. Similarly, training offered to health practitioners in a range of contexts was not based on identified needs and a comprehensive understanding of the local context. For example, trainees were not given an opportunity to define their role and status in the system, their need to share experiences and their need for supervision, support and psycho-social counselling. Training modules were not adapted to suit a wide range of trainees from different educational and linguistic backgrounds. In some post-emergency settings, the content of capacity building activities was oriented more to disaster and emergency response, rather than regular mental health and psychosocial problems. Instead of conducting a formal assessment of the context and local understandings of child protection, in some programmes international actors assumed high levels of trauma and, in turn, ‘recycled’ psychosocial interventions that had been applied in other contexts.

Similarly, in some programmes that provided direct services to children, evaluators stated that there was a failure to invest in research and child-centred activities in order to elucidate the cultural meaning of concepts such as ‘wellbeing’ and ‘resilience’ compared to ‘vulnerability’ and ‘risk’. Numerous examples suggest that guidelines developed by UNICEF and partners were not always culturally, linguistically and contextually specific. This is partly due to the fact that in many cases guidelines were developed by international consultants without being field tested and locally endorsed. In awareness-raising campaigns, many community members remained resistant to rights-based messages and/or perceived them as ‘foreign and imposed’. This is partly because some programmes failed to review materials and language to ensure that they are relevant and culturally appropriate or failed to adapt their strategy to the local context and the changing situation on the ground. For example, messages designed in an emergency context did not reflect the shift to a more peaceful environment and a range of emergent challenges to safe behaviour. Furthermore, reports suggest that messages (particularly in the context of mine action) failed to target the most at risk because they were not designed on the basis of in-depth research.
In many reports, evaluators raised concerns about an over-reliance on international consultants to undertake research, which has then informed programme design. This has left some programmes disconnected from local cultures and realities. Alternatively, programmers did not have the skills to use research findings to strengthen programme design. Furthermore, it was argued that some donors may influence the strategic direction of programmes, to such an extent that the evidence-gathering process becomes spurious.

It is important to move beyond advocacy and technical assistance to monitoring and oversight.

The evaluations identified successes in securing political commitment to protect children through various means, for example, by identifying vulnerable and marginalized children who require assistance and protection; identifying a minimum package of services to assist these children; lobbying for the inclusion of these services in legal frameworks and policies; and mapping or assessing existing policies, laws and services and undertaking a cost analysis and advocating for adequate budget allocations.

Despite these successes, a number of design and implementation challenges were identified. For example, in some cases concerns were raised about the accuracy, clarity and consistency of messages developed by UNICEF and partners. Strategically it was suggested that collaborating with government on the provision of long term developmental assistance will enhance the political will required to respond to a particular child protection issue. In addition, a number of reports referred to limited government capacity (time, human, and financial resources) to engage with advocacy initiatives or implement legal policy outputs. Implementation challenges included confusion about the concept of ‘decentralization’ and the degree of authority and control of resources it infers; limited interest and capacity (i.e. management, human, and budgetary) of district and provincial governments to participate actively and implement plans; and the lack of support from central governments. Poor intersectoral coordination and the failure to engage with civil society also emerged as barriers to programme success.

As a result of these challenges, it was found that programmes often failed to move beyond legal policy reform to implementation. As a result, at times, implementation plans were not developed or failed to include a clear delegation of roles and responsibilities, reporting, and regulatory frameworks. Furthermore, the development of minimum standards, cost analysis, training packages and other tools were often not included in programme design. This supports the finding of the Meta-Evaluation conducted by Sheeran (2008) that the greatest gap in UNICEF programming was in the monitoring of legal policy implementation to ensure quality assurance.

Systematic capacity strengthening and coordination mechanism are essential for improving effectiveness of partnership and community mobilization efforts.

Some programmes were successful in working with stakeholders, partners, and beneficiaries to design, implement, monitor, and evaluate programmes. Participation ranged from consultation to active involvement and ownership. To support that sectors of social welfare, education, health, law enforcement, and judiciary assume an upstream role in overall national child protection systems, advocacy and technical support was provided to government and NGO actors to strengthen their capacity in strategic planning; the outputs included basic guidelines, standards, tools and strategic documents. Examples of results included higher levels of awareness, cooperation and skills among service providers and improved outcomes for children. For example, in the justice sector it was found that there were greater government budgetary allocations to justice issues. Children’s cases were more efficiently processed, managed and followed-up since the establishment of child protection structures in law enforcement and justice sector. Law enforcement and justice officials’ knowledge and skills were enhanced. Child protection for victims, witnesses and offenders was improved by the development of case management and child-friendly procedures. Children who were in conflict with the law were more likely to have their rights fulfilled and protected in pre-trial, trial, and post-trial phases since the implementation of the programmes. There was an increase in arrests and convictions of child traffickers and exploiters due to capacity strengthening interventions and the establishment of regional judicial structures.

In the health sector, it was found that capacity building interventions improved the knowledge, skills, confidence, and networking of health professionals, who, in turn, were better equipped to assist children.
Furthermore, it was held that the use of child-sensitive and interactive counselling methods led to improved psychosocial outcomes for children.

In the education sector, it was found that many programmes were effective in terms of improving teachers and pupils’ knowledge, attitudes and behaviour in relation to violence, leading to a reduced incidence of violence and injury in schools and an improved sense of safety and security. The overall attitude, behaviour and practices of teachers with respect to child rights, child abuse, child participation, and positive discipline was found to have improved; teachers were better able to communicate with their students after having been trained on recreational and interactive learning methods, they were able to identify vulnerable children and they were able to provide psychosocial support to children showing signs of trauma.

However, a number of design and implementation challenges were identified in relation to capacity building measures, some of which overlap with the findings discussed above. For example, some training modules were not designed on the basis of an in-depth understanding of social workers’ experience and needs within the broader child protection system, and in some cases were designed by international consultants or institutions, without consulting national level stakeholders and experts. As a result, some training modules promoted a decontextualized and pre-defined model of social services, which were either overly simplistic or too specialized. Furthermore, failing to include on the job training and support, information management (e.g. documentation of activities, lessons, and outcomes), and monitoring and evaluation (of training content) emerged as programme design gaps. Despite their training, implementation was hindered by limited resources (i.e. infrastructure, communication, and transportation), a backlog of cases, feeling of psychosocial stress and an overwhelming sense of hopelessness on behalf of social workers. The findings suggest that these capacity limitations have had a direct impact on the wellbeing of children. For instance, in some cases, due to a range of challenges encountered when tracing children’s families, undertaking family assessments or making arrangements for family reintegration, many children would spend years in ‘temporary’ shelters/safe houses. Alternatively, they would be returned to abusive environments or sent to another residential institution, neither option serving the best interest of the child. The evaluation reports of some interventions suggest that consultation, follow-up or monitoring of children once they have been returned home is poor.

In many countries, the absence of capacitated local government and NGO counterparts in children’s communities of origin has meant that family reintegration—and family strengthening—activities are limited, with the result that children often leave the homes to which they have just been returned. According to the evaluators, these problems rest on funding and human resource constraints including a shortage of committed, passionate, trained, and skilled staff. Furthermore, poor case management skills, the absence of detailed, practical referral protocols and inadequate intersectoral coordination has meant that some children are simply lost in the system, instead of receiving the care and protection that they need.

The selection of implementing partners appeared to have a significant effect on the efficiency of the programmes under review. Different methods were used to select partners, including building on existing partnerships, developing criteria regarding the capacity, experience and commitment of partners; selection based on geographical coverage; and an open flood gate system based on a call for proposals. Some evaluators questioned the selection criteria used, the absence of institutional assessments, contractual relationships, and the delegation of roles and responsibilities. Efforts to strengthen the capacity of partners were also criticized in terms of content, strategic orientation, methodology, monitoring, and mentoring. Programme management at the level of partner NGOs was found to be particularly weak in many countries.

Partnerships were also forged with community leaders and volunteers, each of whom will be discussed. A number of programmes collaborated with local leaders and stakeholders in their social change programmes. In some cases, it was found that the support of a local leader would guarantee volunteers access to a community, or would give the programme and its messages some degree of credibility. Some local leaders encouraged social dialogue in their communities, denounced acts of violence, supported child protection programmes and even facilitated the release of children from the armed forces or from exploitative situations. However, some evaluators argued that it is necessary to move beyond
consultation to meaningful participation by involving local leaders in the design of behaviour change
programmes or training them on communication techniques and group facilitation.

Community-based child protection committees and volunteers emerged as an effective strategy of
community mobilization and awareness-raising because they are embedded in the community; have an
in-depth understanding of local problems and are familiar with power dynamics; and have a network of
peers and kin that could identify and refer vulnerable children. Positive results included increased levels
of awareness among community members; a sense of community ownership; access to health and
psychosocial care; high levels of coordination between community groups and NGOs; strong linkages
with service providers (e.g. law enforcement, clinics, local schools) to whom children are referred;
decreased levels of child abuse, exploitation and harmful practices; and the stimulation of community-
based programmes. However, a number of challenges emerged in relation to this strategy. In terms of
membership and composition of these groups, questions were raised about confidentiality and motives,
particularly given kin or caste allegiances. In some programmes, the roles and responsibilities of
volunteers were unclear, causing confusion, duplication or gaps in service provision. A high turnover of
volunteers was recorded due to fatigue, low stipends, and contractual or payment delays. Capacity was
an issue of concern due to training, mentoring, supervision and monitoring gaps. It was also found that
referral procedures needed to be clearly and repeatedly articulated as volunteers often do not know the
limits of their powers, do not understand the extent to which they can intervene in cases of abuse, and get
demoralized when they do not receive feedback on cases that they have referred. Linkages with locally
based government workers (e.g. social workers) and other NGOs were found to be lacking. Resource
constraints for communication, transportation and service fees emerged as cross-cutting challenges.

In addition, partnerships were also forged with the media and private sector. In the former, the media was
employed in a number of strategies to raise awareness on child protection issues. While radio
communication was found to be very effective in reaching outlying and rural areas, challenges included
the capacity of journalists to report on children’s issues both accurately and ethically, and the pressure
that the media can place on programmes to move in a particular strategic direction. In the latter, some
programmes targeted the private sector to revise their internal labour practices, to contribute funding to
child protection programmes, to assist on social protection programmes (e.g. vocational training and
apprenticeships) or to undertake project activities. Evaluators criticized selected programmes for failing to
go beyond partnerships with individual companies to developing a larger strategy for social mobilization
that includes private sector targeting. In some programmes, opportunities were missed as the private
sector’s interest in engaging with child protection issues at the level of design and implementation was
not considered. Concerns were also raised about the transparency and appropriateness of certain
partnerships with the private sector.

The evaluations also highlighted challenges encountered when consulting with or encouraging the
participation of other donors. For example, some donors placed pressure on programmes to move in a
specific strategic direction such as encouraging them to focus on CAAFAG when research suggests that
it is not a major issue of concern in a particular location, or pressurizing programmes to move away from
prevention to higher profile ‘rescue’ and ‘rehabilitation’ issues. As a result, less effective strategies, such
as centre-based models, were selected over more effective and sustainable strategies, such as outreach
activities.

Many programmes reviewed were successful in their efforts to strengthen the coordination of child
protection system actors. This resulted in improved cooperation on specific issues across institutions and
sectors, strengthened case management, information sharing, monitoring and reporting. Successful
coordination structures at provincial and local levels facilitated programme activities, streamlined
gatekeeping functions in the context of institutionalization, encouraged inter-departmental cooperation,
enlisted the support of local leaders and mobilized relevant authorities. Despite these successes, a
number of challenges were identified in relation to the design and implementation of coordination
structures. These include the lack of a clear mandate, failure to delegate specific roles and
responsibilities, unclear institutional positioning, the absence of a transparent reporting mechanism, gaps
in the monitoring and evaluation framework, and limited information-sharing mechanisms. Implementation
was also hindered by inconsistent member commitment, ad hoc cooperation, intersectoral challenges,
politicization, limited capacity (i.e. human, financial, and material resources) to action minuted items, and
inadequate oversight and monitoring.
Meaningful participation of children, families and communities need to be planned and implemented more systematically.

A large number of the programmes purport to be driven by a child participation strategy. In terms of positive results, children were found to have gained knowledge and skills, which they shared with their peers, parents, caregivers, and communities. Children also influenced national and decentralized policies and plans. As a result of their participation in children's groups, girls were more empowered. Peer teams contributed to a reduction of violence in schools. Child participation enhanced the self-esteem, problem-solving abilities and social skills of children formally associated with the armed forces. Children's clubs assisted in reducing caste and gender discrimination by giving an opportunity to interact with different social groups. Insights gained from child participation programmes led to the development of child to child training manuals and informed capacity strengthening activities. However, in some cases, the extent to which this participation was meaningful was questioned by evaluators. For example, children who participated in children's groups have never been represented at higher levels of organizational governance. In some cases, peer teams were elected by teachers and not by pupils and/or were asked to carry out predetermined activities rather than designing activities on the basis of their needs and interests. In some cases, children participated in activities that were imposed on them, but did not receive any response from adults in relation to cases of violence reported. In many cases, children did not have the time, space, logistics, transportation, and support to participate actively. These findings suggest that in many programmes, implementing NGO partners do not have the capacity to implement child participation strategies.

In addition to children's groups, some programmes included a peer-to-peer counselling component. It was found that children perceive youth facilitators as important role models and a useful source of information on sensitive subjects. Youth volunteers improved the psychosocial wellbeing of children by discussing problems that were relevant to them, facilitating the development of life plans, organizing young people and engaging with parents and teachers. It was held that these youth were less likely to return to the armed forces given their new responsibilities. However, it was found that children and youth counsellors required more training and ongoing support from professionals. Capacity building was also hindered by the high turnover of children and youth volunteers due to their age, access to life opportunities, short contractual periods, and limited remuneration.

A number of gaps were identified in relation to the capacity of implementing partners to consult with and involve parents and caregivers in programmes seeking to assist their children. Some programmes provided information or skills training to children without considering children's interpersonal context. This is an important oversight considering that these individuals play such an important role in children's development, decision-making, and identities.

Some programmes failed to engage adequately with community members in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of programmes. In many programmes it was found that UNICEF and partners designed and implemented community programmes for beneficiaries, rather than mobilizing existing community resources to implement activities themselves. This led to low levels of community ownership and a negative impact on effectiveness, relevance, and sustainability.

Weaknesses in applying results-based planning and management tools are common in child protection programming.

It is important to note that explicit reference to a logframe or related management and planning tools was made in only a small number of evaluation reports. Positive reference was made to consultative planning processes in the Philippines, to the flexibility and relevance of strategic plans in Senegal, Thailand and Bosnia Herzegovina, to the sequential design of programme inputs in Vietnam, and in Lao PDR, to the use of results based management principles and to the sound logical relationship between expected results, chosen strategies and programme objectives.

Despite these positive examples, many evaluators raised concerns about the absence of this tool and the absence of detailed indicators of process, results and impact in programme documents, thereby hindering
attempts to measure effectiveness. Concerns were also raised about programmatic objectives, which in some cases were overly ambitious and unrealistic, unfocused and/or failed to relate to specified outputs. Risks and assumptions were vague and not accompanied by risk mitigation strategies. There were some positive examples of internal logic and coherence; however, a number of problems were identified including lack of consistency over time, tendency to focus on processes rather than outcomes and impacts, confusion between outputs and outcomes, and failure to specify objectively verifiable indicators and means of verification. Flexibility, sequencing of activities and translating a logframe (or related tool) into a work plan were additional challenges encountered in programmes.

There were examples of successful UNICEF involvement in project management and planning, although problems also included delays, ‘intrusive’ involvement, and shortage of UNICEF human resources. These challenges have had a negative impact on the effectiveness, efficiency, and relevance of programme strategies, and have hindered monitoring and evaluation processes.

Lack of comprehensive monitoring and evaluation frameworks is another common problem which requires capacity strengthening of child protection and monitoring and evaluation staff.

The evaluation findings reinforce the notion that a monitoring and evaluation framework should be developed from the outset of each programme. In effective programmes, strategic monitoring and evaluation documents were widely disseminated and locally owned; methodologies encouraged child and community participation; reporting requirements were clear and simple; ongoing training and support was provided to partners and field staff; dedicated monitoring and evaluation personnel were recruited; numerous planned and unplanned field visits were undertaken; documentation of all activities and correspondence was encouraged; a routine data collection and reporting system was institutionalized; and findings were used to track what does and does not work. The programme in Nepal revealed the extent to which employing a full time monitoring officer can improve monitoring and evaluation; the personal contact offered by the monitoring and evaluation officer in the form of phone calls, field visits and technical support, ensured that MRE focal points, teachers and partners completed and submitted forms on a regular basis leading to an effective and efficient monitoring and evaluation system. Examples from the Comoros and Vietnam suggest that it is also very important to involve government partners in the monitoring and evaluation of programme activities. In another positive example, the effectiveness of the programme in the Gambia was measured against a comprehensive list of indicators which included examining impact-level results.

However, a large proportion of the monitoring and evaluation frameworks reviewed were described as weak by the evaluators. In some cases, concerns were raised about the complete absence of monitoring and evaluation. In other cases, reference was made to simplistic monitoring and evaluation designs; non-existent baselines; resistance from staff (in part due to lack of feedback); weak information management systems; confusion over roles and responsibilities (pertaining to data collection, cleaning, entry, verification, analysis and storage); the lack of training and support rendered by UNICEF to partners; and confusion between process and change indicators, and qualitative and quantitative indicators.

Lack of exit strategies and sustainability issues in programme planning is a key concern.

Many evaluators raised concerns that exit strategies were not developed from the outset and were not clearly communicated with partners and beneficiaries. In terms of funding, evaluators found that a number of programmes would not be able to sustain activities when funding is completed. Reference was made to a culture of dependency on donor support, the absence of a longer-term vision, gaps in cost analysis, failure to diversify donor support or advocate for greater government budgetary allocations. Apart from funding, reference was also made to community commitment and ownership to ensure sustainability. As discussed above, there has been a tendency for government, UNICEF and NGO actors to design and implement community programmes for beneficiaries rather than mobilizing existing community resources to implement these activities themselves. A more participatory approach is necessary to ensure sustainability. Furthermore, it was argued that it is important to obtain the buy-in of community leaders; integrate programmes within existing programmes led by governments, NGOs, and civil society actors; establish or situate programmes within government structures; encourage the decentralization of services; build the capacity of local partners; and gain the trust and commitment of communities, which is often contingent on programmes meeting their immediate needs, as noted previously.

x
Major effort is needed to strengthen equity-based programming to address the gaps noted by past evaluations.

The findings suggest that more needs to be done to ensure that the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children have access to services and protection. Participation of marginalized children was minimal, including those with disabilities or from outlying or migrant communities. While gender equity strategies featured in many programmes, execution was frequently cited as being poor. Common problems included failure to conduct in-depth gender analysis in the design phase, a dearth of gender-disaggregated data, failing to remove barriers to girl’s participation including domestic chores and social pressure to marry, and a tendency to ignore constructions of masculinity and the issues faced by boys.

Targeting was found to be problematic partly because of the dearth of research on the needs of vulnerable groups (e.g. children living with disabilities) in different socio-cultural contexts. For instance, in some programmes those who were participating were not the most vulnerable or marginalized and, therefore, not the intended beneficiaries. Outreach was found to be more effective in identifying ‘hidden’ children but also more resource-intensive in terms of labour, financial and material resources. As a result, some staff failed to actively seek out and encourage vulnerable children to participate in their programmes. In other examples, programmes failed to develop clear criteria to define which vulnerable and marginalized children should be selected in programmes or failed to undertake research to identify which groups are the most vulnerable and marginalized. In some programmes, staff failed to adapt their programmes to the needs and practical realities of vulnerable children, such as scheduling vocational training during hours when children work to earn an income. These examples reinforce the need for evidence-based programming by way of a situational analysis or needs assessment that focuses on vulnerable and disadvantaged groups.

It was also evident in some programmes that equity has been understood as facilitating the access of vulnerable and marginalized children to programmes, rather than addressing the root causes behind their marginalization. Some evaluators argued that at a strategic level it is necessary to shift from vertical responses for categories of vulnerable children to a more holistic approach to vulnerability. Although it is important to address more immediate risks and responses that may be needed, it was argued that this shift will enable interventions to address the underlying root causes of a range of child protection issues. As noted above, this highlights the importance of both prevention and response in the continuum of services for vulnerable children.

Child safe-guarding and associated ethical policies need to be reviewed and improved.

Only a few reports referred to the development of internal child protection policies, otherwise known as safeguarding policies. A best practice was observed in the development of child safeguarding policies comprising codes of conduct, child protection competency training, designating child safeguarding focal points, establishing referral protocols and ‘whistle blowing’ policies. Some programmes extended the policies to cover visitors and journalists (Lao PDR) and researchers/evaluators (Colombia). Nevertheless, a number of gaps were identified.

Some evaluators stated that children who were deemed to be living in a harmful situation were ‘intercepted’ and removed in a manner that was not always respectful, child-friendly, or rights-based. Despite their overarching aim to protect children, some programmes inadvertently caused further harm to children. In selected examples, children’s hopes and expectations were dashed because the objectives of the programmes were not clearly articulated to them.

In terms of safety and security, a few evaluations noted that some beneficiaries were stigmatized and/or were placed at risk through their participation in programmes. For example, shelters and transit centres for victims of trafficking were not always adequately protected and monitored by staff or guards, etc. Some reports suggest that children and adults embarked on long journeys to participate in programmes. There were also a few examples where staff was placed in risky situations, particularly in situations when they were undertaking outreach work.
4. Key Conclusions

From the meta-analysis, the following conclusions may be drawn. Of note, and as mentioned above, this assessment does not cover all child protection work completed in UNICEF Country Offices between 2005 and 2010, and many of the programmes included here were designed and implemented prior to the Child Protection Strategy (2008).

- The programmes under review have tended to focus on one or more component of ecological/protective environment, without recognizing the complex interplay of risk and resiliency factors at individual, interpersonal and macro levels. Further, emphasis has been placed on building child protection systems at national levels without recognizing the extent to which effectiveness is, in part, contingent on communities’, families’ and children’s experience with and perception of the legal policy frameworks, institutions, and service-providers.

- Programmers require conceptual clarity and leadership in relation to a number of child protection issues (e.g., ‘justice for children’, ‘deinstitutionalization’, ‘children on the move’ and ‘social protection’) and, more generally, the systems approach. There has been a tendency to use a vertical perspective on specific programmatic issues, rather than to adopt a holistic view and consider the underlying ‘root causes’ (at macro, interpersonal and individual levels) that are dynamic and that may enhance children’s vulnerability (or resilience); children may experience multiple forms of violence and/or their situation may change over time. Despite the type of violence they are subjected to, children have access to a very limited pool of service providers, institutions and other forms of support. Although it is essential to identify the unique needs of vulnerable children and target programmes accordingly, it is also too simplistic and rather inefficient to focus only on one issue (e.g., children in conflict with the law or child trafficking), when this category overlaps with a number of other categories of vulnerable children.

- There is a tendency to overlook prevention and early intervention in favour of immediate assistance or interim care and/or to adopt a narrow view of prevention centred almost exclusively on awareness-raising or life skills development. For example, a few programmes provided information or skills training to children without recognizing the extent to which their decisions are influenced by the interpersonal context within which they are embedded, thereby neglecting family strengthening and parental support.

- Despite a growing recognition of children’s agency, the findings suggest that this concept is still difficult for programmers and donors to grapple with, particularly when it is used within the context of, or results in, children’s victimization. By understanding why children make certain decisions that put themselves at risk and how they cope with adversity, programmers will be better able to effectively prevent violence from occurring or intervene at an early stage in risky situations.

- To strengthen legal policies and institutions, more needs to be done, by way of advocacy and technical assistance, to translate government commitments into services and programmes on the ground and/or to oversee and monitor this implementation, as was found in the 2008 meta-evaluation (Sheeran 2008).

- Although there were a number of successes in capacity building, overall more attention to the capacity building of professionals is required. This strategy needs to be made more systematic across programmes to ensure that it positively affects services on the ground.

- Interventions aiming to promote social change have achieved numerous successes in terms of changing knowledge and in some cases, attitudes. However, far more needs to be done to translate knowledge into behaviour change and to measure these changes over time. The findings also suggest that response and prevention programmes are more effective when they offer some form of ‘tangible’ and ‘visible’ assistance that fulfils the pressing needs of communities.

- Evidence suggests that social protection measures are effective in many programmes seeking to improve outcomes for children; however, the extent to which these have been designed and
implemented in a child-sensitive and community-responsive manner was questioned. Further, some social protection programmes were found to be problematic; instead, integrated and intersectoral programmes that rest on coordinated responses within and across UNICEF and partner programmes are more successful in addressing child protection issues.

- Child participation has been widely promoted in the context of child protection; however, in the programmes under review, the tendency has been to either allow children to direct programmes in a manner that it is not realistic, viable and sustainable or to override children’s opinions completely on the basis that they are not aware of their best interests or those around them. Thus, on the one hand, some programmes have made tokenistic gestures under the guise of ‘meaningful participation’ or, on the other hand, have failed to understand the limits, parameters and constraints of child participation.

- In some cases, the programme design was found to be lacking in relevance and appropriateness, partly due to gaps in evidence-based planning, results-based management and participatory programming. As a result, some interventions and concepts were ‘recycled’ from other contexts and imposed on communities, rather than being locally grounded, embedded in local practices and existing programmes.

- Some of the greatest challenges encountered by the evaluators were design gaps and implementation challenges in results-based management and monitoring and evaluation across the programmes under review. This hindered the extent to which change could be measured, impact identified and issues of attribution addressed.

- The extent to which equity has been prioritized is not reflected in the programmes in this meta-synthesis. Equity is often viewed as increasing the access of particularly vulnerable and marginalized children to programmes, rather than addressing the underlying root causes of this marginalization.

- Ethical soundness and child safeguarding policies were rarely considered in the evaluations. This is of particular concern because some child protection programmes have inadvertently placed children and staff at risk of harm.

5. Recommendations

a) Overall child protection programme design / strategies

- Programmes should adopt a two tiered strategy in relation to child protection, targeting both systems strengthening and social change, while recognizing the overlapping nature of these two strategic areas.

- The positioning of programmes within the continuum of care should be considered to ensure that children have access to comprehensive services and that essential components such as prevention and family reintegration are not overlooked in favour of ‘band aid approaches’ centred exclusively on interim care.

- Programmes should be informed by an ecological framework that considers a child within the context of the family, community and broader country. Such holistic programmes are more effective in addressing the range of causes of violence and, in turn, the impact of this violence on children, families and communities.

- The child protection sector should better incorporate integrated, multi-disciplinary and intersectoral programming principles; doing so will require forging functional partnerships between different sectors within UNICEF and with other development partners.

- Holistic as opposed to vertical approaches to child protection should be encouraged in order to move beyond the silos of issue-specific programming to more comprehensive and mainstreamed systems approaches.

- Child protection systems-strengthening should be factored into emergency programming to ensure that UNICEF is able to transition efficiently and effectively into a recovery and early development phases of programming.

b) Cross-cutting issues
• Evidence-based planning and meaningful participatory programming should be prioritized in programme design to ensure greater relevance, appropriateness and flexibility to changing circumstances.

• Comprehensive monitoring and evaluation (M&E) frameworks should be developed at the outset of programmes based on clear indicators that do not simply focus on processes but on outcomes and impact. This should be accompanied by comprehensive information management systems for the documentation, compilation, analysis, and storing of disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data.

• To ensure that programmes are appropriately designed, implemented and monitored in relation to their objectives and intended results (outputs and impacts), logical frameworks or related tools should also be utilized across the programming cycle based on evidence, realistic objectives, logical coherence, and a sound, holistic strategy.

• UNICEF should facilitate internal communication (for intersectoral programming) and information sharing between partners, stakeholders and communities, rather than support vertical reporting structures alone.

• Beyond tokenistic gestures of consultation, meaningful participatory programming should be encouraged to improve levels of ownership and, thereby, effectiveness and sustainability.

• To improve efficiency in coordination, partners should be selected using transparent and rigorous procedures; clearly delineated roles and responsibilities should be formalized; and training, mentoring and support should be improved, particularly in relation to programme management.

• Sustainability should be included in programme design, with a focus on exit strategies, long term fundraising strategies, community commitment, government buy-in, and institutional positioning.

• An inclusive approach to equity should be used that emphasizes ‘vulnerable children’ in the context of their families and wider community, in order to address the root causes of marginalization and moderate any unintended effects of equity-focused programming. From a practical perspective, this requires in-depth qualitative and ethnographic research, disaggregated data, multi-partner guidance, and capacity strengthening of UNICEF and partners.

• It is essential that UNICEF and partners develop and adhere to a strict child safeguarding policy that includes background checks for prospective partners, employees and volunteers; a code of conduct; initial and refresher training; the identification of emergency focal points; internal referral protocols; whistle blowing policies; and guidance on the collection, use and storing of sensitive data. Funding for partners should be contingent on the development of these policies and mechanisms. The safety and security of beneficiaries (adults and children), staff, and even evaluators should be prioritized at all times. It is also important to note that this recommendation applies broadly to UNICEF programmes and is not confined to Child Protection.

\c Headquarters / Regional Office guidance and support to Country Offices

• Headquarters and Regional Offices have started to shift the scope of their work; however, more work is needed on providing Country Offices with conceptual clarity about specific child protection issues and broader strategic areas including the continuum of care, child protection systems, ecological systems approaches, multi-disciplinary and intersectoral programming, mainstreaming, and equity.

• At a strategic level, UNICEF’s Child Protection Division at Headquarter and Regional Office levels should engage with other sectors in UNICEF to forge partnerships, develop principles, and define the parameters of intersectoral programming.

• In addition to guidance on specific child protection issues, Headquarters and Regional Offices should support internal capacity development exercises in relation to the cross-cutting issues identified in the report (evidence-based planning, results-based programming, participatory programming, knowledge management, monitoring and evaluation, equity and ethics). UNICEF Country Offices should then take responsibility for extending this capacity building to partners. It is critical that programmes incorporate attention to base-lines and monitoring impact in order to assess progress and build the evidence for what works.

• The staffing of the child protection sector at Country Office level should be carefully considered to ensure that UNICEF has the human resource capacity to adequately support partners and effectively implement programmes.

• At Headquarter, Regional Office, and Country Office levels, procedures (administrative, financial management, funding disbursement, procurement and contractual) should be streamlined.
• Country Offices should assume a greater role in managing and overseeing the implementation of government and Nongovernmental Organisation (NGO) partner commitments at national and decentralized levels.

d) Future evaluations
• The profile and selection of evaluators should be carefully considered so that evaluations reflect a balanced perspective of local and international knowledge and expertise.
• Evaluations should be designed to focus more on outcomes and impact. This may require greater knowledge of what are often unexplored methodologies such as mixed methods, ethnography, quasi-experimental approaches, and longitudinal studies; funding for such evaluations should be allocated accordingly.
• Beyond a desk review of key programmatic documents, evaluators should be required to (a) undertake research, or consult with UNICEF, on the key concepts underlying child protection programmes and (b) conduct research on the context in which child protection programmes are implemented. This will allow for more comprehensive and relevant analyses.
• Although evaluators should be encouraged to capture highly contextual information, efforts should be made to standardize the structure and content of evaluation reports to allow for country, programmatic, or temporal comparisons. Similarly, the criteria used by evaluators should be consistent across child protection issues and include both quantitative scores and qualitative descriptions. Model evaluation TORs and technical support to field offices from experienced monitoring and evaluation specialists are key inputs towards building capacity of UNICEF staff to design and carry out high-quality evaluations.
• Given the dearth of quality evaluations in the area of violence prevention and response, in the coming years it will be important to conduct evaluations on children and violence programming to track progress in efforts to address violence against children. Furthermore, efforts need to be made to integrate children and violence themes into related large-scale evaluations, thus increasing data on violence prevention/response efforts and gaining cost and programme efficiencies by linking these efforts to on-going sectoral evaluations.
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1: Introduction

1.1.1 Objectives and Scope
In June 2011 an independent consultant was contracted to undertake a *meta-analysis of evaluation findings addressing violence against children*. This analysis provides an evidence-base for effective advocacy, planning and programme support as outlined in the Terms of Reference developed by the UNICEF Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section in New York (April 2011; See Appendix 2). This assignment fulfils a number of objectives. First, it provides a synthesis of findings from selected evaluations of UNICEF-supported interventions seeking to address violence against children. Second, it identifies results, lessons learned and good practices with respect to planning, management and the implementation of child protection interventions. Third, it provides an analysis of cross-cutting issues such as targeting and reaching the most vulnerable and marginalized children and communities; expansion and scaling up; sustainability; ethical considerations; participatory programming; coordination; ownership; partnerships; consultation; advocacy; and programme management at national and decentralized levels. Finally, the report provides an analysis of gaps in the selected evaluations and the resulting implications for future evaluative work (UNICEF, April 2011).

The consultant met these objectives by reviewing the findings of 52 selected evaluations of interventions seeking to address violence against children, which were published from 2005 to 2010. Throughout the selected evaluations, ‘violence’ is broadly defined to include sexual abuse and exploitation, child trafficking, child labour, children working and/or living on the street, children in residential care, children in conflict with the law, and harmful practices and injuries to children. Moreover, the evaluations focus on developing and transitional contexts, including countries transitioning from an emergency situation (e.g. armed conflict or natural disaster) to a recovery and early development phase.

This meta-synthesis complements the UNICEF Child Protection Meta-Evaluation (Sheeran 2008), which used the ‘Protective Environment Framework’ (PEF) as the blueprint for analysing 59 child protection evaluation reports. However, the meta-synthesis differs from the 2008 meta-evaluation in scope and structure, as will be outlined in this introduction.

1.1.2 Background and Rationale
The Terms of Reference (TOR; 2011) highlighted the importance of analysing findings from multiple evaluation reports to determine what works and what does not work (and why) in programming to protect children from violence. Although the TOR proposed a ‘meta-analysis’ evaluation, this report is better described as a ‘synthesis of findings’, in which the findings from selected evaluations have been combined and interpreted to identify overall patterns or trends in UNICEF-supported programming.³

The analytical framework used in this assessment was informed by the UNICEF Child Protection Strategy (2008). As part of the Strategy, UNICEF seeks to strengthen child protection systems at national and local levels (e.g. legal and policy frameworks, standards, guidelines, and services), promote positive social norms, attitudes and behaviours toward children and combat practices and norms that are harmful or lead to violence and discrimination against children.

³ A detailed discussion of these terms and methods is beyond the scope of this inception report. Please refer to the bibliography for further sources.
knowledge and participation; strengthening the capacity of those in contact with the child; basic and targeted services; monitoring and oversight.

In UNICEF’s Child Protection Strategy (2008), the above elements have been grouped into the broad strategic themes of ‘building child protection systems’ and ‘supporting social change’. In the former, the Strategy identified a series of strategic actions namely, the incorporation of child protection into national and decentralized planning processes; social protection reform to achieve child protection outcomes; promotion of justice for children within the rule of law agenda; strengthening coordination among child protection system actors; strengthening the social welfare sector and supporting birth registration. In the latter, the following strategic actions were listed: strengthening the protective role of families and communities; promotion of meaningful child participation and empowerment; supporting public education and social dialogue. The Child Protection Strategy (2008) also identified cross-cutting areas. For instance, ‘convening and catalysing agents of change’ refers to the development and implementation of common, multi-partner guidance; private sector collaboration; partnerships and advocacy.

Importantly, this assessment also constitutes a strategic action in the cross-cutting area of ‘evidence-building’, as the Child Protection Strategy (2008) calls for the strengthening of an evidence base on child protection in order to improve policies, laws and their implementation (UNICEF, 2008: III.A. 45). However, because violence against children is often hidden and sensitive, and it can often be difficult to monitor, evaluate and research. This meta-synthesis is therefore one means by which UNICEF can consolidate, analyse and disseminate information on child protection challenges and main results achieved through programming to date.

Furthermore, it enables UNICEF to collate the lessons learnt from evaluations conducted in different child protection programmes, as is listed as a priority action area in the Child Protection Strategy: “More systematic evaluation of child protection initiatives will improve learning within and beyond UNICEF. Evidence of programme impact is increasingly being captured across different sectors...UNICEF should do more to seek out and disseminate such evidence and to draw attention to the child protection research agenda” (UNICEF, 2008: 15).

The 2010 Child Protection Thematic Report indicates that globally, progress has been made in the monitoring, data collection, and analysis of child protection issues. However, the authors argue that “stocktaking” is needed on systems strengthening and social change interventions. A “mapping of strengths and gaps in programme efforts” should be undertaken to inform the development of programme guidance. By synthesizing the findings of evaluation reports, this work contributes to the much needed qualitative and quantitative ‘stocktake’ to guide future programmes addressing violence against children (UNICEF, 2010: 28-29).

This meta-synthesis also responds to the call for an assessment of equity in UNICEF programmes (UNICEF 2010). Equity has received a renewed emphasis and priority which necessitates documentation of knowledge and evidence for addressing equity through child protection programming. In order to ensure that the MDGs are reached with equity, a recent concept note argues that greater attention should be directed to prevention efforts that target the underlying root causes of disparities and to early intervention measures that seek to identify and assist the most vulnerable and marginalized children (UNICEF, December 2010). The Child Protection Thematic Report (2010) argues that more research is needed on equity and UNICEF programming. Thus, this work helps to fill this gap in knowledge, to the extent possible, by focusing explicitly on equity in programme design and implementation.

1.1.3 Key Concepts and Terms

This meta-synthesis answers the following research question: ‘what works and doesn’t work’ in child protection programme management, planning and implementation? It reviews the effectiveness and results of child protection interventions against the objectives, inputs and strategies set out in programme

4 Some programmes pre-date the Child Protection Strategy (2008) and therefore will not be evaluated against the strategy; rather the strategy will inform the overall structure of this report in terms of its focus on building child protection systems, promoting social change and cross-cutting issues.
logical frameworks. It is important to note that this analysis does not determine the effectiveness of the overall Child Protection Strategy's implementation at Regional and Country Office levels, but rather focuses on which specific child protection and cross-cutting strategies and interventions used by the country programmes are effective, based upon the review of 52 evaluations. This was undertaken in order to highlight strengths or weaknesses in planning, design and implementation that affect specific child protection programmes’ performance and outcomes.

As discussed above, the overall strategic goal of all UNICEF child protection interventions is to ensure the fulfilment of children’s rights to protection from harm. Each programme has its own set of objectives to prevent, combat and respond to particular manifestations of violence, such as abuse, exploitation and trafficking in a particular context. These objectives should be relevant to the beneficiary requirements (children, families and communities), country needs, global priorities, partner and donors’ policies. These programmatic objectives should describe the improved situation for children to which the intervention is expected to contribute; in other words, the extent to which the lives of children, their families and communities will change and improve as a result of the programme.

This ‘expected change’ can be described in terms of results, which provide direction for UNICEF programmes. When clarifying results, it is essential to distinguish between outputs, outcomes or impact of the child protection intervention, which may be intended or unintended, positive and/or negative. This requires an analysis of what has happened as a result of the programme and/or what the programme has caused directly and indirectly. Outcomes refer to short-term and medium results, while impact refers to longer-term intended or unintended results produced directly or indirectly by the child protection intervention (OECD/DAC 2000, 1991). For instance, in a child protection programme aiming to enhance children’s safety in schools, the intended impact may be to transform schools into ‘safe spaces’ in children’s communities characterized by a significant drop in the incidence of violence in schools and greater responsiveness of teachers’ to children’s reports of violence in their schools, homes and communities. The short-term and medium results (i.e. outcomes) in a particular school may be the creation of a reporting mechanism for children (e.g. complaints box and trained guidance counsellor), the strengthening of a referral mechanism which teachers can use and children’s enhanced awareness and increased use of this reporting process (e.g. measured in a survey and by number of reports received). This programme would be described as ‘effective’ when it achieves its objectives by producing this set of intended outcomes. An unintended result in this example may be that teachers feel overwhelmed and frustrated at the lack of meaningful response from social welfare services. Children in turn, may then become discouraged at the absence of timely support and decide not to use the reporting mechanism in future. It is important to note that given the scope and time-frame of the evaluations under review, it was difficult to identify impact since this was not considered in the majority of the evaluations. The review therefore focuses on the extent to which the child protection interventions were effective in achieving their objectives and producing intended, positive results in the short and medium term (i.e. outcomes).

The relationship between objectives and results is often conceptualized in a results chain or a results framework (UNICEF 2005). In order to achieve the expected results, it is necessary to address all the conditions that cause a child protection problem. For example, the underlying root causes of child labour are a complex interplay of macro, interpersonal and individual factors. For instance, in a particular community, socio-economic inequalities and constructions of childhood and gender intersect, to ensure that the eldest male child in a rural family feels responsible for making an economic contribution to the household, even if it involves working in hazardous conditions. In order to address these underlying root causes, child protection programmes may encourage social dialogue through awareness-raising and outreach campaigns in local communities with an aim to change parents’ beliefs and attitudes around the roles and responsibilities associated with childhood and masculinity. In addition, they may offer social protection measures (e.g. cash grants, loans and income-generation opportunities), vocational and educational opportunities for working children and their families. They may also advocate for the ratification of international child rights instruments that call for the abolishment of child labour and for the establishment of a progressively rising minimum age.\(^5\) Furthermore, these programmes may engage with the private sector to raise awareness around children’s rights in the context of employment and

strengthen oversight mechanisms in partner companies and subsidiaries. This requires collaborative interventions designed and implemented in partnership with multiple government and non-governmental actors. This may, therefore, also require the creation of an intersectoral coordination mechanism so that actors across sectors and levels of governance, can work together to fulfil child protection objectives.

Results Based Programme Planning and Management is essential to ensure that the sum of these interventions is ‘sufficient’ to address the problem, and that all available financial and human resources are used to achieve the planned results (UNICEF 2005). This synthesis report discusses the extent to which UNICEF Country Offices follow RBM principles and undertake the RBM activities outlined in Box 1 in order to meet their child protection programmes’ objectives.

**Box 1: Results based management and the programme process**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RBM Activities</th>
<th>Areas under investigation in the synthesis report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Agree on the key development challenges and on the analysis of the underlying and basic causes of those priorities;</td>
<td>• Evidence-based planning;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reach consensus among government, civil society and development agencies on priority issues for development cooperation, and a broad distribution of roles and responsibilities;</td>
<td>• Relevance and appropriateness;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Formulate and agree on the specific results of the proposed programme of cooperation (and how to achieve them);</td>
<td>• Advocacy, social dialogue and consensus building;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Finalize the programme design using a using a logical approach, involving all programme partners;</td>
<td>• Participatory programming;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Prepare an integrated Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (IMEP);</td>
<td>• Coordination mechanisms;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Focus UNICEF human and financial resources on jointly agreed results (UNICEF 2005)</td>
<td>• Partnerships;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

RBM therefore refers to clarity of results and programme logic; provision of resources; specificity of indicators, information flow and use in decision making; and clearly articulated strategic choices and shared responsibilities. In order to increase the likelihood of achieving the planned results, UNICEF manuals state that it is essential to improve the inherent logic of programme design, expressed as a Logical Framework or LogFrame. A LogFrame elucidates how the development objective is to be achieved, and the causal relationship between specific strategies and intended results. This tool enables programmers to check whether interventions are sufficient to produce intended results; consider assumptions pertaining to external factors or risks that might influence success or failure; determine key monitoring indicators and strategic evaluation questions; visualize and in turn assess the quality of programme design (UNICEF 2005).

Evidence-based planning is an essential component of results-based planning and management. Evidence-based planning activities (e.g. research and consultation) are essential to ensure the relevance of objectives; to identify underlying or basic causes of a problem, and other contributing factors; as well as to detect and manage assumptions. For instance, in the aforementioned example, programmers may assume that social welfare services have the capacity and resources to respond to teachers’ referrals. This false assumption led to a series of negative, unintended results. In addition, without quality data, it is very difficult for UNICEF programmers to obtain agreement on key developmental challenges and the priority issues for development cooperation. For instance, some actors may not regard child labour or violence in schools as a priority issue that should be addressed, without having access to quantitative and qualitative information about incidence and prevalence. Furthermore, quality data is essential in measuring the extent of ‘change’ and in turn the achievement of results over time. This will allow programmers to compare for instance, the level of households’ understanding of positive discipline,
before, during and after the programme. Hence, evidence should also be seen in terms of Integrated Monitoring and Evaluation Plans, which enable programmers to track progress over time, identify research agendas, synchronize information collection and dissemination, and strengthen partners' capacities in terms of data collection, information management and analysis.

In addition to relevance and effectiveness, the assessment analyses efficiency and sustainability. Efficiency refers to the economical use of resources and inputs in achieving results; this includes, cost, time and expertise. A programme may meet its objectives, but fail to do so within the agreed time frame and budget. It may therefore be effective, but not efficient. UNICEF manuals state that RBM should keep all financial resources and staff focused on agreed results and that strategic decisions should be made about the contribution of partner's skills, expertise and financial resources to achieving these results (UNICEF 2005: 27). A programme may not be efficient because it fails to utilize the strengths of local organizations.

The assessment also reviews the factors that affect sustainability; in other words, the programmes' ability to continue benefits after development assistance has been completed. Some programmes are not sustainable because they do not have the support of local communities, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and key government institutions. This in turn will affect the extent to which programme principles and activities can be expanded/scaled-up to other contexts and beneficiaries (OECD/DAC 2000, 1991).

From the descriptions of project and programme relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability contained in the evaluation reports, results and lessons learned are synthesized to highlight implications for future child protection programming and evaluations.

1.2: Methodology and Analysis

1.2.1 Selection of Reports
UNICEF identified the evaluation reports for inclusion in this meta-synthesis. In an earlier phase of this work, the UNICEF Evaluation Office contacted Regional Offices and Country Offices to identify relevant evaluation reports. Transparent and systematic search and selection strategies were used to limit the number of reports sampled for this synthesis of evaluation findings. Conceptual and thematic focus was given primacy in the inclusion criteria (Noblit and Hare 1998). Loose quality measures were then used to screen the reports that met the required inclusion criteria.

The initial phase of the data collection and mapping resulted in the collection of 41 evaluation reports in English that examine UNICEF's work on child protection, specifically addressing violence. The current sample of evaluations has been expanded to those published in English, French and Spanish during 2005-2011⁶ and those that have been uploaded by the Country Office or Regional Office into the Evaluation Office's Evaluation and Research Database (ERD). The evaluations cover development and recovery/transition programmes. Since a global evaluation is being undertaken concurrently on Child Protection in Emergencies (CPIE), only a small number of reports associated with armed conflict (specifically the transition to recovery and early development phase) were selected.

As the majority of UNICEF’s evaluations are received in English, further enquiry was done to ensure that all appropriate evaluations were included during this time period. The Child Protection Section circulated the initial selection of reports to the Regional Office's and Country Office's to solicit any additional evaluations in English that should be included in the study, which are not currently available in the ERD. From this solicitation, 13 documents were received. Upon inspection it was determined that 11 of these were not evaluations and were thus not included, bringing the final sample to 43 evaluations in English. In addition, 9 evaluations in French and Spanish were also identified directly from the ERD. A total of 52 evaluations were included in this meta-synthesis.

⁶ There are five evaluations published outside of this timeframe (1 from 2003 and 4 from 2004), which were considered potentially informative for the lessons learned exercise.
1.2.2 Analytic Methods

The objectives of this work are primarily to synthesize findings and to produce evidence that can be used by UNICEF staff, partners, donors, policy makers and programmers in future programming. In order to answer questions around ‘what works and doesn’t work’ in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability, a qualitative approach was selected to provide rich discussions of highly contextual and situational complexities that have informed outcomes in UNICEF-supported interventions (Thorne et al, 2004; McCormick, 2003). This includes the impact of policy developments, factors which facilitate or hinder successful implementation and sustainability, and the adaptation of interventions for large scale roll out (Noyes et al., 2008).

In order to synthesize the data, content analysis was selected as the ‘integrative’ approach (Noblit and Hare, 1998; Thorne et al., 2004; Sandelowski, 1997) by which data was amalgamated from a range of reports using a set of pre-defined concepts and variables (Dixon-Woods et al, 2005). An analytical framework was developed in consultation with the Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section, informed by the UNICEF Child Protection Strategy (2008), UNICEF’s Guide for Monitoring and Evaluation and OECD/DAC (2010) programming principles and criteria. Dominant child protection strategies were analysed using logical framework principles namely objectives, strategies and results. Efficiency (cost, timeliness and coordination), and sustainability were also coded.

The strategic action areas outlined in UNICEF’s Child Protection Strategy (2008) were used as the initial framework against which child protection programming was analysed broadly under ‘child protection systems strengthening’ and ‘social change’ and then under specific action areas (See Section 1.2). It is important to note that in practice these approaches are intertwined and difficult to categorize, for instance effective advocacy requires some degree of social consensus; it may as a result, have an impact on laws and policies, which in turn will influence social norms. Interventions to strengthen the protective role of families may rest on strengthening the social work sector. Social protection reforms associated with child protection systems strengthening will have an impact on the family and community’s protective role, which falls under promoting social change. Hence, it was difficult to categorize the interventions into an either/or strategic area. Furthermore, the Child Protection Strategy (2008) serves only as guidance to the CO when designing and planning their programmes, and may therefore not reflect fully the programmes that are being implemented at RO and CO level. The analysis was therefore open to the inclusion of other concepts and variables that were not set out in the analytical framework.

The coding and analysis process was undertaken manually using MS Word. The following coding protocol was used when analysing the data in order to ensure that the coding was undertaken consistently and reliably across the reports:

- Coding unit: Instead of running searches for particular terms or phrases, relevant sentences and paragraphs were coded. When an idea runs throughout a text, it was coded in full regardless of its length.
- Coding of data: Data was coded to all relevant codes without imposing a limit on how many times or where it will be coded.
- Development/revision of codes: Additional codes were identified as themes or issues emerged in the course of the review. Furthermore, as there was some overlap between codes (specifically ‘strengthening national protection systems’ and ‘supporting social change’), codes were merged during or after analysis was completed.
- Weighting: Following an initial coding of the 52 reports, prominent or recurring themes were identified and data was grouped accordingly under each code. The analysis considered the main purpose and objectives of the programmes when coding strategies, activities and results, so as to ensure that the findings remain contextualized, balanced and weighted. For instance, programmes that aimed to promote social change through community-based interventions were not criticized for failing to include capacity building activities for social workers, if this was not one of their expressed objectives. If a programme focused mainly on strengthening institutions and not on changing social norms, this was considered when the assessment was undertaken. Reports were therefore coded broadly, mindful of weighting.
The outputs were primarily qualitative. However, quantitative findings were generated based on the categorization and counting of themes in the qualitative data. This included a quantification of the following:

(a) Trends in child protection strategies/approaches and gaps in coverage (e.g. 10% of the programmes focused on school violence);
(b) Relevance: in terms of the number of reports found to be relevant by evaluators who focused explicitly on this criterion.

This can be likened to an inventory, which enables the Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section to determine what aspects of programming, planning and management, evaluators are failing to consider in their evaluations and/or what aspects programmatic staff have not accounted for in their planning and implementation.

This was an iterative process that required multiple readings of reports and result outputs, in order to demonstrate convergences and differences across the evaluation reports (McCormick et al, 2003; Thorne et al, 2004). It also required discussions with UNICEF and other key stakeholders for the purposes of clarification and analysis. In order to validate the coding process and ensure transparency, the coding documents were made available to the Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section.

1.2.3 Limitations

The original sample of reports in English language was not representative. In order to address this issue, during the inception phase the Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section identified French and Spanish reports for inclusion in this assessment. They were translated and coded in-house by UNICEF and included in the coding process.

In terms of scope, the assessment reviewed selected reports on programmes in transition/recovery contexts, emerging from conflict or emergency situations. However, it is important to note that this did not include a comprehensive discussion on the impact of emergencies on children or the nature of child protection programming in emergency situations, as another evaluation is currently being discussed by UNICEF’s Child Protection Section for this purpose.

Some evaluations were undertaken prior to the development of the Child Protection Strategy (2008) and/or did not employ the DAC/OECD criteria. In addition, some evaluations which were conducted post 2008, did not strictly follow the Strategy (2008). Some programmers and evaluators employed different terms and approaches, which did not necessarily adhere strictly to the child protection strategy. In order to account for this, a flexible analytical approach was adopted to allow for the inclusion of words, terms, approaches and themes that were not considered in the analytical framework.

It is important to bear in mind that this study does at best identify outputs. As many evaluations did not consider impact, this meta-synthesis was not able to draw concrete conclusions in this regard. Similarly, it was difficult to discuss attribution considering that most of the evaluators failed to analyse impact. The report does, however, contain some analysis of the gaps related to the evaluations available and their implications for future research and evaluation work. It also recommends that evaluations of UNICEF’s supported programmes try as much as possible to evaluate impact.

Reflexivity should also be considered in this meta-synthesis (Thorne et al, 2004). The findings that have been presented in the evaluation reports were influenced by the positioning of the UNICEF programmers and recipients in relation to the evaluators. This meta-evaluation adds another dimension as the consultant’s background, beliefs and experiences also influenced the way that the data is analysed and written up (Weed 2005). Attempts were made to minimize this bias and ensure validity, through ongoing consultation with the Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section. All deliverables were peer reviewed by the Reference Group which consisted of colleagues at Headquarters.
1.2.4 Quality of Evaluation Reports

Although the quality and the methodology of the reports varied, most evaluations focused on relevance and appropriateness, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and equity. The methodology employed by evaluators tended to include a desk review, in-depth interviews with programme managers, staff, stakeholders and donors. Some evaluations rested on qualitative interviews and focus group discussions with beneficiaries, while others included a quantitative component that involved surveys and use of control groups to measure impact and derive conclusions about attribution (See Appendix 4).

UNICEF regularly undertakes a quantitative quality assessment of evaluations. UNICEF ratings were available for 46 reports and the consultant rated the remaining to arrive at the following quality ranking: 27% were classified as poor, 48% as satisfactory, 23% as very good and 2% as excellent. The meta-analysis considered all 52 evaluations but in synthesizing findings, it gave greater weight to the evaluations that were of better quality and rigour as compared to the poor quality or incomplete reports.

The quality of evaluations was hindered by numerous challenges encountered by evaluators.

- **Limited programme data and poor documentation**: Many evaluators raised concerns about the scarce availability of programme data, specifically from monitoring and evaluation and financial data, which made it difficult for them to assess certain elements of the programme. For example, the evaluator of the Jamaican programme found gaps in the data for about 300 cases which were being entered into the database in November 2008.

- **Strategic documents**: As will be discussed many programmes failed to use Logical Programme Frameworks as a management and planning tool. Furthermore, in programmes where this tool was used, a number of weaknesses and gaps were identified. In addition to having a negative impact on the effectiveness, efficiency and relevance of programme strategies, it has hindered monitoring and evaluation processes. For example, when ‘means of verification’ are not listed in relation to indicators, data is often missing. The absence of a baseline hindered many attempts at measuring change in target communities. The absence of coherent internal programme logic, made it difficult for evaluators to determine whether programmes were meeting their objectives. For example, the evaluator of the West African programmes stated that as programme objectives were so loosely defined, achievements could not be easily gauged. In Liberia, as a set of indicators had not been formulated as part of the design of the programme, a set of impact indicators had to be designed specifically for the evaluation against which change could be measured.

- **Access** emerged as an issue in a number of evaluations. For instance, in Cambodia it was related to the timing of visits (which took place during the day when people were at work); location (rural and outlying areas were hard to reach due to poor road systems); and reluctance on the part of...
the client to discuss traumatic experiences. In Liberia, the evaluator found it difficult to access children formally associated with the armed forces who were not part of the reintegration programme, as a basis for comparison. It was also difficult to locate children who had dropped out of the skills training programme. In addition, they could not access certain isolated areas. In Uganda it was difficult to access former beneficiaries who had moved from the camp populations, through transit settlements and in some cases, back to their villages.

- **Resistance or discomfort of respondents**: In Cambodia enquiries on behalf of the donor were met with apprehension by those contracted to provide services. This was exacerbated by the fact that a previous enquiry conducted in 2007 into child protection activity within government had led to a phased withdrawal of donor support. As a result, some respondents perceived the evaluation as ‘an excuse for cost cutting’.

- **Funding limitations**: The evaluator of the child injury programme in China could not conduct a large scale end line survey to cover the entire target population so had to rely on data from the IMS system. Given high levels of patronage and corruption, respondents were less open about work and financial practices.

- **Bias**: In Vietnam, the evaluator did not have a say about the selection of communes/districts and participants because these decisions were made by programme staff, leading to an inherent bias. In addition, some interviews were conducted in the presence of programme staff that could influence the responses.

- **Translation**: In Cambodia some of the essence of meaning may have been lost as all interviews were translated from Khmer to English and vice versa.

- **Ethics**: Some evaluators faced ethical dilemmas in the field. For instance, a social worker had set up an interview with a 13 year old girl victim of trafficking who had recently been repatriated from Thailand to Cambodia. She was living alone at home and no responsible adult had been appointed to represent the child. Under these circumstances the evaluator rescinded the request to interview the child. On another occasion, the evaluator interviewed three unaccompanied children who had been repatriated, in the presence of a recognized and reputable NGO. The evaluator applied the UN guiding principles on what to do when coming into contact with victims of trafficking. An access agency conducted most of the interviews with adult victims. Only a few reports explicitly discuss the ethical protocol used in field work. Confidentiality was referred to in two reports. The Somalia report referred to the ‘do no harm’ principle i.e. do not conduct evaluation activities at the risk of the team’s security and well-being of respondents. The evaluator of the Tsunami programme stated that ethically he could not undertake a cost-effectiveness evaluation because it is not possible or desirable to attach a monetary value to – or

---

19 Ibid.
compare the costs of – a protected versus non-protected child. Instead his evaluations sought to determine trends in government support for child protection.  

- **Timing:** The evaluator of the New Delhi programme conducted the evaluation during the peak agricultural season (i.e. late October and early November) to learn more about seasonal child labour. This particular evaluation also had to be postponed due to unprecedented floods. In Vietnam field work was undertaken during school vacation which made it impossible for them to observe MRE classes and meet with teachers and children.

- **Timing – impact:** Some evaluations were conducted during the implementation phase, which meant that they could only highlight potential impacts instead of actual impacts. The evaluator of the Colombia programme stated that as the evaluation was conducted 6 months after the programme, it was difficult to locate respondents who knew of the programme especially since many had moved away. Nevertheless, spontaneous continuations of the programmes’ recreation activities made it possible to infer sustainability. The evaluation of the Somali programme was undertaken 5-10 months after the programme had ended. This meant that the evaluators could not observe or evaluate any ongoing activities, nor could they to trace beneficiaries.

- **Time available:** Many of the evaluators stated that the time allocated to data gathering was insufficient to allow for a comprehensive evaluation.

- **Security:** In Ethiopia the evaluators could not obtain security clearance from the United Nations to travel to selected field sites. Evaluators in Nepal met with serious security and logistical challenges due to the tense conflict environment. As a result, they were not able to conduct field work in certain communities. In Somalia, the team encountered similar challenges related to security and found information collection in this context to be severely restricted.

- **Gender:** Although the majority of respondents in Ethiopia were women, the evaluation team could not secure more than 4 female researchers, given low levels of literacy among women.

---

26 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
The 4 country mine action evaluation stated that the fact that less than half of the evaluation team was female could have resulted in a gender bias of information.33

- **Reflexivity:** Two evaluators discussed his/her personal and professional background and how this influences the research process.34 The evaluator of the Colombia programme stated that evaluations are not objective exercises as they involve concepts that have been determined in advance and judgments are made by evaluators in a subjective manner.35

- **Attribution:** Rapidly changing socio-economic conditions in Vietnam make it difficult to identify and attribute programme impacts.36 It was held that the existence of other programmes and government policies makes it difficult to attribute impact in West Africa to the UNICEF-supported programme.37 In Colombia the evaluator found it difficult to separate the effect of UNICEF support from that resulting from other interventions.38 The evaluator of the Tsunami programme stated that it is difficult to control for economic, political or other events that would have affected programme outcomes.39

- **Shifts in the scope of work:** The evaluator of the Mongolia programme stated that one challenge was ex post factor shifts in the evaluation scope, from assessing the JJ committee to a broader evaluation of legislative reform, capacity building and data collection activities.40

- **Confusion:** In Afghanistan the evaluators posed questions about the ‘Child Protection Sub Cluster’ which caused confusion as it did not exist in the Afghanistan context.41

- **Contextual challenges:** the political transition in the Maldives affected staffing and responsibilities in government, which in turn affected who was available for key informant interviews.42

- **Design:** The evaluators of the Vietnam programme stated that the sequencing of research activities should have been revised. Instead of conducting the KAP survey during the evaluation, they should have conducted it before so as to inform the development of tools for the interviews and focus group discussions.43

- **Support:** Extensive turnover of UNICEF staff caused challenges for the evaluator of the Uganda programme in terms of access to information, institutional memory, and logistic and technical assistance in the field.44

By extension, these challenges have made it difficult to synthesize the findings of the 52 evaluation reports. In some reports, activities and processes are described with no reference to results. In other reports, results are conflated with activities. Some reports failed to discuss issues pertaining to relevance

---

35 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
38 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
and sustainability in any depth, or made scant reference to equity and ethical soundness. Some evaluators failed to adopt a critical approach in relation to the programmes under review, in that they were completely descriptive or overly positive about impact. Many failed to contextualize their findings but instead provided an ahistorical and simplistic account of local realities, political issues and donor requirements. These challenges were also identified by Sheeran (2008), who described the 59 evaluations produced between 2002 and 2007 as inadequate because there was insufficient analysis of institutional contexts, scarce time-series information, and an overreliance on key informant interviews with an under emphasis on sampling and scale (pg. ii).

1.2.5 Ethics
An advisory committee consisting of UNICEF staff in child protection and evaluation had an opportunity to comment on the draft report before it was finalized. It is also important to note UNICEF’s Evaluation Policy which states that all evaluations should be shared publicly, unless very sensitive information is contained.

1.2.6 Report Structure
The report findings are divided into four substantive chapters (2-5) that examine child protection programming, programming principles, and cross-cutting issues/OECD/DAC criteria.

Chapter 2 commences with an analysis of the effectiveness of dominant child protection strategies examined against programme logical frameworks. This section includes a discussion of the scope, relevance, and effectiveness of dominant strategies.

Chapter 3 focuses on specific child protection strategies. The sections ‘strengthening child protection systems’ and ‘supporting social change’ provide an in-depth analysis of the effectiveness of child protection strategies in relation to results achieved. They also include a discussion on challenges, constraints and gaps as identified by the evaluators. Each section concludes with synthesized findings and lessons.

The chapter on programming principles and cross-cutting issues/OECD/DAC criteria (Chapter 4) discusses evidence based programming, results-based planning and management (including monitoring and evaluation, knowledge management, information and communications), participatory programming, efficiency (timeliness, cost and coordination), sustainability, equity and ethical soundness.

These chapters are followed by Chapter 5, which provides a set of conclusions and recommendations for future programming and evaluation. These recommendations should be considered alongside generalized lessons which have been included as Appendix 4. A separate document contains programme summaries, which should be used as reference material when reading the report.
Chapter 2: Findings on Dominant Child Protection Strategies

This chapter focuses on the effectiveness of child protection strategies and interventions supported by UNICEF Regional and Country Offices. Although the Child Protection Strategy (2008) informed the initial structure of this report, this assessment will not measure the effectiveness of these programmes against this strategy, nor will it discuss the effectiveness of the overall implementation of the Child Protection Strategy (2008). Instead, it will focus on the extent to which specific strategies and interventions have been effective in achieving their desired objectives and intended results, in terms of producing positive changes in the lives of children, their families and communities.

This section discusses dominant child protection strategies in terms of scope, relevance and effectiveness. Notably, this chapter serves as an introduction to the specific strategies employed in the programmes under review (See Section 2.2). Furthermore, a number of programmatic principles and cross-cutting strategies are introduced in this chapter and discussed in greater depth in Chapter 3; evidence-based planning, participatory programming, monitoring and evaluation, information sharing, knowledge management, and efficiency (cost, timeliness and coordination) are also discussed in Chapter 3.

2.1 Scope

‘Violence’ is a broad issue with many overlapping features and characteristics, as defined by Article 19 of the UN CRC (1989) and related articles. The scope of this meta-synthesis was to look at broad child protection issues that are not strictly considered to be ‘violence’ but that cause harm to children. Accordingly, the evaluations that UNICEF included in the sample (52 in total) look at a wide variety of interventions, namely those addressing harmful practices (5), children in residential care (5), recovery and transition from armed conflict (10), mine action (5), natural disasters (4), child labour (4), child trafficking and child migration (4), child abuse and exploitation (3), children living on the streets (3), and other topics (6). The sample includes evaluations from the global level and seven UNICEF programming regions45 (See Appendix 1 for List of Reports).

In order to prevent and respond to these child protection issues, the 52 programmes under review aimed to strengthen and support various aspects of the child protection system. Table 2 below highlights the complex distribution of programmes according to their objectives and strategic focus. It is important to note that some programmes addressed a number of different components and have therefore been counted more than once. Counts were not calculated when passing reference was made to an issue or objective, but when the programme had a specific strategy to achieve that objective.

Table 1: Distribution by programmatic areas/ focus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>No. of counts</th>
<th>Percentage out of 280 counts</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening child protection systems</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incorporating child protection into national and decentralized planning processes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Advocacy</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Technical assistance for legal policy reform</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Strengthening decentralized levels</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-total</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening the social welfare sector</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Capacity strengthening (strategic planning and human resources)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Capacity strengthening (infrastructure, communication and transportation)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Response services for children</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

45 WCARO (9), ESARO (8), ROSA (8), EAPRO (11), MENA (4), TACRO (5) and CEECIS (7).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Sub-total</th>
<th>28</th>
<th>10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supporting social protection reform</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Vocational training, income generation and job counselling</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Micro-credit</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Cash transfers</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening the justice sector for CP outcomes</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Victim support</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Targeting the perpetrators</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening the education sector for CP outcomes</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Capacity strengthening</td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Response services</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening mental health/psychosocial services for CP outcomes</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Capacity strengthening</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Response services</td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening the health sector for CP outcomes</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Capacity strengthening</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Response services</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening coordination amongst child protection system actors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Regional</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- National</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Decentralized</td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>21</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening Child Protection Systems Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening social change</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening the protective role of families</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Prevention and early intervention</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Response</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Return and reintegration</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Alternative care</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengthening the protective role of communities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Public education and social dialogue</td>
<td></td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Engaging the media</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Outreach and development activities</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Collaboration with local leaders</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Local volunteers and community based child protection groups</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>64</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child participation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Children in policy and programming</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Peer-to-peer education</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Encouraging private sector collaboration</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supporting Social Change Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>280</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 provides categorizes the programmes by their area of focus. As the 52 programmes have different objectives and strategies, they were counted more than once. The total number of counts 280. Of this number, it is interesting to note that the main area of focus was on strengthening the protective role of communities (23%), followed by efforts to incorporate child protection within national and decentralized planning processes (14%). When rolled up into large strategic areas, it is interesting to note that the majority (60%) of the programmes focused on child protection systems strengthening, when compared to 'social change' (40%). However, as argued in the previous chapter it is important to note that the line dividing social change from national child protection systems is both artificial and fluid. Given the overlapping nature of the strategic areas defined in the Child Protection Strategy (2008) it is impossible to categorize programmes on the basis of whether they strengthen child protection systems (e.g. laws, policies and services) or whether they support social change. Nevertheless, in terms of structure this report will use the broad categorization for the sake of consistency, but will focus more on the programmes’ specific strategies and areas of focus when commenting on effectiveness, relevance, efficiency and sustainable.

2.2 Relevance and Appropriateness

The overall strategic goal of all UNICEF child protection interventions is to protect children from harm; this includes both prevention and response components. However, each programme should be driven by an objective that is relevant to the requirements of beneficiaries (i.e., children, families and communities), country needs, global priorities, and partner and donors’ policies. Although the activities and processes which are used to ensure relevance and appropriateness are discussed in the subsequent chapter, this section focuses on the extent to which the 52 programmes under review were found to be relevant and appropriate by their evaluators. Table 3 categorizes programmes on the basis of whether they are relevant (yes), not relevant (no) or partly relevant (requires some improvements).

Table 2: Relevance and appropriateness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Relevant</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>It was needed nationally and in the community but it ignored the community's more pressing needs such as poverty, health, nutrition and child care.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme responded to identified needs and was in line with government strategies seeking to close residential facilities, promote family reunification and alternative care. Although the government engagement strategies were found to be relevant, the social protection (micro-credit) component was not appropriate, despite various attempts to strengthen it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme was relevant and appropriate as the problem of street children was a major issue of concern. However, in order to improve relevance (and effectiveness) the programme should strengthen its advocacy efforts and focus more on prevention.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme focused on an issue requiring urgent attention but a number of gaps in the programme design and implementation were identified such as the absence of a long term strategy, social protection, counselling, peer-to-peer education, measures to address child neglect. Furthermore it was held that more efforts need to be made</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Programme Area</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Residential care and child trafficking</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>Evidence suggests that the programme was targeted appropriately in line with the needs of children in residential institutions; however, as the programme focused narrowly on building the awareness and skills of children living in residential care, it failed to engage with the community and other civil society organizations promoting the reintegration of children formerly residing in residential care. This adversely affected the relevance of the programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Abandonment and residential care</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme filled in gaps in service provisions and offered an alternative to the dominant system of institutionalization.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The programme is consistent with government policies on deinstitutionalization and alternative care, it responds to national and international priorities, and the design was based on an in depth analysis of child protection needs in the country. The LogFrame was designed with the purpose of addressing major gaps identified in the system, from national policies and the provision of services, in order to respond more effectively and efficiently to the needs of children deprived of parental care.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>It was in line with laws and commitments made by the government. MRE was needed but the scope of the programme needed to be adapted to suit the local context in terms of geography (newly opened communities in the proximity of dangerous areas), targets (high risk groups such as those between 15-29 years), content (the effect of mines on road safety) and messages. The programme failed to transition adequately to a post-conflict situation with new issues to address such as internally displaced persons returning to mine infested communities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It responded to an identified need for psycho-social support in local communities. Furthermore the approach was found to be respectful of traditions and culture. All printed materials were culturally sensitive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child migration and child trafficking</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme is in line with UNICEF’s Mid-Term Strategic Paper (MTSP) (2002-2005) and the Regional Protection Strategy (RPS) for Child Protection. The programme was relevant because child migrants require assistance; however, its strategy was misplaced. It focused on systematically intercepting and sending home children</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

54 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups'. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
without addressing the reasons why children migrate or what happens to them at destination.\textsuperscript{55}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Programme Type</th>
<th>Success</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>There were few other organizations doing direct outreach with children and government services were found to be inadequate.\textsuperscript{56}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Gambia</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme was in line with international and national declarations/instruments. It was a human rights, gendered development issue that needed to be addressed. The strategies were valid and contextually relevant, but the programme failed to acknowledge the presence and contributions of other NGOs working on the same issue and therefore did not align its strategies accordingly.\textsuperscript{57}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The programme was consistent with the government’s strategic framework on deinstitutionalization (prevention, family reintegration and alternative care), it supported the deinstitutionalization process, it complemented the government’s social assistance program, it addressed the identified needs of mothers and its integrated approach was based on a package of services to respond to mothers’ complex needs.\textsuperscript{58}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The programme was consistent with national strategies and plans related to human development, poverty reduction and social welfare; its objectives were related to the goals of the programme of cooperation agreed between UNICEF and the government (‘Strengthen Social Protection Systems and Services), the 2002-2006 UNDAF goal (‘improving child rights and care, and reducing child and youth vulnerability’) and the MDG Goals 1 and 2.\textsuperscript{59}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It was designed on the basis of research into social and economic development in Beijing, and the prevalence of child injury in China. It was also based on international best practice and experience from other UNICEF Child Protection programmes.\textsuperscript{60}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It was highly relevant to the needs of communities and the need for wider policy reform. The decision to include environmental modifications was highly appropriate given the immediate needs in communities, schools and households.\textsuperscript{61}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Bosnia Herzegovina| Child protection reform | Partly  | It was relevant to UNICEF’s country goals to improve mechanisms of child protection and country programme outcomes (provision of inclusive, non-discriminatory and child-friendly services to the most disadvantaged children) as well as UNDAF Outcome 2 (improved access and quality of education, health and social protection services). It responded to the need for overall reform of the child welfare system nationally and at municipal level. By


\textsuperscript{59} Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.


focusing solely on child protection it differed from similar programmes undertaken in the past. An extensive needs analysis and a review of other programmes was undertaken but the lessons learnt were not sufficiently integrated into the design of the programme. Instead, programme strategies were replicated without reviewing how they should be adapted to this particular programme.\(^{62}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Programme Type</th>
<th>Addressed by</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Girl child labour</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It responds to high levels of child and gendered abuse and exploitation as supported by a desk review and household survey. The integrated project approach was highly relevant given the range of societal and systemic factors that influence child labour. In addition, it was designed on the basis of a previous phase, which revealed the importance of an integrated and multi-pronged approach that addressed the issue on various fronts, including the child, parents, community, employer and government systems.(^{63})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The objectives are in line with international instruments such as the UN CRC (1989) and reports such as the UN Report on Violence Against Children (2006). A literature review found that violence is a concern for children in Jamaica and therefore should be addressed. The programme complements the role of other government and civil society actors.(^{64})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>School violence</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The programme responded to high levels of violence in schools. It built on the lessons of related programmes in schools in Serbia and was adapted from a similar programme implemented in Croatia.(^{65})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour and basic education</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It was relevant to the Education For Al Dakar Framework, the MDGs, UN CRC and the ILO Convention 182; nationally to both the National Plan of Action and government policy. ‘Urban working children’ was identified as an important issue to address in the context based on a literature review and review of the national child labour survey. The design also took into consideration the unique needs of these beneficiaries.(^{66})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It responded to the findings of the UN CRC Committee in relation to the poor and inhumane treatment of children in conflict with the law.(^{67})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>There was a high incidence of mine related injuries. The programme was in line with UNICEF’s long-standing programme on MRE.(^{68})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>Children affected by</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Research found that the armed conflict had a significant effect on children’s psychosocial wellbeing so there was a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Affected by Armed Conflict</th>
<th>Result</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme in Nepal was designed on the basis of a community-based assessment, but there were still gaps in information such as patterns of recruitment or the experience of children while associated with the armed group. Although there is a clear need for child protection program, this programme was premised on false assumptions pertaining to a mass release of children from cantonments. This had a negative effect on the approach, timing and budget. Nevertheless, the programme was context-specific, flexible and responsive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The activities were relevant to the needs of the wider population and provided them with much needed basic standard of services. Further adaptations were made to plans to meet the challenges of the changing context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Extensive preparations were undertaken to assist separated children as an outcome of the war. However, planners failed to consider the strength of social networks within Iraq which meant that it was unlikely that there would be large numbers of separated children. As a result UNICEF and inter-agency child protection programme “Was wrong-footed by the outcome of the war”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Messages were designed on the basis of findings from the 2007 KAP survey and from data collected from the VAE injury surveillance system. The mine action programme complements the activities of other organizations. However, more efforts should be undertaken to target marginalized populations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>There was a need for this emergency, recovery and transition programme. The approach was guided by UNICEF’s Core Commitments to Children in Emergencies. Directives on rapid assessment, psychosocial support and separated children were most relevant. Its transition from a service delivery approach to an institutional and capacity building approach in the recovery phase was relevant. However, given the limited pool of local expertise, assessment exercises were conducted by international consultations. Their findings and recommendations were not relevant to the local context. For example, emphasis was placed on post-traumatic stress symptomology rather than family and community supports. In addition, the lack of community development expertise within UNICEF meant that engagement with local communities and beneficiaries in planning and decision-making was weak.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The programme was relevant to urgent protection needs and was guided by UNICEF’s Core Commitments to...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>However, early response assessments failed to focus on the social and economic conditions that impact on child protection. This led to the limited scope of the formal tracing and reunification program, and the response to secondary child-family separation. In addition, the categorization of children into separated, unaccompanied and orphaned categories was not relevant in this context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme responded to need as identified in situational assessments and consultation. It was in line with the strategic purposes of the Country Plan. It was appropriate to the capacity and commitment of government. However, the engagement of children in shaping strategic agendas and programme was weak, engagement with the community level actors was limited and the campaign messages were not culturally sensitive.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia, Ethiopia,</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The approach to child protection systems strengthening was appropriate and coherent in light of UNICEF’s national priorities and global strategic objectives. It is in line with the UN CRC, CEDAW and other international strategies. Needs assessments were undertaken in the design phase. Although the decision to focus on MRE was relevant, the needs of mine victims/survivors was not considered or included in programme plans.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Research identified FGM/C as an important issue to address. The holistic approach adopted by the programme was found to be highly appropriate as it included lessons on good governance, democracy, human rights, problem solving, health and hygiene, literacy, child/forced marriages, and the empowerment of men and women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It responded to the need expressed by parents, children and stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>It responded to the need to standardize country prevention activities, to fight against child abuse and to provide assistance to child abuse victims. It was in line with the UNCRC and other international commitments, and it encouraged partnerships and stakeholder engagement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

77 Ibid.
80 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions (Evaluation du Programme de promotion de l’abandon des MGF mis en œuvre par le MASEF dans 3 régions à haute prévalence).
82 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Reason</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme was designed on the basis of identified needs; however, it did not allow for flexibility of approach to account for the complexity of the phenomenon. 83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The programme was relevant because it encouraged high levels of women’s participation, the selection of villages was based on socio-economic profiling and many community members were familiar with the organization. 84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>Violence</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The activities proposed in the programmes were appropriate for the development of psychosocial skills, but there was a need to give greater emphasis to the analysis of activities based on non-violent conflict resolution and its relationship to everyday life. Additional recommendations were made by the evaluator to strengthen the content of the courses. 85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The objectives of the programme were found to be highly relevant as they were in line with the MDGs, the ILO Conventions 138 and 182, the UN CRC and the government’s strategic plans. The decision to focus on prevention was found to be appropriate. 86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>The programme served vulnerable children in Colombia. It was line with national public policies related to the issue of forced recruitment of children and adolescents, and their demobilization from illegal armed groups. It was also in line with UNICEF’s Country Programme (2008-2012), UNICEF’s Child Protection Strategy (2008) and those of other donors including SIDA, CIDA and the German Cooperation Agency (GTZ). It focused specifically on regions where recruitment was a concern and the design was based on a general knowledge of the situation of children, adolescents and young people although no specific tests were performed in communities. Adaptations to the methodology were made over time. Special adaptations were made when working with indigenous communities in relation to socio-cultural beliefs. 87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Sexual Violence</td>
<td>Partly</td>
<td>The programme responded to high levels of sexual violence in country; however, it was not informed by an in-depth assessment into the situation, in some cases programmes were adapted from international contexts and some of the objectives and approaches were not relevant given weaknesses in the child protection system. 88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

83 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
84 Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviors in Rural Areas of Senegal. Senegal.
85 Evaluation of the External Program, “Against Violence….We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”; Evaluacion del Proyecto “Contra la Violencia, Eduquemos para la Paz, por Ti, por Mi y por Todo el Mundo”. Mexico.
87 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
Out of 43 reports which explicitly discussed relevance, 23 number were found to be relevant, 19 partly relevant, and 1 not relevant. Numerous examples across the report will reveal the extent to which programme objectives, activities and materials were not relevant or appropriate for the local context. For example, in Bosnia-Herzegovina it was held that municipal plans were not tailored to the socio-economic context. In the context of social protection programmes, it was found that some vocational activities are not appropriate for young children who should be receiving education. It was also found that social protection programmes should take into account the socio-economic context and ensure alignment with broader poverty-alleviation efforts. Evaluators argued that programmes in Nigeria and Liberia were not relevant because they were not based on market assessments (see evidence-based planning), they duplicated existing skills training activities, and they did not contribute to broader development plans.

Cash transfer programmes often failed to consider the different ways in which cash would be interpreted by individuals, families and communities. Training modules for social workers and health practitioners in different contexts were also described as inappropriate because they were not based on an understanding of local understandings of child protection, professional practices and systemic constraints nor were they offered in the local language. Instead it appeared that concepts and approaches were simply being recycled from other contexts. In Nepal, the evaluator described psychosocial assistance as a “new concept” in that region. This suggests that it was imposed on local communities and this has had a direct impact on the effectiveness of the programme. In particular, there were no referral mechanisms or institutions to whom children could be referred. Messages in a range of awareness-raising programmes were found to be irrelevant and inappropriate because they did not consider local realities, concepts and terms.

As is evident from the comments in the box above, there are a number of ways of ensuring that programmes remain relevant and appropriate programme. The objectives and approach should be consistent with national priorities, legal policy frameworks and international obligations, as well as with UNICEF's country, regional and global child protection strategies. Objectives must be based on an identifiable need at national and community levels, as can be ascertained by a review of previous literature, a needs assessment or situational analysis, a mapping of related program, and consultation with stakeholders and potential beneficiaries (adults and children). Efforts should be made to ensure that these activities are undertaken by local partners who are familiar with the economic, political, social and cultural context. A comprehensive situational analysis will build a clearer profile of the strategic direction of the programme. In other words, it could assist in the identification of objectives, strategies and target results. For instance, in Morocco the programme did not undertake a needs assessment to identify the extent to which children were involved in the crafts industry, and as a result the programme was overambitious in identifying the number of children it could remove from this industry and integrate into schooling. Strategic plans should indicate a degree of flexibility and adaptability to facilitate rapid responses to changes in circumstances. This is evident in the examples below:

- In Upper Egypt, when partner NGOs felt that the original design which focused only on FGM/C was not appropriate, UNICEF introduced other activities such as hygiene awareness and Avian

---

98 Evaluation of the pilot project "Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector" in Marrakech.
Flu awareness campaigns that gave credibility to local NGOs working on this programme at community level.\textsuperscript{100}

- During vocational training in Tajikistan, it was evident that trainees were not ready for the micro-credit component. As a result, UNICEF, Mercy Corps and NABW adjusted the programme by increasing the training budget and reducing the amount set aside for credit. They also expanded the target group to include families who were at risk of institutionalizing their children in neighbouring districts. Despite this, the uptake of the loans was small, so the programme tried to target businesses and offer them loans for providing employment to people from UNICEF’s target group. After work experience they would be offered credit. This was not successful as few businesses wanted to hire people from the target group and few employed people wanted to leave and start up their own business. So the programmers tried to adapt the programme further, by offering credit to families in rural areas to buy animals. However, the beneficiaries were concerned that they would not be able to repay their loans.\textsuperscript{101}

- The drop-in centre in Lao PDR was not initially designed to provide accommodation to children, but after the police started to incarcerate street children in November 2004 to ‘beautify’ the city for the ASEAN Summit, the programme started to provide temporary night shelter. Other adaptations during the course of this programme include the establishment of a motor bike repair workshop and training restaurant, the initiation of a mobile school to reduce the numbers of new children coming on to the streets, and the development of a home-based production scheme where children and parents could work together producing handicraft items.\textsuperscript{102}

In addition, the programme must be designed in consultation with local stakeholders, often with guidance from external experts. In a number of reports, evaluators raised concerns about international consultants designing programmes; it is held that this leads to a disconnect between the programmes and local cultures and realities. It is constructive to model programmes using standard UNICEF approaches and tools that have been utilized in other countries, although it is important to adapt them to the local context in consultation with local actors.\textsuperscript{103} It is important to implement programmes with the participation of major institutional stakeholders and beneficiaries to obtain buy in and ensure ownership at the outset.\textsuperscript{104} The programme should be implemented in partnership with local actors and in alignment with existing programmes, so as to avoid duplication and to ensure complementary approaches.

Furthermore, it is essential to design programmes based on identified needs, and not on the interests and influence of the donors. For instance in Somalia, a nationwide study on child rights issues in 2004 revealed that the problem of child combatants constitutes only 5% of the total and was therefore low in comparison with countries such as Sudan, Liberia and Sierra Leone. However, UNICEF Somalia accepted the request from CIDA to get engaged in a Child Soldier Rehabilitation and Reintegration Project.\textsuperscript{105}

2.3 Dominant Strategies by Child Protection Issue

This section discusses the effectiveness of dominant strategies, by child protection issue. Programme strategies are summarized in the tables below with reference to comments provided by the evaluators. This informed an effectiveness rating in which the following classification was used: one is not effective, two is partly effective, and three is effective. Effectiveness rests on the extent to which the programmes have been able to fulfil their objectives.

\textsuperscript{102} Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.
13% were not effective, 67% partly effective and 19% effective. It is important to note that these ratings were, however, affected by the quality of the evaluations as discussed above. Some evaluations failed to adopt a critical position towards the programmes under review, thereby skewing the results.

Table 3: Effectiveness by child protection issue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Not effective</th>
<th>Partly effective</th>
<th>Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child migration and trafficking</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children living and working on the streets</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child abuse and sexual violence</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violence in schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National systems strengthening</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAAFAG</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MRE</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural disaster</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of reports</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each table is followed by a discussion of the dominant strategies or strategic debates pertaining to that specific issue. A comprehensive discussion of the synthesized lessons learnt for each child protection issue is beyond the scope of this report; however, subsequent sections discuss specific strategies in greater depth.

Harmful practices

Table 4: Effectiveness of programmes addressing harmful practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Effectiveness ranking</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Issue specific (FGM/C)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
21%. However, the strategy was flawed because the programme was not integrated into government-led national campaigns; focusing on harmful medical effects led to the medicalization of FGM/C; the programme was not integrated in other development or social protection projects that would have given it credibility and ensured that it wasn’t seen as an alien intervention.

Gambia | Addressed FGM/C through broader intersectoral and developmental lens (e.g. health, sexual reproductive health, hygiene, birth registration, human rights, literacy, good governance). Social change: awareness raising and community mobilization | 3 | The evaluator described the programme as effective. The broader developmental approach was found to be successful because it addressed the real needs of community members. Non-formal and education and social mobilization culminated into “public and collective consensus” to abandon harmful practices as was evident in a public declaration in June 2009. Procedural and resource challenges particularly in relation to NGO partnerships, were, however identified.

Mauritania | Addressed FGM/C and early marriage through broader intersectoral and developmental lens. Social change: awareness raising and community mobilization | 3 | In Mauritania, information was brought to more than 206,555 individuals in three wilayas through the MASEF programme. More than 72% of the population supported the abandonment of the practice. The quantitative survey found that the population’s level of awareness of the programme is high (in some communities 86-89%). A number of people interviewed stated that they are now convinced that FGM/C is “a custom which has nothing to do with Islam”. The Tostan programme reached more than 32 000 people in 30 initial communities and 22 ‘adopted’ villages. Awareness of the programme was high in these communities (92%). 78 communities declared their abandonment of FGM/C in May 2010. The evaluator of the programme in Mauritania argued that the programme was successful in raising awareness and mobilizing communities but it failed to harness the support of government actors. It was recommended that the programme increase the capacity of national actors, strengthen legal frameworks and advocate for financial investments from the state to ensure sustainability.

Senegal | Addressed FGM/C and early marriage through broader intersectoral and developmental lens Social | 2 | The programme in Senegal contributed to a better understanding of the issues and the beginning of change process behaviour in communities. The survey
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Change: awareness raising and community mobilization</th>
<th>Reflected a decline in the practice of early marriages in villages in the past five years. It also found a shift in views on early marriage and FGM/C. Fewer women justified circumcision for religious or social reasons. Gender discrimination was also reported to be low in targeted villages. Positive impacts were also reflected in child survival, birth registration and education. Despite these successes, the evaluator stated that early marriage is still practiced and is furthered by fears of pregnancy before marriage. Structural barriers (e.g. geographical accessibility) inhibit access to health and education services despite awareness-raising campaigns. The evaluator recommended greater strategic partnerships with other government and NGO actors. Particular attention should be paid to the cultural, health, infrastructural and economic context.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The strategy of disseminating information on constitutional rights and other legal instruments at a community level, enhanced community members' understanding of women and girls' rights and the adverse effects of FGM/C and violence against women. The programme enhanced the capacity of Women Affairs Offices to fulfil international and national obligations. Training on mainstreaming was described as an effective way of sharing information with policy and decision-making officials and for creating an enabling environment to promote gender issues at regional and local levels. Reference was made to an increased tendency for line offices to take responsibility to address gender concerns. Teachers in schools and officials in the justice sector were also said to be more responsive. However, the Women Affairs Offices were not proactive in furthering women's issues, could not influence policy and decision-making, failed to network with other actors and in terms of community dialogue, did not reach out to all the villages in their regions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Issue specific or intersectoral programming:** When seeking to reduce or eradicate harmful practices, some programmes focused on a specific issue such as FGM/C (Upper Egypt, Ethiopia, the Gambia, Mauritania, Senegal) and early marriage (Ethiopia, Mauritania), while other programmes expanded the scope to address violence against women and children (Ethiopia) or other developmental issues (Ethiopia, the Gambia, Mauritania, Senegal) such as health, sexual reproductive health, hygiene, birth
registration, human rights, literacy and good governance. At a strategic level it was found that the latter approach was more effective in changing norms and behaviour.

The Ethiopian programme included the issue of FGM/C within broader interventions on violence against women and children, and gender mainstreaming. The strategy of disseminating information on constitutional rights and other legal instruments at a community level, enhanced community member’s understanding of women and girls’ rights generally and the adverse effects of FGM/C more specifically. In the Gambia where broader developmental issues were discussed, the evaluator found the approach to be appropriate and effective because it addressed the real needs of community members. Non-formal education and social mobilization culminated into a “public and collective consensus” to abandon harmful practices as was evident in a public declaration in June 2009. Similarly, in Senegal the programme had a positive effect at a broader developmental level and on the specific issue of FGM/C and early marriage. It contributed to a better understanding of the issues and the beginning of change process behaviour in communities. The survey reflected a decline in the practice of early marriages in villages in the past five years. It also found a shift in views on early marriage and FGM/C. Fewer women justified circumcision for religious or social reasons. Gender discrimination was also reported to be low in targeted villages. In addition, positive impacts were also reflected in relation to child survival, birth registration and education.

In contrast, in Upper Egypt the programme was partly effective in meeting its objectives. The evaluator found that some families were thoroughly aware of the programme’s aims and more informed of the harms and opposing it, while others more ambivalent, unsure, or continued to support it. Working with individual families was found to be very effective. However, it was argued by the evaluator that focusing only on FGM/C has led to considerable resistance from the community.

A number of evaluators recommended the inclusion of social protection or intersectoral activities within broader child protection strategies, or the incorporation of child protection outcomes in social protection strategies. With reference to Upper Egypt, the evaluator of the FGM/C programme stated that in order to overcome the suspicion that the FGM/C Abandonment Programme (FGM/CAP) is a ‘western conspiracy’ it should be integrated with activities that address the community’s challenges such as poverty and unemployment. This is supported by the findings of the Somalia evaluation where it was found that in locations where the CPCM programme was implemented in conjunction with other UNICEF interventions such as water, education or health and/or where communities had access to other services, there was a higher level of participation and commitment to the programme and child protection principles. The evaluator of the Gambia programme stated that the main weakness of the Tostan strategy was the absence of a skills training component, support for infrastructural development, agricultural input and micro finance.

Systems strengthening or social change: In order to eradicate harmful cultural practices, the majority of programmes focused on promoting social change (Upper Egypt, the Gambia, Mauritania, Senegal) while the Ethiopian programme focused on systems strengthening (Ethiopia). In terms of the former, the strategy rested on awareness-raising and community mobilization, while the latter involved strengthening of national and decentralized levels of government. It was evident that both strategies had advantages and disadvantages.

With regards to Upper Egypt, the programme was effective in raising awareness in targeted communities, but the evaluator stated that it would have been more effective if there was greater engagement with national processes. For example, the awareness raising campaign could have been integrated into the government-led national campaign. Similarly in the evaluator of the programme in Mauritania argued that the programme was successful in raising awareness and mobilizing communities but it failed to harness the support of government actors. It was recommended that the programme increase the capacity of national actors, strengthen legal frameworks and advocate for financial investments from the state to ensure sustainability. The need for greater strategic partnerships with government actors was also highlighted in the Senegalese evaluation. Despite the successes described above, the evaluator stated

that early marriage is still practiced. Structural barriers (e.g. geographical accessibility) inhibit access to health and education services despite awareness-raising campaigns. Hence, in order to improve the impact of the programme it is necessary to engage with government actors in overcoming these barriers at systems level.

However, focusing only on systems strengthening also has its limitations. In the Ethiopian evaluation it was found that the programme enhanced the capacity of Women Affairs Offices to fulfil international and national obligations. Training on mainstreaming was described as an effective way of sharing information with policy and decision-making officials and for creating an enabling environment to promote gender issues at regional and local levels. However, the Women Affairs Offices were not proactive in furthering women’s issues, could not influence policy and decision-making, failed to network with other actors and in terms of community dialogue did not reach out to all the villages in their regions. This suggests that a holistic programme that centres on systems strengthening and social change is needed.

**Rights-based or health-based strategy:** The evaluator of the programme in Upper Egypt stated that focusing on the health risks associated with FGM/C has had unintended consequences. Instead of discouraging community members from using the practice, it has led them to turn to doctors to undertake FGM/C. As doctors are respected members of the community, this has caused confusion among community members. On this basis, the evaluator has discouraged the medicalization of this issue. In contrast, in Mauritania it was held that the focus should shift more to the harmful health effects of FGM/C and the programme should engage more with medical practitioners as this might encourage community members to renounce the practice.

**Residential care:**

**Table 5: Effectiveness of programmes addressing residential care**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Finding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>The programme aimed to reduce the number of children placed in institutions and to prevent unnecessary new admissions in the pilot institutions. The strategy was focused on systems strengthening (establishing child protection department at local government level, training social workers, national policy guidelines and creating alternative care programmes, which included a social protection component)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The evaluator noted a reduction in requests for placement of children in residential care and a reduction in the numbers of children admitted. Reference was also made to the numbers of children who have been reintegrated with their families and the transformation of institutions into schools, emergency accommodation and boarding schools. The programme also introduced new notions of social work practice. However, the programme failed to meet certain objectives. For instance, policy development at national level was slow; the micro credit scheme was not successful and seen as inappropriate when basic services are needed; the training and support rendered to social workers was inadequate; and the prevention facilities (e.g. day care centre and parent education centred) lacked effective coordination with other actors. The evaluator recommended greater attention to national policy development and engagement with other NGOs and CSOs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>The two programmes reviewed in the evaluation aimed at preventing additional children from entering residential care</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>At a legal policy level the programme was party successful in that it promoted legal policy reform and the establishment of coordination committees. However, there were shortcomings in the draft legislation,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>The programme aimed to reduce the institutionalization of children through implementation of the State Programme on De-institutionalization. Its specific objective was to provide technical support to the government to mainstream the principle of the child’s right to be brought up in a family-like environment.</td>
<td>Technical support outputs included legal policy reform, the establishment of coordination structures and working groups, and an assessment of residential institutions. The number of children in these institutions reportedly declined by 563 in a two year period. However, the evaluator identified a number of strategic gaps. There was a lack of instruction on fund diversion from residential institutions to families and a lack of support to pilot initiatives of alternative care services (e.g. foster families, day care centres for children with special needs, provisions for vulnerable families).</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>The objective of the programme was to facilitate the psychosocial integration of pupils from institutions through life skills development to reduce the risk of unemployment and trafficking in human beings. The strategy included workshops for managers, staff and children using interactive, participatory and</td>
<td>3,049 children aged 10-17 years from 11 institutions were said to have benefitted from the skills development programme. The methods were described as very successful in producing changes in staff and children in relation to knowledge, skills and attitudes. The impact of the programme on unemployment and trafficking in human beings as specified in the programme objective was not measured.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Scope</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Moldova   | The programme sought to prevent the abandonment of 300 children from 100 families in difficulty; support the deinstitutionalization of 20 children from the residential care system; and develop a professional parental assistants network through the placement of 10 children in difficult situations. | Scope: In the United Nations endorsed Guidelines for the Alternative Care of Children (General Assembly A/HRC/11/L.13, 15 June 2009) deinstitutionalization is defined broadly in terms of ‘preventing the need for alternative care’ by means of policies and programmes that promote parental care and prevent family separation, family reintegration, and finding alternative sources of care that are in children’s best interests. In other words, “efforts to keep children in, or return them to, the care of their family or, failing this, to find another appropriate and permanent solution.” In terms of prevention, the guidelines refer to the state’s responsibility to develop and implement comprehensive child welfare and protection policies, to support family care-giving environments, to provide appropriate care and protection for vulnerable children and to tackle discrimination. In terms of return and reintegration, the guidelines argue that an overall deinstitutionalization strategy should be developed that provides alternatives to large residential care facilities. Family reintegration should be encouraged by preparing the child and family for possible return, undertaking a detailed assessment of the child and family, supervising a gradual reintegration process and providing ongoing follow-up and support. Hence, deinstitutionalization has been broadly defined to include prevention, family reintegration and alternative care (informal and formal). In the evaluations under review, the scope of deinstitutionalization and residential care programmes varied.  

The programme in Moldova (2003-2004) sought to facilitate the ‘psychosocial’ integration of pupils from residential care facilities through life skills development so as to reduce the risk of unemployment and trafficking in human beings. This programme did not (a) try to prevent institutionalization (b) promote the development of alternatives to institutions or (c) facilitate family reunification. It was therefore very narrow in scope.  

In Azerbaijan, the programme entitled ‘Child Welfare Reform’ (2006-2007) was designed and implemented to support the State Programme on De-Institutionalisation and Alternative Care (2006-2015). It focused on the “reintegration of children currently residing in various state institutions with biological or foster families, and on the creation of alternative care services to support the de-institutionalization process”. However, this programme did not include a prevention component.  

The ‘De-institutionalisation Project’ (2004-2005) in Tajikistan aimed to “to reduce the number of children placed in institutions and to prevent unnecessary new admissions in the pilot institutions”. In terms of the former it aimed to reduce the number of children in institutions by facilitating the closure of residential
facilities, encouraging poor parents to take their children home and aiding family reunification. Prevention on the other hand, was interpreted to mean the establishment of a gate-keeping system to prevent children who are in need of child protection services from entering institutions and the development of a micro-credit scheme. Although the evaluator found a reduction in requests for placement and the number of children admitted to institutions (e.g. in Gafurov requests declined from 120 in 2004 to 6 in 2005, and 22 admissions in 2004 and no admissions in 2005), it was recommended that prevention be expanded to include counselling for children and parents, monitoring of pregnant women at risk of abandoning their children, family planning, hotline services, day care centres and resource centres. So although this programme included a prevention component it did not try to ‘prevent the need for alternative care’, which is explicitly included in the Guidelines described above.

Two programmes interpreted ‘deinstitutionalization’ more broadly to include a prevention component targeting children, their families and communities. In a programme (2002-2004) in Moldova in addition to the family reintegration of children (29) from residential facilities, the programme established a ‘Family Support and Abandonment Prevention Service’ which assisted 165 families with 300 children. This service offered support (material, financial aid and counselling) to families and children living in difficult circumstances for a maximum of 6 months so as to prevent the need for abandonment or alternative care. This programme also established a Parental Assistance Service for children from institutions or children for whom institutionalization appeared inevitable.

The two projects (2002-2006) discussed in the Georgia evaluation also adopted a broad definition of ‘deinstitutionalization’ in line with the Alternative Guidelines (2009) discussed above. The Family Support and Foster Care Project (FS&FC) and Prevention of Infant Abandonment and De-institutionalization Project (PIAD) in Georgia shared a two-fold objective which aimed at preventing additional children from entering residential care and at reintegrating children already there by (a) addressing causes of child abandonment and (b) creating family-based alternatives to institutional care. Activities included employment and training of the country’s first cadre of social workers, delivery of gate-keeping services, cash assistance to vulnerable families and foster parents, material assistance, counselling, establishment of a mother and infant shelter, employment and business support, mediation, fostering, adoption and family reintegration. Legal policy reform and the establishment of coordination committees were important components of these projects. However, there were shortcomings in the draft legislation, the government promoted the rapid closure of institutions before establishing a continuum of services and there was intersectoral confusion. It was feared that the hasty closure of institutions could mean that children would be transferred from one institution to another.

In both the Tajikistan and Georgian programmes where social protection was selected as the prevention strategy, evaluators argued that it was not appropriate or relevant when basic services are needed. Instead it was recommended that an integrated package of services, that includes shelter and employment support would have better addressed beneficiaries’ needs.

Hence, it is evident that programmes centred on ‘deinstitutionalization’ varied in scope. When reading the report it is important to recognise the varied interpretations of the word ‘deinstitutionalization’, which do not necessarily coincide with the manner in which it is defined in the UN endorsed Alternative Care Guidelines (2009). Efforts will be made to qualify this term throughout the report.

Child migration and trafficking

Table 6: Effectiveness of programmes addressing child migration and trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>In Year 1 the project sought to protect and reintegrate marginalized and migrant children in collaboration with authorities, and to strengthen the capacity of staff and government</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The programme was effective in the following components: repatriation and reintegration of Cambodian and Laos children; vocational training and non-formal education for children and mothers; referrals from the community; assistance from street members in keeping children safe; and enhancing children’s access</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
partners. In Year 2 additional objectives were added, namely to improve data collection and monitoring of migrant and other marginalized children and youth, and to ensure the protection and reintegration of these children in collaboration with authorities. The strategy involved working in shelters and drop-in centres, community-based outreach services, vocational training to impoverished parents and a Child Safe Network to facilitate referrals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Cambodia</th>
<th>Nigeria, Burkina Faso and Mali</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>The programme sought to enhance the identification, return and reintegration of child and adult victims of trafficking by means of capacity building of government actors and in providing direct support to children and families.</td>
<td>The overall programme objective was to “fight against child trafficking through prevention and interception, followed by measures to accompany, rehabilitate and reintegrate child victims”. In Nigeria, the specific objectives focused on addressing underlying causes of child trafficking, exploitation and abuse and the prevalence of HIV/AIDS through health and vocational training centres for youth. In Burkina Faso, the programme focused on advocacy, capacity building, service delivery and behavioural change communication to address child trafficking and child labour. In Mali the programme focused on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td>The programme was not effective in terms of advocacy and awareness-raising; the development of multi-guidance materials; engaging with or building the capacity of government; and forging partnerships with other actors in children’s countries of origin. This has meant that the programme was not able to follow-up and provide support to children who were repatriated.</td>
<td>The programme provided specific but limited training in the provision of support to vulnerable people and basic case management strategies. However, in reality the reintegration and follow-up support was not provided and in many cases the mandated government agency relied on NGO partners. Despite access to training, case management and documentation was poor. Furthermore, the evaluator stated the programme did not adequately address the underlying causes of migration and trafficking.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
developing a legal policy framework to reduce the number of child victims of abuse, violence, exploitation and trafficking.

The programme aimed to conduct surveillance, investigation and rescue child victims of exploitation and trafficking.

The evaluator found that the programme was relevant given the prevalence of child trafficking and exploitation. Concerns were raised that the immediate reactions of children range from fear that they will be put in jail to anger because they were prevented from earning a living after immediate rescue. The impact on children’s lives was difficult to assess because of gaps in the monitoring of reintegration. The provision of psychosocial and other protective services was found to be relevant and responsive, benefiting 1,840 children. However, there were gaps in terms of medical and psychosocial services to children. Reintegration of trafficked children was described as difficult given the absence of local counterparts to effectively monitor and provide support services. The study recommended improving the monitoring of this component as well as family and community based approaches to reunification.

Identification versus ‘interception’: In order to identify vulnerable children, it is very important to come up with contextually specific understandings of vulnerability and a sound strategy for identifying and engaging these children. This strategy needs to be based on the principle of the best interests of the child while also recognizing children’s own agency i.e. decision-making ability. In order to secure children’s consent to being removed from a risky situation, it is imperative that children are informed of the risk, explained the procedures and treated in a respectful and child-friendly manner. Unfortunately, this was not always the case in the programmes under review. The evaluator of the Philippines programme stated that when intercepted at the ports before being taken to the half-way houses, children immediately react from fear that they will be incarcerated or anger that they won’t be able to earn a living after immediate rescue. Stakeholders stated that these reactions are normal and should not outweigh the greater benefit of preventing or removing children from abuse, exploitation and trafficking. In contrast, this evaluator stated that the outreach team was more successful in identifying vulnerable children living on the streets and encouraging them to visit the drop in centre. She stated that this supports the notion that children cannot be forcibly removed from the street. The same point is made by the evaluator of the Burkina Faso and Mali programmes with reference to the manner in which unaccompanied child migrants are ‘intercepted’ and prevented from travelling further, without due consideration of their rights and need to migrate, which for many children may be to escape abuse or to generate income to ensure their own survival and that of their families. The manner in which children in the Philippines and Burkina Faso programmes were identified and intercepted suggests that these programmes are not serving children’s best interests, regardless of whether they achieved their intended outcomes. This is largely because the objectives themselves (i.e. to prevent and stop child migration) are ethically questionable. These

---

110 Ibid.
programmes are failing to recognize that the main problem is not children’s migration itself, but the associated violation of rights. ‘Children on the move’ require protection because evidence suggests that their rights are being violated in their communities of origin, in transit and at destination, and even at the hands of practitioners who purport to protect them. The discourse on ‘prevention’ should be shifted to ‘safe migration’ for children on the move where there is a greater recognition of children’s agency: many use migration as a coping mechanism and source of survival in contexts characterized by a range of adversities. This agency has been masked by an overarching emphasis on child trafficking as is evident in the fact that 3 out of the 4 programmes under review focused on the latter.

Child trafficking and children on the move: At a conceptual level it is important to note that there has been a recent shift in discourse on child trafficking to ‘children on the move’ but there is confusion surrounding this term particularly since there is no standard legal policy definition for this general concept, but internationally recognized definitions for sub-categories such as refugees, trafficked children, separated and unaccompanied children. A number of the programmes under review focus on these separate categories but fail to consider them within the broader heading ‘children on the move’. It is useful to refer to the broad definition of ‘children on the move’ as adopted by Bissell (2008). In a concept note for UNICEF, Bissell (2008) argues that the term ‘children on the move’ refers to a wide range of children including those who have been trafficked, child migrants, asylum-seeking children, children who migrate in order seek family reunification, children who migrate in order to find employment and education opportunities etc. Children migrate on their own or with peers, parents/caregivers and extended kin. They adopt complex migration trajectories that may be linear, but often becomes sequential or circular within and across national borders. Despite the fact that children make decisions and take action in the context of migration, the outcomes may be positive, but may also yield a range of negative and unintended consequences, including abuse, exploitation and trafficking. Even though children are agents, they also need support and protection when their rights are being violated. These categories are not mutually exclusive as children’s situation may change over time and/or they may fall into two or more groups at the same time (Bissell 2008). As argued above, the tendency in the evaluations under review is to focus only one or two of these categories (mainly child trafficking) without addressing these complexities. There is a tension in the literature as to whether the issue of ‘children on the move’ should be mainstreamed or whether it requires separate policies and programmes. Concerns have been raised that developing yet another category of children in need of care and protection is likely to fragment the child protection response. On the other hand, in order to ensure that efforts to strengthen child protection systems benefit the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children, efforts should be made to highlight the manner in which the rights of these particular children are being violated.

Across the evaluations, a number of components were found to be particularly weak. The programmes were not based on an in-depth understanding of the macro, interpersonal and individual factors that motivate children to migrate, and how this is in turn related to gaps in the child protection system in countries/communities of origin. Secondly, apart from reference to traffickers, the programmes do not take cognizance of the range of risks faced by children in transit and at destination including arrest and deportation, food insecurity, health problems, pregnancy, exploitation, stigma and discrimination. Third, apart from the programmes in West Africa that have supported bilateral and regional treaties, the programmes have not supported the development, content and operationalization of standard operating procedures (SOPs) in relation to identification, documentation, tracing and reunification processes. Fourth, significant resources have been spent on ‘intercepting’ children, providing them with interim care and facilitating their return to communities of origin. However, in many instances the findings suggest that children are returned to conditions which are the same or worse and as a result decide to migrate again. This could be overcome by investing resources in (a) pre-home assessments (i.e. assessments that are undertaken to determine whether it is in the child’s best interests to return home) (b) follow-up (c) ongoing support for the child and family (d) establishing a mechanism and clear referral protocol to link the child and family to service providers in their communities of origin. In other words, case management, networking, partnerships and capacity building should be strengthened across borders and communities. Adequate follow up and support requires major structural interventions that address gaps in education, health, social welfare, legal and protection sectors to ensure that children’s rights are realized and that their highly individual and situational needs are met.

Children living and working on the streets
### Table 7: Programmes addressing street children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>The programme sought to strengthen the capacity building, planning,</td>
<td>1 (in</td>
<td>The evaluator found that prior to 2004 advocacy was actively pursued and had positive results in terms of placing the issue on the agenda of government as evident in a range of national programmes, memorandums and funding allocations. However, from 2004-2006 advocacy was neglected and the issue disappeared off the agenda. In terms of coordination, the presence of the overarching network diminished but the task forces and working committees sustained their practices. However coordination within and between these actors was fraught with challenges. The programme was effective in developing guidelines particularly prior to 2004, but they were not widely disseminated. Training was not effective as it was not based on a needs analysis. Child participation was not meaningful. At a strategic level, the programme failed to focus adequately on prevention and family reintegration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>coordination and monitoring of activities for street children by means of advocacy, establishment of local working committees and national assemblies, training of service providers, community-based strategies, child participation and public awareness raising events.</td>
<td>the 2004-2006 period)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>The programme aimed to strengthen government social work capacity, provide children living and working on the streets with access to services, support the reintegration of children, and assist children to acquire vocational skills and find employment. Activities included a drop in centre, outreach work, and direct assistance to children and families.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The programme was successful in engaging with government and enhancing the skills of staff seconded to the project; however a number of training and resource gaps were identified. The programme has developed social work systems and procedures. In terms of family reintegration, the programme returned 60 street children to their families over a 2 year period, of which only a small number have returned to the streets. Assistance (material, education, health, income generation etc.) was provided to 485 families (2005-2006) to reduce the need for children to work on the streets. Outreach activities (mobile health clinic, school and sports) reached 450 children per week. 5 836 children participated in sporting and cultural activities, 129 referrals were made, assistance was given to 39 cases of abuse, 26 684 children used the drop in centre. Weaknesses included inadequate engagement with district officials; social work systems and procedures were not adopted at national, provincial or district level; little advocacy around systems strengthening (guardianship procedures); absence of services to whom children could be referred; and lengthy reintegration process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>The programme sought to develop the skills and</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>540 children participated in 12 recreational and cultural centres. Approximately 930</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
confidence of street children; change attitudes towards street children by raising awareness of parents and community members; and establish linkages and networking with different government and NGO actors to develop a safety net for children. In order to achieve these objectives the project disseminated child rights related information, ensured the effective participation of children who are living and working in streets in their family and community; introduced a child to child education approach, networked with different organizations and established mechanisms to monitor child rights activities.

people participated in social dialogue. Linkages were established with government and NGO actors around long-term support, from which 180 children benefitted. The evaluation found reduced levels of violence in the market place although children still reported exploitative experiences.

The evaluator described positive changes in children’s well-being but argued that more could be done in terms of psycho-social counselling and the participation of parents.

---

**Child labour**

**Table 8: Programmes addressing child labour**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>The programme objective was to support 20,000 urban working children (aged 13+) through the provision of quality non-formal basic literacy, numeracy and life skills training over five consecutive eight month cycles. The strategy involved livelihood skills education for 5000 learners through contracting expert organizations/NGOs, and livelihood skills education for 15,000 children through linkages (e.g. existing ILO programmes).</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The evaluator described the Basic Education and Life Skills Basic Education as successful at mid-point, but there were shortcomings in social mobilization, monitoring and evaluation, and information management. The capacity building programme was not fully implemented and gender was not prioritized in the training curriculum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>The programme aimed to promote an integrated community-based strategy involving government departments, community groups and children in 104</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The evaluator described the following components as effective: intensive community sensitization which led to greater awareness of the risks associated with child labour; dialogue and persuasion with cottonseed employers which led some to submit written commitments to not employ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Evaluation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>The objectives centred on the prevention and eradication of child labour and the protection of young people by focusing on: policy and programme development, information gathering, regulation of child labour, harmonization of national legislation with international conventions, institutional capacity building, mobilization of social actors in particular organizations of workers and employers, and direct attention to the removal of children and adolescents from work and their transfer to schools or other areas suitable for development.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>Two projects in Marakkech and Fez were designed to eliminate the work of child labour in school age children by facilitating their integration into the formal education system and professional opportunities; reducing the prevalence of the worst forms of child labour; engaging with the labour department and holding open courts which led to the booking of 587 cases against farmers. The withdrawal of children from work and integration into schools was effective as the number of out of school children decreased. The programme was successful in lobbying for resources and infrastructure from the district and state government. The evaluator, did, however highlight a number of challenges and gaps such as the failure of the programme to use child fora to address gender issues; the need to focus on gender empowerment; the ad hoc nature of the vocational and skills development programme; the need for purposive planning at the district level and bottlenecks translating government policy commitments into action. Furthermore, it was suggested that social mobilization and learning opportunities might not be sufficient to address child labour issues, but that other modalities such as cash transfers need to be explored.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of work improving the working conditions of children under 18 years, and contributing to the prevention of child labour by raising awareness of key stakeholders (children, families and employers). The evaluation focused largely on the Marakkech project which aimed to prevent child labour through social mobilization, improve physical and psychological health of child workers in the handicraft sector and strengthen local capacity to monitor child labour. Strategies included the removal of 1100 children from work and integration into formal school system or in vocational training, and protection of 1000 child workers against the worst forms of child labour.

For many children, ‘helping’ their families to sustain the household economy is not perceived simply as an obligation. It is a reasonable response on behalf of parents and children to high levels of poverty. In this context, many parents are not able to earn the wages required to sustain the functioning of their households without relying on their children’s unpaid and paid labour. A number of factors influence the workload of a particular child, including the child’s age, gender, the composition of the household, the family’s domestic cycle and the seasonal nature of employment. This is not something that children are necessarily coerced into undertaking but often signifies that they are becoming ‘duty bearers’ and progressing into a new life phase associated with more responsibility, power and respect. In order to prevent child labour it is important to understand the factors that enhance the vulnerability of some children and how this affects their options and life chances.

The programmes listed above have understood prevention narrowly as awareness raising, removing children from situations of child labour and directing them into education or vocational training. However, these strategies do not address the underlying socio-economic and cultural root causes why children and their families support these practices. As will be discussed in subsequent sections, vocational training alone fails to fulfil the needs of children in poverty stricken communities largely because it does not guarantee them access to employment, commercial enterprises and income. Awareness-raising alone cannot prevent abuse and exploitation but together with targeted activities with at-risk children it is likely to have a greater impact. The rationale behind the focus on education was that with access to education, the chances of children being involved in exploitative labour related activities will decrease. However, it is important to consider who will earn income and assume the child’s roles and responsibilities at home and in the community when he/she is going to school. One child may be enrolled in school, but other children in the household may have to work. Furthermore, apart from the programme in Bangladesh there is a failure to engage with parents and provide economic solutions for the whole family. Simply advocating for legal policy reform around the eradication of hazardous child labour, will not address the underlying structural conditions that have allowed it to thrive. It was recommended that conditional cash transfers be...
explored in the child labour programme in Bangladesh, while other evaluators called for intersectoral programmes.\footnote{Evaluation of IKEA Supported UNICEF-SSA AP Phase I Project Elimination of Girl Child Labour in Cotton Seed the Sector Kurnool District, Andhrapradesh. ERU Consultants. New Delhi. 2011.}

**Child abuse**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>The programme aimed to develop and implement a hospital-based model to identify and refer victims of violence; improve parenting skills and conflict resolution; and to implement an intervention model in children’s environments (home, school and church) by engaging with existing community programmes.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the hospital based child abuse mitigation project was successful in identifying children at risk of violence, forming a specialist team who intervened to prevent many children from going through the statutory system, interacting with parents, and exploring critical specialist interventions such as play therapy. In terms of implementation the evaluator argued that the capacity of the hospital to manage cases was limited, multidisciplinary case management and quality control was weak. In addition, the community development and awareness component was neglected.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>The programme was based on a helpline which offered listening and counselling, interventions on site, ‘rehabilitation’, referrals to specialized structures and the documentation of children’s problems.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>The evaluator found that the Helpline strengthened the visibility of government and NGO actors in charge of child protection. The volume of calls suggested that people were aware of the Helpline’s existence (153,207 calls between 9 January and 30 November, 2009). The evaluator raised a number of problems with the Helpline including lack of resources, limited efficiency, poor organization and management, lack of communication and marketing strategy, unclear roles and responsibilities among partners, absence of a multidisciplinary team to undertake case work, broader governance issues, and gaps in the legal policy framework pertaining to child sexual abuse.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comoros</td>
<td>The listening service aimed to increase awareness of abuse and maltreatment, to provide a mechanism for reporting and referrals, to capture data on maltreatment, to forge partnerships with government and civil society groups to improve the response.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the programme strengthened national capacity because services were integrated into the National Centre for Observation and Integration of Vulnerable Children. Furthermore, the programme strengthened engagement with the judiciary. It was argued that this programme offers a relevant service. However, a number of problems were identified in relation to partner involvement, government engagement, project management, advocacy, donor funding agreements, oversight and quality control.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Somalia</strong></td>
<td>The programme aimed to raise awareness and mobilize communities around child abuse issues. The strategy centred on Child Protection Committees (CPCs) which were trained and mentored by Child Protection Advocates (CPAs)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Swaziland</strong></td>
<td>Community-based child protection groups were used to raise awareness on child abuse and to facilitate identification, assistance and referrals. The approach rested on community self-reliance, building traditional strengths and involving the youth as actors.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DRC</strong></td>
<td>The programme included 20 projects in 9 provinces in the DRC, which aimed at preventing gender and sexual based violence and assisting victims (medical, psychosocial, legal and economic). The strategies used ranged from awareness-raising of different audiences (police officers, families, university students, etc.) using different methods (brochures, theatre plays, etc.) to medical, psychosocial and judicial support to victims of sexual violence to socio-economic reinsertion through revenue yielding activities.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The evaluator found the programme to be effective in communities where the CPAs and CPCs were involved in successful referrals, interventions or advocacy that resulted in the delivery of assistance that met the communities’ priority needs (e.g. in communities where UNICEF was implementing other interventions such as water, education or health). In these cases, the community was more willing to engage with the community. In general, however, there were mixed results. The referral process needed to be strengthened. The awareness raising activities were successful to a degree but the capacity of the CPAs and CPCs to mobilize communities and develop community based actions to stop and prevent exploitation and abuse was weak. Although the capacity of the CPCs was developed by the CPAs, there was limited transfer of information on child protection to the wider community.

Child protection committees were established in 188 communities and 5690 child protectors were trained. However, the evaluator referred to high levels of donor dependency, a poor system of referral and lack of supporting structures. Recommendations included capacity building, the identification and remuneration of community-based child protection groups, strengthening of the institutional and legal framework and engaging with the government social work sector.

Some of the positive results of these projects included: the identification of sexual violence increased; law enforcement authorities were more active in urban areas; the training programme for magistrates was effective; advocacy placed the issue on the national agenda; medical support to victims improved; and victims had greater access to PEP kits and medication. There were, however, a number of challenges and negative results. The humanitarian projects were too focused on sexual violence in the context of armed conflict and were therefore not in sync with local realities. The impact of awareness raising and the understanding of messages was not measured; the identification of victims remained delayed; the absence of a database did not allow for a reliable counting of identifications in each province; judiciary support was often delayed owing to the incapacity of judiciary, police and military authorities to assure a minimum protection for victims of sexual violence that would like to start judiciary procedures; only 4 (out of 12)
psychosocial projects had skilled personnel; there was limited diversification to allow for the mobilization of men and boys as victims of sexual violence; some key community actors were not targeted such as community/traditional leaders; the psychosocial support was not well mastered and was badly documented; and medical support was limited and concentrated in big cities. The evaluator argued that the programme was not sustainable.

The strategy to address child abuse issues varied. Two programmes supported a hotline, one programme promoted a hospital-based model to child protection, two programmes established and supported community-based child protection groups and one programme included a range of projects which focused on both systems strengthening (health, psychosocial and justice sectors) and social change through awareness raising. In both the case of the hotlines and the hospital based model, the overarching challenges were case management, the absence of multi-disciplinary specialist teams to respond to reports and absence of service providers to whom cases could be referred. It is interesting that none of these programmes explored the ‘multi-purpose centre’ as a means of providing child victims of violence with a full basket of interim services (education, legal-protection, social welfare and health).

Community-based child care groups have been adopted as a common strategy across programmes on the assumption that communities are able to identify and respond more effectively to their own concerns, thereby ensuring a far more localized and grounded response to child protection. These groups have been utilized in a number of different programmes to direct the emphasis of care to the beneficiaries and their communities; support a functional referral system to ensure access to care and follow-up; integrate informal, non-formal and formal care systems, empower communities to meet their own needs, reduce pressure on government facilities and ensure the access of vulnerable children and families to social welfare systems. Although this will be discussed in greater depth in a subsequent section, in terms of successes a number of tangible and intangible outcomes were highlighted. This includes, examples of community self-reliance; the development of spontaneous links with prevention activities; enhancement of the role of families and community to support the young and elderly; and the freeing up of social workers and other professionals to focus on serving difficult cases, monitoring and support. In terms of challenges, these groups encountered difficulties with the participation, commitment and enthusiasm of community members, as well as lack of financial, material and technical support. This report will provide information of the highly contextual factors that affect the success of this strategy.

Justice for children

Table 10: Programmes addressing 'children in conflict with the law'

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>The Juvenile Justice Committee (JJC) provided supervision (pre and post-trial) to children in conflict with the law to facilitate alternatives to pre-trial detention and custodial sentencing to imprisonment. The JJC was also charged with preventing juvenile crimes, recidivism and supporting the successful reintegration of juveniles</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The following outcomes were identified for children served by the JJC: In pre-trial they were more informed of their legal rights by police officers, more likely to be represented by legal counsel, be accompanied by a parent/guardian and social worker, served by a specially appointed juvenile investigator as well juvenile prosecutor and juvenile judge, be released from pre-trial detention at the request of the JJC Coordinator, be interrogated in child-friendly interview rooms at the police station</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
through education, socialization, health assistance, etc. Further, the JJC organized trainings to enhance the qualifications of state officials and other individuals working on cases of children in conflict with the law. The JJC expanded their activities to support children at risk with the aim of preventing crimes. The JJC coordinator liaised with other institutions at the local level (district educational, social welfare and labour, civil registration and other departments) to address the risks faced by children.

‘Justice for children’: The scope of programmes seeking to ensure ‘justice for children’ has also varied. The United Nations Guidance Note of the Secretary General (September 2008) defines this term broadly: “The goal of the justice for children approach is to ensure that children, defined by the Convention on the Rights of the Child as all persons under the age of eighteen, are better served and protected by justice systems, including the security and social welfare sectors. It specifically aims at ensuring full application of international norms and standards for all children who come into contact with justice and related systems as victims, witnesses and alleged offenders; or for other reasons where judicial, state administrative or non-state adjudicatory intervention is needed, for example regarding their care, custody or protection”. The guidance note recognises that child justice standards tend to be undertaken through “vertical approaches” that focus either on juvenile justice issues (children in conflict with the law) or responses to child victims and witnesses, without recognising the overlap between these categories in terms of institutions, professionals and services.

This is evident in the programmes under review in this report. For example, the programme (2005-2008) implemented in Mongolia focused narrowly on reducing the detention of children in conflict with the law and promoting diversion, restorative justice and community-based alternatives to detention at the pre-trial, trial and sentencing stages. At a policy level, there was a debate around the extent to which prevention should be included in the Juvenile Justice Committee (JJC’s) mandate, which some argued should be restricted to children are already in conflict with the law. In contrast, programmes in Sri Lanka and the DRC centred largely on child victims and witnesses, while those in Burkina Faso, Ethiopia, India and Nicaragua targeted perpetrators of violence. One of the few programmes to recognise the interlinkages was that implemented in Indonesia which addressed issues in relation to children in conflict with the law, child victims and witnesses, and perpetrators of violence. When reviewing this report, it is important to recognise the different ways in which justice for children has been interpreted in UNICEF-supported

programmes. Much of this work was undertaken prior to the formulation of the Secretary General’s Guidance Note (2008) and may therefore not regard justice in such broad terms.

The evaluator of the Mongolia programme argued that prevention should be more broadly interpreted, beyond legal education in schools. Although the Mongolian JJC programme was widely regarded as relevant, appropriate and effective, stakeholders raised a few concerns. There was a divergence of opinions as to whether the JJC should have included juvenile crime prevention in their mandate; whether it should serve vulnerable children or only children in conflict with the law; and whether it should work on broader child protection issues or only juvenile issues. Many of these concerns reflect the fact that there is little understanding of the interdependence of justice with children’s protection rights. This has blurred a sound analysis of underlying causes, as stakeholders continue to believe that poverty, family ‘dysfunction’ or lack of legal knowledge ‘causes’ juvenile delinquency. Prevention has been narrowly interpreted by the JJC as legal education sessions whereby juvenile inspectors give presentations to children in schools. The evaluator argued that this is inadequate to deter children from committing crimes; instead more efforts be directed at strengthening of communities and families with assistance from social workers, educators, law enforcement and NGOs.

Violence in schools

Table 11: Programmes targeting violence in schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>The programme aimed to increase awareness on violence in schools, develop the capacity of staff and children for prevention and response, develop institutional mechanisms for addressing the issue, motivate all groups especially children to get involved in positive change activities in schools, create a safer school environment for children and teachers, raise awareness in the community.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The evaluator found that the programme was effective in relation to the following: establishing an external protective network, clearly delineating roles and responsibilities within schools, integrating the programme within the existing educational system, promoting non-violent communication, beginning to establish new values and perceptions of violence and contributing to higher levels of knowledge and awareness. However, the programme was not effective in terms of the following: implementing mechanisms to respond to violence in all schools, encouraging students to use the trust box, promoting restitution, engaging with parents, involving local community members, supporting teachers, motivating participants to consistently take part in activities, quality control, documentation and monitoring and evaluation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>The objective of this project was to develop psychosocial skills and encourage non-violent conflict resolution in schools, families and communities through a programme implemented in 250-300 schools.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>According to the evaluator, it had a significant impact by virtue of the scale of the programme and the manner in which it encouraged dialogue and negotiation. Participating schools started to identify violence, students and teachers have observed changes in attitudes and practices, and it was argued that children express their feelings more. However, a number of challenges and gaps were identified. Teachers felt vulnerable to reports of mistreatment by students. No systematic evaluation of the acquisition of psychosocial skills was undertaken and training packages did not include a monitoring and evaluation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An international review of promoting school safety identified the following trends in successful interventions. First, these interventions pro-actively promote school safety rather than simply react to violence. Second, they link the needs of victims, victimizers and healthy behaviour to broader school safety strategies. Third, they offer comprehensive approaches such as training for parents, home visits to vulnerable children, social skills coaching for children, academic coaching and social competency skills training and classroom management for teachers. Fourth, they use school-community partnerships to develop inclusive strategies. Fifth, they target ‘at risk’ schools and learners using a strength-based approach and proven (evaluated) programmes. And sixth, they involve young people themselves in identifying and assessing problems, problem-solving and developing projects or interventions (Shaw, 2001; Griggs, 2005, p.132). At a strategic level, the aforementioned programmes do fulfil a number of these requirements, but the evaluator of the programme in Serbia found that it had failed to adequately include children and the wider community in the programme. It had failed to link the school programme with community development strategies or partnerships and networks in the community. Furthermore, it had failed to consider the fact that learner’s problems begin not within the classroom, but from personal, interpersonal and environmental contexts. To a large extent, dealing with the causes of violence is beyond the role of schooling and education per se; however these problems are manifested in the development of the child, their competency in education, and in their behaviour when at school. Consequently, strengthened classroom management, parenting and community development programmes should therefore be intertwined. Furthermore in both programmes, the importance of developing democratic and effective school management was not included in the strategy with the result that efforts to build the capacity of educators and pupils met with a hostile reception from managers and school boards.

**Child injury prevention**

**Table 12: Programmes targeting child injury prevention**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>The programme aimed to reduce and eradicate child injuries by means of national policy making, surveillance and data analysis, local interventions and research.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>The programme was effective in placing this issue on the national agenda due to advocacy and technical assistance. Two pilot projects were effective in reducing child injuries and mortality by raising awareness and making environmental modifications. Behaviour change communication and child participation led to increased awareness and knowledge. Survey findings suggest a decline in the incidence of child injury and deaths caused by injury from the baseline in 2006 to 2009. School and community surveillance systems were built into the existing government health information system. The programme built the capacity of local government staff and partners. The main challenges encountered include creating a system of clear accountability and establishing a permanent line in the public sector budget, especially at local government level. The rural areas required additional interventions. Two lessons were significant, namely the need for government buy-in and multi-sector</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The programme aimed to achieve a 20% reduction in the incidence of injuries in project locations and aimed to support the development of comprehensive government plans of action on child injury prevention. In order to achieve this, the project focused on awareness raising amongst key stakeholders, training and technical support, modification to the physical environment, and advocacy for policy and legislative reform. The evaluation focused on pilot model demonstration and capacity building.

The evaluator described this as a very successful programme because it focused on the practical aspects of community health issues; the modest budget was managed to produce tangible changes in the living environment; and the project led to a development of knowledge and skills related to injury prevention for all stakeholders and community members involved. The evaluator recommended the development of multi-partner guidance to allow the programme to be replicated. In addition, it was recommended that a greater focus on teachers was necessary.

At a strategic level it was found ‘environmental modifications’ were more effective in terms of changing attitudes, norms and behaviour in relation to child injuries when compared with mere awareness-raising. For example, in China following a baseline survey, environmental modifications were carried out in homes, public spaces in the community and at schools. In communes, environment modifications were implemented by putting up railings on small bridges and fencing off public ponds; installing traffic signs, putting up danger warning signs, providing commune road lighting; providing convex mirrors (to allow oncoming traffic to see round blind corners), traffic calming measures on commune roads (such as speed bumps; and upgrading public play grounds to create a safer place for children to play. The selection of environment modifications in each commune was based on the priority order of injury risks identified by the commune. The evaluator found that environmental modifications are tangible, easily recognized, and were most appreciated by stakeholders and community members who felt that they met the needs of the communes. Many people became more committed to the programme when they saw their community changing. However, it is important to note that the effectiveness of this strategy depends on relevance and the quality of the hardware investments. For example in Vietnam, some people complained that the quality of items distributed in this programme was poor; for instance, medicine cabinets were too small, knife shelves were weak and stair case doors were unattractive. The evaluator stated that the provincial coordinators did not pay attention to such details. It is important to note that this is resource intensive and may affect long-term sustainability of programmes. Another effective strategy involved engaging with community leaders. The commune leadership organized injury prevention work. This enhanced the image of commune leaders and local organizations, and led to a greater sense of community engagement and ownership.

### National systems strengthening

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>The programme aimed to increase access by orphans</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>The evaluator described the programme as highly relevant, efficient and cost-effective.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

and vulnerable children (OVC) to social services and improve their protection from all forms of abuse. Outputs included increased number of OVC who receive support, care and protection from CSOs; structures for effective coordination and management; strengthened capacity of programme partners; establishment of M&E systems. Areas of support include school-related support, birth registration, psycho-social support, food and nutrition, health care, water and sanitation, child participation, child protection, education on nutrition, health and hygiene, economic strengthening, life-skills and vocational training, cash transfer and shelter/other support. The programme was implemented through 32 NGO partners and 150 sub-grantees.

The evaluator found that the programme was effectively implemented but encountered some problems. Outputs were delivered well and almost 400,000 OVC received some benefit from the programme. There was ‘good’ coordination among stakeholders at national level, a ‘sound’ NGO capacity building programme was established and an ‘excellent’ output monitoring system was established.

However, problems included the fragmented nature of the programme which offered only one or two types of support to children who need a full basket of services. In addition, the programme focused on numbers of children (reach) rather than quality of services. Coordination at provincial, district and ward levels was ineffective and quality control by the Department of Social Services was limited. The evaluator recommended the development of a more comprehensive and national social protection framework.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bosnia and Herzegovina</th>
<th>The programme aimed to improve child protection mechanisms in selected municipalities by fulfilling the following objectives: improving systems for developing the strategy of social welfare at municipal level, improving mechanisms of child protection in pilot municipalities, improving managerial and professional capacities in managing child protection mechanisms in targeted municipalities and enhancing the capacities of Centres for Social Work. In order to meet the objectives, the following strategies were employed: Municipal Management Boards with specific child protection action plans, pilot projects at municipal level, competence based training for municipality officials, and</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
1                      | The evaluator described the programme as effective in terms of improving the overall quality of treatment and services for only three out of eleven target groups (child victims of violence, children with special needs, socially at risk children). The evaluator highlighted a number of problems in relation to the Municipal Management Boards (MMBs) and the municipal programme plans, which do not reflect local specificities. Equipment supplies were found not to be relevant. Recommendations included raising the profile of the MMBs, greater participation from UNICEF, linkages with other UNICEF programmes, resource pooling, research on government priorities, a participatory approach to define priorities and ensure public buy-in, partnerships between government, NGOs, CSOs and the private sector, intersectoral programming. |
supplying equipment to Centres for Social Work.

The strategy adopted in Zimbabwe rested on intersectoral programming. Under the Programme of Support (PoS) children received a range of services and forms of support. Although the programme was partly effective, the evaluator recommended an even more integrated and holistic programme because the PoS was only able to provide one or two types of support to each child. It was recommended that a comprehensive and national social protection framework for the country be developed which includes three tiers namely, cash transfers for labour constrained households, strengthened child and family care and more effective government social services (e.g. health and education). In other words, taken alone social protection will not meet the needs of children in Zimbabwe, who require access to an integrated package of quality services. Given the politicized nature of the Zimbabwean context, strategically it was decided to channel donor funds through UNICEF and rely on implementation by NGO partners and smaller local organizations (sub-grantees). The evaluation found that this was inadequate because government services and coordination also needed to be improved in order to support systems strengthening. In Bosnia-Herzegovina, it was also recommended that the programmes should promote coordination between NGOs and municipal governments in order to promote the intersectoral aspects of child protection. It was argued that linkage of this programme with other UNICEF programmes would enable stakeholders to enhance effectiveness.

Children associated with armed forces and armed groups

Table 14: Programmes targeting CAAFAG

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>The strategy and implementation framework, outlined the specific objectives of the component on children, namely: (1) ensuring access to health, education, skill training and family tracing and reunification support for demobilized child combatants; (2) continuing the reunification of child ex-combatants with families; (3) increasing the awareness and improving the capacity of families and communities to protect children; and (4) enhancing the capacity of NGOs and agencies in the country to address the immediate and longer-term needs of former child combatants. The strategies employed to achieve these objectives were: the provision of cash and in-kind assistance to various schools to cover basic education fees and enrolment requirements; the provision of educational materials for primary and secondary levels to expand their capacity to admit child ex-combatants; training of social workers; support to training and employment through apprenticeship schemes;</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>According to the evaluator, the combination of vocational training/apprenticeships with education seemed to be among the biggest successes of the programme, increasing the chance of a better future for children, while addressing the immediate needs for livelihood and income. Furthermore, the UNICEF-supported programme was successful in increasing the employability of former CAAFAG through skills training, business training and apprenticeships. 70% of the target group (9,100) were working, in school or in training. Another strength that contributed to the success of the reintegration programme was that activities that led to reintegration of former CAAFAG were initiated in the demobilization phase. The reintegration programme managed to follow up and support the majority of the children who were reunited with their families. It was reported that 'anti-social' behaviour patterns that were shown by former CAAFAG were consistently decreasing. Furthermore, community members played active roles in ensuring the social reintegration of...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Recommendation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>The Return to Happiness strategy was one of the components of a broader set of actions included in the projects evaluated, since in addition to psychosocial recovery, they included components of health, food security, restitution of rights and institutional strengthening. However in general all the projects share, as a central objective, the psychosocial recovery of children and adolescents in areas of armed conflict, and the prevention of the recruitment of children and adolescents in illegal armed groups.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The evaluator argues that the Return to Happiness methodology is viable when working with indigenous communities. The use of adolescent volunteers was described as effective for community mobilization. It was argued that these children's groups should be extended beyond schools to the wider community. An overarching challenge faced in the programme was intra-family violence. It was also argued that the nutritional and food security programmes were an effective way of promoting child protection issues and encouraging recreational learning, for instance through the preparation and consumption of foods. It was also argued that efforts to obtain buy in and transmit knowledge and skills to government actors were an effective way of ensuring sustainability.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>The programme aimed to ensure the psychological rehabilitation of children traumatized by terrorist violence. The strategy included advocacy and technical assistance at the legal policy level, strengthening health services, capacity building, research, family preservation activities, social</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The evaluator found that the programme was successful in developing the capacity of human resources and developing a network of professionals in psychosocial care for children. The material and equipment that was donated had not been used exclusively for CAAFAG but for children and adults more</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>The post-war response was focused on the provision of assistance to children living in residential institutions and/or those abducted during the war. The strategy included direct support to children, awareness raising around the issue of separated children and the provision of offices, vehicles and personnel to the government to trace children.</td>
<td>According to the evaluator UNICEF was active in preparedness for Child Protection, but was slow to adjust its response to the actual circumstances following the war. For example, the issue of separated children was not an important issue, given the lack of population movement. There was some confusion over the question of return and reintegration of former child soldiers as this was not a significant issue either. It was argued that UNICEF’s programming for post-war child protection was delayed and little had been achieved by the end of the evaluation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>The programme used a multi-sectoral, integrated approach in four camps, including activities such as health promotion, training of teachers, health workers and volunteers, and developing child protection systems. Following the ceasefire in August 2006, the programme tracked communities as they returned to their original rural homes. While continuing to meet basic humanitarian standards, there was a strong emphasis on building the capacity of local government and community systems to deliver services and meet the needs of people, wherever they are on the transition process back to their homes. The strategy included building the capacity of community management and volunteer groups in health, education, child</td>
<td>According to the evaluator, across the sectors measurable impact was achieved and interventions were proving to be sustainable as people moved out of the camps. Efforts were made to achieve greater relevance to local needs, greater government capacity and greater community engagement, and the inclusion of marginalized groups. Challenges included bringing health, education, water, sanitation and other sectors in line with national government standards.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
protection, water management and sanitation. In terms of child protection, capacity building efforts centred on assisting children to cope with issues of abduction and trauma associated with the conflict, and the risk of psychological, physical and sexual abuse within the camps or in transit. The strategy involved community based child protection committees and strengthened sub-national government and NGO actors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>The main objective is the provision of child protection in emergencies (CPiE) training to child protection actors.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>The programme’s main objective was to rehabilitate and reintegrate 540 child soldiers through two project phases. Activities included vocational training, life skills training, psychosocial support, non-formal education, job placement, outreach work and civil society strengthening.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some of the key results of the project were as follows: the National Child Protection Action Network (N-CPAN) also acted as the CP subcluster in Afghanistan, although not on a regular basis; technical skills and knowledge specific to CPiE were found to be limited, with the vast majority of child protection actors being focused on longer-term recovery and development programme; the vast majority of those who participated in the review were not aware of the humanitarian reform agenda and the cluster approach. The UNICEF CP unit in Afghanistan did not have leadership staff available given the high turnover of staff. This also had a negative impact on coordination in Afghanistan. While respondents note CPiE is lacking in assessments, there is also a sense that the capacity to develop assessment criteria and necessary skills to conduct assessments in CPiE need to be strengthened within the CP sector.

The evaluator stated that the project trained 540 children as intended although there was no documentation to verify this and some of the beneficiaries may not have been CAAFAG but may have been street children and other youth groups. It was argued that the programme has missed its intended target population. Nevertheless, the programme raised awareness on CAAFAG issues and made rudimentary attempts to demobilize them. The package received by CAAFAG “helped them to begin a new civilian way of life”. Concerns were raised about the lack
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Recommendations</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>The programme aimed to advocate at national and international levels for the recognition of CAAFAG and child protection issues; to facilitate the release and return of children associated with the Communist Party of Nepal-Maoist (CPN-M) and other armed groups, to prevent the recruitment of children at risk; to provide immediate care, family tracing and reunification services by providing vocational and psychosocial training to child protection teams and community groups, to sensitize, inform and mobilize families and communities to protect these children; to capacitate NGOs, CSOs and communities through training, workshops and staff support.</td>
<td>Advocacy, research, consultation, partnerships, conflict sensitive programme design, revisions to the vocational training approach, promotion of employment, capacity enhancement of implementing partners and improved mentoring, monitoring and evaluation.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>The programme aimed to return and reintegrate CAAFAG into their communities. The strategy included encouraging children and youth people to reflect on conflict resolution, social and civic participation, and gender equity, and working with the child and family.</td>
<td>The evaluator described the programme as innovative, encouraging social dialogue on sensitive issues and targeting the most vulnerable and marginalized. Coordination and partnerships were commended. The education and psychosocial components were described as particularly strong and effective. The community sensitization activities were found to be lacking in terms of clarity of messaging, scope and documentation. Additional constraints and concerns include the use of children as negotiating tools in political discussions, lack of urgency around the release of children from the cantonments, political interference, lack of government commitment, inconsistency in messaging, ethical issues related to stipends, design based on false assumptions of mass release of children, complexities associated with individual or school-based support, need for stronger gender analysis and market analysis for vocational training activities.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In programmes targeting children associated with the armed forces, evaluators argued that strategically more emphasis needs to be placed on addressing the reasons why children joined the fighting forces. Reports on Nepal and Liberia recommended greater linkages between reintegration programmes and education, water and sanitation sections in order to address the reasons why children joined the fighting forces. Reference was also made to the need for economic assistance and a greater connection between livelihood and child protection programmes in communities affected by natural disasters such as the Tsunami in order to prevent secondary separations and residential care.

In terms of those programmes that provide social protection services to support the socio-economic integration of children, it was found that the effectiveness of different strategies (vocational training, micro-credit and cash transfers) depended on the local context and the specific programme at hand. However, across programmes it was found that taken alone these measures are ineffective but a more integrated and holistic approach is necessary that takes into realistic consideration local markets, the value attached to cash in different communities and children and families’ access to shelter and services (See Section 3.1.93 for detailed discussion)

References:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>The programme aimed to educate the public about unexploded ordinances. The strategy involved moving away from “planned” communication (small media items such as printed T-shirts, posters and cloth banners) to community-based initiatives, in particular through the establishment of local “rehabilitation task forces” at district and sub-district levels. Deliberate efforts were made to link clearance operations to the needs of the affected communities through the deployment of community liaison officers. Data collection on victims in contaminated areas informed messages. In addition, “anti-mine clubs” and child instructors using peer-to-peer communication were set up within schools to target both schoolchildren and children and youth not attending school, particularly animal herders. Concrete efforts to ensure the long-term sustainability of the programme were made in the decision to hand over the projects to regional government authorities.</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>The evaluation team concluded that the mine risk education programme in Ethiopia was one of the world’s more mature mine risk education programmes. A high level of awareness was created about the danger posed by landmines and other explosive remnants of war (ERW). It was found that casualty rates in the areas affected by the war with Eritrea have come down markedly in the last four years. Community liaison officers helped the community to understand the demining process and offered potential for community participation and involvement in priority setting. The capacity of government and NGO actors was strengthened particularly in attempts to ensure sustainability. However, this was described as a very costly programme. In addition, the programme faced a number of significant challenges, in particular programme coordination, project management, and emergency preparedness.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>The programme aimed to promote mine-safe behaviours through the application of a variety of educational techniques, and to prevent landmine and ERW casualties. No explicit strategy was designed for the MRE intervention but supported activities were</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>This evaluation suggests that the high visibility of MRE messages contributed to lowered injury rates. Innovative and effective interventions employed by the MRE activities included use of video sessions, theatre with children as key actors, captivating murals and billboards and mine victims as community MRE facilitators, etc. However, concerns over the nature of messages and the absence of participatory approaches were also</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Evaluation Remarks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>By raising awareness it was hoped that the number and severity of injuries caused by UXO/landmines would be reduced. Furthermore, there was a call for an improved national response, improved MRE; improved education on UXO/landmine dangers both locally and internationally, better coordination of mine action, the empowerment and education of all persons older than 6 on preventative measures. In order to achieve these goals the project proposed the following strategies: training and capacity building for government staff and project collaborators; advocacy for political commitment and enhanced national coordination; community based mine risk education; first aid training; multi-media activities and Information, Education, Communication (IEC) materials; and mine risk education through UNICEF’s Education Programme.</td>
<td>The evaluation found that the programme achieved a number of its intermediate objectives. The most significant improvements were in the areas of increased awareness and knowledge of children and adults on UXO/mine, more effective counterpart and partner annual planning processes, and development and promotion of Vietnam’s National MRE Standards. Although there is a long way to go to ensure a sustained level of behavioural change, there was a reported decline in mortality and morbidity rates linked to UXO/mines in recent years. Other results were partially achieved particularly in the area of behavioural change, capacity development of provincial, district and commune implementing partners, development of coordination mechanisms and the establishment of a reliable monitoring system. UNICEF’s programme has acted as a catalyst for other actors to initiate MRE programmes in the past three years, particularly among demining/clearance NGOs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao</td>
<td>The UNICEF Mine Action Strategy 2002-2005 defined the role and activity of UNICEF headquarters and country and Regional Offices in relation to implementing three goals: (1) MRE needs</td>
<td>The evaluators argue that UNICEF’s mine action support is highly relevant in terms of its contribution to national priorities and the fact that it targets the requirements of affected populations, particularly in emergencies. Reference was made to high technical</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
are identified and met in an appropriate, effective, and timely fashion; (2) the Mine Ban Treaty and other related legal instruments are universally ratified and implemented; and (3) mine survivors, especially children, have access to the highest attainable standards of services and support. standards and substantial outputs.

However, it was held that its support is not entirely consistent with UNICEF’s priorities or development programmes, nor does it make appropriate use of international humanitarian and human rights instruments. Furthermore, it was argued that UNICEF’s mine action support is overly dependent on particular financial and human resources, leading to the implementation of only some aspects of the strategy. In terms of relevance it is held that MRE needs are identified in an appropriate and timely fashion but apart from the Mine Ban Treaty, it has not used other legal instruments, the scope of victim assistance goals are too ambitious for resource allocation, activities are not mainstreamed within UNICEF thereby affecting sustainability and there are gaps in logical frameworks. In terms of effectiveness it is argued that UNICEF has made an impact by facilitating external coordination through the creation of inclusive fora, but coordination across sections and divisions internally is lacking. It remains a standalone intervention, quality and performance management systems are weak. The evaluators argue that UNICEF has contributed to awareness of mine/UXO related risks, but not necessarily to the adoption of alternative behaviour that has reduced those risks. It appears that UNICEF has contributed to legislation that improves access to public services by survivors, although there is limited evidence that UNICEF has contributed elsewhere to improvements in the quality of life of survivors.

At the level of design, it was found that MRE programmes centred exclusively on awareness-raising and community mobilization are not effective. In Senegal, Vietnam and Nepal it was found that despite heightened levels of awareness of the dangers, children and adults continue to engage in risky behaviours, primarily for socio-economic reasons. They continue to collect scrap metal as it is a source of income, they continue to cut grass near areas marked with fencing or hazard signs, saving explosives for sale or for use in construction or fishing because this is their source of livelihood. Evaluators argued that in order to be effective MRE programmes should make strategic links with education and livelihood programmes to provide alternative income sources for mine ‘at risk’ communities.118

In contrast, the evaluator of mine action programmes in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao stated that UNICEF needs to shift from prevention and MRE to victim assistance; the latter has been neglected due to

to a lack of traditional mine action donor interest and lack of disability experience within UNICEF. The evaluator criticized UNICEF for failing to adequately respond to the medical and psychosocial needs of mine survivors. This was attributed to the labour intensive, technically demanding and costly process of VA in the mid to long-term. It was held that UNICEF is more successful in this regard, when mine/UXO related trauma is addressed within the broader disability context i.e. the needs of accident survivors are addressed in interventions targeted at all disabled people. However, she also argued that there are indications that disability is not being prioritized at HQ level and that staff at CO level have competing priorities.

Natural disasters (Tsunami)

Table 16: Programmes targeting natural disasters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>UNICEF’s immediate response to the tsunami and its process of transitioning toward mainstreamed programming work was within three core areas: child protection, education, and capacity building. In the wake of the tsunami the UNICEF Country Office mobilized a range of activities supporting response in the affected provinces including key logistical support, health and nutrition assistance, water and sanitation, educational provision and psychosocial support. This led to formulation of the ‘build back better’ strategy that was informed by two principal drivers: (1) use of existing programme approaches that were seen to provide relevant mechanisms to address issues of longer term relevance brought to the forefront by the tsunami; and (2) the conjunction of newly identified needs and unprecedented access to resources that provided the opportunity to create new models and extend approaches adapted from existing agendas. In turn, some of the key results of the project include: Case managers represented a key resource for child protection recognized by all stakeholders; the transition from relief through to recovery was relatively seamless; projects served to effectively galvanize local people into action and plan for longer-term developments; and overall, a more enabling policy environment for Education For All and child rights-based education was created through development of school CFS-readiness standards and tools for their application. In terms of gaps, there was little evidence of engagement of children and youth in the development of plans outside of arrangements for public hearings and there was a need to strengthen monitoring functions and technical support.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

120 Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>UNICEF’s response to the Tsunami</th>
<th>Achievements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>UNICEF’s response to the Tsunami refocused its child protection programme in an effort to consolidate its support for a more comprehensive child protection system for the Maldives. The three focus areas included: Child Protection Services; Justice for Children; and the HIV/Drug Prevention Project. The most significant early protection response to the tsunami addressed psychological distress amongst disaster affected communities through the multi-sectoral coordination working groups, volunteers, temporary distress hot line, community volunteers and teachers, advocacy and technical support to government and capacity building of justice sectors.</td>
<td>Some of the achievements of the response effort included the creation of new community-based organizations; government restructuring; strengthened justice sector; decentralization of social services; innovative programmes to tackle drug abuse. However, the evaluator notes that despite the psychosocial programme providing relief to disaster victims immediately after the tsunami it did not strengthen community capacity to support children long-term. In addition, the number of active NGOs decreased due to lack of internal capacity and financial support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>In the aftermath of the tsunami, the Child Protection Programme focused on registration and reunification of separated children, psychosocial activities, and protection from abuse, violence, and exploitation, and mainstream child protection as a key policy issues in the social agenda of the Government. By 2005, UNICEF’s protective environment strategy was adopted to promote the social welfare and justice systems, and to also expand programmatic coverage to include children and youth in post-conflict areas. The strategy included the creation of coordination working groups, volunteers, temporary distress hot line, community volunteers and teachers, advocacy and technical support to government and capacity building of justice sectors.</td>
<td>The evaluator found that the effectiveness of the programmes is in part due to the early linkage of the dual objectives of responding to the immediate needs of vulnerable groups of children and welfare and legal systems-building for all children. It was argued that the child protection systems were achieved and sustained in the early response tracing, reunification and safe space programmes as is evident in new policies and practices, reallocation of government funding, new government-civil society partnerships, emerging professional social service staff and a new university based school of social work. An innovative Juvenile Justice Programme was also established with results suggesting improvements in the treatment of children before, during and after trial. In addition, the Victim of Violence Programme provided higher standards of care than previously. The family tracing and reunification programme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
committees, social welfare centres at sub-district level, youth fora, school-based psychosocial support programmes, child justice initiatives, capacity building of social workers, advocacy and technical support for legal policy reform.

was effective but limited in scope.

Sri Lanka

The programme’s activities centred on identification, documentation, tracing and reunification of separated and unaccompanied children. It also focused on alternative care (e.g. foster care placements). The strategy included advocacy and technical assistance for legal policy changes, capacity strengthening of service providers and safe spaces for children.

2

The evaluator found that the programme succeeded in strengthening the child protection system in Sri Lanka. The strengthening of the child protection system is in large part due to early linkage of the dual objectives of responding to immediate needs of vulnerable groups of children and promoting welfare and legal systems-building for all children. Furthermore, safe spaces provided access to large numbers of children and case conferencing emerged as a promising means of preventing the institutionalization of children. Challenges included lack of policy compliance, shortage of service providers at district levels, limited capacity of teachers and high teacher-student ratios and funding limitations which affected the village based children’s clubs.

The findings suggest that child protection programmes implemented in transitional contexts found it difficult to make an efficient and effective shift to recovery and early development phases. For instance, in Algeria the evaluator stated that the content of training programmes was oriented to a disaster and emergency response, rather than regular mental health and psychosocial problems. In Senegal, the evaluator raised concerns about the messages used in MRE. The messages were designed in an emergency context and did not reflect the shift to a more peaceful environment and the range of emergent challenges to safe behaviour. In Iraq, UNICEF staff was “slow to adjust its response” to the post-war context; this led to delays in programming for child protection.

The findings suggest that in emergency and transitional contexts, at a strategic level it is essential to respond to immediate needs, while building the child protection system. In Sri Lanka, UNICEF was able to make this transition efficiently because it had linked the dual objectives of responding to the immediate needs of vulnerable children and systems-building for all children in its log frame. According to the evaluator of the programme in Indonesia, these two work strands should be seen as complementary. The latter should not be undertaken at the expense of addressing the immediate and pressing protection needs of vulnerable children. It was argued that an effective strategy for strengthening the child protection system is to build on the approaches and elements of ongoing service provision, while investing in policy development, capacity building efforts and supporting social change interventions to address harmful attitudes and practices. It was argued that capacity building of all key role players in children’s protective

environments, including parents, communities, social workers, policy-makers and government officials tends to be neglected in emergencies when it should be prioritized. Furthermore, building linkages between the different environments (child, family, community, sub-district, provincial, and national) is essential.
Chapter 3: Findings on Specific Child Protection Strategies

3.1 Strengthening Child Protection Systems

3.1.1 Introduction
A child protection system is constituted by laws, policies, regulations and services to support the prevention of and response to child protection risks and incidences in all social sectors, particularly social welfare, education, health, security, and justice. A range of state and non-state actors at different levels of governance are responsible for developing and implementing these services. In addition to law reform, policy development and standard setting initiatives, many actors and institutions require capacity strengthening and ongoing technical support with planning, budgeting, monitoring, and information management to ensure that child protection policies and programmes are implemented effectively and efficiently. They also require a coordination mechanism through which roles and responsibilities can be delegated and accountability and transparency ensured in order to deliver quality services to all children with a particular emphasis on the most vulnerable, socially marginalized, and ‘invisible’ groups of children.

The programmes that were reviewed in this meta-synthesis prioritize different aspects of child protection strengthening. This section discusses the effectiveness, relevance, and appropriateness of these programmes in relation to the following activities: advocacy for the inclusion of child protection in national government policies, laws and budgets; technical assistance in the development and revision of child protection legal frameworks and policies; strengthening of child protection services at decentralized level; strengthening social welfare, justice and associated sectors (education, health and mental health); and strengthening coordination amongst child protection actors. The tables provide detailed programmatic information about the issue, strategy, and result. This information can be supplemented by referring to Appendix 1, which contains further background on each programme.

3.1.2 Incorporating Child Protection into National and Decentralized Planning Processes
On the basis of her meta-evaluation of 59 UNICEF evaluations, Sheeran (2008) argued that UNICEF’s most effective work is at the national level in terms of strengthening government commitments through national plans/policies, building a legislative framework, providing opportunities for partners and stakeholders to convene and discuss child protection issues, and strengthening government capacities. However, she found that some of these successes were not translated to civil society and community level engagements and that UNICEF failed to use its ‘clout’ beyond the national level to decentralized levels of governance, particularly in monitoring and oversight. In this section, it is argued that implementation of government commitments remains poor and that far more needs to be done to monitor implementation, strengthen partner’s capacities and support coordination.

3.1.2.1 Advocacy
In the context of child protection, advocacy strategies seek to incorporate child protection into national and decentralized planning processes in social welfare, health, education and justice sectors, including social protection strategies. These efforts aim to secure greater political commitment by identifying vulnerable and marginalized children who require assistance and protection; identifying a minimum package of services to assist these children; lobbying for the inclusion of these services in legal frameworks and policies; mapping or assessing existing policies, laws and services, undertaking a cost analysis, and lobbying for adequate budget allocations. Table 4 provides a description of the strategies and results obtained from these advocacy efforts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Philippines | Children living on the streets | During the period 1986-2003 the National Project for Street Children (NPSC) programme made concerted advocacy efforts. This included lobbying for street children to be recognized as an issue; the involvement of Task Forces and | • Government ratification of the UNCRC and Optional Protocol;  
• Securing of finds from the Presidential Support Fund of the Programme Management System under the Office of the President;  
• A Comprehensive Programme |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Injury Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Highlights</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Working Groups in the drafting of Local Development Plans for Children; providing input into the Annual State of the Children's Situation; membership of the Local Council for the Protection of Children, the Commission for the Welfare and Protection of Children (CWPC) and Social Development Committees. The advocacy component of this programme was not pursued during the 2004-2006 period.</td>
<td>• Local Development Plans for Children for Street Children was developed by government. • Local Development Plans for Children&lt;sup&gt;124&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>UNICEF prioritized advocacy and policy development. In partnership with the Ministry of Health (MoH) and National and local Working Committees for Children and Women (NWCCW and local WCCWs), the Child Injury Prevention (CIP) programme engaged a wide range of stakeholders from local government authorities, All China Women's Federation (ACWF), health, education, public security, traffic police, and media sectors.</td>
<td>• The CIP programme was placed under the Health and Nutrition Programme in the 2006-2010 Country Programme cycle, the first programme with this focus in 30 years; • CIP was integrated into the National Plan of Action for Women and Children (2006-2010) and the Beijing Municipal Government Plan of Action for Women and Children (2006-2010) • Inclusion in the Ministry of Health’s Mother-Baby Package and the Ministry of Education’s national guidelines for school safety; the National Injury Prevention Framework; Beijing Plan of Action for School Health and Disease Prevention (2011-2016), Jiangxi Plan of Action for Women and Children (2011-2020) and the standard criteria for a Healthy City certified by the National Patriotic Health Campaign Committee Office (NPHCCO). • The development of safety-related policies and regulations in health, education and road transport at national, provincial and local levels.&lt;sup&gt;125&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Advocacy activities include discussions with relevant departments, lobbying for the revision of legislation, public meetings and awareness raising days (e.g. Thursday was Child Labour Day).</td>
<td>• The labour department agreed to hold open courts against employers (2005-2007);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Passing of legislation assuring children the right to free and compulsory elementary education. UNICEF was successful in ensuring that 30 days of absenteeism constitutes being out of school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>The Jamaican parliament was lobbied to address violence against children with support from UNICEF and external influential actors such as Professor Pinheiro.</td>
<td>• CAMP Bustamante was developed and implemented as a component of the healthy Lifestyles Programme in the Health Promotion and Protection division (HPPD) of the Ministry of Health and the Environment, as part of the National Strategic Plan for the Promotion of Healthy Lifestyles in Jamaica 2004-2008.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Advocacy</td>
<td>• The government of Mali signed bilateral and multilateral agreements with Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Senegal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The government implemented a system of travel documents for children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>School violence</td>
<td>Advocacy</td>
<td>• The concept ‘schools fit for children’ has been included as an aim of the National Plan of Action for Children (approved in February 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour and informal education</td>
<td>The advocacy strategy involved activities at national and local levels to eliminate child labour and eliminate hazards from workplaces. UNICEF coordinated these advocacy activities with ILO and ADB. Advocacy activities include the observance of national and international days, child rights week video documentation, gender stories etc.</td>
<td>This component was not described as effective given the fact that it was not seen as a priority and was therefore allocated very limited budget and trained human resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>UNICEF advocated national counterparts and the Ministry of Defence to encourage Vietnam’s accession to the Mine Ban Treaty</td>
<td>A positive relationship was forged between UNICEF and MOLISA; however, the evaluator recommends that UNICEF continue to advocate on the Mine Ban Treaty and develops an advocacy strategy on the Convention on Clusters Munitions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>At the early stage of the programme, there was no clear vision for mental health services. UNICEF advocated for this vision and the institutionalization of policies and structures, particularly as it applies to the issue of the psychosocial effects of terrorist violence on children and adolescents. • The psychosocial impact of armed conflict on children has been placed on the agenda, opening the way for treatment and prevention initiatives; • A national mental health policy represented in the National Mental Health Plan; • A number of public sector structures addressed this issue; • A child mental health policy was emerging.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Maldives | Tsunami | Advocacy • Decentralization of social services to the atolls ; • Drafting of periodic reports to the Committee on the Rights of the Child (2005); • Creation of a multi-sector working group to address gaps in the protective environment for children (2006) • Drafting of the Juvenile Justice Act, a National Strategic Plan for HIV/AIDS and the Children’s  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The advocacy strategy included a number of activities: collaboration with some <em>imams</em> and health personnel to develop advocacy messages; organization of awareness raising campaigns in each of the three regions; organization of a zero tolerance week.</td>
<td>With support from a wide range of stakeholders at central and regional levels, FGM/C was placed on the national agenda for debate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao</td>
<td>MRE</td>
<td>UNICEF provided information for awareness-raising and advocacy. It has also coordinated advocacy activities and has been designated the lead agency for advocacy.</td>
<td>Effectiveness of UNICEF’s support to advocacy are the “International Day for Mine Awareness and Assistance in Mine Action” on the 4th of April, progress towards universal ratification of the MBT and the visibility of UNICEF in international forum associated with the MBT.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>UNICEF advocated for the government to contribute financial and human resources to the programme.</td>
<td>Approximately 500,000 RMB were allocated to the programme to match funding from UNICEF. About 1,460 government personnel at various administrative levels, schools, kindergartens, and technical agencies contributed their staff time over a 5 year period.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF advocated for greater budget allocations for child protection programming.</td>
<td>The Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (NAD) budget for child protection and social welfare programmes increased by 684% since 2006. The Child Protection coordination offices under DINAS SOSIAL and KPAID (the Indonesian Child Protection Commission) each registered budget increases of 1,130% and 151% respectively. The ministry office for Women’s Empowerment in NAD, which has a mandate to do child protection.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

135 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>UNICEF advocated for the development of a national strategy to eliminate child labour.</td>
<td>138 The National Strategic Plan for the Prevention and Eradication of Child Labour and Protection of Adolescent Workers (2001-2005) was developed as the main national instrument to guide approaches to the issue of child labour. Other instruments were developed including the National Plan of Care for Children, public policy against commercial sexual exploitation, the National Plan against Commercial Sexual Exploitation Children and Adolescents, municipal plans, the revised National Policy for the Care of Children and Adolescents, Special Protection Policy, the National Policy on Solid Waste Management and the National Employment Policy and Promotion of Decent Work. Results suggest that there was a decrease of 6% in the incidence of child labour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Sexual violence</td>
<td>Various programmes within this programme advocated for an adequate legal policy framework.</td>
<td>139 The campaigns were not successful because the programmes did not receive adequate support to target the national and decentralized levels. The programmes were more successful in raising the awareness of international governments and donors on the situation of sexual violence and the need to mobilize resources.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Challenges, constraints and gaps

Despite these positive results, the programmes faced a number of challenges, constraints and gaps as identified by the evaluators. In terms of the advocacy messages, concerns were raised about the consistency of messages employed by UNICEF and partners. For instance, the evaluator of the Nepal programme stated that advocacy efforts were thwarted by contradictory messages, which arose out of ignorance of international law and/or the UN mandate in Nepal. 141 It was held that advocacy messages were also unclear and caused unintended negative results. For example, the evaluator of the New Delhi programme stated that UNICEF and other stakeholders advocated for a revision of the definition of child labour to refer only to those children engaged in hazardous work. The programme was successful in

bringing about a revision of the definition of child labour; the government revised it to refer to ‘any child out of school’. However, this wide definition created additional problems, as hazardous labour was often overlooked and neglected. Furthermore, the government defined a ‘child out of school’ as one who is absent for 90 days. This created latitude for absenteeism and child labour to flourish during the seasonal months. UNICEF has had to lobby government for reconsideration of this definition.\textsuperscript{142} Some advocacy campaigns were narrowly focused on a single issue and advocacy message. The evaluator argued that UNICEF focused narrowly on MRE in advocacy efforts in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao, rather than addressing other legal instruments related to human rights or the rights of people living with disabilities.\textsuperscript{143} Similarly, with reference to MRE in Vietnam, the evaluator stated that UNICEF did not adequately explore advocacy on the Conventions on Cluster Munitions because it focused exclusively on the Mine Ban Treaty.\textsuperscript{144}

The capacity to design and implement advocacy strategies also emerged as a challenge in terms of budgetary allocation, human resources and technical expertise. In terms of budgetary allocation, in the Philippines, advocacy activities were suspended due to lack of budget for photocopying materials and staff.\textsuperscript{145} Insufficient financial resources also affected the advocacy programme in Mauritania.\textsuperscript{146} In Bangladesh, the capacity of local staff (in terms of availability and expertise) to lobby and advocate for child protection was so limited that less than 10% of the budget allocated to advocacy was spent. Advocacy and communications were found to be inadequate in this context.\textsuperscript{147} Advocacy in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao suffered from a shortage of UNICEF personnel in country. The evaluator recommended an injection of human and financial investment for this activity.\textsuperscript{148}

Political will also emerged as a challenge preventing advocacy strategies from achieving positive results. Despite concerted advocacy by UNICEF and the CAAFAG Working Group in Nepal, the CPN-M was resistant to release children from the cantonments who could be used as a negotiating tool. UNICEF’s access to these cantonments was also restricted.\textsuperscript{149} The evaluator of the programme in Nepal stated that officials were unenthusiastic about the programme or had political reservations because their engagement with government officials was ad hoc, rather than regular and systematically planned with organized agendas and documentation of discussions and actions.\textsuperscript{150} In the DRC, despite extensive efforts to engage with government, they were unwilling to be involved.\textsuperscript{151} Government’s failure to respond to an advocacy campaign was also related to its capacity. A recurring constraint referred to across a number of reports, was limited government capacity in terms of time, human and financial resources to effectively engage with advocacy initiatives or implement the legislative and policy outputs of effective advocacy.\textsuperscript{152}

\textsuperscript{146} Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
\textsuperscript{150} Ibid.
Coordination of advocacy efforts also emerged as a challenge in different countries. Advocacy in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao was hindered by poor coordination between offices, particularly with the Human Rights Unit (HRU) or across the UN system. According to the evaluator, UNICEF assumed a leadership role rather than a “facilitators and enabler of others” when it came to advocacy. In another context, UNICEF failed to coordinate its advocacy efforts with other donor and humanitarian agencies. The evaluator of the Nepal programme stated that the donor/diplomatic community had a strong role to play in advocating for the release and reintegration of children through their diplomatic capacity; however, their role was confined largely to funding rather than diplomacy on this issue.

Lessons

The aforementioned advocacy strategies were effective in meeting their objectives because UNICEF and/or implementing partners undertook the following activities:

- They mapped the stakeholders in order to identify targets, influential actors and potential allies;
- They forged partnerships with key government actors around a particular child protection issue;
- They targeted regional, national and decentralized level stakeholders in advocacy campaigns;
- They led or participated in coordination meetings involving a range of relevant government and non-government stakeholders;
- They provided evidence to government stakeholders about the incidence and impact of the child protection issue, and backed this up with expert testimony, video evidence, case studies and so forth;
- They combined advocacy with large scale awareness-raising campaigns targeting government, civil society and local communities simultaneously;
- They forged partnerships with influential local leaders (e.g. religious leaders and health professionals) to put pressure on government to reform laws and policies;
- Systematically planned and documented advocacy activities.
- The dissemination of information pertaining to all meetings and advocacy initiatives.

Some of these lessons will be discussed in detail. In terms of evidence-based advocacy, it is useful to refer to the programme implemented in Thailand. A situational analysis of Thai children conducted by UNICEF in 2007 found that few children who had lost one or both parents in the Tsunami received support from government agencies and if they were admitted to government boarding schools, there was no systematic assessment of their family circumstances or attempts to explore alternatives. These findings then informed advocacy initiatives. Numbers of separated and orphaned children were used in UNICEF briefings and by other agencies for planning and advocacy. The Situation Analysis provided a clear evidence base for UNICEF’s advocacy regarding the dangers of residential care facilities in Tsunami-affected areas. Similarly in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao the evaluators noted that UNICEF has provided information upon which to base advocacy and awareness-raising efforts, although noted that effective advocacy requires a strengthened information management around the needs and rights of survivors and affected people.

It is essential to engage a wide range of stakeholders when designing and implementing advocacy messages. For example in Mauritania, the Medical Association and OBGYN developed an advocacy piece against FGM/C and religious leaders issued a fatwa against FGM/C. It is therefore important to advocate in partnership with different sectors to bring in greater resources and provide an opportunity to

---

157 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
influence larger programmes. National coordination mechanisms which include government actors, NGOs and development partners are a good platform for advocacy as was noted in Mauritania.

Advocacy messages should be based on the basic rights of the child and should use international child rights instruments as their foundation. For example, since India became signatory to the UN CRC (1989), UNICEF has managed to move the child labour issue forward in rapid strides. With reference to a programme in Upper Egypt, the evaluator stated that focusing only on the physical consequences of FGM/C leads to the medicalization of the process, which loses credibility when people do not know of cases which share such symptoms (e.g. ‘haemorrhage’) and when medical practitioners (i.e., with a vested interest in FGM/C) contradict such messages. The evaluator recommends that messages against FGM/C should be incorporated within the framework of child rights, human rights, gender based violence and adolescent reproductive health. The evaluator of a programme in Bangladesh noted that there is little evidence that a Rights Based Approach has influenced the planning or selection of advocacy activities. This was attributed to the finding that NGOs were not oriented to the broader mission of the programme, nor did they have the capacity to advocate for child rights.

The scope of advocacy campaigns should be carefully considered. Evidence suggests that advocacy alone will not bring about change. Collaborating with the government on the provision of humanitarian assistance assists in building trust and relationships which can strengthen advocacy efforts, as observed in Northern Uganda. In Upper Egypt, the FGM/C advocacy and awareness-raising programme was perceived as a ‘Western Conspiracy’ against Egyptian traditions and values, because it was not coupled with developmental assistance that would address pressing issues of poverty. Similarly in Senegal it was found that effective advocacy on FGM/C and early marriage, requires a wider scope. It should also be placed in the context of adolescent reproductive health so that it addresses pressing needs identified by local service providers and community members.

In order to sustain positive results and translate policy commitments into action, a long term advocacy strategy should be developed, as noted with reference to the programme in New Delhi. This strategy should address issues such as timing and sustainability. A long term development focus is needed which extends beyond advocacy and legal referral to strengthening national systems and community-based mechanisms for protection and responses to abuse. Advocacy should be undertaken simultaneously at various levels (policy level to implementation in the field). For example in New Delhi, the evaluator observed that field level actions are being supported by policy level initiatives such as the setting up of the child labour monitoring cell. In addition, advocacy should be combined with community mobilization and participation, empowerment of children and improvement of the quality of service provision, in order to have the most impact on children.

159 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
165 Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviors in Rural Areas of Senegal. Senegal.
169 Ibid.
3.1.2.2 Technical assistance in the development and revision of legislation and policies

This section should be seen in conjunction with the previous section on advocacy as both seek to promote the development and revision of legislation and policies so that they better serve the rights and needs of children. However, this section focuses largely on technical assistance, which includes research, analysis, advice, technical training and ongoing support in order to strengthen the legal policy framework. Table 5 describes the strategies and results of selected programmes.

Table 18: Legal policy technical assistance by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>In 2003 UNICEF signed a plan of action with the National Council for Motherhood and Childhood (NCCM). UNICEF agreed to provide technical and financial support to understand causes and determinants of FGM/C, supporting government and NGO initiatives at national and sub-national levels, supporting the development and implementation of a National Communication Plan, contributing to national dialogue, promoting regional exchanges, undertaking studies and research.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the programme’s technical unit should have been positioned within NCCM and should be integrated within the NCCM-led national campaign to create an enabling environment for policy change.170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>UNICEF supported policy and legislative development at the national level through: a study tour (in 2004 to Slovenia for a 12 member national delegation), working with the Expert Group on Children Deprived of Family Care, hosting a round table to discuss evaluation findings in November 2005.</td>
<td>The evaluator argued that policy development at national level was slow because it is a new concept, it lacked clear direction from the state and there was the lack of an integrated response from the donor community.171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>UNICEF provided advice for drafting regulations for the Interministerial Commission on Child Welfare and De-institutionalization, funded the Technical Secretariat and salary of the National Coordinator of the Commission, and developed service standards.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the programme is in line with national strategic objectives. The programme has influenced policies in the direction of family and community based alternatives. Results of inter-donor cooperation (EveryChild and UNICEF) include the establishment of Interministerial Commission on Child Welfare and De-institutionalization, the work on standards for alternative child care services and the government’s Optimization Plan on institutions. There were a number of obstacles and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Results include:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child protection</td>
<td>The strategy aimed to ensure that the National Policy on Women, CEDAW and Beijing +10 concerns (and Platform for the National Action) are implemented. In addition, UNICEF assisted the WAB/O to promote the legal provisions observed in the Constitution, National Family Law as well as the drafting and adoption and popularization of the regional Family Law. In addition, the programme provided training on gender mainstreaming techniques to officials.</td>
<td>Achievements include: Mainstreaming of the proclamations on Land Use and Forest Development and Utilization; investment guidelines and affirmative action of the Civil Service and Bureau of Education. 29 reports, procedures and guidelines of line offices and NGOs were also reviewed with a gender lens.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Advocacy, negotiation and technical support was provided by UNICEF. Three national consultants were selected to provide technical support to the Inter-ministerial Coordination Council and other government offices relevant to social welfare reform. Some key stakeholders went on a study tour to Italy.</td>
<td>Results include:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>UNICEF held a workshop in 2007 The national standards had not been evaluated.</td>
<td>The national standards had not been evaluated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue/Disaster</th>
<th>UNICEF Action/Partnerships</th>
<th>Results Include</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>UNICEF advocated for policy change and provided technical assistance on the issue of the reintegration of children affected by armed conflict.</td>
<td>The appointment of a focal point within the Ministry of Women, Children and Social Affairs; The Ministry of Peace and Reconstruction is working with the CAAFAG Working Group to produce and implement a national action plan for reintegration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF and NGO members of the Child Protection Working Group provided technical support to mainstream child protection issues.</td>
<td>UNICEF’s ‘protective environment’ strategy was adopted to promote the social welfare and justice systems and to expand programmatic coverage in post-conflict areas; The Child Protection Secretariat (CPS) was created under DINAS SOSIAL to coordinate social welfare and justice reform; A new Provincial Action Plan on Anti-Trafficking and new provincial Child Protection Legislation was approved by Parliament; The government adopted the Indonesian Government Policy on Separated Children, Unaccompanied Children and Children Left with One Parent in Emergency Situations; A moratorium was placed on adoptions of Acehnese children to allow for community-based solutions; Government-supported family reunification and trafficking prevention activities; The Aceh Governance Law and provincial child protection qanun (January 2009); The Provincial Body of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection was charged with ensuring the implementation of the qanun at district level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Advocacy and technical support through the national partnership was forged with the Department</td>
<td>Registration process for unaccompanied/separated children was established and announced in</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of Probation and Child Care Services (DPCCS), National Child Protection Authority (NCPA), UNICEF, Save the Children and other humanitarian agencies. UNICEF also provided technical support to the Centre for National Operations and national and district authorities.

- A moratorium was placed on the adoption of children affected by the Tsunami;
- Regularization of fostering placements with extended or non-family caregivers using existing legislation (by April 2005, 273 cases of fostering had been adjudicated in district courts with another 236 cases pending);
- Development of foster care systems, child friendly administrative and legal procedures, and care for victims of abuse in safe houses;
- An Action Plan for the reform of the social welfare system was drafted;
- An inter-agency Task Force was established to track and document child recruitment violations;
- The establishment of district child development committees (in 6 districts) and 9 psychosocial coordination networks.\(^{178}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thailand</th>
<th>Tsunami</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF worked closely with the Ministry of Social Welfare and Human Security, the Secretariat of the National Child Protection Committee based within that ministry, the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Interior (MOI) (responsible for local government structures) and a range of other relevant government bodies (e.g. regarding children in conflict with the law). A Child Protection Working Group was established which held regular conferences, workshops and meetings.</td>
<td>The evaluator referred to evidence of significant increased policy awareness of children’s issues as evident in MOI reports and publications.(^{179})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Challenges, constraints and gaps**

In order to strengthen leverage and influence, it is necessary to consider the positioning of the technical support teams. For example, the evaluator of the Upper Egypt programme stated that in order to create an enabling environment for policy change, the programme’s technical unit should have been positioned within the National Council for Motherhood and Childhood, the highest national body entrusted with policy making, planning, coordination and M&E for the protection and development of children.\(^{180}\) Although a technical unit may be based within one government institution, advocacy and technical support should not be directed to one sector alone. With reference to Nepal, an evaluator stated that more efforts should be

---

made to increase commitment from the more reluctant ministries. In Thailand, the more ‘reluctant’ ministry was the Ministry of Education which has engaged less with the issue of gender mainstreaming.

Scope should also be carefully considered when designing advocacy and technical assistance activities. In particular, evaluators across a number of reports stated that programmes should weigh up the consequences of focusing on a specific child protection issue or aiming for broader systems change. The evaluator of the programme in Tajikistan stated that policy development on de-institutionalization was slow because it was pursued in isolation from the comprehensive reform of child protection systems and the development of child protection legislation. As a result, policy and legislative development lacked clear direction. For instance, government closed down residential institutions rapidly before establishing a continuum of services and viable alternatives for children. Similarly, emphasis was placed on de-institutionalization without sufficiently considering the process by which in-depth family assessments would be conducted before reintegration. This concern was reiterated by the evaluator of the Swaziland programme. There were some successes in ensuring that the child protection policy was drafted in 2003, but the evaluator stated that it should have been accompanied by a welfare plan which outlines activities and processes associated with the restructuring of social welfare structures, coordination, training and staff development. Similarly in relation to gender mainstreaming, the evaluator of the Ethiopian programme stated that despite the programme’s efforts to develop a gender mainstreaming policy supported by capacity building efforts, the absence of a national strategy in this regard has hindered effectiveness at national and regional levels. This national strategy should address the lack of gender representativeness/ WAO presence in cabinet so as to enhance their ability to influence policy and decision-making. Hence, focusing exclusively on gender mainstreaming policies instead of national strategic reform hindered the effectiveness of this programme. On the other hand, the evaluator of the Azerbaijan programme stated that the initial planning was too ambitious. The programme tried to advocate and support the overall reform of child protection services in a country where community-based social services were in their infancy, alternative care services were not in place and the concept of case management was unknown to service providers. “In other words, the programme targeted a complex infrastructural change, whose foundations still had to be designed and initiated”. As a result, the programme purpose which was to enhance government capacities for restructuring the child welfare system will require a longer term implementation framework to be fully met. It is important to note that in the context of Mongolia, the evaluator stated that child protection systems building and specific child protection issues such as children in conflict with the law should not be addressed separately. Child protection systems building can leverage the preliminary groundwork established in justice reform efforts.

Technical assistance is only the first step in incorporating child protection into national and decentralized planning processes. The evaluator of the Tajikistan programme stated that an effective programme not only provides technical assistance in the development of legislation and policies, but also supports the development of an implementation plan. Some of the shortcomings in the draft de-institutionalization law included a lack of clear roles and mandates and a lack of provisions to regulate the social work profession. Technical assistance with the aim to improve a specific legislation or policy should be coupled with a clear plan delegating roles and responsibilities, reporting and regulatory frameworks across sectors. In Tajikistan the lack of clear mandates had a negative effect on programme

---

effectiveness. For example, residential institutions were previously under the authority of the Ministry of Finance but staff salaries were paid by the Ministry of Health. They were then handed over to the Ministry of Education. Until handover was completed, the institutions were not obliged to release information to the Ministry of Education or to submit to inspections. The funding of institutions also countered the objectives of the programme. At the time of the evaluation, funding was contingent on numbers of children residing in the institution. Furthermore, as employment issues were not addressed in relation to de-institutionalization, the staff and management at institutions were very resistant and hostile to the programme. Given the handover process, it was unclear which institution should take responsibility for this regulation. Similar challenges were encountered in Azerbaijan. The programme made some progress in terms of achieving a shared vision among policy makers on the need to reform child welfare services for children, but policy and decision-makers did not have a clear understanding of the organizational and management requirements to promote the reform. In order to strengthen capacity, evaluators suggest that technical assistance should be broadly defined to include training and the development of minimum standards, cost analysis and other tools that can be used to implement legislation and policies.

Attribution should also be considered when deriving conclusions about the effectiveness of advocacy and technical assistance. A number of examples reveal the extent to which external factors affect levels of political will. For example, in Upper Egypt the programme was hindered by the unclear stance of the Ministry of Health towards those practicing FGM/C. However, the death of an 11 year old girl in a private clinic from FGM/C complications in July 2007, led to a media campaign against FGM/C, a fatwa against FGM/C by the Grand Mufti of Egypt and a new decree by the Ministry of Health banning the practice. In this changing political environment, the programme suddenly made headway in terms of advocacy and technical support. However, another external factor had an impact upon the effectiveness of this programme. The evaluator stated that international political events such as the American invasion of Iraq and Israel’s military attacks on Lebanese and Palestinian villages had an impact on the way that the programme was perceived by policy-makers and communities: “Supporters of FGM/C link the programme activities to these events and label the programme as a western conspiracy to demolish values and morality”. The evaluator of the Georgia programme stated that the election of Saakashvili in 2004 created a more conducive political environment for social welfare reform.

However, an obstacle faced by the Tajikistan programme was that political changes and reshuffles had an impact upon the government’s institutional memory in relation to advocacy and technical assistance rendered by the programme staff. In Azerbaijan the evaluator stated that the political context was not conducive for the implementation of any reform related to the provision of services. This is related to a lack of accountability; patronage and corruption governing the appointment of managers and operators; and the absence of a tradition of political consultation and negotiation for the reform of legislation. These factors have hindered the establishment of operational mechanisms that would facilitate the reform process.

**3.1.2.3 Strengthening child protection services at decentralized levels of governance**

In order to ensure that positive changes are made in the lives of children, families and communities, it is imperative that programmers shift their focus from advocacy and capacity building at the national level, to decentralized levels of governance at provincial, district and local levels. National/central level policy makers can create a protective environment for children by making a commitment to fulfill their protection rights, developing adequate legislation and enforcement, and establishing the structures for basic and targeted services, monitoring and oversight. However, implementation of these laws, policies and services rests largely in the hands of decentralized level actors whose will, resources and capacity

---

189 Ibid.
193 Ibid.
195 Ibid.
determine the extent to which a protective environment for children is ensured in reality. Furthermore, those who come into contact with children tend to operate at these decentralized levels. As they have so much say, power and influence over children’s access to services and protection, it is therefore essential that these decentralized actors understand the importance of incorporating child protection into their planning and service provision processes, and have the structures, budgets, tools and capacity to do so. Table 6 describes the strategies and results of selected programmes when targeting decentralized levels of governance.

Table 19: Strengthening decentralized levels of governance: strategies and findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>The programme established Child Rights Departments (CRD) at local level in each of the 5 pilot areas under the control of local government. The CRD’s role is to coordinate and supervise the deinstitutionalization process (closure of residential institutions and reintegration of children) and to establish a gate-keeping mechanism to prevent the unnecessary institutionalization of children.</td>
<td>When compared to baseline data gathered in 2003/2004 before the start of the programme, the evaluator noted that the programme had a significant effect on the numbers of children referred to institutions and the number of requests received by 2005/2006. In 2004, Gafurov received 120 requests for placement and 22 children were admitted to institutions. In 2006, this number had dropped to 6 requests and no admissions were made. In Kanibadam, requests dropped from 93 in 2003 to 5 in 2005, of which none were admitted. This sparked national debate around the need for reform at national and local levels.197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care – children living with disabilities</td>
<td>The programme supported a gate-keeping scheme for children living with disabilities. UNICEF developed a Psychological-Medical-Pedagogical Consultation (PMP) in Dushanbe under the City Education and City Health Departments. UNICEF assisted in developing regulations governing the roles, responsibilities and structure of the PMP consultation.</td>
<td>The evaluator states that this strategy reduced the number of children living with disabilities from entering institutional care by 30-35% (baseline data was not available in the report). In the 6 months preceding the evaluation, only 25% of assessed cases were sent to institutions. PMP also found that many children living in institutions have been misdiagnosed and have supported their family reintegration and entrance into mainstream schools.198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>Task Forces and Working Groups became members of the Local Council for the Protection of Children and were actively involved in the drafting of Local Development Plans for Children and Local Investment Plans.</td>
<td>Attempts to integrate/mainstream children into local development plans met with varying success.200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

198 Ibid.
200 Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Child Abuse and Exploitation System</th>
<th>Programme Support</th>
<th>Government Collaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lao PDR          | Living on the streets               | The programme has worked closely with the Vientiane Capital Department of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare. Weekly meetings were held and written progress reports shared between programme staff and district government officials. | Collaboration with officials at provincial, district and village level was described as ‘generally strong’. However, there were a number of gaps and challenges concerning district-level authorities.  
| Philippines      | Child abuse and exploitation        | Efforts have been made at the regional level to make the Sagip Batang Manggagawa (SBM) mechanism operational. | Strategies to localize the SBM mechanism need to be improved.  
| Bosnia Herzegovina| Child protection systems            | The programme supported the establishment of Municipal Management Boards (MMBs) in 5 core municipalities. International Bureau for Humanitarian Issues (IBHI) provided management training to the MMBs. | MMBs had been established in all five core municipalities. They have completed two year child protection plans with associated budgets. The following results were listed: MMBs have accepted their key role in child protection at the municipal level; MMBs feel more competent to adopt this role; MMBs are developing more partnerships and networks with different municipal actors; MMB members are working well together; municipal authorities reported increased awareness on child protection issues largely due to the adoption of municipal plans.  
| India            | Child labour                        | The programme was placed under the district administration with the coordinator on deputation from government. This coordinator was crucial to the functioning of the programme and was therefore selected on the basis of previous experience on similar programmes and sensitivity to field realities. | Embedding the programme within district government structures not only ensured government buy in as it was seen as part of the district administration, but approvals and budget releases were timely and smooth. The programme was successful in obtaining priority attention from the district administration in terms of infrastructure development, deployment of teachers, starting of residential and day bridge centres for working children, mobilizing resources for the education of girls beyond the elementary level. It also activated the district agriculture department to undertake a survey of all farmers growing cottonseed as a first step to a sensitization campaign.  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>One of the goals of the programme was institutional strengthening at municipal level. The evaluator stated that the programme failed to achieve this objective. Apart from the engagement of schools and public libraries, local and municipal authorities did not participate actively in the programme.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The programme aimed to promote an intersectoral vision and decentralization of activities related to mental health/psycho-social wellbeing. The strategy included the creation of a functional network around focal points in several Wilayas. Effectiveness varied according to Wilayas, access to resources, understanding of decentralization, selection of focal point and future vision for child mental health.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Decentralized Social Services Tsunami funding enabled the government and UNICEF to revitalize pre-existing plans for the decentralization of social services. This included the establishment of 21 social service centres and social work training. Despite strengthening services at decentralized levels, awareness of the services by community residents hindered effectiveness.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>As part of the broader protective environment strategy, UNICEF and members of the Child Protection Working Group aimed to improve child protection at provincial, district and sub-district levels. Results include the placement of 240 social workers at sub-district level, the establishment of child protection bodies (LPAs) at the sub-district levels, youth fora at district levels, youth coordinating council at provincial level, integrated service centres (PPT) for abuse and exploitation at district level, children’s desks at district police offices and a separate children’s court in three districts. Provincial level financial allocations to child protection and social welfare activities increased and new provincial action plans on trafficking and child protection were approved by parliament.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF sought to strengthen child protection at the local level. UNICEF helped to establish functioning district child development committees (in 6 districts) and 9 psychosocial coordination networks The evaluator argued that the district child development committees fulfilled a prevention and response purpose by mitigating risk and increasing the referral of cases to the statutory system and protective structures. The coordination networks facilitated information sharing and strengthened</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Issue</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>The Department of Local Administration (DLA) of the Ministry of Interior collaborated with UNICEF on increasing the roles and duties of local authorities in social development to better respond to children's rights. Core activities in 2007 included a Local Capacity Assessment; Assessment of health and nutritional status of underprivileged women and children in six Tsunami affected provinces; a Children’s Rights and Local Planning for Children Advocacy Workshop (2007); Provincial Training Workshops; Local authorities formed multi-sectoral teams (MST) on children’s rights and local planning and formulated children and youth plans, which were submitted to the Provincial Office for Local Administration; Materials on Child Rights and Development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|泰国 |海啸 | 国际发展署（DLA）与联合国儿童基金会合作，增加了地方当局在社会发展的角色和职责，以更好地响应儿童的权利。2007年的核心活动包括地方能力评估；健康和营养状况的评估，以及在六个受海啸影响的省份中对弱势妇女和儿童的评估；儿童权利和地方规划倡导工作坊（2007）；地方培训研讨会；地方当局组建了多部门团队（MST）来关注儿童权利和地方规划，并制定了儿童和青年计划，并将这些计划提交给地方行政办公室；儿童权利和发展材料。 | 据评估员所示，有效性的以下几点：
- 根据地方当局的职责和地方能力评估的发现，改进地方儿童和青年规划流程是合适的；
- 程序与关键MOI/DLA官员合作；
- 培训内容广受赞赏；
- 儿童和青年规划倡议的独特性往往不明确；
- 少有证据表明儿童参与了计划的制定，除了公开听证会的安排；
- 儿童和青年计划的可用性和使用有限；
- 样本中20个青年计划中有4个较弱，剩余的17个计划虽然涉及了适当元素，但可能没有改变地方当局的议程。 |
| Mexico  | School violence | The programme forged partnerships with federal education officials in order to roll the programme out.                                                                                                           | 由于该计划在2003-2004年周期的成功，教育为和平被采用为联邦教育服务管理在墨西哥城的工作计划，并开始从SEP获得财政支持。联邦行政官员要求将该计划从250所扩展到300所私立学校。 |
| 尼加拉瓜 | 青少年暴力 | 该计划倡导将儿童劳动纳入市政当局和其他地方行动者的议程。                                                                                                                                   | 72个计划中的48个聚焦于预防、消除儿童劳动和保护儿童劳动者的主题。目标是形成61个市政当局的经营计划，其中包括最高的儿童最恶劣形式的发生。 |

210 ibid.
212 Evaluation of the External Programme “Against Violence…We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”.
labour was met satisfactorily. Further, 25% of municipalities incorporated the issue of prevention and eradication of child labour and protection of adolescent workers into their line of work.  

| Colombia | Children affected by armed conflict | The projects are implemented in departments and municipalities where there are children vulnerable to marginalization and / or being detached from armed groups. | The programme stimulated high levels of engagement from municipal stakeholders. In 136 municipalities, 69 “rolled the ball” (i.e. supported the sports programmes) and 30 are expected to have the conditions to “roll the ball”; 37 other municipalities did not meet minimum conditions “to start the process”. Concerns were raised about lack of provincial ownership of the programme. |

Challenges, constraints and gaps

In terms of gaps, some evaluators criticized the programmes for failing to support decentralized planning and policy-making processes. With reference to the child injury programme in Vietnam, the evaluator stated that the programme focused exclusively on policy development and enforcement at the national level, rather than supporting policy development at district and provincial levels. It was argued that an ‘Instruction’ from the Provincial People’s Committee and district counterparts would have been useful in terms of spreading the model to non-participating districts, promoting learning, and integrating injury prevention in the design of local infrastructure projects. In Vietnam, advocacy and technical assistance centred more on the national and provincial levels, largely because the Ban Treaty was such a politicized issue. As a result, national and provincial ownership and engagement with the programme did not trickle down to the district or commune level. In Cambodia the programme supported the creation of an Anti-Trafficking and Reintegration Office (ATRO) at the national level, without setting up similar structures at other levels of governance. As a result, transit centres and other relevant sub-national bodies, operated with little supervision or oversight from the national level, thereby raising concerns about the protection of vulnerable adults and children who are ostensibly in ‘state care’.

Confusion around the concept ‘decentralization’ was noted in the Algerian report. Many actors did not understand UNICEF’s objective to strengthen decentralization. Some saw it in structural, policy and financial terms, while UNICEF understood it in network terms i.e. supporting initiatives and activities in different Wilayas. This led to some dissatisfaction with the programme, as certain district stakeholders were frustrated that they did not receive their share of authority and control of resources that they associated with decentralization.

Many of the interventions aimed to ensure that child protection was incorporated in provincial or municipal level plans. These programmes encountered a number of challenges. In terms of appropriateness, relevance and quality, the evaluator of the Bosnia Herzegovina programme stated that the municipal development plans in the 5 core municipalities were not tailored to their unique socio-economic contexts but were implemented directly as a result of the International Bureau for Humanitarian Issues (IBHI)  

214 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.  
training. It was also argued that the planning process was not inclusive and participatory; and no provisions were made for M&E which suggests that the plans were not results-based.\textsuperscript{215} The evaluation of the programme in Thailand raised a number of concerns about the children and youth plans that were developed at local level. First, only between 20-40\% of tambons actually produced plans as specified. Many were uncertain on the role of the Children and Youth Plans. Second, the available Children and Youth Plans indicated a need for significant strengthening. Of the 20 out of 74 audited plans, 4 plans were judged as weak, failing to provide substantive advocacy for the needs of children. 15 addressed appropriate elements but were unlikely to shift the agenda of local authorities. Third, the evaluator notes that there is little evidence the quality of planning for children and youth has improved partly for budgetary and management reasons. The evaluator recommended sustained government engagement to improve the quality and implementation of local planning and provision for children and youth.\textsuperscript{220}

Implementation of these plans was hindered by the capacity of district, provincial and central governments. At the district level, the evaluator of the programme in Lao PDR stated that despite the generally collaborative relationship with government officials there were a number of gaps at district level, including the lack of awareness of district officials in relation to programme activities and services; the failure of district officials to participate in the programme; district officials’ reference to street children as a ‘problem’ and their recommendation that large residential centres far out of town be developed for these children, which counters child rights principles and programme objectives.\textsuperscript{221} At the provincial level, challenges were also encountered. The evaluator of the programme in the Philippines stated that the main challenge lies in limited capacity at the provincial level for SBM mechanisms. In addition to training, the evaluator recommended elucidating agreed procedures and the role of partners, developing standard protocols, integrating the Sagip Batang Manggagawa (SBM) mechanism into existing provincial bodies; improving reporting mechanisms and linking child protection activities at the local level to provincial and central levels.\textsuperscript{222} Although these programmes targeted decentralized levels of governance, the capacity and political will of the central government also had an impact upon effectiveness. The evaluator of the de-institutionalization programme in Tajikistan stated that as there was no clear grasp of the complexities of child protection, the central government placed pressure on the local government to close residential facilities far quicker than was appropriate, at the cost of the development of community based family support services to prevent abandonment and institutionalization.\textsuperscript{223} The relationship between central and local governments also affected programme success. The de-institutionalization programme in Tajikistan was constrained by poor communication between and local and central governments on the implementation of child protection. This was exacerbated by the absence of a national body with a specific responsibility for strategy and policy development on child protection.\textsuperscript{224}

Programme coordination also emerged as a challenge in these interventions at local levels. In Tajikistan there was confusion between the newly formed Child Rights Departments (CRDs) at local level and the newly established PMP when considering cases involving children living with disabilities. The evaluator recommended that PMP should not retain responsibility for deciding on the institutionalization of children, but this should be made by the local expanded CRD, and then subject to external evaluation.\textsuperscript{225} In Bosnia Herzegovina, there were misunderstandings about the roles of different members of the MMBs and of the overarching role of the MMBs themselves.\textsuperscript{226} Poor intersectoral coordination was also raised as barrier to success. In Colombia one of the constraints at the local and municipal level was the lack of coordination and meaningful participation from state entities. Their participation was declared in various official documents, but in practical terms, there was a low level of active participation apart from selected schools.

\textsuperscript{221} Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.
\textsuperscript{224} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{225} Ibid.
and public libraries. In the Sri Lankan programme the local capacity programme involves different divisions in the Department of Local Administration. Programme staff found it difficult to obtain mutual agreement across divisions. This was further complicated by the fact that the Ministry of Interior/Department of Local Administration had little background training and experience on children and development, and had to rely on assistance from the Ministry of Public Health and the Ministry of Social Development and Human Security.

A further constraint in a number of programmes was the inadequate budget allocations for the provision of child protection services at decentralized levels. In Bosnia Herzegovina one of the key challenges was the lack of a legal and budgetary framework, which affected the ability of municipal authorities and responsible institutions to absorb new methods. The evaluator of the Sri Lankan programme stated that local authorities tended to implement children and youth development programmes in accordance with their pre-existing budget framework without engaging in discussions around the appropriateness of these allocations. In Sri Lanka, local officials stated that they could not implement Children and Youth Plans because their budget for work with children and youth had not increased. Across all 6 provinces, there was a modest increase in spending on children and youth activities – from 4% in 2008 to 4.8% in 2009.

Management and human resources also emerged as challenges in terms of developing and implementing local plans. In terms of the former, local authorities in Thailand stated that if top executive officials are not interested in children and development, they cannot implement their development plans. These chief executives failed to attend trainings and were not aware of the expectations of planning. Therefore one lesson emerging from this programme was that securing the commitment of executive chiefs is a major factor in securing progress. The evaluator recommended that provincial officers should have played a key role in following up on the progress of planning at the local level and sharing such information with the central ministry. In terms of human resources, a high turnover of focal points resulted in discontinuity in the Algerian programme. This was associated with high levels of stress and burnout because they were responsible for child mental health coordination in the whole Wilaya and received little support from the administration.

Participatory programming was not prioritized in local level planning. Despite their successes in supporting the decentralization of social services in the Maldives, many community members were unaware of the services available. As a result, the effectiveness of the programme was limited by the absence of a community engagement strategy and civil society involvement. The Thai programme failed to encourage the participation of children in the development of local development plans. This is indicative of a lack of awareness around the importance of engaging children and youth in matters that affect them.

### 3.1.2.4 Synthesized findings, lessons and recommendations for Section 2.2.2

#### Box 2: Generalizable lessons

**Advocacy:**
- It is important to undertake stakeholder mapping in order to identify targets, influential actors and potential allies.
- It is necessary to forge partnerships with key government actors around a particular child protection issue.
- Advocacy campaigns should target regional, national and decentralized level stakeholders;

---

227 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
232 Ibid.
• Coordination structures and activities are an important vehicle for advocacy;
• Advocacy should be based on sound evidence about the incidence and impact of child protection violations.
• Advocacy should be combined with large scale awareness-raising campaigns targeting government, civil society and local communities simultaneously.
• It is useful to forge partnerships with influential local leaders (e.g. religious leaders and health professionals) to put pressure on government to reform laws and policies.
• Advocacy activities should be systematically planned.
• All advocacy activities and outcomes should be systematically documented and shared with stakeholders.
• Advocacy messages should be clear and consistent, and based on an in-depth understanding of the context and legal policy framework. They should therefore be developed in consultation with a wide range of stakeholders.
• Advocacy messages should be based on the basic rights of the child and should use international child rights instruments as their foundation.
• Strategic decisions should be made around the scope of advocacy campaigns; for instance, is it worthwhile to target a specific piece of legislation or expand to include other laws and policies related to a specific issue? Is it worthwhile to move beyond advocacy around a specific child protection issue to advocacy for wider systemic reform?
• Advocacy requires time, resources and a particular set of skills. Implementing partners’ work plans, budgets and human resource capacity should reflect this.
• In order to increase advocacy leverage, it is important to coordinate advocacy activities with other humanitarian and donor agencies.
• Advocacy may be successful in terms of producing revised legislative, policy and budgetary outputs. The impact, however, may be limited because government does not have the capacity to implement these adequately.
• Advocacy should be coupled with long term development strategies so as to increase government buy-in and community-support. It should also be undertaken with activities that seek to mobilize the community, empower children and improve the quality of service provision.

Technical assistance:
• In order to strengthen leverage and influence, it is necessary to consider the positioning of the technical support teams.
• Although a technical unit may be based within one government institution, advocacy and technical support should not be directed to one sector alone.
• Scope should also be considered in relation to whether technical assistance around a specific child protection issue will be effective if it is undertaken in isolation from broader systems change.
• Technical assistance in terms of legal policy reform should be coupled with implementation plans and capacity building interventions.
• External factors that may pose a threat to the programme should be identified in the planning phase.

Decentralized levels of governance:
• It is essential to provide support to both central and decentralized levels of governance in order to strengthen the protective environment for children.
• It is necessary to clarify the concept ‘decentralization’ at the outset in order to ensure that all stakeholders and partners expectations are in alignment.
• Local plans for child protection need to be adapted to the local context.
• Quality control measures should be put in place to ensure that local plans are effective, appropriate, relevant and sustainable.
• The capacity of district, provincial and central governments should be considered when developing local plans.
• Investments should be made in strengthening coordination and communication between levels of governance (central to local) and across sectors.
• A cost analysis of the provision of child protection services should be undertaken at decentralized levels. This can be used to advocate for additional budget allocations.
• It is essential to obtain the buy-in and increase the capacity of policy makers and managers at decentralized levels.
• Support should be provided to local level government staff in terms of resources, training and psychosocial support.
• Participatory programming should be encouraged in local level planning. The involvement of community members, families and children will enable local planners to develop targeted, effective and relevant plans.

3.1.3 Strengthening the Social Welfare Sector

3.1.3.1 Introduction

Social welfare is a key sector to engage in order to prevent and respond to child protection risks and violations. Child protection programmes aiming to strengthen child protection systems often target or are undertaken in partnership with the social welfare sector. Strategic approaches include advocacy, policy development, capacity building, enhancing management and oversight, improving monitoring and information management and systematically strengthening the quality of social work. This section discusses these approaches in relation to ‘support in strategic planning, models and guidelines’, capacity strengthening (human resources and infrastructure), and specific social work practices such as immediate response, case management and social protection reform.

3.1.3.2 Support in strategic planning and capacity strengthening

In order to support the social welfare sector to assume an upstream role in child protection systems, advocacy and technical support has been provided to social welfare actors to strengthen their capacity in strategic planning. The outputs include basic guidelines, standards, tools and strategic documents. In terms of results, reference has been made to higher levels of awareness, cooperation and skills among social welfare service providers and improved outcomes for children. Strategic planning was also accompanied by capacity building. UNICEF and partners supported the recruitment, training and supervision of social workers in order to promote the implementation of regulations and guidelines and to improve the quality of service provision.

Table 20: Strengthening the social welfare sector by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Maldives | Tsunami| The programme implemented a new model of service delivery to overcome the centralized and voluntary traditional model. The new model was a continuation of central services offered by the Department of Gender and Family Services (DGFPS) and FCPU/MPS in Malé. It included a new dedicated Family Protection Unit (FPU) at the Indira Gandhi Memorial Hospital and the creation of Family and Child Service Centres (FCSC) at the atoll capitals. Training was provided to social workers and to FCSC centre and ministry personal on the statutory requirements of national policies. | • UNICEF developed a Procedure Manual on Delivery of Services, upon which staff and ministry personnel were trained.  
• FPU provided support to women and children affected by violence. From August 2005 to June 2006, a total of 49 cases of child abuse were recorded by the unit.  
• The establishment of the FCSCs in 21 atolls also led to increased reporting of child protection concerns and an overall increase in public awareness about child abuse. 73% of staff at the 11 FCSCs noted increased awareness about the centre and child abuse issues, and 55% stated that formal reporting has improved. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Residential care</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Basic social welfare training was provided to teaching and care staff in 6 institutions over a 5-6 month period to equip them with assessment and reintegration skills, enable them to identify parents and extended family, prepare families and children for return. Training was conducted by ORA International and by a local social work trainer. The courses were designed by students taking part in a Stockholm University social work course, who first took part in taught course modules, then developed training modules for Tajikistan. They then visited pilot areas to deliver modules and seminars. On these visits they collected information on children who are in residential care and submitted the reports to the Deputy Minister of Labour and Social Protection.</td>
<td>• The programme introduced notions of good social work practices, including investigation, assessment and care planning; training of staff in social work skills at a local level in institutions and child rights departments; effective gate keeping to prevent children who are not in need from entering institutions; and a general shift in mindset that a child needs to grow up in a family environment and that institutionalization should be undertaken as a last resort. • Staff from institutions expressed frustration at not being able to use the skills they have learnt following the closure of residential facilities; • Concerns were raised about the changes in the composition of the Mobile Group, which was initially envisaged as a national level group composed of government, media and NGO representatives, rather than Stockholm University Students. The former would have been better positioned to monitor and assess the progress of pilot sites and could have developed and advocated on policy and programming. • As the courses were designed in Stockholm, the evaluator noted that they were removed from field realities and did not enhance the quality of their work. • A national competency based training scheme for social workers was recommended.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>The FS&amp;FC programme employed and trained social workers. 42 social workers were formally employed by MoES with funding from EveryChild for</td>
<td>The programme introduced elements of practice that formed the basis for the development of a gate keeping and case management system in Georgia;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Country   | Children living on the streets | National Project for Street Children/National Network for Street Children (NPSC/NNSC) focused on the training of service providers on how to assist children living on the streets between 2004 and 2006. | Case management tools, social worker’s job descriptions and standards for childcare services were developed.  
The capacity of social workers on case management tools and the care of children in institutions increased.  
Concerns were raised that the training was too narrow and that the social workers required broader training in psychology, communication skills and legal issues.  
The majority of stakeholders and service users expressed high levels of satisfaction with the service, the number of self-referrals has increased and the commitment and professionalism of social workers was commended.  
• The design of the training courses was not based on evidence as no proper training needs analysis was conducted;  
• Training workshops were not monitored in terms of quality of instruction;  
• There was no follow-up on trainees to see if the skills were useful  
• There was no impact evaluation of the training.  
• 24 support staff completed basic training in social work;  
• Social workers assumed leadership roles;  
• The training was “appropriate, of high quality and effective”;  
• In post training evaluations, 100% of staff described it as good quality;  
• Requests for additional training included drug abuse, English language skills, First Aid and basic computer training;  
• 3 government staff were integrated and trained as social workers, of whom 2 have management responsibility over the drop in

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Activities and Challenges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Children living on the streets and child migration</td>
<td>One objective of staff at the drop in centres was to build the capacity of government staff working there.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The programme developed guidebooks for working in shelters, standard operating procedures for drop in centres and strengthened case management;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Government staff appeared unwilling and unmotivated to actively participate in the programme and learn from the programme staff. This was demoralizing for programme staff, who ended up assuming the roles and responsibilities of government social workers;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Management of this process was uneven due to the reassignment of senior level staff in the drop in centres.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Centres were established by the government and UNICEF, with support from implementing partners. One of the implementing partners was a government agency (The Ministry of Economic Planning). In order to strengthen the capacity of the centre, 16 permanent government staff worked alongside 16 ad hoc staff specialists. 11 volunteers and 2 youth had undergone UNICEF’s peer education training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Concerns were raised about the capacity of the permanent staff drafted from different government missions as they did not have the specific vocational skills required by the centre.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Programme personnel and local authorities were trained on abandonment prevention, working with children and procedures for evaluating professional parental social assistants. Once a month the team met local authority specialists to discuss the programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Staff and local authorities benefitted from the theoretical and practical training which was adapted to different situations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• The models upon which they were trained (include evaluating the child, family and community using an ecological map) should be reproduced as they offer a sound theoretical base and practical application.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### Evaluation of the Child and Family in Risk Situations in Ungheni District Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>The programme aimed to build the capacity of social services. Three of four planned activities were undertaken to achieve this result. 10 high level government officials made a study visit to Italy with support from an international non-governmental organization, EducAid which was tasked with establishing social service mechanisms. Stockholm University organized workshops to inform the development of guidelines and standards. EducAid ran a cycle of workshops throughout the country with service providers on case management and networking methodology. EducAid conducted three cycles of workshops in five regions, reaching more than 150 members of the Commission on Minors and Social Protection Services, 40 managers and staff of child care institutions and 60 representatives from civil society. A monitoring mission was conducted in all residential institutions; • The study visit was described as a success by key stakeholders as it stimulated interest in the rights of children to grow up in families and in the Italian model of decentralization of services. • Stockholm University developed a manual on Basic Guidelines and Standards for Child Protection in Social Work, which was fully endorsed by MoLSP. • The involvement of service providers in the EducAid workshops was particularly successful as it stimulated the cooperation of various services at local level on case management. In one district, it led to the creation of a local child protection council with the involvement of service providers and NGOs, who have tried to strengthen referral mechanisms and facilitated the reunification of some children living in residential care. • The overall impact of the training workshops was a &quot;radical change in the social services system&quot;. 243</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

institutions. The recommendations were endorsed by the Minister of Education in 2007.

- As a result of the workshops and discussions with policy makers and service providers, basic guidelines and standards for child protection in social work were prepared by Stockholm University and finalized with input from various stakeholders. The final document was presented in April 2007 for further testing.
- High levels of awareness about the needs and rights of children deprived of parental care, among a range of actors;
- High levels of cooperation among service providers in some districts;
- Innovative models of social services were under discussion within the Ministry of Labour and Social Protection;
- As a result of the reform, the number of children in institutions has decreased by 563 in two years and there are cases of children reunified with their families.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>The programme facilitated the recruitment and training of social workers who were placed at the Bustamante Hospital for Children. Staff was trained on how to screen children for levels of risk of abuse, who would then receive social work interventions or be referred to relevant support services. The screening tools adopted were based on the Ecomap and Genogram that enable social workers to capture environmental and family risks and protective factors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The international NGO HealthNet Transcultural Psychosocial Organization (TPO) was responsible for training staff on psycho-social assistance, a new concept to the country.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


245 Ibid.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF provided training and technical support to the Family Protection Unit (FPU) at Indira Gandhi Memorial Hospital. In addition, in 2008 30 social workers graduated from the SSW course and started working in the 21 FCSCs in the atolls.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The FPU became the first point of contact for children entering the health system with abuse issues or mental health/trauma related to the Tsunami. The trained social workers used the practical guidance on social work best practices and tools in the Procedure Manual on Delivery of Services, developed by UNICEF.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>With guidance from UNICEF, the government abandoned the voluntary nature of social service staff positions. NAD has supported human resource development through a new university-based social work programme developed in partnership with McGill University in Canada.</td>
<td>Since 2006 the government employed 240 newly trained social workers. More than 60 students commenced their studies in July 2008.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF and INGO partners worked with probation and child care workers to provide follow-up social work services and held regular meetings with the District Child Protection Committee (DCPC). UNICEF and the Christian Children’s Fund Sri Lanka (CCF) also implemented a package of programmes called ‘Children First’, which included training for Department of Probation &amp; Child Care Services (DPCCS) staff and offered a one-year diploma in child protection. In the recovery phase, UNICEF in partnership with government actors built 60 Social Care Centres in Tsunami affected</td>
<td>Until June 2005, 333 cases were processed for foster care and UNICEF and INGO supported social workers made follow up visits to 6538 separated, unaccompanied and single parent children. 60 Social Care Centres were constructed; An action plan for social services reform was drafted by the end of 2005; A child wise action plan was developed by a UNICEF consultant in 2007 for separated and unaccompanied children; By October 2005, in 9 districts procedures were put in place for</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

areas and supported a 3 day workshop consultation with provincial commissioners to develop a plan of action to address social work service gaps. In 2006, UNICEF engaged in a two year capacity building programme for the Department of Social welfare in the North Eastern Province addressing probation and child care services. A UNICEF consultant worked with CCF and provincial commissioners to develop a child-wise action plan centred on separated and unaccompanied children.

| Thailand | Tsunami | Training for case managers was held in Bangkok for tambon employees and those who worked in child protection, with the goal of including case management in their job descriptions. The second round of training was offered to those with professional social work training. Case managers were hired for 13 months from October 2007. One province was selected for the piloting of CPMS development. UNICEF provided training and support to all district OSCCs serving tambons without case management. A child protection manual for each province was developed focusing on a participatory and multi-sectoral approach; this was followed by three workshops per province. | • The first round of training did not produce any case managers as trainees were unable to combine case management with their existing duties.  
• Although it was intended that all 27 tambons have a case manager, a number of factors meant that only 16 tambons became New Family Development Centres (NFDCs) with case managers.  
• The participatory approach to the development of the child protection manual led to greater awareness and collaboration of provincial level actors on child protection issues. It fostered a sense of ownership and led to the development of practical tools.  
• Case managers were recognized as a key resource of child protection by all stakeholders, and important in bridging the gap between service providers at provincial and local levels.  
• Concerns were raised about the separation of monitoring and response elements, governance issues, recruitment, retention and competence issues (see below). |

| Cambodia | Counter-trafficking | Civil servants completed a two week Basic Social Service Training (BSST) and Professional Social Services Training (PSST) | Concerns were raised about the effectiveness and sustainability of the capacity building activities. |

developed by government with support from UNICEF and Social Services of Cambodia. These training courses provide a basic introduction to social work with a specific focus on reintegration. In addition, a 6 week part time training course provided by an NGO Trans Psychological Organization (TPO) equips trainees with basic understanding of psychosocial models and responses in social work.

Challenges, constraints and gaps:

Evidence-based training: It is essential to have an in-depth understanding of social workers’ approach and needs within the broader child protection system before designing training modules to build or strengthen their capacity. In some of the examples above, the training modules were designed by international consultants or institutions without consulting national level stakeholders and experts. The training modules developed by students at Stockholm University for social workers in Tajikistan was described as too theoretical because it was not based on an analysis of the country situation, and failed to provide tailored implementation mechanisms. These training modules promoted a de-contextualized and pre-defined model of social services, which contradicted the training methods of EducAid proposing a more participatory process and contextualized outcomes for defining a model for social services. Although these training workshops were offered to different audiences within the same programme, the evaluator criticized the programme for lacking methodological coherence and thereby causing confusion among professionals. The evaluator of the programme in the Philippines stated that no training needs assessment was undertaken prior to the provision of training on how to assist children living on the streets. The table below lists some of the gaps identified by evaluators in relation to the training needs of social workers.

Table 21: Gaps in training, guidelines and materials for social workers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Gap</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>An integrated system of child protection where the artificial division between the monitoring (CPMS) and response (case manager) elements of the system is removed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Design and implementation of community based services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina-Faso</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Clear guidelines and materials for approaching children in transit in order to determine if they are victims of trafficking.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>Specific procedures for alternative care, including guardianship arrangements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Abuse and exploitation</td>
<td>Procedures for monitoring the reintegration of children with their families.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Moldova
Residential care
Reintegration procedures, including family assessments. Selection criteria for identifying vulnerable families and counselling procedures.

Bangladesh
Abuse, exploitation and discrimination
Guidelines differentiating the reintegration of victims, and standard child and family social work practices.

Jamaica
Child abuse
Guidelines on adapting the screening tools to the local context.

Georgia
Residential care
Basic foundations for psychology, communication, legal issues and the functioning of the social welfare system more broadly.

Targeting trainees: Strategic decisions should be made around which individuals and institutions should be trained in order to generate the greatest impact on children. The evaluator of the Moldova programme recommended that staff in residential institutions be trained so that they can assist in the family reintegration process. However, it is useful to note that staff from residential institutions in Tajikistan complained that there was little value in participating in training workshops, as they could not use their skills after residential facilities are closed. In Cambodia it was difficult to find committed staff to train because many posts were filled by contract staff (whose long term future is uncertain) or posts are ‘purchased’ but not necessarily operational.

Content: A needs assessment would elucidate the scope and content required in the training modules. In some cases, trainees wrongly assumed that social workers had received basic foundational training and therefore only needed training in specialized fields. The training on children in institutions and case management in Georgia was said to be too narrow as it failed to give social workers the basic foundations for psychology, communication, legal issues and the functioning of the social welfare system more broadly. The training content and handouts provided by EducAid in Azerbaijan were described as too complex for participants to comprehend or share with other stakeholders. In contrast, the evaluator of the programme in Moldova stated that the training focused too broadly on abandonment prevention but did not address the issue of institutionalization and its impact on the child adequately. In addition, it was recommended that programme staff require specialized training on counselling.

Follow-up: In order to ensure that trainees have the skills and confidence to turn their newly acquired knowledge into practice, follow-up and ongoing support is needed. The evaluator of the Azerbaijan programme criticized EducAid for failing to provide proper follow-up, tutoring and support after the training workshops. A more continuous presence would have allowed for the achievement of concrete actions and sustainable results. It was recommended that a more intensive programme of training, the provision of

guidelines and new working tools be developed to improve social services for children.\textsuperscript{270} In some cases, repeat training was highlighted as a gap. In Cambodia as social work positions are pensionable; many social workers have been in post for many years. As a result, many have not been trained since 1999 and urgently require repeated training.\textsuperscript{271}

\textbf{On the job training:} Formal training in workshops and courses is only the first step in capacity building. Evidence suggests that these courses and workshops might have an impact upon their knowledge but it will take time and substantial on the job support, to turn this knowledge into skills. In three examples described in tables above, government staff was seconded to NGO run services so that they could receive practical hands on training. However, a number of challenges were raised in terms of strengthening the capacity of government social workers by means of on the job training and support. In Lao PDR, government staff packages were less than those received by programme staff, which caused tension in the workplace. In addition, only a small number of individuals were seconded to the programme, which led to the concern that skills may be lost if these individuals leave or are transferred to other departments.\textsuperscript{272} In Thailand, government staff seemed resistant to learn from or assist the programme staff.\textsuperscript{273} In Nigeria, the government staff seconded to the programme did not have the specific vocational skills required by the centre, even though the centre had to pay their salaries. This was a source of friction.\textsuperscript{274}

\textbf{Support, monitoring and evaluation:} Capacity building exercises must be monitored to ensure that objectives, targets and standards are being met adequately. However, this emerged as a gap in some evaluations. In Tajikistan, a Mobile Group composed of government, NGO and media representatives was supposed to monitor the progress of the interventions; instead, the Mobile Group was comprised of students attending a social work course at Stockholm University. This had an adverse effect on levels of support, monitoring and evaluation of the programme as well as scope for future advocacy and policy development.\textsuperscript{275} The capacity building component of the Philippines programme was not adequately monitored in terms of quality of instruction; there was no follow up on trainees to determine whether the skills were useful; and no impact evaluation of the training was undertaken.\textsuperscript{276} The evaluator of the Thailand programme stated that little action was taken against government staff who remained disengaged and unwilling to perform their duties on this programme; this is partly because the manager of the centre was in the process of being reassigned.\textsuperscript{277}

\textbf{Documentation:} It is necessary to document the activities, lessons and outcomes of all capacity building exercises, ranging from study visits to training workshops. This information is essential for future learning, the development of strategic plans and monitoring and evaluation purposes. The evaluator of the Azerbaijan programme stated that it is difficult to determine the effectiveness of the study visits involving high level government officials who travelled to Italy to learn about ‘de-institutionalization’ due to the lack of a detailed report with concluding observations and guidelines. This information could have been used for M&E purposes but also to develop policy position papers and technical guidelines.\textsuperscript{278}

\textbf{Capacity of social workers:} Despite the training they have received and new skills that have been developed, many social workers cannot implement what they have learned. For instance, in Jamaica it

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\footnotesize
\item \textsuperscript{271} An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and rehabilitation programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayn Sammon. Cambodia. 2009.
\item \textsuperscript{272} Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.
\item \textsuperscript{274} Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fafo AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.
\end{thebibliography}
was held that social workers continue to struggle with service delivery due to vacant staff posts, staff retention challenges, an inherited large backlog of cases, and the lack of psychosocial counselling for staff who have to cope with child abuse cases.\textsuperscript{279} In Mongolia social workers were not able to implement the skills they acquired in training partly because they did not have a detailed job description and public knowledge of their specific functions was limited.\textsuperscript{280} In Nepal, social workers struggled to provide assistance because the concept of psychosocial assistance was not new. In addition, they had large caseloads spread out over geographically wide areas which made it difficult for them to reach and counsel children and families on a recurrent and meaningful basis.\textsuperscript{281}

### 3.1.3.3. Capacity building: infrastructure, communication and transportation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia Herzegovina</td>
<td>Child protection mechanisms</td>
<td>In order to enhance the capacities of Centres for Social Work (CWS), UNICEF provided equipment, materials and supplies.</td>
<td>This support did not lead to positive results. It was held that the equipment did not meet their needs. Requests for particular materials and supplies that would have enhanced their capacity were not granted because they were not in line with UNICEF procurement/administration rules.\textsuperscript{282}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>UNICEF provided offices, vehicles and personnel for the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare to locate children from institutions who had run away or had been abducted during the emergency.</td>
<td>Some children were located but there was little success in persuading them to return to the institutions.\textsuperscript{283}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF provided equipment to increase the surveillance capacity of the Women and Children’s Police Desks.</td>
<td>Officers reported transportation problems due to delays in receiving donated bicycles.\textsuperscript{284}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>UNICEF has invested in computers, photocopiers, motorcycles and other basic equipment (e.g. bicycles) for the Ministry of Social Action and National Solidarity (MSANS).</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that these investments are important but it is difficult to see their direct impact on child victims of trafficking or vulnerable children.\textsuperscript{285}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Challenges, constraints and gaps

The decision to provide materials, infrastructure and transportation to social workers should rest on an identified need and demonstrable proof that these investments will lead to positive changes for children. However, in more than one report it was held that this form of capacity building was not appropriate or relevant. In some evaluations, it was held that no needs assessment was undertaken and the materials were left largely unused or were appropriated by other government entities. In Bosnia Herzegovina, it was held that the equipment did not meet their requirements. Requests for particular materials and supplies that would have enhanced their capacity were not granted because they were not in line with UNICEF procurement/administration rules. Delays in receiving these materials also had an adverse impact on social worker’s activities. Furthermore, it is difficult to measure their direct impact on children. However, it is important to note that hardware investments (e.g. in buildings, vehicles and electronic equipment) that are tangible are often preferred by aid agencies and donors to ‘software’ (e.g. communication costs to strengthen the community’s response to child protection). This will be discussed in greater depth in Section 3.5.3 on Cost Efficiency.

3.1.3.4 Social welfare services to children: shelter and immediate assistance

Interventions to strengthen the social welfare sector also aim to improve the quality of specific social work practices. This section will focus on immediate response services and in particular the provision of shelter and related services to children in need, such as those who have been abused, exploited and trafficked. Table 23 describes the strategy in relation to results in the provision of response services to children.

Table 23: Social welfare response services to children by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Abuse, exploitation and trafficking</td>
<td>The establishment of half-way houses at seaports as a means of detecting possible child trafficking cases. All unaccompanied children travelling through the port were brought to the halfway house by the port personnel to check travel documents and provide information about child trafficking and how to access support. Children who have been trafficked were then provided with temporary shelter and psychosocial services, before being reunited with their families or referred to other shelters and NGOs within a 3 week period.</td>
<td>At the Davao and Manilla seaports, Visayan Forum recorded 642 children intercepted, rescued and assisted by Anti-Trafficking Task Forces. Children’s immediate reactions range from fear of imprisonment to anger because they were prevented from earning a living. Stakeholders stated that these reactions are normal and should not outweigh the greater benefit of removing or preventing the victimization of children. Impact is difficult to measure because there are gaps in monitoring the reintegration of children to their families.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Abuse, exploitation and trafficking</td>
<td>Street educators reach out to children living on the streets and encourage them to visit the drop in centres. At the drop in centres, services included health, dental and nutrition services, early</td>
<td>The evaluation found that the forcible removal of children from the streets is not effective; rather they need to be identified and encouraged by peers or people familiar with the street.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Program Description</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>The programme rests on two main activities: outreach and drop-in centres. Outreach teams target vulnerable children living on the streets and provide them with a range of services including non-formal education (literacy and numeracy), life-skills training, basic medical care, basic psycho-social counselling, games, drawing and sports. Weekly visits are made to children detained in local prisons and drug rehabilitation centres. Children are also referred to other services within the programme and those offered by other service providers. The drop-in centre offers the following services: a well-equipped classroom for preschool and primary lessons following the national curricula; small clinic with a full time doctor; vocational training and life skills training (incl. adolescent reproductive health, HIV/AIDS and STIs, drug abuse and hygiene) and ad hoc support from social workers.</td>
<td>240 individual children were in regular contact with outreach team at time of the review (approximately 50% of all children on streets). Targeted children of different genders and ages (slightly less than half were female, 76% were under the age of 15, 49% were less than 10 years old, 81% were working on the streets, 11% were living on their own on streets, 8% were with their family on street). A total of 5,836 children took part in activities for July 2005-June 2006. Children were consulted in the evaluation. Ethical guidelines were followed during interviews and focus groups with children and young people, focusing on “informed consent, confidentiality, gender sensitivity, and voluntary participation”. Children who participated in the evaluation described the activities as appropriate in terms of content, location, timing and frequency. Their favourite activities included drawing, playing sport and games, reading folk stories. 129 referrals were made of which 121 were referred within the programme (72% to drop in centre, 28% to reintegration team). Other referrals were made mainly to hospital and drug rehabilitation centres. Assistance was rendered in 39 cases of violence and abuse against street children.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

290 Ibid.
From April-June 2006, 229 individual children visited the drop-in centre. The numbers of children who stay overnight increases when the police try to remove children off the streets, during festivals, national days and international conferences. From July 2005-June 2006: 26,684 children used services and activities in drop in centre. Although children raised a number of concerns, they appreciated the food, accommodation, medical care, education and recreational training. They also identified positive changes in their lives including new friendships, improved behaviour, better health and nutrition, and improved knowledge and skills. Compared with children interviewed on the streets, all but one respondent had a positive outlook on life and a clear vision for the future, which they believed the programme can help them achieve.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Child protection</td>
<td>The programme supported government shelters to improve services to vulnerable and marginalized children and mothers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The evaluator commended the staff for developing respectful, trusting relationships with children and adults. They delivered all planned services with “dedication, stamina, sensitivity and hard work.” Although the outreach activities reached vulnerable, marginalized and at risk children, many of the children using the centre were not vulnerable or marginalized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Unaccompanied child migrants are taken into custody or referred to local child welfare agencies. They are lodged in district transit centres where they receive food, shelter and basic medical and psycho-emotional care until arrangements have been made to send them to their home districts. These transit centres are operated by the district offices of the Ministry of Social Action and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No statistics were provided as to how many children were identified and assisted in this way; however, the evaluator raised ethical and child protection concerns about the approach used (See discussion).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

292 Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Disaster</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Key Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>National Solidarity (MSANS). Upon arrival in their home district, intercepted children and youth are interviewed by a child welfare worker, and an initial in-take interview is conducted. The initial in-take interview asks a series of basic questions (i.e., related to the child's name, age, village, parents and level of schooling). Children are then returned home.</td>
<td>The centres helped to identify 3,000 separated and unaccompanied children and reunite nearly 2,500 children with their relatives and known neighbours. The centres were also used to provide rudimentary psychosocial support—play, sports, cultural activities, and peer exchanges—to some 17,000 girls and boys.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>In order to register and reunify separated children, provide psychosocial activities, and protect them from abuse, violence and exploitation, 19 children's centres were established in the first six months of the emergency response (January-June 2005).</td>
<td>Safe houses were found to be highly relevant. As a result, of the 101 officially reported cases of child abuse were the child needed alternative care, 61 were admitted into voluntary homes due to a dearth of alternative care options. From 2006 to 2008, 75% (175 of 234) of Galle children in need of alternative care were institutionalized. It was found that safe houses provided quality, temporary care while longer term alternatives are found, thereby preventing the institutionalization of children. The safe house mechanism was described as very effective. However, at the time of the evaluation there was only one safe house in Batticaloa and no safe houses were present in Galle. In the absence of a safe house, children who have been abused are returned to an abusive environment or sent to a voluntary home. The programme and facilities at the safe house in Batticaloa were assessed in the evaluation. The researcher found that the staff-child ratio, services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


---

provided and physical space were all of good quality. Of the 171 children who stayed in Batticaloa’s safe house from 2005 through 2008, 59% were returned to family care after one or two case conferences.\textsuperscript{296}

**Challenges, constraints and gaps:**

**Equity:** UNICEF has made a commitment to ensure that the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children have access to services and protection. However, the evaluator of the Thailand programme found that the children participating in the activities in one shelter were not the intended beneficiaries – they were not vulnerable or marginalized. The evaluator did not describe the profile of these children who used this particular shelter but stated that it “begs the question as to whether Peuan Peuan staff’s time would be better-spent working in another centre” (p.g.11). Outreach activities seemed more effective in identifying and assisting vulnerable, marginalized and at risk children, but it appeared as though the government shelter staff were not actively seeking out and encouraging vulnerable children to come to the centre.\textsuperscript{297}

**Assessment interview:** In order to make decisions about what is in the best interests of children, it is imperative that social workers and practitioners in related professions have been trained on how to conduct assessment/in-take interviews in a child-friendly manner using age-appropriate participatory methods (e.g. art, music and role play) where necessary. In addition, they need tools and guidelines on how to conduct – and document - a comprehensive interview so that children do not need to go through the trauma of being interviewed multiple times by different service providers. In Burkina Faso, the in-take questionnaire included a series of basic questions related to the child’s basic demographic information, but did not address the child’s physical, psychological and/or emotional health, nor did it deal with trauma associated with previous experiences with violence.\textsuperscript{298}

**Length of stay:** Decisions around the length of time that children spend in shelters should be based on ‘best interests of the child’ considerations. The UN endorsed Guidelines for the Alternative Care of Children (2009) state that removal of the child from the care of the family should be wherever possible “temporary and for the shortest possible duration” (Article 13). It outlines detailed assessment procedures that should be undertaken to ascertain whether short-term or longer-term placements are in children’s best interests. This will depend largely on “the nature and quality of the child’s attachment to his/her family; the family’s capacity to safeguard the child’s well-being and harmonious development; the child’s need or desire to feel part of a family; the desirability of the child remaining within his/her community and country; his/her cultural, linguistic and religious background; and relationships with siblings, with a view to avoiding their separation” (Article 61). Some children may need the additional support (e.g. psychosocial, health and legal) that such a stay would afford. In other cases, staff may not be able trace the children’s families. However, at the outset these support structures should define their mandate - as providing temporary shelter so that they do not separate children from the family environment. Children’s right to grow up in the protective environment of the family should be prioritized in all cases. In the Philippines, given the time taken for healing and recovery, some children needed to spend a longer period of time in the shelters. Furthermore, the cost of repatriating children to their provinces and delays in undertaking family assessments, served to prolong their stay. As a result, in some sites children spent longer than three years living in ‘temporary’ shelters.\textsuperscript{299}


Capacity of shelters: While it is argued that efforts should be made to reach the most vulnerable children, it is concerning that the shelters do not have the capacity to provide assistance to them. Concerns were raised in the Philippines and Lao PDR reports about the capacity of shelters, which cannot fully meet the need for shelter.\(^{301}\) In Sri Lanka the shortage of safe houses has meant that children who were abused were returned to an abusive environment or sent to a voluntary home, neither option serving the best interest of the child.\(^{301}\)

Human resources: It is essential that shelters are manned by trained social workers who receive adequate supervision and support. However, in the Philippines, the evaluator was concerned about the shortage of social workers to assist children living in the shelters, especially when they have been victims of sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation.\(^{302}\) With reference to the drop in centre in Lao PDR, the evaluator stated that staffing levels were not sufficient for adequate supervision and quality care, especially given the large numbers of very young children staying on site. This affected the regularity of activities; for example, during the evaluation no classes were offered as a staff member had left and a new one was being trained.\(^{303}\) The evaluator of the Thailand programme stated that staff is so stretched that they may experience burnout due to the amount of work they are tasked with and/or due to the emotional nature of the work. Psychosocial counselling should therefore be provided to staff at drop in centres.\(^{304}\) It was held that the government staff, which was seconded to the shelters, lacked the skills needed to adopt a rights-based approach, manage child protection cases, and communicate with parents and children. Despite these gaps, the government staff appeared unwilling to learn from programme staff as has been discussed elsewhere.\(^{305}\)

Referrals: In order to ensure that vulnerable children are identified by social workers and/or that they can access a full range of services, including medical, psychosocial, justice and education in a timely manner, a practical intersectoral referral protocol is needed. In Sri Lanka it was held that probation officers have acquired new skills from their training, but cannot use them adequately given their unmanageable workloads and the absence of an adequate referral protocol. The evaluation found that not all abuse cases reported to the police were referred to probation officers.\(^{306}\) In Georgia, social workers had little resources for transportation, communication and equipment and their work was hindered by a weak referral system.\(^{307}\) Intersectoral coordination and case management remained a challenge in many countries with the result that children effectively become ‘lost’ in the system, instead of receiving the care and protection they desperately need (See Coordination).

Funding: As will be discussed in the Cost Efficiency section, the centre based approach to social welfare is more expensive than outreach services given the cost of infrastructure and materials, the range of services offered, the intensity of services offered to individual children and the fact that face-to-face interaction requires investments in human resources. However, funding remained a challenge for many shelters. For example, in Indonesia emergency funding was dedicated by donors to centres for Tsunami-affected areas. So efforts to expand the child protection programme and the reach of the children’s centres to include support for children and youth affected by the conflict was difficult.\(^{308}\)


\(^{305}\) Ibid.


3.1.3.5 Supporting families to respond to child protection issues

Three (3) programmes have also assisted parents to respond and cope with events such as child abuse, child migration and justice issues. The table below describes the results in relation to the strategies used in each programme.

Table 24: Strengthening families in order to improve response by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td>In this programme, parents of children in conflict with the law are guided through the criminal justice process. Positive parent-child relationships are encouraged and parents are provided with practical advice on how to prevent their children from re-offending. Parents are also involved in children’s individualized action plans.</td>
<td>The evaluator provided a useful quote from a parent suggesting that the programme was effective: “Because I have never personally been in conflict with the law and this was the first accusation against my son, I wanted to talk to someone who had more experience. All of the concerns and questions my wife and I had were fully addressed by the JJC coordinator. She spent almost two hours with us during the first meeting. It was extremely helpful”. One of the lessons learnt from this programme was that family preservation is crucial, but that the programme needs to account for situations where children may be orphans, separated from their families or when being under the care of parents is not in their best interests.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Some parents of 100 child beneficiaries participate in annual parenting fora to discuss their children’s progress, their own parenting challenges and achievements, and to learn positive parenting techniques. Many received counselling on how to cope with the abuse that their child had suffered, largely at the hands of someone else. In addition to parents, this programme provides counselling to siblings of victims of abuse, many of whom are witnesses.</td>
<td>According to the evaluator, the response of parents/caregivers was overwhelmingly positive. Initially they were uncomfortable with visits from social workers, but in the end they found them “empowering, informative and reaffirming”. Many parents appreciated the information received and the sense that someone cares about them and their child. They described their children as far happier since they started participating in summer camps and Saturday classes. The programme also had an effect on their parenting practices. In focus group discussions, parents requested more support. The evaluators argue that the Parenting Forums should be expanded to include more parents of child victims of abuse.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>This programme found that intra-family violence continues to threaten the happiness of beneficiaries. The programme</td>
<td>Volunteers have not been able to fully address the issue of intra-family violence but have opened up communication on this issue.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

310 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
tries to resolve the conflicts by offering recreational workshops, taking cases to Family Commissary's and clearly delineating the roles and responsibilities of children (to play), youth (to serve) and parents (to love and protect children) in the community.

Despite these results, the evaluators described a number of challenges faced by practitioners. One of the lessons learnt from the programme in Mongolia was that family preservation is crucial, but that the programme needs to account for situations where children may be orphans, separated from their families or that being under the care of parents is not suitable. It is particularly challenging finding alternatives when it is not in children’s best interest to be cared for by their parents.  

Despite their attendance at parenting fora in Jamaica, some parents were unable to process negative experiences. In focus group discussions, parents requested more sessions, more visits from case workers, facilities and programmes for older children, and training on parenting of adolescents. Another challenge encountered in the Jamaican programme was that logistics (e.g., cost of transportation) and scheduling inhibited parent’s attendance at events. Bus fares to and from parenting fora were only reimbursed at the end of the programme and the cost of hiring transportation was found to be too expensive. Another factor ensuring that less than 50% of parents who were invited actually attended the parenting fora was the scheduling of meetings on Saturday mornings when they were working or committed elsewhere. The Administrative Assistant tried to call parents and follow-up if their children failed to appear, but infrastructure and time to undertake this on a weekly basis was lacking. In addition, the evaluators recommended that more efforts should be made to raise awareness around the benefits of children’s participation in the programme, as some parents were restricting their attendance.

In Algeria, the evaluator of a programme centred on children affected by armed conflict argues that more interventions need to be directed to families with severe or complex psychosocial problems. Mothers in particular need psychosocial support to address their own suffering (which includes grief, poverty, marginalization, PTSD, and gender-related concerns felt by widows, divorced and unaccompanied mothers) and to better care for their children and assist in their own psychosocial recovery.

### 3.1.3.6 Return and reintegration

Many programmes support families as part of a larger return and reintegration strategy for children who have been living in residential institutions, living on the streets or have travelled elsewhere (either as trafficking victims, child migrants or displaced persons). These interventions aim to prevent children from leaving the safety of the family again. The results of these interventions are described in Table 25.

#### Table 25: Family strengthening activities in the context of return and reintegration by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>In Tajikistan, practitioners meet families to conduct assessments to determine the feasibility of reintegrating children who have been institutionalized. Poverty and misconceptions around the benefits of living in an institution were found to be the major.</td>
<td>In terms of successes, the programme has succeeded in significantly reducing the number of children living in institutions as is evident.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


driving factors behind the decision to abandon their children. When it is seen as unsafe to return the child to the family, social workers try to locate extended families to care for the child. If the decision is made to return the child to the family, many children continue their education as day pupils at institutions or day care centres to allow for ongoing support. A Parents Education Centre supported by the NGO Health also provides support and skills to parents, especially when they are caring for children with disabilities. Parents are also encouraged to bring their other children to the sessions so that they can learn how to support siblings living with disabilities. Eleven staff works with 40 families per month, of which six families receive home visits. Clothing and medication is also provided to these families by other NGOs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Residential care</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Social assistants conduct household visits in order to estimate the reintegration potential and develop a reintegration plan. Parents are initially encouraged and assisted with cash transfers to visit their children in the institutions. They are also referred to various medical, family planning and counselling services to prepare them for reunification.</td>
<td>This programme has successfully reintegrated 10 children into their biological families and 19 into their extended families. In terms of successes, the evaluators note that the programme has prevented many children from entering institutions by strengthening their capacity to overcome crisis and manage stress. In addition, children’s right to have a family is fulfilled in cases where reintegration has been a success. The beneficiaries described the quality and consistency of the services in a positive light.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Practitioners have also recognized the importance of supporting the family.</td>
<td>There is growing realization that it is essential for children to grow up in the context of the family. The specific results of family</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Target Population</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>Extensive time was spent on each case in order to ensure that the placement was feasible, safe and in children's best interests. Another component of this programme is prevention. The programme has assisted 485 families (July 2005-June 2006) through counselling, problem-solving, medical care, small business development grants, income generation activities, life skills education and short term food support.</td>
<td>The prevention component has involved 565 household visits and 644 follow up visits, on average of 100 visits per month. This programme has managed to reintegrate 60 street children into their families. The evaluators note that this programme has been effective in that only a small number of children, who were placed in family care, have returned to the streets, largely due to drug related issues. In terms of the prevention component, families were ‘appreciative’ about improvements in their quality of life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia, Thailand and Laos</td>
<td>Child migrants</td>
<td>In order to reintegrate child migrants in their families and communities in Cambodia, Thailand and Laos, the programme tries to enhance families’ capacities for instance through Home Based Production, medical referrals, non-formal education, life skills and school reintegration.</td>
<td>The evaluator argues that the social protection component of this programme is the most effective as it empowers families to generate an income, allow their children to attend school, instead of returning to Thailand without documents. On this basis, he recommends that the programme be expanded to include more parents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>In order to reintegrate child victims of trafficking practitioners conduct home visits with families, undertake strict family assessments and prepare the family for the return of the child.</td>
<td>It was difficult for the evaluator to comment on this component apart from noting that due to limited resources follow-up visits are rare.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child migration and child</td>
<td>When trying to reintegrate child victims of trafficking and child migrants, practitioners conduct a household visit and a needs assessment.</td>
<td>In 2004, 33 parents (19 women and 15 men) in the province of Sahel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Affected by</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Parents of children affected by armed conflict received psychosocial support.</td>
<td>Some children reported that their parents did not want them to participate in the programme, as they did not want them to be officially part of a group associated with fighting forces; out of fear of stigma and later repercussions on parents and children and fear of stigma. However, the 43 parents who were interviewed in the evaluation stated that the psychosocial support that they received helped them to reintegrate their child back into their homes and communities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia and Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami Tracing and return activities. In order to empower families to care for children in need of protection instead of sending them to residential institutions includes Placement Review Committees and Family Group Conferences.</td>
<td>The evaluator found that family strengthening interventions are active only in certain regions. In Indonesia, the Inter-Agency Family Tracing Network effectively reunited more than 80% of its caseload, however this only constituted 20% of the estimated 15,000 total separated children's population. Findings of the evaluation suggest that girls in family care are better off than girls in institutional care, although there was no significant difference for boy's outcomes (aged 13-18) in families or Islamic boarding schools. In Sri Lanka, 540 children enrolled in the Fit programmes were placed in family care, as opposed to 2 in institutional care.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, many children (19,000 in 2007) continue to live in institutions in which they are not adequately monitored.

| Colombia | Children affected by armed conflict | One of the programmes focused on the care of children demobilized from armed groups, within the family environment. Children were returned and reintegrated in their families, or are placed in alternative care or transitional housing centres if no family options are available. In indigenous communities, families participate in ritual cleansings so that the child can free him/herself from the ‘dirt’ or ‘bad energy’ linked with war. Children are also encouraged to repair relationships with family members and the wider community by undertaking activities (e.g. administrative work and gardening) for the collective good. In addition to family preservation activities, cash transfers were made to children and families. | The programme has had a positive impact on relationships and values in the impact, but concerns were raised on high levels of dependency on cash transfers.322 |

Despite these results, a number of challenges were identified in return and reintegration programmes. In a de-institutionalization programme, the evaluators argued that coordination between government bodies and the programme is poor and that a government-run assessment and treatment centre, supported by community programmes should be established to support families and children.323

The programme in Moldova faced the following challenges. Firstly, the overarching culture still supports institutionalization. Personnel in the institutions try to restrict parent’s access to their children, believe that the child is better off in the institution and that the parent cannot care for him/her. In some cases, poor documentation and record-keeping has meant that the whereabouts of parents for children in institution cannot be located. Second, at an institutional level it is important for personnel to maintain numbers in institutions as it determines funding and budgets. Many are insensitive to the needs of children and their families, do not provide psycho-social support and express various prejudices in relation to institutionalized children. Third, the evaluators note that there is no unitary approach to the issue of family reunification, largely due to poor collaboration and communication across departments.324 In Azerbaijan, the evaluators argue that the programme tends to regard children and families as two separate categories of beneficiaries on two separate programmes, without integrating the two under the overarching rationale that it is important to safeguard the family as the primary protection unit for children.325 In the programmes seeking to reintegrate children affected by the Tsunami in Sri Lanka and Indonesia, an overarching challenge faced was that despite the presence of strong social norms promoting extended family care for children in need, poverty, conflict and insecurity has led parents to regard institutions as a safer and better environment for their children than family-settings.326

In programmes aiming to reintegrate children living on the street with their families, the evaluator of the Bangladesh programme notes that the results should be treated with caution: “The lasting impact of the reintegration programme – the number of street children who settle into a family environment, complete school and find decent jobs – will need to be measured over a longer time-period” (24). A challenge in

---

322 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
This component of the programme is the absence of alternatives for children – or support services for parents - when their families are afflicted by drug abuse and other issues. Many of these children have resided in the Centre for over a year. Although families were ‘appreciative’ about improvements in their quality of life brought about by the prevention programme, the absence of a monitoring system has made it impossible to determine whether the programme has had a desired impact on children, namely to reduce their need to earn money on the streets and enable them to attend school.\footnote{Final Report for Mid-Term Evaluation of the Basic Education for hard to Reach Urban Working Children’s Project (2nd Phase). Bureau of Non-Formal Education. Bangladesh. 2008.}

In programmes seeking to reintegrate child victims of trafficking, a number of challenges were encountered with the family-based component. For instance, in the Philippines programme the evaluator noted the following challenges: first, there are few local government and NGO counterparts who can effectively monitor and provide support services for children and their families in their places of origin. Delayed family assessments for instance, prolong the stay of children in shelters; second, it is often difficult to locate parents and relatives. Third, some poverty-stricken families are not able to fully care for the children and may even be living on the streets themselves. The evaluator recommends the improvement of the monitoring of reunification by developing feedback mechanisms and tools shared by the Department of Social Welfare and Development and NGOs. Family-centred approaches should also be explored so that children who are returned and reunited do not continue to leave their homes in search of education and employment opportunities. This includes practical mechanisms and interventions to prepare families for the reintegration of child victims, and the creation of education and livelihood opportunities for children and their families.\footnote{Evaluation of the impact of rescue, recovery, healing and reintegration services for victims of child abuse and exploitation. Kathleen Macebeo Tan and Lewelyn Baguyo. Philippines. 2007.}

In the Burkina Faso programme, some practitioners at district and local levels did not understand the notion of re-trafficking and the importance of reducing the need for children to leave again and risk being re-trafficked. The evaluation team could not locate any children who had been reintegrated because local authorities could not identify them, despite claims that they kept such a list. In one province, it was found that most children leave within a few days, which according to the evaluator leads to questions around the relevance, effectiveness and impact of this intervention on children themselves. In addition, despite the fact that an assessment should be conducted on each child, the evaluator found that there is no analysis of the child’s psycho-social or physical wellbeing, apart from a basic socio-economic assessment. Consultation, follow-up or monitoring of the children once they have been returned home is poor. In Mali, children are returned home even though they don’t want to do so, because they are returning home empty handed or trying to escape abuse. As a result, some are returned to a situation of violence or adversity. In general, the evaluator argues that the reintegration component is lacking in this programme.\footnote{Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fato AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.}

Another reintegration programme that was found to be lacking was in Liberia. Despite the fact that parents of children affected by armed conflict received psychosocial support, they did not receive income generation support. Funding limitations prevented this aspect of the programme from being implemented, which according to the evaluator had a negative impact on the potential achievements of the reintegration programme.\footnote{Impact Evaluation of the reintegration programme for children associated with fighting forces (CAFF) in Liberia. Irma specht and Hirut Tefferi. Liberia. 2007.}

\textbf{Box 3: Synthesized challenges}

In residential programmes, the following challenges were encountered:

- Poor coordination between government bodies and programmes;
- Culture supports de-institutionalization;
- Resistance from staff;
- Poor record keeping and case management makes it difficult to locate parents;

\footnote{Final Report for Mid-Term Evaluation of the Basic Education for hard to Reach Urban Working Children’s Project (2nd Phase). Bureau of Non-Formal Education. Bangladesh. 2008.}

\footnote{Evaluation of the impact of rescue, recovery, healing and reintegration services for victims of child abuse and exploitation. Kathleen Macebeo Tan and Lewelyn Baguyo. Philippines. 2007.}

\footnote{Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fato AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.}

\footnote{Impact Evaluation of the reintegration programme for children associated with fighting forces (CAFF) in Liberia. Irma specht and Hirut Tefferi. Liberia. 2007.}
• Funding mechanisms inhibit deinstitutionalization mechanisms;
• No unitary approach to family reunification, due to poor communication and collaboration across departments;
• Failure to adequately conceptualize programmes involving families as the primary protection unit for children.

In programmes seeking to reunify children living on the streets or on the move the following challenges were encountered:
• Absence of alternatives for children whose families have high levels of drug and substance abuse, interpersonal violence, cannot support their children etc.
• Few local government and NGO counterparts to monitor and support children and families in their places of origin, specifically at local levels.
• Delayed or inadequate family assessments.
• Lack of tools and feedback mechanisms to monitor reunification.
• Absence of practical mechanisms and interventions to prepare families for the reintegration of child victims.
• Children are not adequately consulted about the return process and may be returned to environments that are harmful or lacking.
• Funding limitations hinder social protection support to parents.
• Ongoing monitoring and consultation is poor often due to lack of resources, infrastructure (e.g. transportation and telephones) and human resources.
• Challenges measuring impact of prevention programmes.

In programmes seeking to reunify children affected by armed conflict and post-emergency, the following challenges were encountered:
• The scale of emergency affects the reach of programmes that only reunify small numbers of children.
• Activities to empower families to care for their children are uneven at district and local levels.
• Poverty, conflict and insecurity leads to the false perception that children are better off in institutions.

### 3.1.3.7 Alternative care
Two (2) programmes sought to strengthen the family environment in order to enhance the options for alternative care that can be provided by members of the extended family and foster care parents. The results of these programmes are described in the table below in relation to the strategies adopted in each programme.

#### Table 26: Family strengthening in the context of alternative care by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>The pilot programme provided legal advice and advocacy in two districts, including 15 villages of the most affected areas. To prevent secondary separation, the programme provided monetary support to foster families.</td>
<td>Legal guardianship was established for 173 children and 500 government officials and civil society members were trained to replicate this initiative. Monetary support was provided for 3 months to approximately 1,700 children living in 1,300 foster families. After a review of these 1,700 cases, further livelihoods support, including access to credit and vocational training, was provided to 461 caregivers, through 35 self-help groups, to start new businesses and to 122 caretakers to support existing businesses.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Sri Lanka Tsunami

Issuing of internal directives and public messages prioritizing foster care placements with the extended family or other caregivers over formal adoption’ regularizing fostering placements; identification of foster arrangements; local child sponsorship schemes; monitoring of children placed in foster care by a Child Rights Promotion Officer. In addition to training of social workers, this programme focused on strengthening foster families through the distribution of 5,000 family packs (including cookware, personal hygiene supplies, mosquito nets, floor nets) and contribution of monthly 200-500 rupee payments.

In the recovery period, UNICEF statistics identified 4,933 registered separated/unaccompanied children, 979 of whom had lost both parents; 967 of these children were placed with community or extended family and 12 were in institutions or orphanages. Following the issuance of a legal ruling, through December 2005, 770 of 1,582 children identified as having lost both parents were provided legalized fostering arrangements under the Fit Person Ordinance Act. UNICEF also distributed 4,150 family kits to families hosting children who lost parents.

Each of the programmes described above faced a number of challenges. In the programme in Indonesia, the evaluator found that formal guardianship was considered to be unnecessary because guardianship is usually assumed by a male relative on an informal basis. Legal guardianship activities (technical assistance and advocacy) should therefore only be directed at children fostered by the extended family and members of the community.

Secondary separation also emerged as an issue as families struggled to foster children in a context characterized by high socio-economic deprivation. Studies suggested that a large proportion of children who were affected by the Tsunami were placed in institutions or Islamic boarding schools. The evaluator argued that the family tracing system was not designed to adequately address the causes and consequences of secondary separation. Only a small proportion of families (approximately 20%) who happened to have been registered on the FTR Network received financial and livelihood support. He therefore recommended that programmers should start “rethinking FTR efforts to better account for recurring realities in humanitarian emergencies that lead to the undermining of family unity and child care”. Strategies could involve advocacy for the implementation of vulnerable family support programmers at district and sub-district levels and expanding reach to families who have not been registered. The overarching lesson from this evaluation is that “prevention of secondary separation is a key national and global programme learning need”.

Similar challenges were encountered in Sri Lanka where the evaluator notes that families required a greater level of external assistance given high levels of poverty and other deprivations resulting from the Tsunami and the civil war. As a result, many children continued to be placed in institutions because it was perceived to be a better, safer option. A number of evaluators of programmes in Central Asia recommend the promotion of alternative care services.

3.1.3.8 Synthesized results and recommendations for strengthening families

Table 27: Synthesized results for strengthening families

| Prevention and early intervention | • Families in certain communities are more opposed to FGM/C on their daughters; |

---

- Fewer mothers are abandoning their children as a result of prevention efforts;
- The attitude of parents towards child abuse, discrimination and violence has changed;
- Parents are slowly taking an interest in the education of their daughters and formerly working children;
- Parents in Bangladesh are slowly taking an interest in the education of their daughters and formerly working children;
- Parents, grandparents and caretakers are more aware about child safety issues and have taken steps to modify their living environments;
- Parents are more willing to report acts of abuse through the use of hotlines.

Response
- Parents of children in conflict with the law feel more informed and empowered to prevent their children from re-offending;
- Parents (and siblings) of child victims of abuse have received counselling, information and parenting skills training. This has had a positive effect on their relationships with their children and their disciplinary practices;
- Families are benefitting from family preservation and dispute mediation activities.

Return and reintegration
- The numbers of children entering and living in residential institutions has been reduced due to the provision of material and psychosocial support to families.
- Children are more likely to be placed in alternative care (e.g. foster care) than in residential institutions.
- Children have been successfully reintegrated into their biological families or into extended families.
- Former street children have been successfully reintegrated into their families and have been assisted through counselling, problem-solving, medical care, small business development grants, income generation activities, life skills education and short term food support.
- Families have benefitted from livelihood support which has reduced the number of children who decide to leave home.
- Families are better able to support their children who were formally associated with the armed conflict.

Alternative care
- Secondary separation has been avoided by the provision of livelihood support and family kits to foster families.
- The rights of children who were in foster care were strengthened due to legalized fostering arrangements.

Box 4: Generalized lessons for strengthening families

Prevention and response:
- A rights-based perspective to family preservation should inform all child protection interventions. This should not be seen as a ‘nice to have’ or ‘add on’ to existing programmes, but should be at the core of all child protection activities as children have a fundamental and inalienable right to grow up in the protective environment of the family. This is also imperative from a developmental perspective.
- Although family preservation activities are essential, programmes should also focus on alternative care, particularly when it is not in children’s best interest to be cared for by their parents.
- Parents of child victims of abuse and violence, need far more intensive programmes with multiple sessions and visits from case workers; they may also need psychosocial counselling in order to create a protective environment for their children.
- In order to ensure meaningful parental participation, logistics (e.g. cost of transportation),
compensation and scheduling should be carefully considered.

- It is essential to communicate and follow-up with parents, but the necessary infrastructure (e.g. telephones), time and human resources should also be in place.
- Some parents remain resistant to children’s participation in programmes. More efforts should be made to raise awareness of the benefits of attendance by bringing them on board at the outset of the programme.
- Programmes that seek to enhance the psycho-social wellbeing of children, should also consider that of parents.
- Intra-household violence can affect the wellbeing of child beneficiaries. Family preservation and dispute mediation activities should also be developed.

Return and reintegration

- As return and reintegration activities involve a number of different stakeholders often operating in different communities and countries, it is imperative to establish coordination structures and mechanisms. It will also require partnerships with counterparts in different countries and communities based on clear standard operating procedures for returning children who may be undocumented, separated and unaccompanied.
- It is important to build the capacity of local service providers and civil society organizations so that they can undertake family assessments in a timely manner and effectively monitor and provide support services for children and their families in their places of origin. In addition to funding, communication and transportation, these actors need training on case management. A particular institution and/or responsible party should be held responsible and accountable for managing a particular case in the short and long term.
- Structured tools and feedback mechanisms should be developed and widely disseminated.
- In ‘deinstitutionalization’ programmes it is useful to obtain the support of residential staff and management who could obstruct progress and effectiveness. It is imperative to ensure that residential staff and management understand why it is necessary for children to live with their parents. It may be useful to incentivize their participation for example by providing them with training, employment counselling and other opportunities after the institutions have been closed.
- The decision to return a child home should be based on his/her best interests and the determination of that rests on a comprehensive assessment of the child’s wellbeing and the situation of the family at home. These assessments should include an analysis of the child’s psychosocial and physical wellbeing. In addition to socio-economic assessments, it is necessary to assess relationships and power dynamics within the family.
- Children’s consent must be given primacy. If they do not want to return home, child-centred techniques can be used to find out the reasons why and on this basis develop solutions or come up with alternatives. Ethically child protection agencies cannot return children home to an environment where they are being abused, exploited or harmed in another way.
- Simply removing children from institutions and returning the child home will not produce positive results, unless it is combined with activities that strengthen the family and enhance its protective potential. Families should be prepared in advance for their children’s return and should be provided with parenting skills training and support, family mediation etc.
- An important component of reintegration is awareness-raising so as to change norms and misconceptions that institutions are a safer and better environment and/or why families might feel that it is better for a child to live in another community or country.
- Family strengthening activities should include a social protection component, as poverty and economic insecurity is one of the main reasons why parents feel their children’s best interests would be served in an institution and/or why decisions are made about migration abroad.
- In addition to family strengthening, reintegration involves working closely with individuals, groups and institutions in the community. For example, elsewhere in the report reference was made to the pivotal role schools can play in children’s reintegration.
- Longitudinal assessments will provide a clearer picture of the impact of these interventions on children. The evaluations under review were not able to provide information about the situation of children once they have returned home.

Alternative care:
• Programmers should carefully consider the appropriateness of formal guardianship given the salience of the extended family in certain communities.

• Family preservation and social protection interventions should also be directed to foster care parents, grandparents and other relatives who have assumed responsibility for the child so as to prevent secondary separation in the face of high socio-economic deprivation.

3.1.3.9 Social protection reform

3.1.3.9.1 Introduction

There has been increased emphasis on social protection within the field of social welfare and child protection. The objectives of social protection are to address poverty, vulnerability and social exclusion through investments in health, education, water and sanitation. In the context of child protection, social protection can potentially reduce the risk of abuse, exploitation, and violence and promote positive outcomes for children in terms of nutrition, health and educational status (Joint statement, 2009). This section focuses on some of the strategies used to promote social protection, namely income-generation, vocational training, job counselling, micro-credit, and cash transfers. Family support services will be discussed in the next chapter in programmes that ‘support social change’. Before proceeding with the analysis it is important to highlight the child-sensitive principles to social protection, as identified in a joint statement by a range of development agencies, including UNICEF (See Box). It is argued that many programmes in this review, did not completely fulfil all these principles.

Box 5: Principles of child sensitive social protection

Principles of child-sensitive social protection (Joint statement 2009)

“The following principles should be considered in the design, implementation and evaluation of child-sensitive social protection programmes:

• Avoid adverse impacts on children, and reduce or mitigate social and economic risks that directly affect children’s lives.

• Intervene as early as possible where children are at risk, in order to prevent irreversible impairment or harm.

• Consider the age- and gender-specific risks and vulnerabilities of children throughout the life-cycle.

• Mitigate the effects of shocks, exclusion and poverty on families, recognizing that families raising children need support to ensure equal opportunity.

• Make special provision to reach children who are particularly vulnerable and excluded, including children without parental care, and those who are marginalized within their families or communities due to their gender, disability, ethnicity, HIV and AIDS or other factors.

• Consider the mechanisms and intra-household dynamics that may affect how children are reached, with particular attention paid to the balance of power between men and women within the household and broader community.

• Include the voices and opinions of children, their caregivers and youth in the understanding and design of social protection systems and programmes”

3.1.3.9.2 Income generation activities, vocational training and job counseling

Table 28: Income generation, vocational training and job counselling by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Prevention of child</td>
<td>PIAD offered innovative employment services to vulnerable mothers who are</td>
<td>The evaluator argued that this strategy is relevant given that</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Target Group</td>
<td>Activities</td>
<td>Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>An internal evaluation conducted in 2005 identified vocational training as a priority need for older street children and families. A motor bike repair workshop for children was established in 2005, which was followed by a training restaurant in mid-2006. In 2006, the programme started a home-based production scheme, where children and parents can generate income through the production of handicraft items.</td>
<td>At the time of the review, 12 children were involved in mechanics and 10 were working in the restaurant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Children living on the streets and child migration</td>
<td>A Home Based Production scheme commenced in August 2009. Given the timing of the evaluation (less than a year later), only 9 adults had participated in this activity.</td>
<td>The evaluator consulted 3 adults involved in the Home Based Production Scheme. All expressed satisfaction as they were generating a small amount of income for their families. The availability of materials was raised as a concern as beneficiaries put themselves at risk looking for recycled materials. As the programme was in its infancy the evaluator could not determine overall effectiveness but described it as a ‘good start’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child migration</td>
<td>The programme sought to increase</td>
<td>Although these activities were</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Programme</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>The programme aimed to reduce children’s vulnerability to trafficking and other dangers by providing children and youth with local opportunities. It was assumed that these opportunities would reduce their incentives for migrating elsewhere, would empower children and youth to identify and avoid risky situations. In order to meet these objectives, the centre facilitates employment placements for children and provides vocational training. The target audience for vocational training was “children with physical evidence of deprivation and neglect 15 to 18 years old, child victims of trafficking, vulnerable children with evidence of poor formal educational attainment and children with interest in income-generating skills”. Although job placements were a key component of the centres, children were expected to find employment themselves with a letter of recommendation from the centre. Many children expressed difficulties in finding placements. One challenge was that potential employers expect payment (apprenticeship fee) in return for job placement. The evaluator notes that there is no data on the success rate of vocational training and the centre has little capacity to follow up with former students.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>In order to reintegrate children, the principle of the programme is that returned children should live with their parents and benefit either from schooling, vocational training and/or a small grant depending on their age, level of educational attainment and interest. From 2004-2005, 114 girls and 114 mothers received livelihood support. In 2004, 33 parents of whom 18 were women and 15 were men received livelihood support. In terms of non-formal vocational training for children, the programme wrongly assumed that there are non-formal vocational training organizations in the district centres which offer relevant and adequate training programme for vulnerable children and youth. Nevertheless, local social service staff commended recent efforts to diversify livelihood creation initiatives (e.g. a livestock grant to children in more remote villages who cannot participate in vocational training but who can access pastures).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Issue</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>The programme was still in its design stage at the time of the evaluation. The contracted agency JOBS was about to embark on a needs assessment and job market survey with a focus on employment prospects for girls in non-traditional and nongender-stereotyped skills. They were planning to prepare a list of marketable skills and a set of criteria for selection of trainees for livelihood skills trainees. The pilot would involve 500 children and 20,000 children who would be targeted for vocational training (e.g. carpentry, sewing, data entry etc.) and non-technical livelihood skills (e.g. job interviewing strategies, business management, entrepreneurial and money management skills). The overall objective was to equip graduates with basic skills so that they better livelihood options.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that the design is unclear as urban child workers cannot be freed to travel to an institution to gain skills as their priority is to earn an income.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>In order to support the reintegration of children affected by armed conflict, productive initiatives have been developed such as handicrafts and agriculture.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the activities are highly relevant but as there is no programme for promoting the commercialization or marketing of projects, or the generation of cooperatives, the sustainability of these efforts is limited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>As many children affected by armed conflict lost educational opportunities, a skills training and vocational programme was designed as a component of the reintegration programme. It targets children aged 14 and above. It is supplemented by basic literacy and numeracy, business development skills, follow ups, psychosocial care and placement into apprenticeship programme. Business training courses were also delivered by specialized business trainers.</td>
<td>Successes include the employment of graduates from the skills training in the private sector, which is an important resource for on the job training and employment. Despite the successes of the skills training programme, the evaluator stated that the vocational training system was extremely weak as there are few training facilities available, the programme was not linked to the ministry of vocational training and linkage to the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

341 Ibid.
343 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
The objective of this programme was to give older children an alternative to education if they are reluctant to attend school, are under economic pressure at home to start earning or are not comfortable at school for another reason such as being a parent themselves or too traumatized to mix well with other children in a school setting. The intended idea of skills-based training is that children will be enabled to work or start their own businesses, and girls will be independent and less likely to be married at an early age.

The evaluator described this component as particularly weak. At the time of the evaluation, there were only a few children being trained, and they were primarily girls doing tailoring or beautician training. Children expressed frustration and disappointment at the content of the courses (see discussion). The psycho-social aspect of the training was positive as it enabled children to establish friendships with people outside the family.¹⁴⁵

| Nepal | Children affected by armed conflict | The intended outcome was to rehabilitate and reintegrate 540 former child combatants by providing them with training on non-technical skills (e.g. conflict resolution) and vocational skills (e.g. electric installation, auto-electric, | Results include: training of 9 conflict resolution trainers, 6 psychosocial counsellors and 420 former child combatants were provided with vocational and life skills. In Phase 1, 2 out |

---


welding, carpentry and tailoring). This would be accompanied by life skills and psychosocial counselling. The selection of trainees was based on a lengthy process. The local mass media in Mogadishu advertised the programme in order to solicit former child combatant applicants. A clan and district based quota system was adopted. Influential leaders and intermediaries persuaded respective faction leaders to release the children from their armed forces for training in the programme. Children were then registered with the programme and trainees and parents were required to sign a commitment to complete the training. Training was conducted at the Resource Centres or at separate training sites using a limited number of instructional tools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges, constraints and gaps:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Evidence-based programming:** An effective social protection programme centred on vocational training, job and income generation counselling must be based on an in depth assessment of the labour market to ensure that the skills that are being taught are relevant, marketable and will increase employment opportunities. A concern raised by the evaluator of the Nigeria programme is that a thorough labour market assessment was not undertaken before deciding on the types of trades to teach. The trades that were taught (tailoring, hair dressing, welding and electricity) are the most typical trades for apprentices, and leaves vocational students open to major competition when looking for job placement. In Burkina Faso, the evaluator notes that because no market assessment was conducted before the programme, the programme risked wasting its resources by training youth into unemployment, while also distorting the local labour market. Adding new vendors to the market, leads to an increase in competition and a depreciation of prices. The evaluator recommended that market research should have been undertaken into the types of production that can be sold outside the community. This was reiterated by the evaluator of the Liberian programme. The choice of training was based on ‘traditional’ choices of vocation such as carpentry, which are already on the market and in high competition. The evaluator found that UNICEF and ILO had commissioned a Labour Market Analyses at the outset of the program, which was widely disseminated to partners. However, the findings were not used to design the vocational training courses and this was not identified in ongoing M&E. Recommendations such as the importance of providing income generating support to the parents of younger children were not considered. Instead of a market assessment, the Somali programme was based on the opinion of stakeholders and the Board that technical training would be useful to children associated with armed conflict. The vocational training classes were matched to the interest and focus of each trainer rather than the needs of the children and the local market.

**Participatory programming:** It is necessary to consult a wide range of actors when designing a programme, including stakeholders, community members, families and children; however this needs to be

---


348 Ibid.


balanced against what is realistic, feasible and sustainable. The evaluator of the Nepal programme stated that the programmers not only failed to undertake a market analysis but also based their decisions on children's interests rather than on what was viable. This led to a range of negative consequences:

“...It also appears that the desire to take children’s views seriously and to listen to their expression of what they wanted to do took precedence over realistic, sustainably targeted training. For instance, many boys stated that they wanted to become drivers and so they received a month’s training. Many are now disappointed as they were either too young to obtain a driver’s license or are unable to obtain work that involves driving because they live far away from roads or cars. For girls, most accepted the offer of tailoring training, although again they are too young to set up their own business (in some cases too young to work)”.351

Relevance: Social protection initiatives should be relevant and appropriate for children in both the short and long term. In the short term, activities should be suitable to the target group. In Nepal girls received tailoring training and looked forward to setting up their own businesses; however, this was unlikely as they received no training in business management, many were illiterate and innumerate, and many were under 16 years of age. So in this context, the activities were not appropriate. The evaluator argued that particularly since many of these children were younger than 14 years of age, they should have received training balanced with educational input appropriate to their age and abilities.352

In addition, social protection programmes should take into account the socio-economic context and ensure alignment with broader poverty-alleviation efforts. Evaluators argued that some programmes were not relevant because they were not based on market assessments (see evidence-based planning), they duplicated existing skills training activities, and they did not contribute to broader development plans. In Nigeria, the evaluator noted that the vocational training centres created parallel structures which compete with informal training. The evaluator argues that the centres should have worked with communities within their premises, especially when working on traditional trades. Alternatively, the centre should have provided training on innovative and non-traditional trades and production targeting markets outside the local community in order to (a) avoid conflict with informal trainers in the community and (b) to find a new market for services and goods.353 The evaluator of the programme in Liberia stated that the vocational training was not explicitly linked with broader social development schemes. Apart from one exception, where UNICEF lobbied for the inclusion of parents of demobilized children to be involved in the National Foundation against Poverty and Disease Inc. (NAFAPD)’s road maintenance project in order to increase their household incomes, few efforts were made to combine vocational training and income generation activities with infrastructural development projects.354

It is not effective or appropriate to provide children with a set of skills that they cannot use in future. Social protection programmes should be specifically designed with the objective of alleviating poverty, increasing children’s opportunities and facilitating their access to a means of livelihood and survival, thereby addressing some of the underlying causes of violence. A number of evaluators stated that the programmes were designed to enhance the opportunities available to children and families in contexts characterized by high socio-economic inequalities; however, over the long-term, this appropriateness was called into question. For instance, vocational training may be effective in terms of providing trainees with a set of skills; however, if these skills are not marketable on the labour market or unlikely to increase commercial production, these programmes are not effective. In Burkina Faso it was found that despite vocational training, some children and adults earn the same as what they did before entering the programme several years before.355

352 Ibid.
Support: A concern raised in many reports is that vocational training will only be successful, when support is provided in selling outputs in a commercial enterprise. In Thailand, there were tentative plans to complement the Home Based Production with a Friends International Training Restaurant and a shop selling Home Based Production products in 2011; however, this required significant additional funds, personnel and capacity. This was echoed by the evaluator of the Colombia programme, who stated that the effectiveness and sustainability of productive initiatives such as handicrafts for women or agriculture in schools are limited due to the absence of a programme for promoting the commercialization or marketing of products, or the generation of cooperatives. In terms of employability, in Nigeria vocational students were frustrated that they were required to seek their own job placements, with only a letter of recommendation from the centres. Many struggled to find employment on their own and/or had to pay apprenticeship fees in return for job placements.

Follow-up support: it was held that vocational training is only the first step, resources should be directed at following up on those children and parents who have received assistance, for instance after they have graduated from the Home Based Production in Thailand. Similarly in Liberia it was argued that the programme does not follow their graduates systematically and loses track of those whose businesses have failed or those who are unemployed. This not only hinders the provision of long term support, but it also makes it difficult to measure the real impact of the programme. Follow-up would show that many children formerly associated with the armed forces remained idle in their communities because their toolkits were stolen or sold; start-up capital was misused or not yet received; job placements were lacking; many could not produce quality finished products or start-up businesses because they were not adequately trained due to the limited time allocated for training; some children failed their lessons because of overarching economic needs; many did not save their income because they had immediate expenses; and all needed additional support in their small business enterprises (place, tools and capital) and in finding employment in a very competitive labour market. Similarly in Somalia, follow-up was poor. Trainees felt that they had not been sufficiently coached once they had finished their training; they were not sufficiently oriented and supported when seeking employment; and they had not received start-up capital or seed money to start their own informal businesses.

Targeting: Social protection programmes should aim to reach the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children. However, in Burkina Faso targeting was raised as an issue of concern. Although the vocational training programme was targeted specifically at returned child victims of trafficking, the evaluator found that none of the children were victims. This is due in part to the failure of social services staff to actively seek, invite or encourage child victims (otherwise described as child survivors) to apply and participate in the programme, and partly due to the fact that child victims do not want to wait in their communities to join the next vocational training programme which only starts in October. So although, child victims/survivors may be integrated into other programmes for vulnerable children, the evaluator argued that they are not receiving much assistance after being returned home. They “appear to be lost amongst the many other types of vulnerable children despite the programme’s anti-child trafficking aims, objectives, activities and title”. The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme stated that the design of the social protection programme should be carefully reconsidered as urban working children will not be freed to travel to an institution for non-formal education when their priority is to earn an income. Enterprise development skills and self-employment training would be more of an incentive, but careful

---

357 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
consideration needs to be given to how this programme will reach and deliver such programmes, without hindering children's livelihood activities.\textsuperscript{363}

While it is extremely important to target the most vulnerable, attention should also be given to other children in the community. Concerns were raised about the targeting of children formally associated with the armed conflict by other members of the community. They stated that their children are not given equal opportunities for skills training (only 10\% non-CAAFA\textsuperscript{G} in the vocational training programme) and that there are few alternative training programmes for their children. The vocational training programme was described as biased and unfair.\textsuperscript{364} These perceptions are likely to hinder reintegration efforts. So these children may have skills but they may be excluded from productive and social activities in the community.

\textbf{Gender:} Social protection programmes should take into consideration gender issues when selecting trainees and designing vocational training and income generating activities. The evaluator of the Ethiopian programme stated that gender empowerment needs to be considered in their income generating activities.\textsuperscript{365} Gender was also raised as a factor in the Nepal programme. Although implementing partners stated that girls had chosen tailoring, the girls stated that this was the only option they had been given, while boys were trained on electrics. Non-gender-specific training and work opportunities should be provided to children regardless of gender.\textsuperscript{366}

\textbf{Ethics:} Like all child protection programmes, social protection must not promote activities that jeopardize adults and children’s safety and wellbeing. The evaluator of the Thailand programme referred to the example of a mother who crosses the border without documentation in order to look for recycled material for the Home Based Production. She put herself and often her children at risk in the process.\textsuperscript{367} In Nepal, girls would have to travel “long and dangerous journeys” to access vocational training which was provided outside of their communities (often up to 2 hours), with little consideration for their safety. Concerns were also raised about the absence of adequate security, including female security staff at residential facilities offering these activities.\textsuperscript{368}

\textbf{Expectations:} The evaluator of the programme in Nepal stated that the objectives of the programmes were not clear and transparently communicated to beneficiaries i.e. whether it was to provide economic self-sufficiency for older children or simply to provide children with something interesting to do. As a result, children’s expectations were raised and hopes dashed when the programme failed to achieve the former.\textsuperscript{369}

\textbf{Guidance material:} Guidance material that is developed for trainers and trainees must be sensitive to the socio-cultural and linguistic context. Although there were some books and materials in the Somali language at the Resource Centres, a large proportion was in English and contained several donated primary school textbooks which were not relevant to the needs and interests of reintegrated children.\textsuperscript{370}

\textbf{Knowledge management:} In order to monitor the effectiveness of social protection programmes and to share information about its activities and outcomes, documentation is very important. For example in Somalia, although information about numbers of trainees should have been included in monthly reports, the evaluation had to rely on scattered and dispersed sources which included little disaggregated data or


\textsuperscript{369} Ibid.

reliable information about numbers of graduates per programme site for each programme phase and course.\textsuperscript{371}

**Monitoring and evaluation:** The evaluator of the Liberia programme stated that UNICEF did not adequately monitor the reintegration programme. As a result, partners did not use the findings of the local labour market assessment to design their vocational training programme.\textsuperscript{372}

**Partnerships:** In order to strengthen social protection it is necessary to forge partnerships between different stakeholders, including government, NGOs and private sector. For instance, in Thailand the Home Based Production can only support a limited number of women; Don Bosco could assist in this regard as they already provide vocational training for older youth.\textsuperscript{373} In Mali, the absence of skilled local partner organization has meant that integration efforts were overly ambitious. Vocational training should be accompanied by structural changes that provide opportunities and prospects for the children on the move in Mali.\textsuperscript{374} In Nepal the evaluator states that UNICEF should partner with other development partners such as the World Bank and the Agricultural Development Bank because initiatives such as rural electrification and livestock programme create training and income generation activities, and community run initiatives such as the cooperative movement would create opportunities for apprenticeships and training for older children and youth.\textsuperscript{375}

**Funding:** The evaluator of the Liberia programme stated that funding limitations meant that the programme failed to invest in families and community environments, or link the reintegration to the wider national programme despite the findings of a market analysis that recommended these components.\textsuperscript{376} The budget for the Nepali programme was underestimated and could not include literacy, numeracy, business skills or life-skills training, which is a concern given the fact that many of the children were younger than 14 years of age and needed a balanced educational and vocational programme.\textsuperscript{377}

3.1.3.9.3 Micro-credit schemes

In order to address the structural causes of poverty, some social protection schemes focus on the provision of micro-credit to small businesses. Table 29 describes three programmes which adopted this strategy in relation to results.

**Table 29: Micro credit schemes by strategy and finding**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Micro-credit was provided to poor families in order to encourage them to accept their children back as part of a family reintegration process. The target group was offered micro business opportunities as part of a larger programme administered by Mercy Corps and implemented by the National Association of Business Women (NABW). The scheme allowed people with no collateral to join up and take out</td>
<td>During the vocational training, it was evident that the families were not ready for the credit component, despite various adjustments to the budget and approach. The uptake of loans was small and had “no discernible impact” on the programme. The programme even tried to target businesses and offer loans for providing employment to people from</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{371} Ibid.  
group loans. Social workers and Child Rights Departments provided lists to the NABW but were not part of the selection process.

UNICEF’s target group, but few businesses wanted to hire these people and few who were employed, wanted to leave and start up their own businesses. Rural families were not interested in taking out loans to buy livestock as they feared they would not be able to buy them back. As of August 10th 2005, out of 115 participants of the training, only 18 took out loans, and only 5 out of 12 people were hired by other businesses and had retained their jobs.  

In collaboration with the Ministry of Economic Planning, the Delta centre established a micro-credit scheme in January 2007. Students who had graduated from vocational training courses could gain access to a micro-credit loan in order to set up a business and become self-reliant.

The uptake of the micro-credit loans was small as many students were intimidated by the prospects of having to pay it back. In addition, Shell and BP were giving out cash grants in the same state which made students question the value of a loan.

The Ministry of Labour sought to prevent child labour by offering revolving credit, training in small business management and employment services to families of children.

This strategy contributed to the gradual elimination of child labour.

**Challenges, constraints and gaps**

Evidence from Nigeria and Tajikistan suggests that the uptake of micro credit loans is low among youth and parents living in poverty. In Tajikistan it was found that families were not ready for the credit component despite having received vocational training. They were averse to taking loans because they feared that they could not pay them back. Similarly in Nigeria, vocational students were intimidated by the prospect of having to pay the loans back. As a result, it was argued that “micro-credit schemes as part of child protection services are not appropriate, but there is a need to develop very basic services including parenting skills, budgeting, and day to day management of living”.

In Ethiopia, the associations that administer micro credit to women failed to reach women in rural and outlying areas, many of whom would not have the capacity to fulfil the requirements to access credit. The

---

383 Ibid.
evaluator recommended that the programmes focus more on poverty alleviation and economic empowerment of women at the grassroots level than on micro-credit.  

3.1.3.9.4 Cash transfers

Table 30: Cash transfers by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Prevention of abandonment and residential care</td>
<td>The FS&amp;FC programme supports cash transfers. A temporary cash allowance (60 GEL) was paid by the MoES for food for a period of 6 months to prevent the institutionalization of children or to motivate the reintegration of children as part of a de-institutionalization process. Foster parents received an additional allowance (total 100 GEL). When caring for children living with disabilities, this reached GEL 220.</td>
<td>Concerns were raised about the appropriateness and effectiveness of this intervention (see discussion).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Families enter into a contract with the programme to enter into an ‘action plan’. Multi-disciplinary teams provide different types of support, including material and financial aid. 165 families with 300 children benefitted from family support services but there was a tendency to reduce this service to material-financial aid.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>In cases of extreme need, district social workers could access an emergency social fund at provincial level. Procedures for accessing this fund were lengthy and complicated. It also required a family to have sufficient resources to be able to travel to the provincial town to collect the cash. As a result, this fund was said to exist in name only.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The CPB-M provided a set amount to children for their time spent in the cantonments. The adverse impact of this strategy was discussed at length by the evaluator (See discussion).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>To prevent secondary separation and to ensure the quality of care of children placed in foster families, monetary support was provided for three months to foster Monetary support was provided to 1300 foster families for approximately 1700 children. In addition, livelihoods support such as access to credit and vocational training was provided to 461 caregivers and to 122 caretakers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Challenges, constraints and gaps</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>To meet the material needs of separated children and their families, UNICEF contributed 200 rupees to the 500 rupee/month payments made to foster parents when the fit persons order were complete. This was accompanied by the distribution of family packs, made up of cookware, personal hygiene supplies, mosquito nets, floor nets and other items through July 2005. Nationally, 770 of 1,582 children (48%) who lost both parents in the tsunami benefited from the Fit Person Ordinance as of 2007. UNICEF also distributed 4,150 family kits to families hosting children who lost parents. Discrepancies were found in relation to who was eligible for the 500 rupee payments and concerns were raised about administration procedures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>Child protection systems</td>
<td>Under the Programme of Support, children received school-related, psychosocial, food and nutrition, health care, and child protection support. In addition they received ‘economic strengthening’, which included vocational training, cash transfers, food hand outs and income generation schemes. A household survey of beneficiaries found that 4% of children benefitted from economic strengthening. Economic strengthening was not rated as adequate, effective and relevant given the challenging economic environment where exchange for money was replaced with bartering and even then bartering became impossible. Targeting was also questionable as many households were labour and asset deficient and did not have the capacity to undertake economic activity.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Grants were provided to demobilized children. The resources were sent to a bank account for each applicant, but would only be available when the child reached 18 years of age. The programme provides advice to children and families on how to manage these resources. The evaluator argued that these resources are highly contentious and might pose threats to families and communities.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Sexual violence</td>
<td>Socio-economic support was rendered to victims to varying degrees in the 20 projects in order to support reintegration. This component was found to be very weak (see discussion).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Challenges, constraints and gaps:

392 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
Appropriateness: The appropriateness of unconditional cash transfers need to be considered in light of the socio-economic and cultural context, as well as in light of the range of children's needs that must be met and rights that must be fulfilled in the short and long term. With reference to the programme in Georgia, the evaluator argued that cash benefits were not “the right or sufficient instrument to support parents in raising their children”. Not only was the amount of cash assistance for foster parents insufficient, but the beneficiaries needed an integrated package of services, including shelter, employment support, day care services and inclusive education, including centres and services for children living with disabilities. Nevertheless, it was found that the PoS could not comprehensively address the needs of OVC because the absence of critical services and socio-economic challenges meant that some children could not stay in school even when their fees were paid (e.g. cost of school uniforms, food, school levies). It was therefore recommended that a comprehensive social protection framework be developed for the country based on cash transfers to labour constrained households.

The decision to use cash transfers should be considered in terms of what this cash would mean to communities, families and children themselves. In Nepal, the evaluator stated that the cash handouts for cadres based on the time they spent in the cantonments were not appropriate given the local socio-economic context. First, children would return home with more money than the normal family income. To put it in context, these children would return home with around NRs 27,000 in communities where a month’s school fees are around NRs 35 and the average yearly salary is around NRs 12,000. This could promote the view that children are being rewarded for their participation in the armed conflict or that they are valued more than other children. Second, it encourages children to spend money on items or services that are not necessarily in their own or their families’ best interests. It may even encourage prostitution in some communities. Third, the evaluator stated that the stigma faced by girls for spending time away from home in the company of men could be exacerbated if she returns with money, which community members may think was generated in ‘inappropriate’ ways.

In Colombia, the evaluator stated that the cash transfers could threaten family and community unity. As these resources are distributed and managed by individuals, it was held that this contradicts the indigenous communities’ customs of collectivity. As a result, when working with indigenous communities, adaptations were made to the programme; for instance, financial support was given directly to the indigenous council rather than individuals or families. Both the Nepal and Colombia examples suggest that there is a discord between individual and collective understandings of social protection measures. The evaluator found high levels of economic dependency on the cash transfers. Delays in disbursement of cash had a significant effect on the livelihood of families, and on the perceptions of families towards the programme.

---

396 Ibid.
398 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
Targeting: In order to be effective, clear and transparent targeting criteria and mechanisms should be established at the outset. The evaluator of the Sri Lankan programme stated that there were a number of irregularities in terms of the decision to target single or double orphans. In some areas, children whose fathers had died were enrolled in the programme, whereas those whose mothers were deceased were not. The age or existence of guardians was also included as a criterion in some districts.\textsuperscript{399}

In the DRC it was held that this component was particularly weak as market studies were not conducted, the cash was not sufficient, vulnerability criteria and rates of integration were not defined. Furthermore, there were significant differences between the cash that a victim of sexual violence would receive in comparison to those received by former combatants, who were often perpetrators of sexual violence. It was argued that social protection activities that are integrated into community networks (e.g. agricultural activities) with a socializing and psycho-social dimension to remove the stigma faced by victims would be more appropriate.\textsuperscript{400}

Administration: The administration of cash transfers was highlighted as a challenge. In Cambodia, the emergency social fund for people in extreme need usually takes up to two weeks to access by which time the emergency may have become a crisis. Families or individuals also need resources to travel to the provincial town to collect it.\textsuperscript{401}

Verification and documentation: In Sri Lanka it was difficult to verify whether financial assistance reached children because programme assistants did not keep records of the ‘fit payment’ receipt. All records were based on personal memory or hand written notes. Verification was further complicated by the fact that some payments were allocated in lump sums rather than monthly payments. In fact the evaluator found that only a few households visited could provide evidence that financial assistance was ever received. As a result, many children in need were not assisted.\textsuperscript{402}

Misuse of funds: In Liberia it was found that the transitional safety allowance (TSA) which was provided to children associated with armed forces, was misused by a large proportion of the children and their commanders. In other words, it was not used to support small businesses, pay school fees or to buy personal effects as originally specified. The evaluator did not specify how these children and their commanders further ‘misused’ the TSA.\textsuperscript{403}

3.1.3.10 Generalized lessons for Section 3.1.3

Box 6: Generalized lessons for strengthening the social welfare sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capacity building:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• It is essential to have an in-depth understanding of social workers’ approach and needs within the broader child protection system before designing training modules to build or strengthen their capacity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Strategic decisions should be made around which individuals and institutions should be trained in order to generate the greatest impact on children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• A needs assessment would elucidate the scope and content required in the training modules.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In order to ensure that trainees have the skills and confidence to turn their newly acquired knowledge into practice, follow-up and ongoing support is needed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Formal training in workshops and courses is only the first step in capacity building. Evidence suggests that these courses and workshops might have an impact upon their knowledge but it will take time and substantial on the job support, to turn this knowledge into skills.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{401} An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayn Sammon. Cambodia. 2009.
\textsuperscript{403} Impact Evaluation of the reintegration programme for children associated with fighting forces (CAFF) in Liberia. Irma specht and Hirut Tefteri. Liberia. 2007.
• Capacity building exercises must be monitored to ensure that objectives, targets and standards are being met adequately.
• It is necessary to document the activities, lessons and outcomes of all capacity building exercises, ranging from study visits to training workshops. This information is essential for future learning, the development of strategic plans and monitoring and evaluation purposes.
• Despite the training they have received and new skills that have been developed, many social workers cannot implement what they have learned. Investments should be made in strengthening social welfare institutions and child protection systems more generally.
• The decision to provide materials, infrastructure and transportation to social workers should rest on an identified need and demonstrable proof that these investments will lead to positive changes for children.

**Strengthening social welfare response services:**

• A rights-based approach to social welfare should form the basis of advocacy, legal policy reform and programming. Capacity strengthening should aim to ensure that children’s right to care and protection is ensured and that their best interests are fulfilled by quality service provision.
• In order to identify vulnerable children, it is very important to come up with contextually specific understandings of vulnerability and a sound strategy for identifying and engaging these children. This strategy needs to be based on the principle of the best interests of the child while also recognizing children’s own agency i.e. decision-making ability. In order to secure children’s consent to being removed from a risky situation, it is imperative that children are informed of the risk, explained the procedures and treated in a respectful and child-friendly manner.
• Programmes must live up to UNICEF’s commitment to ensure that the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children have access to services and protection. Outreach activities may be more effective in identifying and assisting these children.
• In order to make decisions about what is in the best interests of children, it is imperative that social workers and practitioners in related professions have been trained on how to conduct assessment/in-take interviews in a child-friendly manner using age-appropriate participatory methods (e.g. art, music and role play) where necessary. In addition, they need tools and guidelines on how to conduct – and document - a comprehensive interview so that children do not need to go through the trauma of being interviewed multiple times by different service providers.
• Decisions around the length of time that children spend in shelters should be based once again on ‘best interests of the child’ considerations. Children’s right to grow up in the protective environment of the family must be prioritized.
• While it is argued that efforts should be made to reach the most vulnerable children, some shelters do not have the capacity to provide assistance to them. This commitment should be followed through with a clear implementation strategy, budget and implementation plan.
• It is essential that shelters are manned by trained social workers who receive adequate supervision and support.
• In order to ensure that vulnerable children are identified by social workers and/or that they can access a full range of services, including medical, psychosocial, justice and education in a timely manner, a practical intersectoral referral protocol and case management system is needed.

**Social protection:**

• An effective social protection programme centred on vocational training, job and income generation counselling must be based on an in depth assessment of the labour market to ensure that the skills that are being taught are relevant, marketable and will increase employment opportunities.
• It is necessary to consult a wide range of actors when designing a programme, including stakeholders, community members, families and children; however this needs to be balanced against what is realistic, feasible and sustainable.
• Social protection programmes should take into account the socio-economic context and ensure alignment with broader poverty-alleviation efforts.
• Social protection initiatives should be relevant and age-appropriate for children in both the short and long term.
• It is not effective or appropriate to provide children with a set of skills that they cannot use in the future. Social protection programmes should be specifically designed with the objective of
alleviating poverty, increasing children’s opportunities and facilitating their access to a means of livelihood and survival, thereby addressing some of the underlying causes of violence.

- It was held that vocational training is only the first step, resources should be directed at following up on those children and parents who have received assistance, for instance after they have graduated in order to provide them with support to enter the labour market or sell commercial products.
- Social protection programmes should develop creative strategies to reach the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children.
- While it is extremely important to target the most vulnerable, attention should also be given to other children in the community. Perceptions of bias or injustice are likely to hinder reintegration efforts.
- Social protection should take into consideration gender issues when selecting trainees and designing vocational training and income generating activities.
- Like all child protection programmes, social protection must not promote activities that jeopardize adults and children’s safety and wellbeing. Ethics should be given primacy.
- It is essential to be transparent about a programme’s objectives from the outset, so as not to raise expectations.
- Guidance material that is developed for trainers and trainees must be sensitive to the socio-cultural and linguistic context.
- In order to monitor the effectiveness of social protection programme, make necessary adjustments to the programme and share information about its activities and outcomes, documentation and clear monitoring and evaluation strategy is very important.
- In order to strengthen social protection it is necessary to forge partnerships between different stakeholders, including government, NGOs and private sector. These partners can assist by providing training or livelihood opportunities.
- Budgetary needs should be calculated at the outset so that the programme can be efficient, effective and sustainable.
- Micro-credit may not be appropriate in certain contexts as the uptake of loans is low particularly in impoverished communities.
- The appropriateness of unconditional cash transfers need to be considered in light of the socio-economic and cultural context, as well as in light of the range of children’s needs that must be met and rights that must be fulfilled in the short and long term. Children and families may need a more integrated package of services. However, an integrated package of services that does not meet their economic needs might hinder children’s access to services.
- The decision to use cash transfers should be considered in terms of what this cash would mean to communities, families and children themselves.
- In order to be effective, clear and transparent targeting criteria, selection mechanisms and disbursement processes should be established at the outset.
- In order to prevent the misuse of funds, investments should be made in administration, verification, documentation, monitoring and evaluation activities.
- In order to ensure positive changes for children, programmers and policy-makers should consider the inclusion of social protection within broader child protection strategies, or the incorporation of child protection outcomes in social protection strategies.

3.1.4 Strengthening the Justice Sector in the Child Protection System

3.1.4.1 Introduction
A small number of child protection programmes in this review focused on improving the justice and security sector’s response to child protection issues. This included children who are in contact with the law as victims, witnesses and offenders. Activities include promoting tools for justice for children, training law enforcement and judicial officers, disseminating information on issues related to children such as diversion and child-sensitive procedures, and promoting the legal empowerment of children, families and communities.

3.1.4.2 Programmes centred on child victims and witnesses
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>A new PPT programme for victims of violence was developed. It includes case management and follow-up. Integrated service centres (PPT) provided child victims with legal protection, medical treatment, counselling and shelter for victims. In 2008, PPTs were established in four districts.</td>
<td>When compared to the old programme where no follow-up visitations were reported among clients, 67% services in the new programme reported follow-up. Support to the Pelayan Perempuan dan Anak (PPA) system was accompanied by an increase in the number of children and women’s desks (RPK [21 by 2007]) and children—whether as suspects, victims, or witnesses—processed through these desks. Data from five districts in NAD indicated a 186% increase in children being processed through these desks since the PPA system was activated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>In the early response phase, female police women were trained to patrol IDP camp barracks and assume a role in cases involving children in conflict with the law. By April 2005, 50 policewomen were trained and deployed to children’s centres. These policewomen formed community-based patrolling mechanisms to prevent exploitation, abuse and violence against children within IDP camps. Police were stationed at key transit points to ensure that children travelling without their parents and without proper documentation were returned to NAD. In the recovery period, 195 policewomen were trained and deployed to sites around NAD by October 2005. There was a strengthening of justice services and establishment of services for Abuse, Exploitation and Trafficking (AET) including the strengthening of children’s desks within police stations. By 2008, 22 children’s desks were re-established in all districts. One child courtroom established in Banda Aceh district; instructions on</td>
<td>The programme supported training for almost 600 law enforcement officials on child-friendly judicial proceedings. A total of 50 law enforcement officers were specifically trained on the PPA Minimum Standard of Services through mid-2008 and another additional 190 were trained on child-friendly judicial proceedings. Additionally, from 2005 through 2007, 43 Judges, 18 Prosecutors, and 25 Probation Officers were trained on child protection and child-friendly judicial proceedings. In 2005, 78 cases of abuse and exploitation were reported to children’s centres and police stations. Service uptake increased since the PPT programme. 35 people accessed these services during the year prior to PPT and 75 during the year after. Women who had received services before and after the PPT programmes were interviewed by the evaluator. It was found that services were of a more consistent and higher standard. The most significant difference was in the area of follow-up monitoring: prior to the PPT programme no follow visitation was reported, compared to 67% serviced by the new programme. Improvements were also noted in the documentation of the incident by the officer in charge (80% before to 93% after), a medical report was received by the victim for submission to the court (73% before and 100% after) and the purpose of the interview was explained (7% before and 53% after).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

405 Ibid.
diversion adopted by the police; standard procedures and guidelines for restorative justice for police officers developed; and, case management database under piloting.

Sri Lanka  Tsunami  In the recovery period, the Child Protection Programme supported child-friendly administrative and legal procedures and fostering, and supported safe homes as a method to provide care to abuse survivors.  By 31 October 2005, nine districts had procedures in place for management of cases of child abuse and children in contact with the law. 406

DRC  Sexual violence  The AED Project team is composed of legal professionals who collaborate with judiciary and police authorities. The ACH project was composed of jurists who would provide legal support. However, no training is provided to this sector. No concerted advocacy efforts were developed around justice issues.  A number of systematic challenges were identified (see discussion).

In the DRC, a number of concerns were raised in relation to these services. It was held that victims of sexual violence remain resistant to engaging with the judiciary and law enforcement, because of fear and insecurity, the absence of a meaningful protection policy and inefficiency within the justice system. Second, programme collaboration with this sector is often restricted by expectations of financial support. Third, judicial procedures were not well defined, leaving victims and families exposed to further harm. Many victims were at risk of additional threats from perpetrators who seemed to be released without punishment. Fourth, emphasis was placed on parents’ consent and decisions over and above the victim. These parents were often looking for financial compensation rather than justice. Alternatively, they preferred family-based solutions rather than going through the formal justice channels. Fifth, although units for the protection of women and children were being developed, they were mainly active in the larger cities, they lacked resources and transportation, and the unit was not nationalized 407

3.1.4.3 Programmes centered on children in conflict with the law

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td>The Juvenile Justice Committee (JJC) provided supervision (pre and post-trial) to children in conflict with the law to facilitate alternatives to</td>
<td>The following outcomes were identified for children served by the JJC: In pre-trial they are more informed of their legal rights by police officers, more likely to be represented by legal counsel, be</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


pre-trial detention and custodial sentencing to imprisonment. The JJC was also charged with preventing juvenile crimes, recidivism and supporting the successful reintegration of juveniles through education, socialization, health assistance, etc. Further, the JJC organized trainings to enhance the qualifications of state officials and other individuals working on cases of children in conflict with the law. The JJC expanded their activities to support children at risk with the aim of preventing crimes. The JJC coordinator liaised with other institutions at the local level (district educational, social welfare and labour, civil registration and other departments) to address the risks faced by children.

accompanied by a parent/guardian and social worker, served by a specially appointed juvenile investigator as well as a juvenile prosecutor and juvenile judge, be released from pre-trial detention at the request of the JJC Coordinator, be interrogated in child-friendly interview rooms at the police station in a child-friendly manner, experience shorter periods of investigation; attend school, trainings and/or recreational activities during the pre-trial phase. During trial, they are more likely to be represented by counsel, be informed of their legal rights by judges, receive forced disciplinary and educational measures as a sentence, receive a deferred sentence with probation, be released under the supervision of JJC, avoid sentences of imprisonment for minor and moderate crimes and be treated with respect by the police.

All 100 stakeholder respondents described the JJC as beneficial for children. There was a tangible positive shift in stakeholder attitudes towards children in conflict with the law. Greater levels of cooperation and coordination among stakeholders were described. In addition, there was more objective reporting by the media and less discrimination and stigma at the community level.

Beyond the scope of the programme, local authorities from 4 additional provinces requested UNICEF to replicate the JJC model. Local parliaments from 2 provinces committed financial support to similar committees. 408

Indonesia Tsunami

In order to protect children in conflict with the law, children and women's desks (RPK) were expanded after the Tsunami which would process children as suspects, victims or witnesses. Training for law enforcement officials (police, lawyers, judges) on child-friendly judicial proceedings and restorative justice was also provided. In the restorative justice programme, emphasis was placed on diversion from jail.

Data from five districts in NAD indicates that before the PPA system, 29 children were processed; after the programme the number increased to 83, representing a 186 percent increase. After the PPA, 71 percent (5 of 7) of children were diverted from jail in UNICEF programme areas sampled; whereas before the PPA programme, only 33 percent (1 of 3) were diverted. Only 21 percent (8 of 39) of children were diverted from jail after the PPA in non-UNICEF programme areas.

In order to determine the quality of service, the evaluator administered a questionnaire to children who came into conflict with the law before and after the establishment of the PPA unit. The findings suggest that children benefitted from this unit. For instance, before

the PPA unit only 8% of sampled children reported that a lawyer or NGO representative accompanied them during questioning, compared with 76% of children who reported that they were accompanied after the programme. No children were questioned in a private room before PPA, compared to 80% afterwards. Non-formal justice methods were used to solve the problem in 4% of children before PPA, compared with 96% afterwards.409

Although the Mongolian JJC programme was widely regarded as relevant, appropriate and effective, stakeholders raised a few concerns. There was a divergence of opinions as to whether the JJC should have included juvenile crime prevention in their mandate; whether it should serve vulnerable children or only children in conflict with the law; and whether it should work on broader child protection issues or only juvenile issues. Many of these concerns reflect the fact that there is little understanding of the interdependence of justice with children’s protection rights. This has blurred a sound analysis of underlying causes, as stakeholders continue to believe that poverty, family ‘dysfunction’ or lack of legal knowledge ‘causes’ juvenile delinquency.

Prevention has been narrowly interpreted by the JJC as legal education sessions whereby juvenile inspectors give presentations to children in schools. The evaluator argued that this is inadequate to deter children from committing crimes; instead more efforts should be directed at the strengthening of communities and families with assistance from social workers, educators, law enforcement and NGOs.

Early identification and child participation has raised some ethical concerns. JJC coordinators relied on children to identify peers who are at risk of committing crimes, even though this unfairly stigmatizes or marginalizes children who have not committed any offences, and places them at risk of increased police surveillance.

In terms of roles and responsibilities, JJC members were often uncertain as to which entities were responsible for providing services at national and sub-national levels, and this was compounded by the lack of documented interagency referral procedures and clear job descriptions for service providers such as social workers.

Partnerships also proved to be a challenge, as there were tenuous links between JJC and other development programmes supported by international agencies and broader civil society.410

3.1.4.4 Programmes targeting perpetrators of violence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burkina</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Legislative reform, training of officials and awareness-raising. A Vigilance and Surveillance Committee (VSC) was established in selected regional centres and was made up of essentially government officials and</td>
<td>There was an increase in arrests and convictions of traffickers. In 2004, 41 traffickers were arrested, of who 16 were tried and convicted, 10 were remanded, 6 were being tried and 9 were awaiting trial.411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faso</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

agencies, including: a local law enforcement officer, a local child protection worker, and regional and district social services representatives.

**Ethiopia**

**Gender and child protection**

The Wereda Women Affairs Desk (WAD) provided legal counselling, technical backing and facilitation services to communities. Communities stated that the WADs are appropriate places to seek assistance. WAD’s technical committees at decentralized levels and efforts to mobilize community institutions were effective in promoting gender and human rights issues, stimulating a sense of community ownership and creating a better linkage with claim holders. For instance, two communities decided to penalize community members and parents who allow early marriage and FGM/C by imprisoning them for one year and insisting on the payment of a fine respectively. According to the evaluator, “This has provided opportunity for communities to revisit their local systems (norms and values) and adjust and/or revitalize their participation consistent to the protection of human rights. The penalties established/developed by communities and enforcing them on the predominant types of HTP and VAW have been effective”. It is important to note that UNICEF does not endorse this type of measure as a means of addressing harmful practices.

**India**

**Child labour**

During 2004-2007, Open Courts were conducted by the labour department, covering problem issues in the district. These Open Courts were not empowered to conduct legal proceedings but were awareness drives by the department of labour in the district. The main objective of these sessions was to propagate legal provisions in place against deployment of child labour; to counsel the suspected persons dealing in child labour; to discourage parents from sending their children for wage work in and outside India. The Open Courts drive was described as successful. After 2005, cases involving child labour decreased significantly. It also led to the booking of 587 cases against cottonseed farmers under the Minimum Wages Act. This served as a major deterrent. In 4 out of the 16 villages where the qualitative assessment was undertaken, the evaluator found that girl children have stopped work and are in school. This was attributed to the effectiveness of community level sensitization and the open courts drive, as well as external factors such as the decrease in cotton seed cultivation.  

---


Nicaragua  |  Child labour  |  In 2003, the Ministry of Labour published an inspection plan that indicated that 77 inspections were granted. In 2005, inspections were expanded to include agriculture, fishing, mining, informal business sectors with emphasis on hazardous work and included 268 inspections in the formal sector, and 97 in the informal sector with commitments with business owners. To support these initiatives, UNICEF assisted in the creation of 36 new inspector posts and 12 new trucks.  |  Despite initial resistance by the private sector, over time there has been an increased awareness by employers about exploitative labour and minimum age provisions.  

The primary challenge identified in the programmes in India and Burkina Faso related to intersectoral coordination on law enforcement and judicial matters. In terms of India, the issue of child labour was initially addressed by the Education Department, which was supposed to have a mandate for all children of school going age. However, as legal powers for punitive action against perpetrators lay with the Department of Labour, the jurisdiction of child labour shifted again. These challenges, extended to funding as the Open Courts had to be suspended due to a lack of resources. The Open Courts were used to demonstrate the effective ways in which the labour department could work but no plans were developed to turn it from an innovative to sustainable intervention. In addition, there was a need to link up the Open Courts initiative with the Department of Women and Child Development and Education Department in order to plan for a convergence of strategies.  

In Burkina Faso, local law enforcement agents or the provincial Social Action office both have a mandate to intervene when potential trafficking situations are identified, thereby calling into question the value of establishing a Vigilance and Surveillance Committee.  

### 3.1.4.5 Supporting birth registration
Children have a right to birth registration as enshrined in Article 7 and 8 of the UNCRC (1989). In addition to being a right, birth registration can enhance children’s access to basic social services, legal protection and the acquisition of a nationality. Birth registration can also improve national data, planning, budgets, and the implementation of national legislation on minimum ages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>Child protection</td>
<td>The programme aimed to achieve 90% birth registration rates for children born during the project period in the 80 communities participating in the programme.</td>
<td>48.3% of children born during the programme were found to have birth certificates, whilst only 15.1% has no birth certificates yet. The evaluator stated that this was a significant improvement from the baseline findings of 2006.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>UNICEF contributed to the government’s birth registration campaign in the form of logistics, training, staff participation, equipment and an assessment of the civil registry in one region. The findings of the assessment were integrated into the plan of action for the civil registry campaign (2003-2008). Community Surveillance Structures (CSS) were also trained to educate communities on birth registration. The evaluator described these efforts as successful in terms of providing children with an opportunity for protection and promoting their right to an identity. It also enabled the government to generate information on the population, which is important for planning services. Stakeholders also described it as an important tool to prevent trafficking, as it gave children access to travel documents. Interviews with villagers confirmed that village-level sensitization activities had been conducted on birth registration. Results were not provided in the report.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>National protection systems</td>
<td>Under the Programme of Support, funding was directed at a birth registration campaign. 42% (10,395) of ‘new’ orphans and vulnerable children born during the programme period obtained birth certificates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Birth registration was included in the operational plans of municipal governments. Results were not discussed.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of challenges pertaining to birth registration, the issue of access was raised. Village residents in Mali complained about the distance to the civil registry offices and stated that culturally they would be expected to buy gifts for their neighbours upon their return. This added to travel expenses and administrative fees was regarded as exorbitant. In order to address these barriers, the government set up civil registration service centres in every second village across eight regions where a representative (i.e., teachers, nurses or individuals with at least six years of schooling) could perform the registry task without a fee. 421

In a report on child labour in New Delhi, it was held that in order to circumvent child labour regulations, parents in cahoots with private schools would obtain false birth certificates (showing the age of their children to be above 14 years). The labour department issued a warning against private schools who were issuing these certificates. 422

In Zimbabwe, weak coordination of CSOs and government services

---

422 Ibid.
hindered the roll out of the birth registration scheme. It was also affected by lack of cooperation from the Registrar General’s Office and the inability of families to gather the necessary documentation.423

3.1.4.6 Synthesized results, lessons and recommendations for Section 3.1.4

Box 7: Synthesized results of justice and law enforcement interventions

- There were greater government budgetary allocations to justice issues.
- Children’s cases were more efficiently processed, managed and followed-up since the establishment of child protection structures in law enforcement and justice sectors;
- Law enforcement and justice officials’ knowledge and skills were enhanced;
- Child protection for victims, witnesses and offenders was improved by the development of case management and child-friendly procedures;
- Children who were in conflict with the law were more likely to have their rights fulfilled and protected in pre-trial, trial and post-trial phases since the implementation of the programme.
- Large numbers of children in conflict with the law were diverted from prison and benefited from child-sensitive judicial procedures.
- Stakeholders’ attitudes towards children in conflict with the law also changed as a result.
- There was an increase in arrests and convictions of traffickers and exploiters due to capacity strengthening interventions and the establishment of regional structures.
- Communities were empowered to advocate for justice, question harmful social norms and stand up against perpetrators of harmful practices due to the creation of decentralized justice structures.
- A significant number of children were registered at birth. This secured their right to an identity and enhanced their access to services. These interventions also improved service planning in different sectors.

Box 8: Generalized lessons from justice and law enforcement interventions

- Children’s inalienable right to protection and respect for their dignity and self-worth as witnesses, victims and offenders should be used to form the basis upon which interventions related to the justice and security sectors are advocated, designed, implemented, monitored and evaluated.
- The mandate of structures established in the justice sector need to be clearly developed from the outset in consultation with a range of stakeholders.
- The roles and responsibilities of relevant stakeholders at national and decentralized levels should be delegated, documented and monitored.
- A relevant and practical intersectoral referral protocol should be developed at national and decentralized levels.
- Given the intersectoral nature of child protection, partnerships, coordination mechanisms and clear lines of accountability should be prioritized.
- Justice initiatives should be based on strategic plans and associated budgetary frameworks to ensure effectiveness and sustainability.
- UNICEF and partners should advocate for the inclusion of prevention in justice and law enforcement responses; this will require a change in mind-set about child protection rights, ‘root causes’ of juvenile justice issues, the scope of prevention interventions, and the importance of intersectoral programming.
- Child participation and empowerment should be enabled through individual legal guarantees and services in judicial and administrative proceedings, but also in protocols, rules and programmes in collective settings and activities. However, the ethics of encouraging child participation in law enforcement responses (e.g. as informants) should be carefully considered.
- Investments should be made in empowering children, families and communities to improve

their access to justice.

- The cultural, practical and logistical challenges of birth registration should be considered in strategic planning.
- Government agencies should be strengthened in terms of human resources, materials and financing to fulfil their international and national obligations around birth registration.
- Investments should be made in raising awareness of parents and communities about the value of birth registration.

3.1.5 Strengthening the Education Sector in the Child Protection System

3.1.5.1 Introduction

As previously mentioned, child protection systems exist in multiple social sectors including social welfare, education, health, security, and justice sectors. UNICEF and implementing partners seek to strengthen the laws, policies, regulations and services needed across all social sectors so as to prevent and respond to child protection risks and violations. Thus far the report has discussed efforts to strengthen social welfare and justice sectors. The remaining sections in this chapter focus on education, health and mental health/psycho-social services for children. It examines both the capacity strengthening component as well as response services.

It is important to refer to children’s rights to consistent and quality service provision (Article 28 UN CRC 2008). Many of the programmes under review aimed to ensure that this right to education was enshrined in the context of child protection (See Table 18). Schools were used as a vehicle for preventing violence; strengthening social supports for children (in the form of teachers, guidance counsellors, principles and school management); facilitating children’s access to services; increasing children’s confidence, skills (literacy, vocational and conflict management) and technical knowledge; and raising the awareness of children, families and communities about key child protection issues.

3.1.5.2 Capacity strengthening

Table 35: Strengthening the education sector by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>School violence</td>
<td>Teachers were trained in workshops on how to prevent school violence and how to use positive approaches to class management. Registration of cases of violence was enforced using certain forms. Restitution was encouraged at pupil’s level.</td>
<td>Teachers claimed that the courses were effective and that they were implementing the programme elements: 77% of teachers prevent from violence at least once a week and make sure pupils act in line with the rules. 73% of teachers refer to established behaviour rules on weekly basis. They claim that both their colleagues and pupils are willing to accept these components. 58% of teachers say that their colleagues regularly use activities and apply programme mechanisms (i.e. refer to the rules, ask for assistance by external and internal protective network, apply restitution) while one third says their colleagues do this occasionally. One tenth of teachers did not feel that the programme is practiced by their colleagues in any form. Despite these positive results, the evaluator stated that in reality implementation was irregular and unsystematic. Restitution in particular was not</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
understood and rarely applied. There has been an increase in the number of children who ask for assistance from their teachers in the face of bullying and other forms of school violence, but in 33% of cases the teacher tried to help but fails or in 16% of cases, did not respond. School principals and professionals are said to provide timely support. An important contribution is that the majority of pupils had the impression that violent pupils are looked upon differently now than before programme implementation. 13% of pupils believed that there are no such violent children in their school. 31% of pupils believed that the majority of children perceive violent children differently, although there are still those who admire the bullies, whereas 26% believed the popularity and power of bullies has been reduced to a significant extent. Only 4% of pupils believed that the popularity and power of bullies have increased. More than half of the pupils (56%) stated that they feel safer at school now than they did before the programme was implemented. On the other hand, almost one third did not notice any changes, while 11% felt less safe than before. 85% of pupils felt their safety has increased overall, while in certain schools this is far less (32%).

| Moldova | Residential care and child trafficking | In order to prevent child trafficking, the programme aimed to develop local resources in teaching communities. A national team of trainers was created comprising of 2-3 educators from each boarding gymnasium participating in the programme. The focus was on life skills development using interactive methods. | The evaluator stated that the skills of educators from boarding gymnasiums on life skills development were strengthened within the long-term training course. In addition to acquiring knowledge, they showed greater self-confidence, optimism, communication, problem resolution, and self-evaluation skills. In addition, children and youth saw a number of personal and social benefits. In the opinion of educators, the interactive methods were successful due to the fact that they: secure an open communication with children; offer new opportunities of getting to know children; favour |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>One component of this programme was to improve teacher competencies through training and capacity building. 180 out of the 192 schools (94%) in the programme area were covered under the quality package (provision of furniture, teacher sensitization and resources). 402 teachers were trained. A high turnover of teachers hindered effectiveness.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>6 members of the materials development team trained a small number of Master Trainers (76) who then cascaded the material down to supervisors and teachers in a 21 day Foundation Training and subsequent Refreshers. The materials balanced theory, methodology and teaching practice. The methods were primarily participatory. Training and refresher training is provided to teachers. Well-defined lesson plans are included in teacher’s manuals. Teachers are supported by supervisors who visit each school twice a week to monitor attendance, curriculum coverage and delivery. Supervisors are intended to be able to support the teachers with technical teaching skills and through modelling teaching. The evaluator found evidence that the teachers were using their resources and new skills as intended, providing opportunities for class work, individual work and group work methods. Concerns were raised about teacher’s abilities to differentiate and provide multi-grade teaching.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>A training package was developed for the Education programme teachers’ training. A 3 day training session was designed focusing on an introduction to MRE and incorporating MRE into the existing curriculum. School teachers and inspectorates stated that the training helped them to improve their understanding of MRE and how to incorporate it into the teaching programme.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The Return to Happiness programme was included in the education plans of schools in Teachers recognized the value of the recreational learning approach. It has enriched their classroom.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Program Description</th>
<th>Evaluation, Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Mine</td>
<td>UNICEF advocated for the inclusion of MRE as an extracurricular subject at provincial and district levels. In the pilot in 2005, teachers were trained to deliver MRE lessons to students during the school year from grade 1 to grade 5. In 2008, 80 schools were involved. In addition, 648 primary school teachers from 38 primary schools were trained in Mine Risk Education (MRE) and consequently started to integrate MRE into their school curriculum. The evaluation KAP found, however, that results from the schools which were not involved in the mainstreaming programme were indistinguishable from those in the schools where the mainstreaming curriculum was used in terms of level of knowledge. Despite results being indistinguishable between schools, the evaluation found that 70% of children had learned about the dangers of UXO/mines from their teachers on in the school environment. What is significant though is that 67% of children who were not exposed to the new mainstreaming curriculum also listed their teacher as their source of information about the dangers of mines/UXO from their teacher, which seriously questions the added-value of the curriculum.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Mine</td>
<td>UNICEF and the Department of Education (DOE) started systematic MRE in 20 districts in 2009. Children in the lower secondary grades (aged 11 to 13 years) were targeted due to their elevated risk of injury. UNICEF trained master trainers in a 2 day training course. They then trained RPs in a 1 day course, who then trained health and science teachers, who were believed to be skilled at communicating MRE messages. Teachers then trained children over 1-3 school periods, involving 90 students in each MRE session. On average, a teacher would finish all MRE activities in a school in one to two weeks. The programme reached an estimated 1000 schools and 500,000 children.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child</td>
<td>The safe schools and safe kindergarten programme involved working with principals. Forty primary and secondary schools and 26 kindergartens located within the programme.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

429 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups'. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
teachers and students to establish safe schools and with children so that they could act as agents of change to influence their parents and communities. All participating schools established injury prevention committees that integrated safety into routine work and obliged teachers and principals to sign contracts with schools to ensure the safety of students. A ‘Safe School Checklist’ was developed to identify injury risks and teachers and students participated in a safety audit. Safety measures were then put in place after hazards were identified. A ‘Safe School Standard’ was also developed and finalized.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child abuse, exploitation and discrimination</td>
<td>School teachers were trained on child rights, positive attitudes towards children, child participation, protection of children from abuse and parental responsibility.</td>
<td>In terms of results, the following changes were noted: decreased levels of ignorance, ill-treatment and corporal punishment and an increased understanding on children’s potential and overall visibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td>Education and legal awareness activities were undertaken in schools. Juvenile inspectors visited schools on a monthly basis to educate children on criminal law, the situation of children in conflict with the law, and to advise them on the consequences of and ways to avoid committing crimes.</td>
<td>International experience suggests that this is inadequate to deter children from committing crimes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Schools are provided with indirect support or financial support to renovate or repair their premises, as managed by School Management Committees. This was intended to support the reintegration of children associated with armed forces. They also identify non-CAAFAG ‘vulnerable’ children who could benefit from the</td>
<td>Schools report that reintegration of children has been positive and that they are hardworking and diligent.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected</td>
<td></td>
<td>Persons who were trained include 4,295 CAAFAG, 3,722 teachers and 326 principals. This was in 582 elementary schools implementing CEIP, 329 public schools, 208 private schools and 45 community schools. Conditions in schools have improved due to provisions of psychosocial care and support and educational materials. Participation of ex-CAAFAG is high in school activities, especially recreational programmes. All children have benefited from improved social infrastructure and materials on life skills, self-esteem, rights of girls and leadership skills. 436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami Training was provided to teachers to better understand children’s responses to trauma; use of creative and expressive arts for children; and the identification of vulnerable children. 212 teachers across seven communities received training on psychological first aid. Within a year of the Tsunami 321 teachers were trained. 437</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami The objective was to mainstream psychosocial support through the education system in tsunami affected districts, through the formation and facilitation of teacher support groups and the development of culturally appropriate psychosocial training modules and materials for teachers. By mid-December 2005, staff from 480 schools had been trained. In the early development phase, 1,800 teachers, social workers and psychosocial advocates were trained and 723 schools organized psychosocial support activities reaching more than 13,000 children. 438</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Mexico | Violence | In schools teaching kits were used to raise awareness of the impact of violence on children and adults who have no access to justice. Toolkits include specific guidelines on how to teach ‘creative and non-violent’ conflict resolution and working with adolescents and secondary level persons up to 22 years of age. This was rolled out to 711 schools during the 2003-2004 cycles. | The teachers and primary school teachers indicated that aggression among children has decreased, because they feel more respected and less likely to be subjected to corporal punishment. Teachers and students stated that they were able to observe changes in attitudes and behaviour pertaining to conflict resolution in schools. Teachers felt more confident and less likely to apply penalties to children. School performance among children also increased. The greatest achievement was found in terms of communication: teachers and students felt that they could talk and express their feelings more than before they participated in the programme. |
| Nicaragua | Child labour | The aim of ensuring universal education and quality education for children and adolescents was fulfilled by 85%, by making progress on the 7 goals that compose this including 1) strengthening of community preschools in municipalities with higher incidences of the worst forms of child labour through action programmes or projects; 2) ensuring access to free primary education to 100% of the workers and children not attending school 3) universal access to education 4) access to secondary or technical education 5) linking of schools to action programmes so that teachers can be trained on child labour 6) programmes of action undertaken in partnerships with schools and communities to strengthen educational options and/or eliminate child labour 7) ensuring the retention and promotion of 80% of children and adolescents treated in programmes and projects and 70% of all integrated classrooms for older pupils. | Results for each goal include: 1) There was a high performance of growth centres and preschool enrolment 2) Goal 2 was partially fulfilled with a net rate of primary school enrolment at 80% in 2005; 3) There was a medium level of compliance in relation to goal to achieve universal access to education; 4) At least 50% of teens placed in the worst forms of child labour was not covered and is only partially fulfilled; 5) 100% of teachers were trained in child labour issues and other issues to support the motivation and academic success of students; 6) High levels of compliance 7) Goal 7 was successfully completed in all programmes of action. |

---

439 Evaluation of the External Programme “Against Violence…We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”.  
Challenges, constraints and gaps:

Resistance from teachers and school principles: the Serbian programme found that teachers were resistant to certain components of the programme such as registration of cases of violence and applying restitution. The evaluator noted that some teachers do not recognize the value of the programme, do not see themselves as agents of change, they have lost faith in the school’s ability to fight violence, they regard aspects of the programme as a burden and waste of time, and they feel that parents and wider society should take responsibility for the issue. Many had expected concrete solutions to be provided by the programme and had not expected to have to think of reaction strategies. Many had not expected the high level of engagement required from them in the programme, and felt that their educational obligations should be prioritized. In particular, elder teachers rejected change in relation to alternative methods of violence prevention and response. In the Liberia programme, some schools were hesitant to implement the programme and some placed restriction on the number of children formally associated with the armed forces they were willing to accept. In Mexico the teachers felt vulnerable to the possibility of complaints of mistreatment by students.

Content: The content of training courses should be designed on the basis of identified needs, consultation with key stakeholders and a comprehensive understanding of the existing approach, norms and values. However, in many of the programme, there were certain gaps in content as identified by the evaluators. Teachers struggled to absorb certain lessons that would require a shift in their approach to children. In Moldova, teachers in institutions required additional training on life skills development, with an emphasis on identifying the development needs and interests of children. In Mexico, the teachers required more training and guidance on restitution. The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme stated that the content of teacher training should focus more on gender, child rights and human rights. It was held that the MRE training course in Senegal should be expanded to include techniques on how to incorporate MRE into the curriculum and how to develop extra-curricular activities with an MRE focus. The evaluator of the child injury programme in Vietnam recommended that teachers be trained on child injury prevention and first aid for school children. He stated that the training they have received thus far is inadequate, and is reflected in their incorrect responses to his questions on child injury and first aid.

Capacity: Some teachers did not benefit from the training because they were not trained on basic child protection issues; false assumptions were made about the schools and teacher’s capacity when the courses were designed. According to the evaluator of the Maldives programme, schools were ill-equipped to respond to child protection concerns. Teachers were not trained on how to respond to drug abuse, bulling and violence. Most schools did not have a school counsellor on staff. Administration was unsure of the procedures when a child protection concern was raised.

Ongoing training and support: Training should be followed by quality ‘on the job’ training and support in order to ensure that newly acquired knowledge and skills are being implemented properly. For example, following their training, teachers in Serbia received support from mentors. Most teachers described this support as inadequate due to the lack of practical advice and concrete solutions they received; the time-

445 Evaluation of the External Programme “Against Violence…We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”.
Refresher training: Many teachers have been in post for a number of years or have moved into another position. These teachers and/or their predecessors will need refresher training to reinforce the knowledge and skills gained in the first round of training, and to ensure that their teaching methods and content remain relevant and in line with child protection principles. The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme highlighted the need for refresher training to strengthen teachers’ capacity and allow for the sharing of experiences and challenges in implementing the skills learnt in the first round of training (Round 24). In Senegal, the evaluator stated that repeat training is essential given the circulation of teachers in and around the region. As one teacher moves on, another teacher will require training.

Training of trainers: In order to scale up training programmes, the trainer of trainers model is often used so that knowledge and skills will filter down to reach a larger number of trainees. This was a challenging model to implement in some countries. For instance in Vietnam, relying on a small group of trained teachers to debrief other teachers on the topic and skills proved to be inadequate, as important knowledge and skills was lost. Training of trainers needs to be undertaken in a more comprehensive and systematic manner, recognizing that teachers will require more skills, time and resources to train others. In Nepal, it is interesting to note that master trainers were not trained only as a means of ensuring that information and skills are widely disseminated, but to provide an extra layer of monitoring and sustainability.

Institutional context: The institutional context should be taken into account when designing training courses for teachers from both a practical and normative perspective; wider institutional change may be more effective than teacher training. It was found in Moldova that the effectiveness of training teachers situated in institutions was limited because many were reserved or resistant to change and the overall institutional environment limited changes that they could make to the rigid schedule and teaching methodology. Similarly in Senegal, the time constraints in the school schedule affected the extent to which teachers could incorporate MRE into their teaching programme.

Institutional support: Training may be effective in imparting skills and knowledge to teachers, but if the buy in of managers and supervisors has not been obtained, teachers will not be able to implement what they have learnt. With reference to Moldova, the evaluator stated that training will not be effective if the boarding gymnasium managers are not committed to supporting teachers and suggested changes to the curriculum. It is therefore important to obtain the buy in of managers at the outset and/or encourage them to participate in training. This was reiterated by the evaluator of the Bangladesh programme who stated that supervisors should help teachers conceptualize what works and does not work, and provide support in that regard.

Monitoring and evaluation: In order to ensure the training methods are successful in producing changes in the lives of children, a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation plan should be developed at the outset. The evaluator of the New Delhi programme stated that efforts should be made to develop a monitoring and evaluation approach specifically for teacher training on child protection issues. If the training was focused on improving learning levels, methods would include tracking classroom transactions, improving assessment processes and also periodic tracking of children’s learning levels. Child protection training

---

will require different indicators and data collection methods.\textsuperscript{459} As part of a broader monitoring and evaluation plan, the evaluator of the Bangladesh programme stated that teachers should be encouraged and trained on how to self-reflectively consider what works and doesn’t work in their classrooms.\textsuperscript{460} In Mexico, the training packages do not include forms of assessment and specific tools to understand whether the training has had an effect on participants’ conflict resolution methods.\textsuperscript{461}

Community engagement: Focusing only on creating safe schools, means that efforts to create a safe community at large are ignored, conducted in parallel or contradictory ways particularly when community members are not actively involved in the programme. In the Serbian programme, there was no clear mechanism for inclusion of the community and community members could not see their roles in the programme or the benefits of participation.\textsuperscript{462}

‘Hardware investments’: In the earlier stages of the programme in Nepal, the School Management Committees chose ‘inappropriate’ ways of spending support such as purchasing photocopiers where there was no electricity or building a classroom roof without having resources to complete the windows and walls. The evaluator attributed this to misunderstandings about the programme support or to the playing out of power dynamics within the management committees.\textsuperscript{463} In Liberia the extent to which distributed books were being used varied. In some schools they were unused and stored away. According to the evaluator, this may be due to the fact that not all schools were aware of the involvement of the Ministry of Education in decision-making. Some felt that financial assistance should have been made available instead of materials, so that they could buy materials based on needs. Some believed that the books were not commensurate with the national curriculum. Furthermore, teachers were not trained on the importance of the books that they had received.\textsuperscript{464}

Safety and security issues: In Sri Lanka, violence in the conflicted affected North and North East regions led to disruptions in the school based programmes. Construction had to be halted and many children could not attend school due to fear and displacement.\textsuperscript{465}

3.1.5.3 The provision of education services to vulnerable children

Table 36: Education response services by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>The programme assisted children to enrol with project assistance. Children, parents and schools were first consulted to ensure their commitment. Remedial education was provided at the drop in centre if necessary. Children were then enrolled in a grade appropriate to their ability, and where possible, placed in a class for children of the same age. The programme paid school registration fees, school maintenance levies and provided</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>61 street children were enrolled in 28 public schools with programme assistance. The majority have remained in school but grade points suggest that performance is an issue.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


\textsuperscript{462} Evaluation of “School Without Violence” Strategic Marketing Research. Serbia. 2009.


\textsuperscript{464} Ibid.


\textsuperscript{466} Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Programme Area</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Child protection</td>
<td>The programme identified children who are not in school and then assisted them with school reintegration. This included support for school materials and connecting them with available scholarships.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the programme is excelling in this area. School attendance was enhanced for 2,000 children through temporary classrooms, education grants, transport for children living in shelters, school repairs, and school clean up campaigns. Many children have been assisted with school reintegration and have received school materials. No challenges were raised in this regard apart from evidence that programme staff is filling in the role that government social workers should play.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>The programme enrolled girls engaged in child labour into schools. In addition, the programme introduced a new curriculum in classes I and II and a quality package which included furniture, teaching learning material and teacher training in child-centred methods. Bicycles were provided to girls to travel to high school, as a symbol of ‘movement, speed, freedom and convenience’.</td>
<td>The evaluator reported that during 2006 to 2010, a total of 11,213 children were mainstreamed into education. 7,530 children were withdrawn from work and directly enrolled in schools and 3,683 were admitted into residential bridge schools or other residential schools of the government. Of these children, 3,060 (i.e. 80%) were girls withdrawn from cottonseed work and admitted into Residential Bridge Centres or other educational institutions. The programme data also indicates that the numbers of out of school children have declined steadily. The programme reports that over the Phase I period, 180 out of the 192 schools (i.e. 94%) in the programme area have been covered under the quality package. 1,200 girls who had completed class VII were given bicycles to travel to high schools. 92 girls were given higher education support in 2009-2010 after having completed 10th class after having re-entered the education system under the programme. In the period 2006-2010 around 240 children were trained in tailoring and embroidery, computer training, carpentry and printing. In addition 79 were supported with ILO support in computers, nursing and as mechanics. 94 girls who were</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Details</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>The programme assisted urban working children to enter schools. The objective was to provide 20,000 working children (out of 200,000) of 13+ age group, who completed Cycle 3 of basic education course, with livelihood skills training and access to support systems to ensure optimal use of life skills based basic education to improve their life chances. In order to account for gender equity, girls were targeted as 60% of learners.</td>
<td>In terms of achievement, the data suggests that the majority of children received Bs, followed closely by those who achieved As. Attendance figures gave an inconsistent message. Visits to schools, and discussions with stakeholders all suggested that attendance is in the 80-100% range on a daily basis. Drop-outs only ever number 2-3 at most. This is consistent with data supplied by UNICEF which puts drop-out at approximately 8% over Cycle 1. The basic education curriculum was described as highly relevant as it strengthens the national curriculum. The teaching/learning materials were described as innovative for encouraging the participation of learners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The educational component was designed to assist children affected by armed conflict to return and reinte rgrate in their communities. Children were provided with direct financial support to cover school fees, uniforms and school materials. Schools were also encouraged to keep the child in school up to Grade 10.</td>
<td>Teachers and parents state that children are more determined to perform well and participate fully in school life, than before they left. Some children assumed leadership roles within their schools. Children stated that if they did not receive the support, they would leave school and rejoin armed groups and political parties. Children stated that it will reduce the likelihood of early marriage for girls who won’t be seen as a drain on their resources and will be more likely to make a better match if they are educated. Schools reported a positive experience, stressing that the reintegrated children are hard-working and diligent. They also appreciate the financial support for renovations and repairs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Challenges, constraints and gaps:**
- **Performance:** Although the programme in Lao PDR managed to ensure that former street children remained in school, they performed poorly at school. This suggests that additional bridging education may be necessary and that emphasis should be placed on understanding why they are performing poorly. For instance, it may be because they have been stigmatized for their

---

time living on the streets and have found it difficult to interact with the other school pupils and teachers.

- **Institutional support:** The evaluator of the programme in India found that in the 5 schools where children’s learning levels were tested, improvements in performance was associated with having “a better school environment, interested teachers who are regular and teaching, and overall a positive management”. Therefore, children’s learning outcomes are directly related to the institutional environment.

- **Equity:** According to the evaluator of the programme in Nepal, the main challenge that will be faced in future will be “how to manage the arrival, at school, of children with unheard amounts of cash and avoid them either becoming vulnerable to abuse or ‘hero-worshipped’ by other children.” The impact of social protection interventions on children in relation to the perceptions of the peer group should therefore be considered.

### 3.1.5.4 Synthesized results, lessons and recommendations for Section 3.1.5

**Box 9: Synthesized results in the education sector**

**Capacity strengthening:**
- There were improvements in knowledge, attitudes and behaviour in relation to violence on the part of teachers and pupils. This has led to a reduced incidence of violence in schools and an improved sense of safety and security in schools.
- Children living in residential institutions were more knowledgeable, confident and empowered after participating in life skills courses.
- Teacher’s skills and teaching methods improved as a result of training.
- Many teachers incorporated mine risk education in their teaching programmes, thereby raising the awareness of children.
- Teachers were better able to communicate with their students after having been trained on recreational and interactive learning methods.
- Schools became safer as teachers and children were more aware of the dangers associated with child injury.
- The attitude, behaviour and practices of teachers improved in relation to child rights, child abuse, child participation and positive discipline.
- Schools supported the reintegration of children formerly associated with the armed forces. These children performed well academically, have participated actively in school activities and have benefited from the additional investments and support.
- Teachers are better able to provide psychosocial support to children showing signs of trauma.

**Response services:**
- Children who were living and working on the streets were enrolled in school and were attending classes regularly. Findings suggest that many are performing consistently well.
- Scholarships and material provision have increased the attendance of formally out of school children.
- Large numbers of working children were mainstreamed into education.
- Girls have greater access to education and vocational training opportunities.
- Children affected by armed conflict were attending school, performing well and participating actively in school activities and community life. This reduced their desire to rejoin armed groups and has had an impact upon the early marriage of girls.
- Teachers and students benefitted from education programmes, particularly with regards to

---


their psycho-social wellbeing, self-esteem and conflict resolution skills.

Box 10: Generalized lessons from interventions in the education sector

- In order to overcome resistance from teachers and school principals, it is necessary to involve them in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the programme. It is necessary to educate them on the value of the programme, adopt an appreciative approach to their current work practices, promote their roles as agents of change, re-institute their confidence in the role that the education sector can play in child protection, incentivize their participation so that it is not seen as a burden, take into account their heavy workloads and personal commitments, and encourage their engagement with parents and members of the community.
- Training courses should be designed on the basis of identified needs, consultation with key stakeholders, a comprehensive mapping of existing programme, structures and role players, and an in-depth research into power dynamics, current practices, norms and values.
- Results-based management requires careful consideration of assumptions and risks. In the context of training, it is important not to make assumptions about the existing capacity of teachers and schools.
- Training should be followed by practical ‘on the job’ training and support in order to ensure that newly acquired knowledge and skills are being implemented properly.
- Many teachers and/or their predecessors need refresher training to reinforce the knowledge and skills gained in the first round of training, and to ensure that their teaching methods and content remain relevant and in line with child protection principles.
- In order to scale up training programme, the trainer of trainers model can be used if it is undertaken in a comprehensive and systematic manner, bearing in mind the budgetary and human resources implications of such an approach.
- The institutional context should be taken into account when designing training courses for teachers from both a practical and normative perspective; wider institutional change may be more effective than teacher training.
- In order to ensure that teachers can implement what they have learnt, it is necessary to obtain the buy in of managers and supervisors.
- In order to ensure the training methods are successful in producing changes in the lives of children, a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation plan with highly specific indicators and data collection methods should be developed at the outset.
- The community should be engaged in education strengthening activities.
- The decision to make ‘hardware’ investments (e.g. materials, infrastructure) in schools should be based on identified needs, consultation with staff and stakeholders, training of staff on the use of such materials, and systematic monitoring to ensure that they are used appropriately.
- The safety and security of beneficiaries, teachers and implementing partners should be prioritized.
- Some children who are being reintegrated in the school environment may need bridging classes to improve their performance, ongoing psycho-social support and assistance to interact socially with the peer group.

3.1.6 Strengthening health and psycho-social services in the child protection system

3.1.6.1 Introduction

Children’s right to health care is enshrined in Article 24 of the UN CRC (1989). This section focuses on the effectiveness of child protection programmes that (a) seek to promote the strengthening of health and mental health services and (b) provide direct services to children.

3.1.6.2 Capacity strengthening of psycho-social and mental health practitioners

Table 37: Strengthening mental health/psycho-social wellbeing services by strategy and findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>Children affected</td>
<td>In order to provide technical and</td>
<td>Despite a number of weaknesses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Training was provided to implementing partners and staff members on psychosocial counselling.</td>
<td>It was found that these activities were relatively strong, when staff was adequately trained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Nepal   | by armed conflict                 | material support for structures providing psychosocial care for children and adolescents, training, equipment and material support was provided. The decision to provide this type of support was based on requests from partner government and NGOs. In terms of training, the multi-sectoral steering committee selected a core group of trainers. They then provided a one week training course on psycho-social trauma. | in terms of relevance, appropriateness and effectiveness (see discussion), the evaluator highlighted the following strengths: the training was structured and had clear goals; it contributed to the development of professional identity in psychologists and improved their sense of self-confidence; it corrected misperceptions about trauma and child mental health generated in undergraduate courses; it created links between psychologists beyond the training seminar; it contributed to the creation of a network of mental health professionals and it was free of charge. The material and equipment was timely and relevant in relation to the needs expressed by professionals and institutions but no needs assessment was undertaken. The extent to which these materials were used specifically for the service of children affected by violence was not monitored.  

The UNICEF-supported training complemented the training supported by UNFPA to community educators, volunteer counsellors, health workers and other relevant individuals. It also worked in alignment with the American Red Cross’ (ARC) psychosocial support programme (PSP) directed at 66,136 people on 76 islands in 7 atolls.  

Nepal Children affected by armed conflict Training was provided to implementing partners and staff members on psychosocial counselling. It was found that these activities were relatively strong, when staff was adequately trained.

Maldives Tsunami In 2005 UNICEF supported the Ministry of Gender and Family’s (MOGF) implementation of a Psychosocial First Aid course to deal with the emergency situation. This involved the training of 300 teachers and provided them with basic skills in understanding the nature of trauma among children and in assisting them, through creative arts and expressive therapies, in the immediate aftermath of the disaster. They were trained to organize Emotional Support Brigades composed of about 10 to 20 volunteers from the community who were given two to four training days. The training included activities such as emotional support, peer support, and creative activities to help children cope with their emotions. It was found that these activities were relatively strong, when staff was adequately trained.

---

three hours of training on the — Five Steps in Psychological First Aid. These included assessing the needs of the people, listening, being empathetic, accepting their feelings, maintaining eye-to-eye contact with persons with serious problems and referring them to where help can be gained.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>The goals of the Child Protection Programme’s psychosocial interventions after July 2005 were to continue to foster a return to normalcy for affected children and to continue to promote resilience and recovery. UNICEF and others achieved these aims by continuing to partner with communities to offer support services (e.g., by developing tsunami awareness materials and by offering film and creative arts activities for children and communities that reached 150 venues through Mobile Visions); by mainstreaming psychosocial support through the education system in tsunami-affected districts (e.g., formation and facilitation of teacher support groups to share experiences amongst the teaching profession and the development of culturally appropriate psychosocial training modules and materials for teachers); and by offering financial and technical support to community-based NGOs and government agencies to further strengthen the positive advances made in the emergency phase UNICEF supported the training of teachers on basic psychosocial support. Psychosocial-support-staff were also trained in camps, schools and communities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In total, more than 65,000 children received psychosocial support and assistance. In the South, approximately 150 psychosocial support providers received training and worked with local health authorities in camps, schools and communities. In the North East, UNICEF worked with the Sri Lankan Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Social Welfare to provide psychosocial training to community groups; additionally, they worked with 250 psychosocial counsellors from other NGOs in the area. By mid-2005, staff from 480 schools was trained in psychosocial approaches. Some 1,800 teachers, social workers and psychosocial advocates were trained, and approximately 723 schools organized psychosocial support activities that reached more than 13,000 children.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Challenges, constraints and gaps:

Relevance and appropriateness: In order to ensure that training modules are relevant and appropriate, it is essential to conduct a needs assessment and undertake piloting before they are rolled out. For example, with reference to the programme in Algeria, the evaluator identified the following content gaps in the training that was offered to mental health workers: first, trainees were not given an opportunity to define their role and status in the system, their need to share experiences and their need for supervision and support. Second, the training was not adapted to suit a wide range of trainees with different educational backgrounds and levels of experience. Third, the language used was not appropriate. Instead

---

of teaching in Arabic, the courses were offered in French. Fifth, abstract theoretical language was often used by trainers, which trainees could not understand. Sixth, the content was oriented to a disaster and emergency response, rather than regular mental health and psychosocial problems. The evaluator of the Sri Lanka programme stated that instead of conducting a formal assessment of the context, local understandings of child protection and the methodology that should be employed, international actors assumed high levels of trauma and ‘recycled’ psychosocial interventions that had been applied in other contexts.

Ongoing support: It was held that mental health professionals in Algeria require continuous personal and professional support. As their university education was largely disrupted by the violence, many mental health professionals need basic skills in interviewing and counselling the child and family. A lack of supervision and follow up has meant that this problem has not been identified. The evaluator recommended in service training and supervision, ongoing monitoring and evaluation, a formalization of modes of communication and coordination among psychologists and other professionals, easy and free access to information and literature, and official clarity around their role and status.

Targeting: It was held that the training offered to mental health professionals in Algeria should be expanded to involve other professionals and paraprofessionals, such as medical doctors and paediatricians who interact regularly with traumatized children.

The psycho-social needs of mental health workers: The evaluator of the Algeria programme stated that the psycho-social needs of experts/trainees should also be considered. Many have been exposed to similar events and situations that traumatized children have faced. Therefore, many were ill-prepared to enter the field and were isolated with little access to information, knowledge or integrated training. As a result, he argued that a one week training course on ‘psychotrauma’ is not sufficient to fulfil their needs and provide them with the necessary tools to intervene efficiently with traumatized children.

3.1.6.3 Response services: psychosocial counseling and life skills activities for children

Table 38: Psychosocial response services by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Violence, abuse, exploitation and discrimination</td>
<td>Art, role-play, games, life skills were used as a means of communicating with children and providing psychosocial counselling. The following criteria was used to select children: age 8-14 years, dwelling in the selected place for 6-12 months, 80% of children work and spend time on the streets for 12 hours; 20% of children spend 24 hours in the street; 50% girls and 50% boys.</td>
<td>The evaluator noted decreased levels of family disinterest; harmful activities: fights, aggressiveness and distrust; trauma and psychological disorder; begging, stealing and scolding; hazardous labour; destruction and arrogance among children. Reference was also made to children’s increased levels of capacities and potentials; self-consciousness and self-esteem; communication and negotiation skills; alternative thinking levels; analytical ability; empathy and social relationship skills; sense of togetherness; knowledge on rights; health consciousness; navigating street risks; expectations and life skills.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ibid.
Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Abuse, exploitation and trafficking</td>
<td>Partners provided a range of services to children who are identified as victims of abuse, exploitation and trafficking. This included educational and counselling sessions, formal education, vocational training, medical and psychiatric services, referrals to other shelters and family reunification services.</td>
<td>1,840 children were recorded as having been provided with psychosocial and other protective services by NGO partners. All children received counselling and were provided with some form of alternative education sessions on child rights and personal safety lessons and other life-skills, formal education and alternative learning system, medical and psychosocial support. Professional medical services were provided to 55 children including 10 children who received professional psychiatric care. Partner NGOs showed a high-level of effectiveness and competence in their psychosocial help and case management and in providing educational assistance to children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child protection</td>
<td>Victims of harmful practices were provided with legal counselling and support services which included liaison, facilitation, follow-up and counselling, through the WAB/O structures.</td>
<td>The contacted staff at all levels indicated that they counselled an average of 4-5 victims a day. Local communities and stakeholders described this in a positive light.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>The programme provided psychosocial support to street children in two day care centres, with the aim of reducing the risk of placement in residential institutions and at strengthening their life skills.</td>
<td>Results were not discussed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Peer-to-peer facilitators ran interactive life skills courses with institutionalized children to</td>
<td>The Life Skills Contest for children and adolescents from residential institutions from Moldova,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Social Learning and Life Skills curricula were developed by partners for different target groups including adolescent girl’s fora, children’s fora, and children in residential learning centres. Summer camps or Saturday classes (art, drama, music, and personal development) were also held for children.</td>
<td>From <a href="#">487</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>In order to increase children’s awareness of their rights and to strengthen their life skills, the Life Skills Basic Education (LSBE) was rolled out to vulnerable children or children working in exploitative conditions.</td>
<td>From <a href="#">488</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Camp Bustamante (CB) offered children in need a ‘rehabilitative package’ which includes sports, arts, Saturday schools, summer schools, visual and performing arts, photography, culinary skills, storytelling and field trips. The objective of these activities was to ‘build life skills and create a ‘healing space’ for children. An indicator used to measure the effectiveness of this activity was ‘Children integrated into stable after-school activities’.</td>
<td>CB students participated in the following programme: 6 places were reserved for summer school offered by Tomorrow’s Children; 20% of places at the Saturday school ‘art on the street classes’ offered by the Multicare Foundation; 6-10 places at the Junior Centre-Institute of Jamaica’s summer school. The activities were described as culturally appropriate. The evaluator stated that the programme had a therapeutic effect on children, helping them to overcome negative experiences. The interactive methods were described as highly successful. Innovative approaches included the exhibition of children’s art, poetry, plays and musicals on child abuse, thereby revealing the perceptions of abused children to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>‘Psycho-social-cultural’ animation was used in target communities to catalyse learning and training in children and adolescents. Staff ran recreational workshops in local schools and communities using recreational therapy, art and drama.</td>
<td>Children and adolescents stated that the programme helped them to overcome negative emotions and adverse sentiments in favour of more adaptable ones such as security, harmonization and equilibrium. The children identified with the positive feelings and emotions associated with play and sharing with others. The materials (printed matter and toys) in the therapeutic backpacks were culturally appropriate as they were adapted to the specific regional context. In terms of equity, no child or adolescent was excluded from the programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The international NGO HealthNet Transcultural Psychosocial Organization (TPO) provided training to social workers on the provision of psycho-social support to children and their families.</td>
<td>Children and their parents described the support that they received from social workers in positive terms. There was a growing cohort of people, based in the community, who were aware of psycho-social issues, able to address basic issues for children and young people, and were willing and capable of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Event</td>
<td>Activities</td>
<td>Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Children associated with the LRA were assisted to return home. Psycho-social counselling was provided prior to family tracing, reunification and follow-up.</td>
<td>Over the period of the programme, 216 children, 50% each of girls and boys, were supported through trauma counselling, family tracing, reunification and follow up to ensure proper care and protection. The evaluator stated that the programme was effective in adapting strategies to the local culture, including the use of traditional cleansing ceremonies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF supported the Psychosocial Support and Counselling Unit at the NDMC to conduct various activities in the four relief camps in Malé and other tsunami affected islands. Materials such as toys, clay, paints, crayons and paper were provided.</td>
<td>Approximately 21,000 children were reached in these psychosocial activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Through 19 Children’s Centres, rudimentary psychosocial support involving play, sports, cultural activities and peer exchanges was provided to children. Efforts were also made to establish a professional mental health system, including an intensive acute mental health unit, volunteer village level psychosocial -mental health cadre and community mental health nurses.</td>
<td>17,000 girls and boys received psychosocial support and 1,200 teachers were trained in this regard. A 2007 assessment of the mental health services interviewed 44 households including 38 patients and 36 caretakers. The assessment found that in 3 of the 4 sub-districts, the system was working effectively. 90% of the patients and caretakers surveyed reported improvements, with an average improvement of 1.85 on a scale of one-to-five. None of the patients or caretakers in the three functioning sub-districts reported a worsening of mental health or social functioning. In addition, a cross sectional study on the effectiveness of UNICEF’s child centre psychosocial programme found</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

that: UNICEF correctly targeted the most vulnerable children (Tsunami-affected, underprivileged and displaced); 41.5% of the comparison group of children have experienced stress, anxiety or depression, compared to 24.2% of children in UNICEF-supported programmes; 17% of parents of the comparison group reported that their children had significant social and behavioural problems as compared to 14% of parents of children in UNICEF-supported programmes.496

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Psychosocial assistance was provided through schools in one-on-one support and group activities. Few schools implemented the full programme; instead attention was focused on the role of the guidance teacher. According to Ministry of Education statistics, 424 teachers in Galle and 442 teachers in Batticaloa were trained on this programme in 2007 and 2008. In total, 35% of those trained are male and 65% are female. Few guidance teachers referred children for specialized psychological or psychiatric assistance. There was no standard procedure for recording child visits. It was therefore difficult to determine the number of children in contact with the school-based psychosocial programme.497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>In order to assist the reintegration and psychosocial recovery of children associated with the armed forces; the programme promotes peaceful conflict resolution, civic participation, and gender equity etc. using sports. In addition, in indigenous communities, ritual cleansings are undertaken with the participation of the family and community. It was found that the activities have had a positive impact on children’s attitudes and behaviour, and this impact has been extended to their peers and families. 91% of the participants viewed the programme as very important.498</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Sexual violence</td>
<td>In the 20 projects included in this review psychosocial support to victims was rendered usually by This component was found not to be effective largely due to human resource constraints.499</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

496 Ibid.
498 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenges, constraints and gaps:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Relevance:** The evaluator of the Colombia programme recommended partnerships with the region’s universities to undertake psychological and educational research on the Return to Happiness programme. This could inform the development of a strategy that is more relevant, comprehensive and systematic. Similarly the evaluator of the Algerian programme recommended that experts consult psycho-social experts on different models that be used to assist adolescents and youth exposed to extreme war or war-like trauma. In particular, she referred to comments made by adolescents during the course of her evaluation in relation to the importance of culture, identity and role definition. Investing resources in finding out what these concepts mean to adolescents themselves through participatory activities should be considered so that they can be integrated into psychosocial programmes (e.g. role modelling). In Nepal, the evaluator described psycho-social assistance as a “new concept” in that region. This suggests that it was imposed on local communities and this has had a direct impact on the effectiveness of the programme. In particular, there were no referral mechanisms or institutions to which children could be referred.

**Equity:** Child protection programmes should try to ensure the inclusion of the most marginalized, vulnerable and ‘hidden’ children; however, the needs of other children in the community should also be considered. For example, the evaluator of the Bangladesh programme raised concerns about the criteria used for selecting children to participate in the programme. In particular, it was held that the numbers of children only constitute 1% of the total children in the community; the criteria do not consider the economic situation of the families which might contribute to the vulnerability of children; and children may be stigmatized when they return to their communities and interact with children who have not been targeted. In the Maldives, it was stated that there are few psychosocial programmes for children who are outside of the school environment, are living in residential institutions or are residing in the outer atolls. Children from impoverished communities were also excluded from participating in certain activities. For instance, the children attending the Camp Bustamante programme could not attend after school activities and many summer school activities due to the cost of bus fares. Victims of sexual violence often had to walk long distances to reach centres where psychosocial counselling was offered; this hindered access and continuity of counselling.

**Capacity:** In the Philippines, the shortage of professionals such as psychiatrists and psychologists who can provide free or low cost services to children who may need specialized interventions emerged as a significant gap. The staff in the Bangladesh programme did not have sufficient training on counselling or child development. Many facilitated activities according to their own conceptual understanding and commitment, but there was no uniformity in approach or opportunity for focused supervision. The staff in the Ethiopian programmes was concerned about the quality of their counselling services as they did not have any background and/or knowledge about psychosocial counselling. With reference to the Algerian

---

500 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
programme concerns were raised that a developmental perspective focusing on childhood as a highly dynamic and rapidly changing life, and children’s risk and resiliency was not included in the training of staff. The evaluator of the school based programme in Sri Lanka stated that the programme lacks competence-based criteria for the selection of guidance teacher staff, most of who have limited experience with psychology and have the added burden of teaching other courses as well. In Moldova it was held that staff found it difficult to adapt to the needs of an interactive approach to psychosocial support/life skills. In the DRC, psychosocial support was generally rendered by volunteers. However, it was held that many had not received specific training, are overstretched (e.g. 1 volunteer for 226 victims), are not supported by a professional psychologist and the commitment of volunteers vary largely due to inadequate stipends.

Referrals: The evaluator of the Burkina Faso found that in progress reports it was claimed that children who were victims of abuse and trafficking were being assisted and their medical and psychosocial health needs were being attended to; however, in reality she was unable to find a single case of a child being referred for medical attention or counselling in five years of functioning. The lack of referrals was attributed to a lack of investment of adequate resources in these services, but also the staff’s inability to identify and assess children’s needs and refer those who need additional care. This was echoed by the evaluator of the Sri Lanka programme who found that referrals were made when children were sick and in need of medical attention, but very few were referred for specialized psychological or psychiatric assistance. It was argued that guidance teachers did not feel equipped to make referrals nor were they aware of mental health service providers in their areas.

Gender: The evaluator of the Nepal programme stated that gender issues tend to be addressed in ‘it’s worse for girls’ approach and that more attention needs to be directed to the psycho-social needs of boys.

Monitoring and evaluation: The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme raised concerns about the absence of a baseline against which one could measure dimensions of change for children, disaggregated by gender and socio-cultural context. The evaluator of the Algerian programme also called for a strengthening of monitoring and evaluation starting with information management (improving existing records and registers); clearly defining concepts, terms and categories; and the development of both qualitative and quantitative monitoring mechanisms that measure the outcomes of interventions. Data collection was also found to be poor in Sri Lanka where it was noted that guidance teachers do not keep records of child visits, making it difficult to follow up on individual cases but also to determine the number of children who were in contact with the programme and what type of service they received.

---

### 3.1.6.4 Strengthening health care services in the child protection system

**Table 39: Strengthening health care by strategy and finding**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>In this programme, violence was interpreted broadly as ‘harm to children’. Practical training was provided to health care professionals and civil society representatives on the prevention of child injuries. This was undertaken in the form of training courses at provincial or central levels. In-country study tours and conferences were organized for capacity building purposes. Provincial annual evaluation workshops and annual national planning workshops were useful capacity building opportunities. Training included technical knowledge (e.g. prevention on burns, drowning, poisoning, falls and animal bites) and first aid skills in cases of injury. Members of provincial and district PMBs attended the trainings, which were facilitated by officers of the Health Sector. Capacity building also focused on programme management including needs assessments, developing programme implementation plans, monitoring, report writing, recording injury cases and behaviour change communication activities. Trainers of these courses were independent consultants. The expected results were that PMB’s at provincial and district levels are able to manage programmes, provide training and support to commune PMBs and collaborators. Participants were appreciative of the training courses as it raised their awareness of injury risks within their homes, schools and communities. The first aid training was regarded as particularly valuable. Participants stated that the training on programme management gave them more tangible skills such as making annual work plans, recording injury cases and reporting. Although the participants did not specifically applaud the training on programme management skills, UNICEF has stated that the quality of reports submitted by provincial PMBs has improved as a result of the training.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Mine Action</td>
<td>In collaboration with the regional Health Bureau and hospital administration, the programme established a physiotherapy unit and orthopaedic workshop in Akum and Shire hospitals. Nurses and technicians were trained on basic physiotherapy and orthopaedics techniques. In addition, the programme also transported 11 mine victims from Afar to Dessie Orthopedic Workshop and facilitated the provision of prosthesis fittings and other appliances to the mine victims. A number of mine victims benefited from these services.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>Child protection</td>
<td>In addition to birth registration, this programme sought to improve the vaccination of children less than three years of age through community mobilization and awareness raising activities. Non-formal basic education had a health module.</td>
<td>In 2009, 52.6% of children under 3 years were said to be ‘fully vaccinated’ on the vaccination calendar, whilst only 11.17% were either partially or not vaccinated at all. This compares favourably with Tostan Baseline findings of 2006.522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Child abuse, exploitation and trafficking</td>
<td>The provision of medical services (lab tests) and psychiatric services (including medicine) to children who were reached.</td>
<td>Medical services remained a gap. Of the 1,707 children reached by the partners only 41 received medical services (lab tests) and 14 received psychiatric services (including medicine).523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>There were two health centres in Edo and Delta that offered students who were attached to the skills training course, free HIV/AIDS testing, referrals and counselling. Support groups were also offered to those who had tested positive.</td>
<td>The ‘youth centeredness’ of the health services attracted youths to HIV/AIDS testing. The majority of the students had been tested for HIV/AIDS, which suggests that the programme was effective. They described the health centres as well structured, with qualified staff and resources. The support groups were well attended and offered a space for sharing of experiences, support and learning. The students did not stigmatize participation in the clinic and emphasized the importance of knowing your status.524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Support was provided to the institute for children with disabilities of the Mardakai district, through the presence of a physiotherapist.</td>
<td>Results were not discussed.523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>In order to ensure access to physical rehabilitation for landmine survivors, referrals were made to the Mekele Orthopedic and Physiotherapy Centre. The Centre made provisions for prosthesis and supporting physiotherapy.</td>
<td>Staff at the Mekele Centre was positive about the existing referral system and the work of ORSA. Concerns were raised that at times the local ORSA representative adopted a reactive rather than proactive stance.525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Goal 1: Supporting access to comprehensive basic health for children, adolescents and their families, enabling them to improve their living conditions and quality of life.</td>
<td>Goal 1 was achieved by 85%, over the fulfilment of each of the five goals established in the Plan. Goal 2 was fulfilled. Goal 3 was on track but</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
life.

Goal 2: Providing comprehensive health care both preventive and curative, to 100% of children, adolescents and families served in programmes.

Goal 3: Ensuring the health conditions of 100% are adolescents workers is well on track

Goal 4: Sponsor at least 4 research projects demonstrating the harmful health effects caused by the performance of certain work activities in children and adolescents (trash, fishing, agro-exports).

Goal 5: Ensuring that 100% of the schools that are part of the Healthy Schools initiative include the component for the eradication of child labour as one of the indicators fulfilled in the Child Friendly Schools initiative.

Goal 6: Supporting the elimination of malnutrition in 100% of children and adolescent workers in programmes/projects aimed at the eradication of child labour in 20 Family area intervention projects funded by ILO-IPEC Save the Children.

compliance could not be assured due to difficulties in monitoring/tracking. Goal 4 showed 200% compliance. Goal 5 was largely fulfilled. Goal 6 was included in the programmes of action.

DRC  Sexual violence  Some projects offered PEP kits and medications to victims of sexual violence.

This tended to be a stronger component of the project, but a number of challenges remained including the proximity of intervention (as most are concentrated in urban areas), regularity of supplies, and inadequate response from medical partners. As a result, support is often not rendered within 72 hours. 527

Content: In Vietnam participants raised concerns about the adequacy of practical training both in terms of child injury prevention and programme management skills. In terms of the former, first aid skills such as dealing with burns and poisonings should have been demonstrated rather than simply presented verbally. In terms of the latter, participants were still uncomfortable with the recording and processing of injury data, conducting participatory needs assessments, communication and advocacy. 528

Targeting: The evaluator of the Jamaica programme recommended that the identification of and response to child abuse should be integrated in the training of medical doctors, nurses and nurse aides. 529 It was

held that training of health personnel on how to recognize the side effects from FGM/C and how to practice reconstructive surgery should be included in the Mauritania programme.\textsuperscript{530}

**Relevance:** With reference to the Philippines programme, the evaluator notes that there is a mismatch in medical services. STI-HIV/AIDS interventions (testing and counselling) should be provided for victims of sexual abuse and commercial sexual exploitation, other than just reproductive health and STI-HIV/AIDS education. Although the education modules improve knowledge, the evaluator argued that there are not enough sessions to increase children's skills so that they can engage in alternative, safer and more productive activities. She was particularly concerned about a child who was engaged in prostitution and rescued from trafficking who did not know if she had been tested for HIV/AIDS when her blood sample was taken at the hospital.\textsuperscript{531}

**Scope:** Given the success of the health clinics in Nigeria, the evaluator recommended that they expand their services from HIV/AIDS testing to other sexually-transmitted infections (STIs), bearing in mind that this would require additional funding and more advanced testing equipment and staff.\textsuperscript{532}

**Children living with disabilities:** The evaluator of the mine action programme in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao criticized UNICEF for failing to adequately respond to the medical and psychosocial needs of mine survivors. This was attributed to the labour intensive, technically demanding and costly process of VA in the mid to long-term. It was held that UNICEF is more successful in this regard, when mine/UXO related trauma is addressed within the broader disability context, i.e. the needs of accident survivors are addressed in interventions targeted at all disabled people. However, she also argued that there are indications that disability is not being prioritized at HQ level and that staff at CO level have competing priorities.\textsuperscript{533}

**Referral mechanisms:** It was argued that standardized referral mechanisms should be established at local and district levels to promote the physical rehabilitation of landmine survivors.\textsuperscript{534}

**Costs:** It was held that the high cost of laboratory and medical fees hinders children's access to medical services in the Philippines.\textsuperscript{535}

### 3.1.6.5 Synthesized findings, lessons and recommendations for Section 2.2.6

**Box 11: Synthesized results emerging from health and psychosocial interventions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strengthening the capacity of health and psycho-social/mental health services:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The knowledge, skills, confidence and networking of psychologists and counsellors improved as a result of material support and training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Community educators, volunteer counsellors, health workers and teachers were better equipped to provide psychosocial assistance to children in the aftermath of the Tsunami.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The knowledge and skills of health care professionals and civil society representatives to prevent child injury and provide first aid assistance to victims was enhanced.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direct health and psychosocial services to children:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The use of child-sensitive and interactive counselling methods has led to improved psychosocial outcomes for children, many of whom are showing more positive attitudes and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{530} Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.


behaviours towards themselves and others.

- A large number of children in post-emergency settings have access to counselling and in a small number of cases, professional psychiatric care. These children reported improvements in their sense of wellbeing as a result of psychosocial interventions at the community level.
- Victims of harmful practices and abuse received counselling, which had a therapeutic effect on them.
- Children living in residential institutions were reportedly more informed, self-confident, future-oriented and skilled in interpersonal relations, conflict resolution and communication as a result of the interactive life skills courses.
- Working children’s life skills were strengthened. These children acquired information, skills and knowledge which they applied to their daily lives.
- Children and adolescents formerly associated with armed forces were exhibiting more positive and adaptive emotions and sentiments as a result of recreational workshops. This assisted their family and community reintegration.
- Children formerly associated with armed conflict and their parents found their engagement with social workers as beneficial in terms of improving their psycho-social wellbeing.
- Many young children were fully vaccinated.
- Many children and youth chose to participate in voluntary HIV/AIDS counselling and testing activities due to the child-friendly nature of the health centres.
- Children living with disabilities were able to access physiotherapists.
- Landmine survivors benefitted from access to physiotherapy and orthopaedic centres.
- Working children’s access to health care was significantly improved.

**Box 12: Generalized lessons emerging from health and psychosocial interventions**

**Strengthening of health and psychosocial services:**

- Children’s right to access quality health services and attain the highest standard of health should inform policy and programming in this sector.
- In order to ensure that training modules are relevant and appropriate, it is essential to conduct a needs assessment and undertake piloting before they are rolled out. Adaptations should then be made to levels of difficulty; language, terminology and concepts; and local understandings of trauma and child protection.
- In service training and supervision, the development of professional terms of references, ongoing monitoring and evaluation, formalized communication channels, information sharing and coordination with other psychologists and professions should be included in strategic plans.
- Training on psychosocial counselling should also be provided to other professionals and paraprofessionals who interact with children.
- Psychologists and counsellors should also be provided with psycho-social support, particularly in post-conflict and post-emergency settings.
- Training on health care methods should be practical and demonstrable.
- In addition to first aid training, health care professionals and civil society representatives need training on project management (including data collection, needs assessments, communication and advocacy) so as to ensure the sustainability of interventions.
- All health care professionals should receive training on how to identify and respond to child abuse and harmful practices.

**Direct health and psychosocial services to children:**

- Partnerships should be forged with academic institutions, research institutes and NGOs to undertake research on highly contextual socio-cultural constructions of psychosocial wellbeing in order to ensure that strategies are relevant, comprehensive and systematic. This will depend largely on the context and quality of the research institutions.
- Participatory activities should be used to understand what these concepts meant to adolescents themselves, so as to ensure that activities are more targeted and effective.
- The relevance of psycho-social concepts should be carefully considered so as to ensure that they are not imposed on communities.
- It is essential to adapt psycho-social counselling techniques to the local culture, for example by
using traditional cleansing ceremonies or adapting therapeutic materials to the linguistic and socio-cultural context.

- Innovative participatory, highly interactive and age-appropriate psychosocial methods were found to be particularly effective.
- Child protection programmes should try to ensure the inclusion of the most marginalized, vulnerable and ‘hidden’ children by designing activities to identify these children (e.g. outreach) and by finding creative solutions to challenges such as geography, logistics and cost that inhibits access.
- In addition to the most vulnerable children the needs of other children in the community should also be considered so as to ensure that perceptions of unfairness and injustice do not undermine the effectiveness of the programme or affect the reintegration and wellbeing of child beneficiaries. Targeting should therefore be undertaken very sensitively, transparently and in a highly participatory manner.
- The capacity of professionals to implement training courses should be considered when designing these interventions so as to ensure that they have the background and basic foundational knowledge to understand and implement new concepts and techniques.
- Investments should be made in developing referral protocols on the one hand, but also in strengthening the capacity of institutions and staff to identify, refer and respond to such cases.
- Gender issues should be considered when providing psycho-social assistance. It is important to recognize the vulnerability of girls and boys in different contexts.
- In order to measure the impact of psychosocial interventions it is necessary to invest in monitoring and evaluation, including baselines, indicator setting, documentation, information management and qualitative and quantitative monitoring mechanisms.
- Health education should provide children with practical skills to engage in alternative, safer and more productive activities.
- The medical and psychosocial needs of mine survivors should be addressed within mine action programmes and/or programmes directed to children living with disabilities.
- Standardized referral mechanisms should be established at local and district levels to promote efficient and effective responses to children’s health problems.
- The cost of laboratory and other medical fees should also be considered when budgeting for health care provision.

3.1.7 Strengthening Coordination amongst Child Protection System Actors

3.1.7.1 Introduction
This chapter focuses on programmes that strengthen the capacity of different sectors (e.g., social welfare, justice, education and health) to better protect and assist vulnerable children. It also discusses direct services that are provided to children to prevent risk or respond to child protection violations. In order to ensure that children and families receive timely, appropriate and accessible services, coordination between these sectors is essential. This section discusses the regional, national and decentralized coordination mechanisms and structures that UNICEF and partners have supported in the 52 programmes.

3.1.7.2 Regional level mechanisms
In Central and West Africa, the Regional Office (WCARO) has supported the development of transnational anti-trafficking agreements by facilitating intergovernmental working meetings and developing a model bilateral legal agreement on child trafficking. This has led to the drafting and signing of a number of important bilateral agreements between such countries as: Benin and Nigeria; Benin and Côte d’Ivoire; Burkina Faso and Mali, Mali and Côte d’Ivoire; and Mali and Senegal. The evaluator referred to the political will shown by the Government of Mali (GoM) as reflected in the fact that it has signed more bilateral and multilateral agreements than any other country in the region. The GoM participated in the Abuja process leading to the signing of a multilateral agreement to harmonize the notion of child trafficking and identification, as well as signing bilateral agreements with Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Senegal. Despite these successes, the evaluator states that effectiveness can only be measured once
efforts have been made to implement these agreements. The capacity of West African governments will need to be strengthened in this regard.536

3.1.7.3. National coordination structures

Table 40: National coordination structures by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>The Child Welfare Interministerial Committee was established to coordinate activities, develop guidelines and revise legislation in the direction of family and community based alternatives. EveryChild and UNICEF played an advisory role.</td>
<td>The Committee created three working groups, including professionals, practitioners and civil servants, with the objective of analysing existing standards for care services as well as procedures and mandates of decision-making bodies, which are in charge of providing services, and then proposing an outline of norms and standards for services to be adopted in the future. The committee was working on the first draft ‘recommendations on standards’ at the time of the evaluation. A draft law on de-institutionalisation was developed but international agencies expressed critical comments about this draft. A technical group was therefore assigned the responsibility of revising this draft.537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care and social welfare reform</td>
<td>With the mandate of developing the reform’s operational plan and providing guidelines and recommendations to decision-makers, the Inter-ministerial Coordination Council (CC) was established in May 2006. It was initially positioned under the coordination of the Cabinet of Ministers and then under the Ministry of Education. It met twice in 2006 and once in 2007.</td>
<td>An annual work plan for 2007 was developed and signed by all partners; 7 technical working groups (on: awareness raising; database management; family reunification; legislation; monitoring; school inclusion; social work) under the CC were created in June 2007 composed of government experts and NGOs representatives. The TOR for the working groups was drafted but not yet approved. A monitoring mission was conducted in all residential institutions. Recommendations were endorsed by the Minister of Education in November 2007.538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>MRE</td>
<td>In order to coordinate mine action, a mechanism was</td>
<td>The evaluator found the network and mechanism to be highly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Children affected by armed conflict</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>A National Child Protection Action Network (N-CPAN) was established in 2008/9 as an extension of the provincial level Child Protection Action Network (CPAN). Its aim was to provide technical support and follow-up to regional CPANs where necessary, but more importantly to allow for strategy development, policy formulation and advocacy.</td>
<td>The evaluator called the effectiveness of the N-CPAN into question (see discussion).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The Afghanistan Country Task Force on children affected by armed conflict (CTFMRM) was established in July 2008. The Task Force was co-chaired by UNICEF and UNAMA and current members are UNODC, WHO, OCHA, OHCHR, UNHCR, the Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission and Child Fund Afghanistan. In April 2010 regional task forces were established in eastern, south-eastern, western and central regions.</td>
<td>The CTFMRM was described as the key child protection body amongst child protection actors. Monitoring and reporting was described as a strength. Concerns were raised about its mandate and scope for systematic responses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The CAAFAG Working Group met monthly in Kathmandu and when necessary in the regions. It was comprised of UN bodies including the UNMIN Child Protection Section and the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, international NGOs and national partner organizations. ICRC and the National Human Rights Commission attended.</td>
<td>The evaluator described the working group as strong, cohesive and well-coordinated.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

541 Ibid.
as observers. The Working Group was coordinated and convened by UNICEF and aimed to have a joint or harmonized approach to issues of children’s release and reintegration.

| Iraq | Children affected by armed conflict | UNICEF played a lead coordination role in the Inter-Agency Coordination of Child Protection and the Inter-agency Working Group on Separated Children. The six member agencies worked together to formulate policy and agree on common procedures. | As child protection was a relatively new area for all agencies, particularly in emergencies, UNICEF played an important role in sharing learning with the view to improving practice and guidelines.  

---

| Maldives | Tsunami | The Child Protection Secretariat (CPS) was established in 2006 to coordinate all child protection activities within NAD. It fell under the direct responsibility and supervision of the Head of DINAS SOSIAL. It was the executive body that managed, coordinated, and monitored child protection activities of the government, local, and international organizations in NAD. Inter-agency coordination meetings in both child protection and psychosocial support continued on a monthly basis through 2008 with approximately 25-30 agencies attending the monthly meetings. The Child Protection Secretariat, rather than the international community, led the child protection coordination meetings. | It was found that a lack of inter- and intra-sectoral coordination, including the lack of capacity in government agencies to coordinate various stakeholders, and high staff turnover resulted in instability within UNICEF’s work on drug abuse/prevention.  

---

| Thailand | Tsunami | A national Child Protection Working Group co-chaired by UNICEF and the MSWHS was formed to coordinate a more systematic and child-centred approach to child protection. UNICEF convened a national workshop in July 2005 on child protection. It also led a study tour to Australia for members of the Child Protection Working Group. | The workshop provided a platform to develop a new agenda for community-based child protection systems; The study tour raised awareness on how a child protection system could be developed; Engagements with government and other partners led to the development of a model for a comprehensive child protection system. |

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Program Area</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>Child protection systems</td>
<td>A large component of the Programme of Support was the creation of multi-stakeholder coordination and implementation arrangements, comprising of the NAP Secretariat and its sub-national structures at provincial, district and local levels as the overall coordinating body, the OECD-OVC group as funding agencies, UNICEF as fund manager, the Working Party of Officials, the Technical Review Team, the Core Team and the NGOs and CBOs as implementers.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the composition and roles of the institutions were well articulated; they promoted good interaction and cooperation among stakeholders, and facilitated broad-based ownership and flexibility which helped clear challenging bottlenecks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Nicaragua   | Child labour   | In 1997, the National Commission for the Eradication of Child Labour and Protection of Young Workers (CNEPTI) was conceived as the coordinating intersectoral and inter-highest level for addressing the phenomenon of child labour and adolescents. In 2000 this Committee led the campaign for ratification of ILO Convention 182. Similarly, CNEPTI led the National Strategic Plan for the Prevention and Eradication of Child Labour and Protection of Young Workers 2001-2005. In 2000, there was the first National Survey of Children and Adolescents in the country (ENTIA 2000) coordinated by the Ministry of Labour with technical and financial support of ILO-IPEC in collaboration with UNICEF. Through CNEPTI the country has taken important steps towards the prevention and eradication of child labour and the protection of young persons working in different aspects: policy and Programme development. | The coordination structures were described as successful in terms of supporting a participatory framework, encouraging the interaction of all actors involved, making roles and responsibilities explicit in the national action plan, being action oriented and making resources available for implementation. The coordination structure met the following goals:  
- The goal of meeting 100% of children and adolescents working in the 5 largest landfills Nicaragua and removing at least 85% of children and 60% of teens who work there is well on track.  
- The goal to develop at least 12 action programmes or pilot projects for groups of children and young workers with the participation of different social and economic sectors is in progress and 30 projects were conducted through funding from international agencies.  
- The goal of performing an inventory of the main needs and research topics was fulfilled by CNEPTI, which allowed it to make a rational decision. |

---

Constraints, challenges and gaps:

Mandate: The mandate of the coordination structure must be defined at the outset in a participatory manner involving all key stakeholders. This should be formalized in a highly context specific terms of reference (TOR) for the structure and used as the basis against which members are appointed and strategic plans developed. The evaluator of the Azerbaijan programme called for clarity in terms of the CC's role (i.e., was it a coordination or decision-making body?). Similarly, the evaluator of N-CPAN in Afghanistan stated that it was unclear whether the network met simply to discuss individual caseloads or whether overarching strategies and technical frameworks should be on the agenda. There has also been some confusion amongst child protection actors as to the difference between NCPAN and the Child Protection Sub-Cluster. In addition, it was argued that NCPAN’s TOR referred specifically to its mandate in a post-conflict rehabilitation context, and has not been updated to reflect the humanitarian setting. The CTFMRM in Afghanistan was described as an effective coordination body, but its limited mandate and sensitive remit ensured that a systematic response to children affected by armed conflict involving a

---

wider engagement with the sector would not be covered under the MRM framework. In Ethiopia, EMAO has a formal mandate to implement mine action activities; however, it did not have a formal mandate to coordinate mine action. This led to disputes that impeded the performance of the MRE programme.

Roles and responsibilities: In addition to defining the mandate of the coordination structure, it is essential to delegate specific roles and responsibilities - and corresponding accountability mechanisms - for each member. These should be widely disseminated to stakeholders and beneficiaries to ensure effectiveness and transparency. In Azerbaijan one of the challenges faced by the CC was the lack of an official document which defines specific mandates and responsibilities for key stakeholders involved. This is a basic requirement for effective coordination and would ensure the accountability of each actor based on defined reporting mechanisms. This shortcoming was evident in the fact that the Coordination Council only met once in 2007 and failed to implement any activities apart from the preparation of a report on a monitoring mission in institutions. Similarly, in Vietnam it was held that the roles of UNICEF, MOLISA and other key coordination actors would require greater definition for effective and efficient mine action.

In Nepal there was confusion between the roles of UNMIN Child Protection Section, OHCHR and UNICEF within the CAAFAG Working Group mechanism. In addition to defining these roles explicitly, the evaluator stated that communities, parents and children should know which organization to approach. Awareness-raising and other forms of community engagement are therefore necessary.

Institutional positioning: The institutional positioning of a coordination structure should be carefully considered in order to obtain government buy-in, facilitate access to human and financial resources, streamline decision-making and encourage the active participation of representatives from other sectors. The relocation of the Coordination Council from the Council of Ministers to the Ministry of Education was said to add a layer of reporting that would cause delays in decision-making in Azerbaijan since representatives of various ministries are reluctant to report to another ministry rather than directly to the government.

Reporting mechanisms: In order to ensure that members of coordination structures deliver, it is important that they have an institution or individual to report to using a structured format and mechanism. It was found in Azerbaijan that the lack of a defined reporting mechanism hindered the efficiency of the work of the 7 technical working groups. Although the reporting system for NCPAN was functional in Afghanistan, the information was not consolidated in a meaningful way at the national level, obstructing ongoing national analysis and information management.

Follow-up: Reporting should be accompanied by follow up to ensure that coordination structures are action and results-oriented. In Afghanistan the lack of designated follow-up in NCPAN has meant that little concrete progress is made, leading to repetitive agendas and discussions.

Monitoring and evaluation: In Vietnam, the evaluator stated that the effectiveness of the coordination structure was hindered by the absence of a reliable data collection system that would support a monitoring and evaluation framework. Time constraints on UNICEF and MOLISA meant that monitoring activities were inadequate to ensure quality control on the ground.

550 Ibid.
551 Ibid.
557 Ibid.
559 Ibid.
Information sharing: It was found in Vietnam that information is shared vertically with UNICEF/MOLISA with little information sharing between partners and stakeholders despite the existence of a coordination structure.60

Timeliness: In Nepal the CAAFAG Working Group developed consistent advocacy messages, but the need to work collaboratively and achieve consensus caused a number of delays.561

Commitment from members: When a coordination structure does not fulfil its mandate and does not have reporting, monitoring and information sharing mechanisms, members and partners may become so dissatisfied that they disengage from the coordination structure or commit in name only. In Afghanistan the N-CPAN failed to fulfil its functions of strategy and policy development, advocacy, information consolidation and management, due in part to the diminished buy-in and participation of partners.562

Politization: In Afghanistan concerns were raised at having a government-led or co-chaired child protection sub-cluster. Reference was made to their use of schools and health facilities in the up-coming elections. Advocacy with government on the issue of children affected by armed conflict was also highly sensitive and concerns were raised about UNICEF’s ability to continue regular programmes in-country despite their participation in coordination structures.563 In Zimbabwe, politicization also emerged as an issue in terms of funding mechanisms for coordination bodies. The government was supposed to play a key role in the coordination and supervision of the Programme of Support (PoS); however, donor funding was conditional on the absence of direct financial support to government structures. The evaluator described this as a systematic design flaw in of the Programme of Support, which affected the speed of implementation and quality of outputs.564 Political changes and reshuffles have also impeded the institutional memory and overall effectiveness of the Child Welfare Inter-ministerial Committee in Georgia.565

Capacity of partners: In Zimbabwe, although the multi-stakeholder institutional arrangements for the Programme of Support worked well in terms of promoting interaction and collaboration, and in turn circumventing bottlenecks encountered during implementation, a constraint that hindered the effectiveness of this coordination mechanism was the weak capacity of individual partners such as the Department of Social Services, which lacked the necessary human, financial and material resources to implement the Programme on the ground. It was further hindered by the weakness of coordination structures at sub-national (district, ward or village) levels and poor coordination between partner NGOs and sub-grantees.566

Gap: The absence of a coordination forum was identified in relation to the following programmes: Serbia’s school violence programme 567, Colombia’s psychosocial programme to children affected by armed conflict 568, Senegal’s MRE programme 569 and Ethiopia’s MRE programme.570 The National Strategic Plan for the for the Prevention, Eradication of Child Labour and Protection of Young Workers 2001-2005 failed to articulate how power and responsibilities between central, provincial and local institutions should be

560 Ibid.
568 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
divided. Focus groups indicated poor communication and coordination in policy implementation, decision making, coordination and action between central and local levels of governance.571

3.1.7.4 Decentralized coordination mechanisms

Table 41: Decentralized coordination mechanisms by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The programme aimed to create a forum for interaction and cooperation. This led to the establishment of Interdisciplinary Consultative Committees (ICCs) at governorate level. ICCs were composed of representatives from the Directorates of Health, Education, Insurance and Social Affairs and Religious Affairs, representatives from the governor’s offices, partner NGOs (PNGOs) and local NGOs (LNGOs).</td>
<td>A number of factors affected effectiveness, including different levels of involvement in ICC, cooperation of authorities in different governorates, staff and individual connections. Successful ICCs facilitated a number of activities in schools and health units, facilitated the training of doctors and religious leaders, sent doctors and religious leaders to provide lectures at the community level and generally mobilized relevant authorities at the governorate level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>In order to coordinate the closure of residential facilities and reintegration of children, and establish longer term gate-keeping functions, Child Rights Departments were established at local level.</td>
<td>In terms of results, the evaluator stated that it &quot;streamlined a cumbersome, inefficient and ineffective system of placing children in institutions&quot; and encouraged inter-departmental cooperation to improve services to children and families572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Multidisciplinary panels were established in each region by FS&amp;FC to ensure that decisions were made on the basis of children’s best interests. They were composed of healthcare specialists, lawyers, psychologists, local municipality and parliament members. Panel members were trained on child rights, foster care and related issues. The panels discussed the action plans for each child that were developed by social workers and made the final decision on the type of assistance to be provided.</td>
<td>The evaluator commended the multidisciplinary panels for contributing to transparency, matching needs and services, and constituting innovative practice.573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>Between 1986 and 2003, task forces and working committees were developed at local levels to</td>
<td>Despite the withdrawal of NPSC/NNSC support, the evaluator highlighted a number of</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

discuss issues related to street children. Task forces were composed of faith based groups, academic institutions, government agencies, local NGO groups, representatives from City Planning and Development Office, local Department of Social Welfare and Service, Local Government Operations. Over time it was expanded to include stakeholders who are in contact with street children including law enforcement, lawyers, judges, teachers, ministers, civic groups, and business people. In 1995 there were three regional assemblies of chairpersons of city task forces, three regional conferences and seven sub-regional clusters. The NPSC/NNSC played an important role in supporting these local activities and organizing national assemblies of local working committees. However, from 2004-2006 the NPSC/NNSC presence diminished.

Factors that have sustained the local task forces and working committees including strong commitment, strong leadership, camaraderie, regular meetings with documentation and joint activities, recognition from the Local Chief Executive, a strong sense of volunteerism and an umbrella coalition like the National Council of Social Development. Good practices in these local structures/networks included monthly meetings in sample cities rotated among member agencies; annual membership fees to fund common activities, informal social gatherings like Christmas celebrations, summer camps, team building; securing venues where task forces can meet regularly; established links with local government; geographic division of cities where there is more than one organization to avoid duplication; training activities even without budget (e.g. participants brought own meals and snacks, photocopied training materials etc.); payment of street educators (former street children) to continue working with street children; and participation in networks for future governance.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>In a pilot community-based programme, a multi-sectoral collaboration mechanism was developed to address child injury through implementation models of safe school, safe kindergarten, safe home, and safe community. The Beijing Working Committee for Children and Women (BWCCW) coordinated the activities of over 20 municipal government departments such as health, education, public security, traffic police, fire police, civil welfare, and urban planning among its membership. Each participating agency integrated Child Injury Prevention into the routine work of. Approximately 500,000RMB were allocated to the programme to match funding from UNICEF. About 1,460 government personnel at various administrative levels, schools, kindergartens, and technical agencies contributed their staff time over the last 5 years. Inspired by the programme, the Beijing public security, education sector, road traffic police, animal management and control departments invested their own resources for Child Injury Prevention beyond the geographic boundary of the programme in 2007.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The BWCCW programme managers developed specific programme indicators that related to their work performance to ensure interventions were conducted according to the work plan. They developed and implemented a total of 9 municipal and district level policies and guidelines, and 207 local safety rules and regulations were developed and enforced at home, schools, kindergartens, and in communities. The municipal government and the programme community also contributed financial and human resources to the programme. To ensure coordinated implementation, a programme management system was put in place at the beginning. It coordinated 132 participating agencies. This included annual work plans, quarterly inter-agency coordination meetings, a programme newsletter, field monitoring, feedback, and a mid-term evaluation. Most (86%) of participating agencies established a taskforce specific for Child Injury Prevention led by the head of the agency.

Vietnam | Child injury
--- | ---

PMBs (Project management boards) were established at three levels, provincial, district and commune levels. At each of these three levels, the PMB is established with representatives from the respective People’s Committee, Health sector, Education & Training sector and the former Committee for Population, Family and Children (or currently the Labour, Invalid and Society sector). Representatives from other sectors and organizations such as the Police, Women’s Union, Youth Union and the Socio-Cultural office were invited to join the PMB depending on the particular province. At every level in many localities, the representative from the health sector was successful in assuming a leading role in project management due to their enthusiasm, technical background and network of health staff and trained collaborators at commune level. According to the evaluator the roles of the sectors and organizations in the project were well organized: “It is difficult to find a better arrangement for the project now or for the scaling up stage.”

The People’s Committee was assigned the role of ‘Chief’ of the PMB; and the representative from the Health sector assumed the role of the ‘executive’ counterpart or ‘Deputy Chief’. Each PMB at every level had a secretary who acts as project coordinator and a project support staff person who looks after project accounts.

| Ethiopia | Gender and child protection | This programme used the focal persons scheme/approach to ensure coordination and mainstreaming in the programmes of the line offices in the region. Focal points were assigned by their respective offices and were expected to be members of the management committee for them to participate in decision-making process. Focal points then organized or attended meetings, workshops and trainings on discussions related to gender issues. | Concerns were raised about the effectiveness of the focal point approach (See discussion).  

577

| Burkina Faso | Child trafficking | Two local structures were established to monitor, alert or act on suspicious incidents where child trafficking may be occurring. A Vigilance and Surveillance Committee (VSC) was established in selected regional centres and was made up of essentially government officials and agencies, including: a local law enforcement officer, a local child protection worker, and regional and district social services representatives. Local Relay Committees (Noyaux relais) were also set up and form the key ‘community’ structures at the village level. The members of these structures were sensitized to the phenomenon through basic training on child trafficking and child rights. | In Burkina Faso, local law enforcement agents or the provincial Social Action office both had a mandate to intervene when potential trafficking situations are identified, thereby calling into question the value of establishing a VSC structure.  

578

| Philippines | Child abuse, exploitation and discrimination | Anti-Trafficking Task Forces were established in the ports to discuss security and improve anti-trafficking activities. At the Sasa port, Task Force Angkla is | The Task Force met regularly and showed evidence that they are more capable and competent in handling and managing trafficking cases. They displayed familiarity

composed of the PPA-GAD, PPA Police, Philippine Coast Guard, PNP Sasa, Sasa Barangay Council, Aboitiz Shipping Company, Sulpicio Lines Porters Association, PACAP, and Visayan Forum.

with the referral system used in the port area and their roles and responsibilities. 579

Challenges, constraints and gaps:

Role and mandate: The Task Forces and Working Committees in the Philippines were hindered by the absence of a clear role and mandate i.e. the provision of direct services or supporting roles in coordination, networking and fundraising. 580 Similarly the role of the Vigilance and Surveillance Committees in Nigeria were called into question given that they duplicated the functions of law enforcement and justice departments. 581 Although the multidisciplinary panels established in Georgia were accountable to MoES, it was held that they require official recognition and a legal mandate within an institutional framework introduced by new laws. 582

Strategic planning: Strategic planning emerged as a gap in relation to the Task Forces and Working Committees in the Philippines as the Executive Committee did not have a mechanism for decision-making, strategic planning, monitoring and evaluation. 583

Government engagement: In Upper Egypt the main challenge was inconsistent levels of engagement from ministries in different governorates. 584 This was reiterated by the evaluator of the programme in Tajikistan. In some sites the Department of Education was very cooperative, but in other sites it did not put pressure on schools to accept reintegrated children without the appropriate documentation. This arose because cooperation and coordination was based on “good will and personalities of the people involved rather than agreed procedures and legislation”. It is therefore important to ‘institutionalize’/formalize cooperation and coordination. 585 In Vietnam, the representative from the People’s Committee was assigned the role of Chief of the PMB for political reasons; however, this political representative did not have time to manage the programme (due to demands associated with being a public authority) nor the technical background to manage the programme properly. These roles and responsibilities fell in the hands of the Health Sector, the representative of which was assigned the role of Deputy Chief. 586

Intersectoral challenges: In Georgia the effectiveness of the multidisciplinary panels was hindered by the lack of legal obligations for infant houses and maternity clinics under MLH&SA to refer mothers to the programme social workers. Orphanages and boarding schools were not obliged to report on incoming children as they were positioned under the Ministry of Finance and their salaries were paid by MLH&SA,

rather than by MoES. In China, multi-sectoral collaboration over programme management was hindered by a lack of clear accountability for individual sectors.

Focal points: With regard to the gender and child protection programme in Ethiopia, concerns were raised about the selection of focal points that represent their respective ministries. They were not selected on the basis of merit or commitment to gender issues, and they had no clear terms of reference to help them understand their roles and responsibilities. The effectiveness of this position depended largely on the interest of the individual assigned to represent the institution. It was recommended that further detailing of responsibilities, standardizing, educating the assigned staff and institutionalizing the scheme is necessary.

Referral systems: The evaluator of the Georgia programme recommended the regulation of a referral system, which includes a legal obligation to exchange information amongst relevant agencies. Weak referral systems also emerged as a challenge in the Philippines. Despite the effectiveness of the Anti-Trafficking Task Forces in the Ports in terms of improving counter-trafficking measures, it was unclear who should assume responsibility for the handling of cases, from identification to referral and follow-up. In relation to the Somalia programme, the evaluator also recommended the development of a country-wide referral and coordination system which would include assessment, a follow-up system and regular communication on referrals. It was held that this should be developed by UNICEF in discussion with relevant agencies and service providers, bearing in mind the limited capacity of local partners who were positioned in remote and distant areas facing logistical, security and transportation constraints. The referral process in Jamaica was also found to be inadequate. It was held that the Technical Working Group failed to adopt a multidisciplinary approach. As a result, ‘clients’ were exposed to repeated short term contacts with different specialists, who proved to be ineffective in meeting their needs and securing their rights. Serbian teachers cooperated with the protective network (e.g. law enforcement, health centres, Centre of Social Work) on an ad hoc rather than systematic basis, particularly when it came to managing specific cases of violence.

3.1.7.5 Synthesized results, lessons and recommendations for Section 3.1.7

Box 13: Synthesized results in the strengthening of coordination structures and mechanisms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National level coordination structures and mechanisms:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Coordination structures developed work plans, established technical working groups and conducted monitoring missions in residential institutions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The coordination mechanism in selected countries has improved cooperation between clearance and victim assistance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Coordination structures have strengthened case management, monitoring and reporting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Working groups have led to improved outcomes for children affected by armed conflict because they are strong, cohesive and well-coordinated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Coordination structures facilitated the sharing of knowledge and lessons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• An outcome of working groups and associated activities was the development of a model for a comprehensive child protection monitoring and response system in certain countries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Multi-sectoral coordination mechanisms encouraged cooperation among stakeholders across</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

sectors, facilitated a sense of ownership and assisted the programme to overcome challenges.

**Decentralized coordination mechanisms:**
- Successful committees at provincial and local levels have facilitated a number of programmes activities, enlisted the support of local leaders and mobilized relevant authorities.
- Decentralized coordination structures streamlined gate keeping functions in the context of institutionalization and encouraged inter-departmental cooperation.
- Multi-disciplinary panels improved case management.
- Task forces and working committees sustained activities for street children even after funding and support was suspended.
- Coordination mechanisms encouraged different departments and institutions to invest resources (financial and human resources) into the programme.
- Programme management boards effectively coordinated activities related to the child injury prevention programme.
- Anti-Trafficking Task Forces were more capable and competent in handling trafficking cases.

**Box 14: Generalized lessons to strengthen coordination structures and mechanisms**
- The mandate of the coordination structure must be defined at the outset in a participatory manner involving all key stakeholders. This should be formalized in a highly context specific terms of reference (TOR) for the structure and used as the basis against which members are appointed and strategic plans developed.
- In addition to defining the mandate of the coordination structure, it is essential to delegate specific roles and responsibilities - and corresponding accountability mechanisms - for each member. These should be widely disseminated to stakeholders and beneficiaries to ensure effectiveness and transparency.
- Time-bound and budgeted strategic plans should be developed for coordination structures on the basis of evidence and in consultation with other key stakeholders.
- The institutional positioning of a coordination structure should be carefully considered in order to obtain government buy-in, facilitate access to human and financial resources, streamline decision-making and encourage the active participation of representatives from other sectors.
- In order to ensure that members of coordination structures deliver, it is important that they have an institution or individual to report to using a structured format and mechanism.
- The minutes of meetings and workshops should be documented with clear actions for different members.
- Reporting should be accompanied by follow up to ensure that coordination structures are action and results-oriented.
- Information management, data collection and monitoring activities should be prioritized by coordination structures to assist in planning and quality control.
- Vertical and horizontal information sharing between beneficiaries, partners and stakeholders should be encouraged.
- Strategic plans and work plans should account for delays associated with collaborative and consensus-building exercises within coordination structures.
- There is a need to carefully consider ongoing support to coordination structures that have become politicized bodies with vested political interests.
- Coordination structures should be appropriately funded so that they are able to fulfil what is often a labour and resource intensive mandate.
- In addition to strengthening coordination structures, it is essential to strengthen the capacity (institutional, financial, material and human resources) of individual members so that they can fulfil their roles and responsibilities.
- It is important to institutionalize / formalize cooperation and coordination with government structures and partners to ensure that the level of engagement is consistent and based on institutional commitment rather than personal interest.
- Referral systems should be regulated and include a legal obligation to exchange information among relevant actors in timely manner.
National referral systems and case management procedures should include assessment, follow-up and regular communication, but should also take into account the varied capacity of service providers across the country to respond to such referrals.

Section 3.2. Supporting Social Change

The Protective Environment Framework (2002) refers to a number of elements that are relevant to this section on social change, namely attitudes, traditions, customs, behaviour and practices; open discussion including engagement of media and civil society; and children’s life skills, knowledge and participation. In the Child Protection Strategy (2008), these elements have been addressed as Social Change, although it is recognised they cannot be separated completely from many of the components addressed under ‘strengthening child protection systems’ given the interconnectedness of laws, policies, regulations, services, norms and values in the child protection system. In the Child Protection Strategy (2008) social change is discussed in relation to social consensus. To change harmful norms and values that support the use of violence against children, it is necessary to change knowledge, attitudes and beliefs held by children, families and communities in relation to the importance of child rights and the negative impact of child abuse. In doing so, interventions seek to prevent the incidence of violent behaviour and child protection violations.

It is important to refer yet again to Sheeran’s (2008) assessment of the 59 evaluations in her meta-evaluation. She found that ‘changing attitudes, customs, and practices’ was minimally represented in investments, but “shows a validated, replicable, methodology that packages peer-to-peer counselling, participatory monitoring, and training in rights awareness, with community education” (p.iii). However, she found that capacity building programmes for professionals were better in quality than capacity building programmes for families and communities, and that the over-reliance on volunteer workers impeded the child protection recognition and response. Furthermore, she found that child participation was not robustly represented in the report and that there were insufficient media-related investments. In contrast, in this evaluation it will be shown that there were significant investments in social change programmes and despite numerous challenges, the use of volunteers and the media has facilitated social mobilization and awareness-raising campaigns. Child participation and life skills were described in detail across the reports, with reference to both challenges and successes, positive and negative outcomes.

3.2.1 Conceptual Frameworks

The evaluators rarely provided a detailed discussion of the theoretical or conceptual framework that informed the programme design and implementation. However, it is interesting to note that programmes focus on different ‘environments’ or ‘ecological systems model levels’ in their specific attempts to promote social change.

At the level of the child and family, a programme in Algeria was based on a developmental approach. This is based on the idea that childhood is a dynamic and changing stage of life. Although mental health professionals have the skills to encourage children’s resilience and ability to cope with adversity, mothers and community members should be seen as the ‘experts’ because they are aware of traditional methods of child rearing that are central to children’s development and responses to adversity. Practitioners should therefore recognize that children’s development is therefore socially and contextually specific. Social change will only emerge in programmes that recognize this cultural component and use it in their tools and approach. As the evaluator noted, “Local idioms of distress and folk tales and actual case studies are easier to understand and integrate in training than Greek mythology”.

A programme in Jamaica was based on an ecological approach to child protection, which regards the child as embedded within various systems including the family, community and country. These can be broadly categorized in terms of individual, interpersonal and macro levels. Children’s risk and resiliency in the face of adversity is influenced by factors at each of these levels. Therefore, it is necessary to design

---

interventions for multiple levels, such as the child, family, school, community and government. A programme in Mali also discussed the importance of creating a ‘protective environment for children’ by working at multiple levels, but emphasized the need to focus more on families and extended families in order to create cultural change within communities and thereby prevent harmful practices.

At the level of the community, the authors of an evaluation report on a Female Genital Mutilation Abandonment Programme in Upper Egypt discuss the Positive Deviance Approach (PDA) that has guided the programme strategy. This approach focuses on identifying individuals within the local community who choose not to practice FGM/C and build on their experiences to encourage other community members to abandon the practice. This approach was initially used in a Save the Children programme in Vietnam to combat child malnourishment, but was adapted to the local context in a number of ways. First, instead of trying to induce positive action such as increased nutrition and safe sex practices, the approach was used to induce negative action (i.e. to stop FGM/C). Second, the ‘positive deviant’ was not identified as an uncircumcised girl or woman but rather individuals within families and larger communities who have refrained from promoting this practice for their granddaughters, daughters, wives and other female relatives. The programme encountered a number of challenges when adapting this approach which will be discussed in a subsequent section.

A programme in Gambia was based on Social Convention theory, which was developed by Dr. Gerry Mackie in 2004. According to this theory, changing a social norm requires discussions and public declarations involving all members of the community so that no single individual, family and community bears the responsibility - or consequences – of this change. This theory has informed a number of strategic directions. The approach centres on a participatory and ‘respectful, culturally sensitive’ approach: “The approach claims to be sensitive to the culture and traditions of the communities and thus refrains from using shocking terminologies, films or drawings to depict new information. The villagers usually appreciate such an approach which is respectful, non-judgmental and positive. The approach enables the participants to discuss and debate issues openly without feelings of embarrassments and shame. The use of separate classes for different age cohorts is also an added cultural bonus on the programme approach.” The evaluators argue that this approach empowers participants to become actors in their own development process. In order to further stimulate empowerment, sharing of knowledge and dialogue within and between communities, the programme employs an ‘Organized Diffusion Model’ that works at village, inter-village, regional, national and international levels.

A report on FGM/C in Mauritania also refers to this ‘organized diffusion’ model in order to assist communities to reach the moment of a public declaration of abandonment. They argue that this rests on ‘community mobilization for social transformation’, participatory methods, non-coercive education programmes, and the participation of all actors at all levels (including community actors, NGOs and government at local and national levels).

A programme seeking to eliminate child labour in New Delhi is also based on an integrated and multi-pronged approach that shifts from the village level to that of the wider area or in the case of this programme a ‘cotton corridor’ involving the child, parents, community, employer, justice sectors and the government system. The evaluators argue that this approach is relevant because evidence from the first Phase revealed that “interlocking barriers need to be addressed simultaneously to create some synergy for change”.

---

600 Ibid.
601 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
A programme on child labour in Bangladesh sees social change in terms of ‘movement-oriented activities to create critical mass’. A social mobilization programme in this country is the ‘entry point’ for development interventions. It is interesting to note that the evaluator of a programme targeting school violence in Serbia expressed criticism of the programme for failing to use community mobilization as its entry point. It was argued that the programme failed to have a significant impact because it focused on schools alone and did not challenge social values and beliefs that promote violence in the general social climate. The evaluator argues that the programme’s objectives should be first to change the general situation in the society, and then work on developing a culture of tolerance and cooperation in schools. It is, however, important to recognize that budgetary constraints may have meant that focusing on schools was more doable with the resources available and it may have also been too sensitive to adopt a broader approach.

Timing also emerged as an issue in a report on the psychosocial recovery of children affected by armed conflict in Colombia. The authors argue that ‘social transformation’, particularly in conflict or post-conflict areas, should be conceptualized differently. Instead of programmes with an average life of between 12 and 15 months, longer cycles (e.g. 3 years) will allow for the creation of community ownership, the emergence of leaders within schools and other institutions, a shift in social norms around the rights of children and adolescents and the need for social cohesion and protection within the community, and a change in the emotions and sentiments expressed by children and adolescents.

Box 15: Recommendations for developing a theoretical/conceptual framework to support programming

- Develop a holistic programme that focuses on the child, family, community and government in order to promote social change.
- Adopt a developmental perspective to child protection that recognizes children’s resilience, local strengths and contextually and culturally specific child rearing practices.
- Include the family and extended family to create a protective environment and promote social change within the community.
- Ensure that theoretical/conceptual approaches developed elsewhere are adapted to the local context.
- Identify respected individuals within the community who can promote social change either because they are refraining to carry out a harmful practice or because they are promoting positive practices.
- Programmes working at the level of the community need to adopt a participatory and culturally sensitive approach.
- Community-based approaches should encourage the engagement of all individuals and families in order to promote changes in social norms.
- Efforts should be made to move beyond the village level to inter-village relations and the wider geographical area in order to stimulate the sharing of information and dialogue.
- It is imperative to understand the impact of social norms on the effectiveness of a programme. This may require programmers to consider working at multiple levels (e.g. at the level of the community and the school), in multiple phases (e.g. at the level of the community first and then the school) or extending the life of a programme.

3.2.2 Strengthening the Protective Role of Families

It is imperative to strengthen the family for a number of reasons: first, children have a right to grow up in the family environment (Article 7, 9, 10, 19 and 20, UNCRC 1989). Family strengthening should therefore be at the heart of child protection interventions. Second, children’s understanding and experience of

---

605 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups'. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
adversity is mediated by the knowledge, beliefs and experiences of their parents, and the relationships that they have forged with family members. Third, perpetrators of child abuse are often people who are known to the child, including family members. Fourth, research has shown that children who grow up in a protective family environment have better developmental outcomes than children who grow up in residential institutions. Fifth, communities are composed of families. It is necessary to engage with this institution and strengthen its protective role in order to have an impact on wider social values and norms. The programmes under review focused on the family at different stages of the continuum of care, including prevention and early intervention, response, return and reintegration and alternative care. Each of which is discussed in turn.

A few programmes targeted families as a means of prevention and early intervention. In the continuum of care, prevention activities are directed at communities and families at large in order to prevent a risky situation from occurring. Early intervention activities on the other hand are directed at specific families who have been identified as vulnerable, so as to prevent a child from entering statutory care. In many cases, prevention and early intervention activities overlap. The table below describes some of the activities that can be described as effective in this regard. Effectiveness is in this sense measured in terms of the extent to which programmes were able to meet their objectives by achieving a particular set of results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices (FGM/C)</td>
<td>The programme was implemented from 2003-2006. In the first phase, partner NGOs and LNGOs, Positive Deviants and volunteers would identify families at risk in a particular community. In the second phase, teams would visit households at risk and provide them with information about the dangers of FGM/C until the girl is married. If the girl is not circumcised between ages 13-17 years, she is considered ‘protected’. When she becomes married without having been forced to undergo FGM/C, she is considered ‘saved’.</td>
<td>The evaluation was conducted from November 2006-February 2007. Despite a number of challenges (see below), statistics provided before and after the programme suggest that this approach was effective. In the four governorates the percentage of targeted families opposed to FGM/C rose significantly from 13% at the start of the intervention to 51% by the end of Dec 2006, with a slight rise in the percentage of hesitant families from 25% to 26% of targeted families, and a significant drop in the percentage of families supporting FGM/C from 62% of families to 21%. (pg. 19). Focus group discussions with households in the target villages found uneven responses, varying from continued support to ambivalence and opposition. Nevertheless, when compared with control villages, statistics suggest that girls in the targeted families are less likely to be circumcised. 606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices (FGM/C)</td>
<td>Practitioners and stakeholders identified three high prevalence regions. They then targeted vulnerable families who were provided information about the</td>
<td>The evaluators also noted a change in behaviour at the level of the family. In reference to the question of whether or not girls five years old and younger have been cut, more</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

harmful effects of FGM/C.

than 73% of those interviewed declared that their daughters of five years old or younger have not undergone FGM/C, compared to the opposing 26.9%. Out of those interviewed whose daughters have not yet been cut, 9.4% believe that they will have their daughters undergo FGM/C in comparison to the 83.7% who declared that they will not cut their daughters. 7% were undecided.\textsuperscript{607}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Program Description</th>
<th>Example Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Prevention of abandonment and residential care</td>
<td>Two programmes in Georgia focused on the ‘mother’ as the key agent of change. In the mother and infant shelter or at home, mothers were provided with psychological support, reproductive health counselling, life skills training and medical assistance. In addition, they were provided with time emergency assistance (e.g. refurnishing or repairing a house, food and medicine, small grants, gifts) and employment counselling, job placement and micro-enterprise. These activities were designed to give them the self-confidence and skills to care for their young children because the majority were coming from extremely poor households (61.7%) and from outlying communities, which contributed to their helplessness and lack of support. Since 2003, 100 mothers used the PIAD employment and business services, 580 children were involved in prevention programmes, 173 children were reintegrated into their biological family and 183 children in foster care. The evaluator described this programme as very effective, because all mothers who participated in preventative services, have decided to keep their children. However, there is little statistical information on the impact of this programme on the overall number of admissions in institutions, and on the wellbeing of the child and family over time.\textsuperscript{608}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Abandonment prevention</td>
<td>Practitioners provided counselling services, information to families about their rights, accompaniment to official institutions, further referral to support institutions or benefit increases, assistance in obtaining official documents to parents, and material-financial aid in order to prevent a problem or crisis from occurring. These families were identified by 165 families with 300 children benefitted from the family support services, although statistics pertaining to the numbers of children who were abandoned in these families was not available.\textsuperscript{609}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{607} Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.


\textsuperscript{609} Evaluation of the child and family in risk situations in Ungheni district project. Moldova. 2004.
authorities who referred them to the programme team to undertake an evaluation of the family’s situation and develop an action plan. It is important to note that the team draws up a ‘collaboration contract’ with the parent stipulating roles, responsibilities and expectations. The evaluator described these contracts as particularly effective as they motivate the client (i.e. parent) “who is considered to be a ‘partner’ and not a ‘subject’ of the intervention”. The case is closed when the objectives in the action plan are met, when the beneficiary refuses to receive assistance, the contract is violated or financing of the programme stops. Cases are followed up for a period of two months afterwards.

---

**Bangladesh**

Prevention of child abuse, discrimination and violence

Parents were also targeted in a programme on child abuse, discrimination and violence in Bangladesh in order to strengthen their attitudes and behaviour in favour of an enabling environment for children. Information on child rights, child and maternal health, positive attitudes to children, protection of children and parental responsibility was shared with parents in meetings at schools.

The evaluators noted a change in the attitude of parents: “Parents expressed that they didn’t realize that their children can also make changes if they can have a better and supportive environment. Parents also said that they are happy to see their children can draw pictures, can perform drama, can write names and moreover can talk better than before. Parents have also expressed that they are happy that their own children not only can write their own names, they can write their address and parents’ names. They are happy to see visitors going to their areas to talk for the betterment of their children. They said that they used to send their children to School and they are much happy to see their children going to Schools with clean dresses and better appearances”. However, the evaluator notes that there is little statistical information to indicate change, beyond their attendance at meetings.\(^{610}\)

---

**Comoros**

Prevention of child abuse

A ‘listening service’ was offered to children and families who

The evaluators note that this has had significant effects on the

---

have concerns that they would like to share with officials and service providers. Despite the fact that the awareness-raising campaign had not been launched at the time of the evaluation, parents have been empowered to contact the listening services to discuss their problems. This has attracted other families to come forward. Thus, the existence of listening services helped bring parents out of isolation, silence and has helped to not forget the parents of abused children. It facilitated the restoration of self-esteem, confidence in justice, dialogue and the alleviation of this great weight of the suffering of these parents but also the victims. They stated that as a result of the programme, parents are more willing to report acts of abuse but have also raised concerns about the effectiveness of the judicial system if they come forward.

**Bangladesh**  
**Prevention of child labour among urban working children**  
Parents were encouraged to send their children to school. They participated in child rights week, Meena day, education day and Independence day events. In addition, they were invited to attend motivational meetings and workshops. Brochures, calendars and posters specifically targeted parents. The evaluators note that as a result of the programme, parents are slowly taking an interest in their children’s education, especially girls who were formerly seen as a burden and forced into early marriage. These parents are now encouraging their children to attend school because they are “slowly realizing the value of education”.

**China**  
**Prevention of child injuries**  
Parents, grandparents and caretakers were trained on safety issues, child supervision and the administration of first aid at home. Using a ‘child safe home’ checklist and a ‘safe home model display’, parents and grandparents were trained on how to conduct a home safety audit and modify their homes to reduce injury risk. When compared with the baseline, evaluation findings suggest that the programme was effective in that it had a significant positive impact on 10 out of 11 safe home indicators in households with children younger than 6 years. These indicators include children’s ability to reach tools and sharp objects, pesticides, matches, lighters and sockets, as well as the presence of balconies and stairs without rails, open yard gates and water containers, wells and open water sources without lids.

**Vietnam**  
**Prevention of child injuries**  
Raising the awareness of parents and modifying the living environment. The evaluators conclude that “in participating communes, children do gave a safer environment at home, at school and in the

---

611 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.  
613 The number of outdoor water sources with physical barriers increased from 29% before to 83% after the intervention, an increase of 53% (P <0.01). In particular, fencing of ponds and ditches and at front gates increased from 4% to 55% and 6% to 56% respectively after the intervention (P <0.01). In addition, warning signs were set up at 28 reservoirs after the intervention, an increase from 10 before.  
The programme sought to strengthen families as a means of targeting violence against women. Parenting education and sessions on non-violent conflict resolution were provided to parents at schools.

The evaluator stated that the decision to focus on the family was highly relevant and appropriate. Participation in workshops was poor because of personal commitment and fear of discussing personal issues in public. There was a high level of participation of grandparents who were tasked with caring for children. The most successful sessions involved the attendance of both mothers and fathers.

Despite these successes, a number of challenges have been encountered by practitioners in these programmes. These have been summarized below:

**Targeting:** It is essential to define the criteria for the identification and selection of beneficiaries at the outset of a programme. In the abandonment prevention programme in Moldova, practitioners found it difficult to define the selection criteria; instead they relied solely on whether families were in local authorities’ records or database. The evaluator stated that this is not an adequate selection criterion. The evaluator emphasized that in terms of its objectives, the programme should seek to prevent abandonment and not provide assistance to all poverty stricken families.

**The content of awareness-raising activities:** In relation to the programme in Upper Egypt, the evaluator noted that there was little diversity in terms of the content of house visits. Households and volunteers expressed boredom and frustration at being given the same information at each visit. In order to overcome this, efforts were made to shift the rotation so that volunteers visit different households, but this had an impact upon trust building activities.

**Impact:** In order to have an impact, programmes need to ensure that attitudes change from ambivalence to a shift in attitudes and behaviour. The evaluator in Upper Egypt raised concerns about the long term impact of the programme as ambivalent or hesitant families could be easily swayed by peer pressure, confusing religious, medical and media messages. Behaviour change is a lengthy process. The evaluators of the programme on child labour in Bangladesh emphasized that changes in parental attitudes towards education have been slow to occur.

**Commitment to change:** In order to obtain the commitment of families, various methods have been used. For instance, the evaluator of the Moldova programme commended the use of the ‘collaboration contract’ but stated that challenges arose because the contracts could not be personalized and therefore specific responsibilities for every family/client could not be identified. It is therefore important to develop relationships of trust with families to ensure that expectations are met and roles and responsibilities are shared.

**Scale-up:** To obtain a critical mass supportive of social change it is essential to expand the reach of programmes. The evaluators on the Upper Egypt programme argue that the targeted families constitute a minority of the population in the villages. They constitute a core group of families who could assist in

---

616 Evaluation of the External Programme “Against Violence...We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”.
619 Ibid.
reaching a critical mass of people willing to abandon this programme, but the programme needs to expand its activities to reach this critical mass.\textsuperscript{622}

**Gender:** Teams in Upper Egypt were well received by women but men opposed the household visits as an invasion of privacy.\textsuperscript{623}

**Social protection:** As discussed in a previous chapter it is difficult to provide a basket of services to families, when the demand seems to be primarily material-financial. For example, practitioners in the Moldova programme tried to fulfill the needs of their clients in order to prevent abandonment. As a result, there was a tendency to reduce the service only to material-financial aid rather than providing other forms of support to families (e.g. parenting skills training, conflict management, bereavement counselling).\textsuperscript{624}

**Child protection systems:** One cannot separate social change from child protection systems, which include laws, policies and services. It is therefore important to create an enabling institutional environment to support families. In the Comoros, it was noted that parents are more willing to report acts of abuse as a result of the programme but parents have also raised concerns about the effectiveness of the judicial system if they come forward.\textsuperscript{625} In other words, it may seem futile to encourage families to report acts of abuse if they receive little response from the law enforcement and justice sectors. Similarly, simply raising awareness on the existence of the listening service is not sufficient, if they receive little assistance from social workers after calling in. The evaluator of the abandonment prevention programme in Moldova stated that it is difficult for local authorities to assume responsibility for this programme because legal regulations prevent them from offering financial assistance.\textsuperscript{626}

**Monitoring and evaluation:** Evaluators from a number of the programmes stated that methods to measure the impact of the interventions on children and their families are inadequate. For instance, the evaluator of the programme on child abuse in Bangladesh noted that there is little statistical information to indicate change, beyond parental attendance at meetings.\textsuperscript{627} In addition, the evaluator of the Upper Egypt programme raised concerns about the methods used to measure the effectiveness of this programme as families may not publicly admit their true feelings about FGM/C.\textsuperscript{628} Furthermore, it was argued that impact on children and families can only be measured over time. The evaluator of the abandonment prevention programme in Georgia stated that although the programme was effective in ensuring that the 100 mothers who participated in their programme decided to keep their children, there is little statistical information about the impact of this programme on the overall number of admissions in institutions, and on the wellbeing of the child and family over time.\textsuperscript{629}

**Gaps:** Some evaluators criticized programmes for failing to target the family adequately. The evaluator of the India programme stated that staff should work more with parents when trying to eliminate girl child labour. Labour officials who were interviewed in this evaluation noted that parents were complicit in child protection violations. In order to overcome the legal requirement for children aged 6-14 to be in school, parents would submit fake birth certificates. Hence, more prevention and early intervention efforts should be directed at parents.\textsuperscript{630} Similarly, an evaluator of a school-based programme in Serbia notes that inadequate efforts have been made to include parents by programmers or school teachers, despite the fact that children first report their problems to their parents. The reasons for this include: failure of the

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{623} Ibid.
  \item \textsuperscript{624} Evaluation of the child and family in risk situations in Ungheni district project. Moldova. 2004.
  \item \textsuperscript{625} Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
  \item \textsuperscript{626} Evaluation of the child and family in risk situations in Ungheni district project. Moldova. 2004.
  \item \textsuperscript{627} Evaluation Of “Protection of Children On The Street From Violence, Abuse, Exploitation and Discrimination Project” With Bangladesh Institute of Theatre Arts (BITA). Bangladesh. 2008.
  \item \textsuperscript{629} Evaluation of the Family Support and Foster Care Project (FS&FC) and Prevention of Infant Abandonment and De-institutionalization Project (PIAD). Prepared by Development Researchers’ Network in association with the Institute for Policy Studies. Georgia. 2006.
  \item \textsuperscript{630} Evaluation of IKEA Supported UNICEF-SSA AP Phase I Project Elimination of Girl Child Labour in Cotton Seed Sector, Kurnool District, Andhrapradesh. ERU Consultants. New Delhi. 2011.
\end{itemize}
programme to define clearly how to involve parents; teachers lacking faith in parents or the programme; and parents having little motivation to involve themselves.\textsuperscript{331}

### 3.2.3 Strengthening the Protective Role of Communities

The community is another protective environment for children that must be targeted in child protection programmes. Evidence suggests that social change can only be promoted by working at the community level. Activities in this regard include public education, open dialogue, outreach, community-based child protection committees and collaboration with influential local leaders. The effectiveness, relevance and appropriateness of these activities will be discussed in this section.

#### 3.2.3.1 Public education and social dialogue

A large proportion of the programmes sought to promote social change by raising community awareness and stimulating open dialogue on the rights of the child and on activities that are harmful to the child.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful Practices</td>
<td>At the level of the community, the authors of an evaluation report on a Female Genital Mutilation Abandonment Programme in Upper Egypt discuss the Positive Deviance Approach (PDA) that has guided the programme strategy. This approach focuses on identifying individuals within the local community who choose not to practice FGM/C and build on their experiences to encourage other community members to abandon the practice.</td>
<td>The programme identified 1317 PDs, of which 560 were active. A total of 582 volunteers were mobilized, of which 263 were active participants. They were trained to encourage general social dialogue and act as ‘live examples’. The evaluator commended the programme for enabling and creating “an environment where community leaders were able to break the silence on this issue and discuss it openly among themselves and the rest of the community. In this way a deeply entrenched custom is challenged and the harms of FGM/C are exposed, and the community is encouraged to reflect and reconsider its position towards this practice” (27). The evaluator stated that the programme met its objectives in terms of mobilizing communities and raising awareness about the dangers of FGM/C.\textsuperscript{332}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The Tostan programme adopted a holistic approach that promotes the abandonment of FGM/C while strengthening capacities in terms of democracy, human rights, conflict resolution, hygiene and health. Four elements defined this approach: non-coercive holistic education programmes designed to strengthen people’s capacities;</td>
<td>Reports from the Community Management suggest that reports of FGM/C have declined significantly since the start of the programme. A survey found that 88.5% of the people interviewed knew of the programme. 67% of those who know the programmes were in favour of abandonment. In reference to the question of whether or not girls five</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{331} Evaluation of “School Without Violence” Strategic Marketing Research. Serbia. 2009.  
organized diffusion of knowledge through existing social networks; public declarations of abandonment of harmful practices; and an environment that supports these conditions involving active participation of government and civil society actors. Innovative participatory methods based on positive traditions from the community (storytelling, personal stories, theatre, songs and poetry) were also used.

Innovative participatory methods based on positive traditions from the community (storytelling, personal stories, theatre, songs and poetry) were also used.

In addition, there has been increased participation of women in decision-making processes and there has been increased focus on child protection in Community Management Committees. The evaluator notes that the holistic approach has triggered social change with communities and mobilized villagers. Improvements were also made in school enrolment, sanitation of public and private spaces, pre and post natal medical consultations, children’s vaccination and ECD. The Community Management Committees have created a sense of ownership over the programme. Results show that nearly 65.4% of people interviewed believed that the population fully participated in the activities of the programme. The Tostan programme was expected to reach 30,000 individuals and in actuality reached more than 32,000 people in the 30 initial communities as well as in 22 adopted villages. The organized diffusion of information led to public declarations of abandonment such as a gathering of 130,000 people on 25 May 3010 from 78 communities.

Tajikistan

Residential care

The Parent Education Centre promoted good child care practices with children living with disabilities through radio and newspapers and by disseminating leaflets. Seminars held by visiting specialists from other countries were also provided to

Parents (and siblings) increasing visited the centres to learn how to better care for their children living with disabilities.

633 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Target Group</th>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Public education and media campaigns were used to spread information on the existence of the programme and to recruit foster and adoptive parents and improve referral systems across services.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that the awareness-raising campaigns have been effective as is evident in the increased number of self-referrals i.e. numbers of parents contacting the programmes. This has ensured that more families at risk can be identified and reached.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>The mass media was used to generate nationwide awareness and action. In addition group media (e.g. street theatres, parents' classes and children's performances) were used to mobilize community action. To reach larger audiences symposia, press conferences, round table meetings, radio broadcasting, television appearances, visual arts (art banners, posters, flyers, leaflets, and brochures) were used.</td>
<td>The campaign was successful in raising awareness around the rights of children living on the streets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>Children living on the street</td>
<td>A campaign was planned to dissuade the public from giving money to child beggars on the basis of research findings.</td>
<td>Results unknown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Child abuse and exploitation</td>
<td>Awareness-raising was directed at government agencies, business sector, NGOs and the general public on child labour and child trafficking. Training and advocacy workshops were held for 100 port officials, workers and port users and 384 community members through the Basic Awareness Orientation Seminar.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that the public education campaigns have increased awareness, highlighted the need for more concerted efforts to address these issues, and have increased detection and reporting of cases, especially in the port area among port users and port workers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comoros</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Efforts were made to raise awareness on the listening service and telephone number, as well as general issues related to child abuse and human rights.</td>
<td>The evaluator found that the population was more aware of the existence of abuse against children, and have increasingly reported such acts to the authorities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>A variety of media (TV, internet, newspaper, community radio, community bulletin, brochures and posters, mobile phone text message) were also used to</td>
<td>The evaluator found that the communication and education programmes led to improved awareness, knowledge, skills in parents and caretakers to prevent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

639 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
reach parents, care-takers and children themselves with messages designed to raise their safety awareness. To increase community ownership, over half of the communication materials were designed by community multi-sectoral coordinating activities. Entertainment was found to be an effective means of delivering educational messages and generating interest in solemn topics. Safety promotional events, such as national fire prevention day, competitions for safety quiz and home safety tips, and variety shows were held frequently in the programme communities. The programme also used the 2008 Beijing Summer Olympics to promote the theme of “Safe Community”. This was complemented by door to door visits, text message communication and collaboration with village doctors.

### Vietnam

| Child injury |
| Public education took a number of forms: announcement through community loud speakers; household visits; writing and drawing contests for school children; integration within school curriculum; inclusion within summer vacation programmes; children’s parades; monthly television programmes; sharing of costs of injury cases (e.g. recorded costs for treatment, loss in days of work etc.) to adult clubs; sharing of actual cases of injury in the commune; local leaders creating and voicing slogans. Action Learning was also used with households, where individuals would be invited to participate in a learning day which involved visits to other households followed by group discussion. |

The evaluator stated that the programme “touched people deeply and influenced the way people felt about injury”. Particularly when they heard about actual cases of injury, people’s attitudes changed from indifferent to concerned and enthusiastic about doing something. Household visits were said to be the most critical aspect of the programme. Community meetings and approaches created a “Safety movement” in the community, and a “shared purpose”. The materials used were described as “very good”, “clear and easy to read,” nicely presented and relevant. In comparison, television did not show much impact because they were short, not shown regularly and were not interesting. In general, the evaluator noted that since the start of the programme “injury prevention and risk reduction has become a key community concern”. A survey showed an increase in knowledge, although this will not reflect the extent to which knowledge is applied. When

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Program Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Community-based child protection</td>
<td>The Child Protection Community Mobilization Programme involved communities and young people discussing the findings of a child protection study. Child Protection Advocates (CPAs) were engaged to disseminate the findings and mobilize communities. Using a variety of approaches such as public announcements and discussions at mosque during prayers, large community meetings, megaphones and household visits. Each committee member was responsible for disseminating information to an allocated section of the settlement or village.</td>
<td>The evaluator found that the knowledge of CPA’s increased during the course of the programme but that there remained a gap when compared with community members and children. Some community members had heard about child protection issues but did not understand what they as individuals could do to change the situation. Creative interventions (e.g. mobilizing financial contributions to assist children to attend school) were found to be more effective as they were concrete interventions which wielded immediate and visible results. The evaluation found that in locations where the CPCM programme had been implemented in conjunction with other UNICEF interventions such as water, education or health, or where communities had access to other services, there was a higher level of participation and commitment to the programme. The evaluation found that in instances where communities had access to some level of services then there was an increased willingness to engage in discussions on child protection, because immediate needs were being addressed. Successful referrals or advocacy efforts also resulted in greater enthusiasm from the community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child protection</td>
<td>The programme established technical committees at regional and local levels and mobilized community institutions. Emphasis was placed on achieving community consensus on the issue of human rights, gender and child protection that is consistent.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that the emphasis on consistency with local systems has furthered the commitment of communities. Engagement with the communities has allowed them to “revisit their local systems (norms and values) and adjust and/or revitalize their systems.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

to the local systems. Teachers and school administrations were also involved in public education related to early marriage, sexual harassment and child abuse. Participation consistent to the protection of human rights”. It has led to positive effects such as creating a gender friendly environment in some communities, to the extent that circumcision of girls and domestic violence is no longer acceptable and leads to a strong community reaction. Schools and justice institutions are also taking action against perpetrators. Another positive result is that girls are starting to claim justice, report and seek protection from their teachers for cases of early marriage, sexual harassment and circumcision. The only concern raised was that out of school girls may not benefit from this programme if the communities are not sufficiently responsive.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gambia</th>
<th>Harmful practices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A non-formal basic education programme centred on good governance and democracy, human rights and responsibilities, problem-solving, hygiene and health, literacy, mathematics, management skills was implemented in 40 Madinka and 40 Fula communities using an organized diffusion model. Adult learning techniques and applied non-directive but highly interactive communication processes were used to ensure the participation of women, adolescents and influential individuals in the community. It was rolled out to 8,683 participants and then the 80 programme communities adopted a total of 63 neighbouring communities with an estimated population of 19,550. Inter-village and zonal meetings were conducted to facilitate this diffusion of information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The evaluator found that 88% of the respondents stated that their expectations were partially or fully met by the programme. 68.5% of the respondents either felt ‘satisfied’ or ‘very satisfied’ with the Tostan programme outputs, results and or benefits. Only 4.7% stated that their satisfaction is ‘Just OK’ whilst 20.4% indicated either ‘unsatisfactory’ or ‘very unsatisfactory’. In the majority of cases, the reasons given for rating the programme unsatisfactory relate to the delayed commencement of the income generation activities, the absence of literacy structures and labour saving devices. A number of changes were attributed to the Tostan Programme. For instance, 24 communities in URR recently organized a Public Declaration ceremony where they publicly declared their abandonment of the practice of FGM/C and forced /early child marriages. Focus group discussions indicated that the programme improved communication and dispute resolution within families, thereby reducing incidences of domestic violence. Survey questions on FGM/C were consistent with the baseline findings. The majority of participants believed that the approach was relevant and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Additional Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>National workshops and conferences were held. The media was used in the form of interviews with UNICEF on local TV channels, articles and reported life stories. The first draft layout of a national awareness campaign with the headline “every child needs a family” was prepared by the company “Poyraz” to be shared with government stakeholders and further developed in 2008. The aim of the campaign was to “attract the attention of the public on the needs of - and rights to - love and protection of children living in residential institutions and children with disabilities”</td>
<td>The evaluator argued that the national workshop and conference helped make this issue nationally visible, the newspaper articles were effective in reaching citizens and stimulating discussions, and the national awareness campaign was well designed. The evaluator did however note that a survey on people’s attitudes should have been undertaken prior to the awareness-campaign so as to inform the design of the latter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Delhi</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Intensive community sensitization was undertaken in all programme villages on the issue of girl child labour in the cottonseed sector. This was based on community level interactions and sensitization meetings reaching 900 PRI members, 400 teachers, 675 ICDS staff and 7000 SHG members.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated people interviewed in the field survey were able to recall the awareness drives and some key messages. There were also reports of a visible drop in the rate of child marriages and child labourers in the programme area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>CAMP Bustamante also set out to raise awareness on child abuse through informative and educational printed materials targeted at the general public (a brochure), children (a small stand-up tent card with information on</td>
<td>The evaluator described some of the methods as highly innovative in raising awareness and mobilizing the community around child abuse; for example, the fabric mural on which over 80 men visiting Emancipation Park wrote their suggestions as to</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child trafficking and child migration</td>
<td>The intention of the awareness-raising campaign was to educate and to some extent mobilize the public, families, households and citizens to stop children from migrating, largely preventing risks such as child trafficking. In addition to advocacy, social mobilization was directed at NGOs, associations and other networks; and communications aimed at changing behaviour for individuals, families, communities and the population at large. Community radio and popular education groups that undertake outreach (including community theatre, games, competitions and outdoor cinema).</td>
<td>75,000 people were targeted by local sensitization activities. The evaluator described the media and awareness-raising activities as of a high quality and having a large geographic reach. It was 'well organized' and 'integrated' with broader regional UNICEF protection initiatives. This aspect was said to be sustainable as key community media organizations were mobilized and coordinated effectively.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>Child Trafficking and other child abuse related issues</td>
<td>On sensitive issues, UNICEF encouraged local partners to develop culturally-sensitive and appropriate materials and/or awareness-raising techniques.</td>
<td>The evaluator found that villagers could confirm that village-level sensitization activities were conducted on themes such as schooling, birth registration, worst forms of child labour and child migration. The effectiveness of these campaigns in changing behaviour was not discussed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Child migration and child trafficking</td>
<td>The provision of Child Safe training to community and street members (incl. street vendors, tourism police volunteers). Participants receive certificates signed by local officials.</td>
<td>Participants have played a critical role in identifying children at risk and reporting such cases (e.g. street working children) to programme staff.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>School violence</td>
<td>Awareness-raising in schools by presenting the findings of research and promoting peer teams through school notices, posters in notice boards, parents’ meetings and in a small number of cases through the mass media.</td>
<td>The evaluator identified the following outcomes of the awareness-raising campaign: awareness of susceptibility to various forms of violence; higher motivation for programme implementation; initial cooperation between mentors and schools. 87%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

649 Ibid.
88% of teachers believed the programme managed to increase the awareness of colleagues. 92% believed that changes took place among students, including greater recognition of violence, greater discussion and reporting of violence (measured by number of reported cases), progress in peer team work and increased familiarity with rules. This was described as the greatest achievement of the first stage of this programme. The effectiveness of awareness-raising on parents and the local community was described as less effective although the media was used said to bring to light problems in the community.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Project Type</th>
<th>Strategy Details</th>
<th>Evaluation Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Mine Risk Education</td>
<td>All partners used the same messages and methods including video shows, audio cassettes, printed material, murals and billboards. Drama competitions and plays are also used. Multi-media campaigns included RV, radio and newspaper.</td>
<td>The evaluator commended the consistent use of messages across partners. Communities and school children preferred video, drama and animation-tools. Participants expressed the belief that video’s contributed to a reduction in mine casualties. A database suggests that mine injuries have consistently decreased but it may be difficult to attribute this to the awareness-raising campaigns alone, as other security factors such as restrictions on movement may have had an impact.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Adolescent volunteers, teachers and parents formed support groups for children. They worked closely with school principals in raising awareness around the rights of children and adolescents. The context and culture informs the review, adaptation and harmonization of materials. Cultural dance and music (e.g. ‘whistle and drum’ activities) were used to target children and adolescents.</td>
<td>The programmes have generated behavioural changes in the community and have made adults more aware of the rights of children and adolescents, and of their own role as protectors and guarantors of the integral development of the child population, even under conditions of emerging social violence. This awareness has increased among indigenous communities, where the authorities now include the themes of the rights of children and adolescents on the agendas for their Councils’ sessions. Adolescents have started to view themselves as important members of their community.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

653 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Children affected by armed conflict</th>
<th>Awareness-raising seeks to change community attitudes towards children associated with armed groups so as to aid their reintegration. Community sensitization is also used to identify children who are eligible for support, to increase the likelihood that problems with reintegration can be identified at an early stage and to reassure parents and children that the community is ready to receive children back home. Social workers conduct household visits and facilitate community meetings. Community-based organizations also organize community events.</th>
<th>Given the strength of community values in Nepali society, the sensitization process was effective as information spread quickly and reduced resources (human and time) to share information. As a result of these efforts, the evaluator noted that there is a growing cohort of people in the community who are aware of psycho-social issues and are able to assist children, young people and their families to cope with difficult experiences. Concerns were raised about the methods used and messages developed (see below). 654</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Mine Risk Education</td>
<td>The programme used community liaisons to raise awareness in local communities prior to mine clearance, ensuring community participation and community engagement in the process from clearance to handover and community-based hotlines. IEC materials (posters, booklets, brochures and leaflets) and the mass media were also used to raise awareness. Over 140 mobile communication teams including youth and children also raised awareness to school children, the general public and children in remote and disadvantaged areas.</td>
<td>The survey conducted by the evaluator found that overall there is a high level of understanding of mine risk among children (aged 6 to 15 years). 38% had seen a UXO/mine in their community, 47% had seen one in the media and 99% knew that they are dangerous. 93% stated that they would report it to a community leader, to their parents (6%) or to their teacher (5%). Nearly 96% knew not to play in contaminated areas, not to collect mines for scrap metal (83%), not to undertake risky activities (92%), not to move a UXO/mine marker (96%). When compared with a 2002 survey, these results reveal that the programme was effective in improving knowledge. Similar changes were observed among adults, although many continued to believe that one could become an expert in handling mines over time and that certain high risk activities (such as scrap metal collection) can be undertaken. The evaluator notes that there is evidence that knowledge has not led to behaviour change given external factors such as the lucrative trade in metal. The survey also found that older children (aged 11-16 years) are more likely to touch a UXO largely because they have more opportunities to play in dangerous areas.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Ethiopia | Mine Risk Education | Although no communication strategy was formally drafted and adopted, there were a number of components to the approach. All newcomers (migrant workers) to the region were required to be registered at the local police station and then MRE was provided. Newcomers in search of grazing land and water for their animals were registered with the local administration and then MRE was provided. Out of school children were reached through child instructors, mass media and interpersonal communication. Planned communication products (banners, T-shirts, posters etc.) were abandoned in favour of community-based approaches. Student and teacher handbooks were planned but not completed. | In terms of effectiveness, the evaluator notes that the programme has failed to undertake a comprehensive assessment of risk-taking so that the MRE programme can respond to the needs of identified target groups. The effectiveness of the methods in increasing knowledge and changing behaviour was not discussed in any detail; however, the evaluator observed that community-based approaches were more effective than the use of communication products.  

|---|---|---|---|
| Nepal | Mine Risk Education | MRE materials including leaflets, flipcharts, user-guides, posters and landmine hazard signs were developed using local artists with guidance from UNICEF, so as to target the large illiterate population. Field tests were undertaken to ensure that images were well understood in local communities. A minimum set of messages was developed by UNICEF in consultation with government actors. Media materials (newspapers, radio and television) were also developed by contracted advertising companies. | In terms of effectiveness, the evaluator notes that MRE messages and programmes were well adapted to suit the findings of research. Systematic targeting of certain age groups has ensured that all risk factors and fears of reporting have been addressed. Emergency MRE was delivered in a timely and efficient manner. MRE messages are clear and culturally appropriate. Most activities in the work plan were fulfilled and resources and networks were used in a competent manner. The capacity of MRE focal points has been strengthened. The evaluator states that the best indicators of MRE effectiveness are changes in the number of injuries among individuals who have received MRE; change in high risk behaviours; and a change in areas. Although they have a high level of mine knowledge they are still not “mine smart”. There has been a reported reduction in mine/UXO casualties but it is difficult to find a direct correlation with MRE activities.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Tsunami</th>
<th>Awareness campaign activities</th>
<th>Findings and evaluation notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>An awareness campaign was run to combat substance abuse and addiction using billboards, posters, brochures, TV, radio spots and the internet. The programme has also encouraged open discussion and engagement with child protection issues. A range of civil society and government activities (e.g. workshops and presentations) were run.</td>
<td>The campaign reached over 2000 people with drug prevention messages and trained 20 young peer educators. The substance abuse campaign was found to be ineffective due to culturally inappropriate materials, English-only messages and lack of local planning or buy-in. The campaign on child protection issues was found to be moderately successful in terms of increasing recognition of the situation facing children in the Maldives and awareness of child abuse issues at the community level. The evaluator stated that the programme was moderately successful in analysing threats, weak in being open to sensitive issues and moderate in terms of media coverage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Awareness-raising campaigns were run on child rights and child protection issues. Pamphlets were distributed to camp residents, messages were targeted at humanitarian staff, children and families received messages pertaining to reporting mechanisms. Community-based awareness-raising strategies complemented system-wide efforts.</td>
<td>In order to measure effectiveness, the evaluator administered group surveys to children’s clubs, parents and community members. Findings suggest that roughly a third of children, half of community members and more than half of parents are familiar with child rights and protection concerns in Galle. The level of awareness in Batticaloa was significantly lower: less than a third of children, a quarter of community members and a quarter of parents were familiar with these concepts. This suggests that efforts to raise awareness programming need be more extensive in more vulnerable areas that may have a lower baseline awareness of these issues.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Following an initial base-line survey, awareness-raising campaigns were run in communities, schools, child care centres and among child protection officials on child rights and child protection. Posters, stickers, booklets and trainings were used.</td>
<td>In terms of results, the evaluator noted that the baseline survey assisted in defining priorities and target groups; the capacity of change agents was strengthened; a range of innovative local programmes were stimulated in a short timescale; programmes managed to effectively</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
were used to promote messages. Change agents from 12 pilot communities were trained and asked to submit programme proposals. They then implemented programme activities in local communities on issues such as breastfeeding, nutrition, hygiene, positive hygiene and safe sex.

galvanize local people into action and plan for longer term developments.\(^{660}\)

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Under the ‘Ensuring a Legal Education and Citizens Programme’ an education campaign on legislative frameworks, child rights and citizens’ legal rights was undertaken jointly by unions, childhood commissions, municipalities, national NGO churches, businesses and international agencies. The Association of Rural Workers (ATC) developed a process of sensitization for 1200 base leaders, middle managers and national leaders who, in turn, multiplied training in the workplace and society in general.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that transforming behaviour is very complex, especially when breaking established traditions of child labour. This was particularly difficult in the rural areas.(^{661})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Sexual violence</td>
<td>Various methods were used in the 20 programmes to raise awareness, including theatre, brochures, debate and participatory activities with different groups.</td>
<td>It was held that the information was too vague, it was not based on a thorough mapping of the services available, it was not diversified, messages are not tailored to local languages, and little efforts were made to target traditional leaders. Confidentiality was often not respected.(^{662})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Despite the results described in the aforementioned table, the programmes under review faced a number of challenges in terms of educating the public and stimulating social dialogue. The following challenges were encountered in some of the awareness-raising campaigns:

**Evidence-based planning:**
- Failure to adequately use evidence to inform the design of interventions either due to poor design, funding or timing issues.\(^{663}\)

**Human resources:**
- Shortage of human resources to design and lead communication campaigns.\(^{664}\)


• Community based volunteers and staff lacked skills and strategies to transfer information to wider audiences.  

Logistics:
• Logistic challenges (security, accessibility and transportation) hindered the dissemination of materials and information to outlying communities.

Budget:
• Cost hindered the efficiency and effectiveness of mobile communication teams.  
• Budget shortages prevented extended or repeated phases of sensitization.  
• Limited budget for printing or dissemination of materials to communities.  
• Limited budget for social protection interventions to supplement awareness-raising activities.  
• Delays in payment affected implementation and results achieved.

Coordination:
• Poor coordination between behaviour change initiatives implemented by different organizations.  
• Lack of coordination between local and regional levels and across sectors.

Documentation, reporting, monitoring and evaluation
• Confusion around the importance of transferring information – achievements and needs - to donors and managers.  
• Poor documentation of awareness-raising activities and results at local level.  
• Supervision and monitoring was poor or limited.

These challenges will be discussed in greater depth in the section on programmatic and cross-cutting issues. Child protection programmatic issues will be discussed in greater depth in this section in relation to socio-cultural constraints, engagement of local leaders, socio-economic constraints, relevance, targeting and methodology.

Socio-cultural constraints
The evaluator of the FGM/C programme in Upper Egypt listed the following socio-cultural challenges: first, the commitment of the Positive Deviants was affected by the fact that many were ostracized in the community. Many of these Positive Deviants were not adequately trained to deal with this level of resistance. Second, prevailing social norms and dynamics around honour, status, gender and childhood made it difficult for individual families to abandon the practice. The evaluator notes that the programme has not achieved the ‘overly ambitious objective’ of establishing FGM/C-free communities but that it has started to create a shift in attitudes.

Although the Tostan programme in Gambia was commended for being respectful of the local culture and customs, there were a number of socio-cultural barriers to the programme. This includes, resistance from community members in relation to the participation of children in the programme; forced and early

---

marriages; strong cultural and religious beliefs in favour of FGM/C; common beliefs and practices that contradict Tostan messages and cause confusion among community members (e.g. pregnant women should not eat eggs, while Tostan encourages the reverse). In Somalia, rights-based discourse also led to some resistance as community members perceived the programme as promoting a ‘foreign and imposed’ value system which was not relevant to the local context.

The salience of social norms has also hindered the effectiveness of de-institutionalization programmes. Despite efforts to change prejudices through public education campaigns, practitioners in Tajikistan note that negative stigma towards children born out of wedlock and children living with disabilities, continues to persist. As a result, the programme is not having its intended effect on rates of abandonment.

In Nepal, the evaluator stated that cultural factors can be both an opportunity and a constraint. The close-knit nature of Nepali communities facilitated the rapid spread of information. However, divisions between ethnic groups prevented them from helping each other in the context of child protection. The caste system and mechanisms of marginalization and discrimination also meant that targeting as an approach has had to be adapted to different social groups. The evaluator argued that in order to ensure relevance, “this component, particularly, has to be tailor-made to fit the context at the very local level. What works in the far West of the country may well not work in the East and vice versa.” On this basis it was argued that simple messages should be designed in a culturally appropriate manner to visually bring the message home that “all children in Nepal are equally welcome, valuable and precious to their parents, communities and society as a whole.”

Relevance of messages

With reference to a child labour mitigation programme in Bangladesh, the evaluator argued that the materials need to be reviewed by a panel of experts and adapted to ensure that they are appealing and relevant to the local context and target audience. An awareness-raising campaign in the Maldives was ineffective because the materials were culturally inappropriate and were available initially only in English.

The evaluator of the New Delhi programme stated that the communication and awareness-raising strategy should have been more dynamic in relation to the changing situation on the ground. For instance, once initial sensitization on child labour had been undertaken, issues such as seasonal child labour and irregular school attendance should be taken into account in messaging.

In Burkina Faso, the evaluator raised concerns about the definitions used in messages on child trafficking. In some cases, child trafficking, child migration, child labour exploitation and child fostering practices were conflated. As a result, some campaigns emphasized prevention of child migration regardless of whether it is in the best interests of the child to remain at home or migrate elsewhere. For some children, remaining at home in contexts characterized by domestic exploitation, abuse and threats of forced marriage may not be in their best interests. Adolescents and youth may also have important reasons to want to leave and work elsewhere. These nuances are missed in awareness-campaigns that use simplistic messages with conflated definitions.

---

681 Ibid.
In Senegal, the evaluator raised concerns about the messages used in MRE. The messages were designed in an emergency context and did not reflect the shift to a more peaceful environment and the range of emergent challenges to safe behaviour. In addition, the messages did not guarantee safety from mines (e.g. they encouraged backtracking as opposed to staying put and calling for help) and caused confusion around identification and marking of dangerous areas. Concerns were also raised about the shocking images that were used in the images and the potential for additional trauma. The evaluator argued that the MRE campaign should be expanded to include information about risks associated with road behaviour (as core messages only deal with pedestrians at risk), the reintegration of returning populations, landmine victims and people with general disabilities; and the manner in which communities can assist in demining operations.

Participatory programming: Although this will be discussed in greater depth in a subsequent chapter, it is useful to provide an example at this juncture. In a school based programme in Serbia, the evaluator noted that school principals themselves should have been actively involved in the development of an awareness-raising campaign, following an initial introductory module on the issue.

Targeting
Targeting was also found to be an issue. The evaluator of the Senegalese programme argued that MRE programmes should target specific at-risk groups within communities affected by the conflict and landmines. While much attention is given to school children, the most vulnerable group was found to be adolescents and adult males, between 15 and 29 years of age. No specific messages or methods (e.g. incorporation into the secondary school curricula) were designed for this group. Statistics suggest a higher rate of casualties caused by mines on the roads, but no messages were developed to address road safety behaviour. Seasonal issues were not addressed even though regions where harvesting occurs at a particular time of year, have shown an increase in mine accidents. Similarly, in Vietnam the evaluator stated that messages were not appropriately targeted to at-risk groups. 11% of the children under the age of 10 did not understand questions related to MRE despite having been targeted using simplistic key messages; quality transfer of messages was raised as a concern with this group. Adults were also targeted but little efforts were made to differentiate between low and known high risk groups within the adult population. Hence, the evaluator argued that messages need to be adapted, more creative and relevant to target high risk groups such as adolescents and adults who are collecting and dealing in scrap metal. Similarly, the evaluator of the MRE programme in Nepal recommended a revision of MRE symbols and messages to ensure that they are easily understood by the target audience. This evaluator argued that the MRE activities are focused correctly on high risk groups but they are focused too narrowly to cover enough individuals. Illiterate women are receiving MRE messages, but others such as returning IDPs are not receiving adequate attention.

Evidence is essential in targeting. In Sri Lanka it was argued that vulnerable areas that have a lower baseline awareness of child rights issues should be targeted in awareness-raising programmes. In Azerbaijan, a survey of national opinions was only conducted simultaneously with the national media campaign, thereby missing an opportunity to ensure evidence-based targeting.

Methodology
The evaluator of the programme in Somalia described a number of problems with the methodology used in this public education and social dialogue campaign. First, the evaluation found that the community mobilization had some effect in changing attitudes, but the period of community engagement was too

---

690 Ibid.
693 Ibid.
short and intense to ensure information retention and sustainability. Second, the Child Protection Advocates (CPAs) lacked the skills and strategies to transfer information to the wider audience, and in some cases did not use the materials and visual aids produced by UNICEF. Third, the CPAs took on an ‘informal policing’ role in the community and instead of raising awareness, started to identify child protection violations and instruct parents to stop this behaviour. The evaluator notes that there is little evidence that such an approach was effective. Fourth, the strategy to disseminate information from the CPAs to the community was flawed as there was a clear gap in knowledge between the CPAs and the wider community. Fifth, the manner in which information was presented had an effect on levels of community engagement; for instance, it was found that when statistics were used the communities were not able to engage as much as when emphasis was placed on the consequences of harmful behaviours.  

A number of gaps were also described in relation to the content and nature of awareness-raising materials. The evaluator of the programme on abuse, violence and discrimination in Bangladesh noted that more emphasis should be placed on public education using flyers, posters and stickers on which key child protection messages in the local language can be displayed. Similarly the evaluator of the programme in Thailand stated that education and promotional materials for children and adults need to be improved and standardized, although this will require budgetary revisions and the recruitment of a media and communication officer. In Mali, an evaluator was concerned that outreach materials were not provided in community sensitization activities.

In a programme on child labour in Bangladesh, the evaluator noted that apart from the observance of relevant national days, the programme has not advocated for child rights at the national level, nor mobilized communities at the local level. Committees at the community level are largely inactive.

**Socio-economic realities**

The FGM/C programme in Upper Egypt was seen as a Western driven intervention and likened to a ‘conspiracy’ in certain communities because it was ‘not demand driven’. The evaluator recommended that these interventions need to be driven from within the community and sustained over time, and that FGM/C abandonment efforts should be integrated within UNICEF’s existing school and health programmes to show that it makes a ‘tangible contribution’ ‘catering to the village’s most pressing needs.”

There was a degree of community resistance in relation to discussing child protection issues in Somalia. The evaluator stated that this may be because the information was not relevant to the Somali context, where economic factors are cited as reasons behind child labour and/or parents’ inability to protect their children in line with the ‘high’ standards set by the CPAs. In sites where it was difficult to engage the community in Somalia, it was found that as the programme failed to address material needs and other priorities related to basic survival, they were not willing to engage with the programme. In general, the evaluator noted that there was increased awareness of child protection issues amongst village leaders and CPC members but on the whole, awareness was limited.

An overarching challenge shared by the MRE programmes was that in spite of receiving MRE and being aware of the dangers, children and adults continued to engage in risky behaviour. A number of reasons were provided for this: in Senegal, the evaluator stated that out of desperation and a need to be resettled in their homes, people do not wait for trained de-miners but try to clear the land themselves. In

---

703 Ibid.
Vietnam, the evaluator stated that adults continue to engage in risky behaviour due to the lucrative trade in metals in post-conflict contexts characterized by high levels of socio-economic deprivation. The evaluator argued that the MRE programme should link with education and livelihood programmes to provide alternative income sources to scrap metal. Scrap metal collectors and dealers should also be targeted in campaigns, as they have also become the role models for children and youth because of their access to money and material goods.\textsuperscript{705} Similarly in Nepal, the evaluator notes that MRE messages highlight the dangers of travelling through combat areas, cutting grass near areas marked with fencing or hazard signs, saving explosives for sale or for use in construction or fishing, but do not suggest alternative sources of livelihood to this practice.\textsuperscript{706}

In cases where awareness-raising was coupled with social protection, socio-economic challenges continued to hinder meaningful participation. For instance, participation in the Tostan programme in Gambia was hindered by the following: inadequate materials (e.g. spades, rakes, wheel barrows), inadequate writing and sitting facilities; inadequate teaching and learning materials; reduced participation of women in activities due to heavy domestic chores; lack of credit facilities for income generation; retention of facilitators at literacy centres and shortage of learning and teaching materials.\textsuperscript{707}

3.2.3.2 Engaging the media in public education campaigns

The media can play a pivotal role in raising awareness and stimulating dialogue and thereby reducing the prevalence of unfavourable or discriminatory attitudes, beliefs and harmful practices. Table 32 provides examples of how programmes engaged the media in child protection activities.

Table 44: Engaging the media in public education by strategy and findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child protection</td>
<td>The programme tried to network with the media as a means of advocacy and public awareness.</td>
<td>Selected offices made attempts at engaging with the media. The WAO in Amhara provided training on ‘gender and the media’ to media staff. The office organized a debate with the Bureau of Information on equality, affirmative action, abortion and civil society reform. A regular column on gender issues was published in a local newspaper. Broadcasts were also made on Ethiopian Radio for 13 weeks in Harari and Oromiffa languages. To increase reach, the office distributed a New Year card that included information on the broadcasting time.\textsuperscript{708}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>UNICEF engaged with journalists and provided them with information on de-institutionalization.</td>
<td>41 newspaper articles were published in two years on de-institutionalization.\textsuperscript{709}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>School violence</td>
<td>The media was used as an instrument to raise awareness in local communities on the issue of violence.</td>
<td>In the evaluation, local communities referred frequently to the media as a source of information about the problems that children face. Mentors were frequently invited as guests on</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

radio stations to discuss issues pertaining to violence. The media also provided support to different school events.\textsuperscript{710}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>UNICEF engaged with the Iraq Media Network to broadcast spots on mine awareness.</td>
<td>The media ran daily stories on children being injured and killed by UXOs.\textsuperscript{711}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>In the transition to a development phase, UNICEF increased its awareness-raising efforts to address the issue of children and substance misuse. This was informed by the findings of an ethnographic study on this issue.</td>
<td>UNICEF facilitated and financially supported a unique partnership between Journey (a local NGO), the NNCB (government), Television Maldives (Media) and Dhiraagu (a national telecommunications agency) to undertake a broad-based awareness campaign —Wake Up!.\textsuperscript{712}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In relation to media collaboration, a number of challenges and concerns were raised in the evaluation reports:

- **Gap:** In Ethiopia and Mauritania, the evaluator stated that the programme had failed to explore options for effectively using the media to promote gender and child protection issues.\textsuperscript{713}

- **Capacity:** The evaluator of the Ethiopian programme stated that media staff needs to be trained to improve the quality of reporting and the involvement of the media in child protection issues.\textsuperscript{714}

- **Orientation:** The evaluator of the programme in Azerbaijan stated that media attention was more focused on the actions and opinions of the government, rather than on public opinion or the views of children in relation to residential care. Of the 41 articles on de-institutionalization, only eight mention the situation in residential care, four report on the life story of children in residential care and few consider the opinions of families. It was recommended that the media need to be encouraged to include life stories of children and their families, to which more members of the community will be receptive.\textsuperscript{715}

### 3.2.3.3 Outreach and community development activities

Outreach and community development activities are essential to reach community members; identify, assist and refer vulnerable children and families; and encourage consensus building around the need for social change. Table 33 provides examples of outreach and community development strategies and associated results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 45: Outreach and community development strategies and finding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Country</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{710} Evaluation of “School Without Violence” Strategic Marketing Research. Serbia. 2009.
| Country      | Children living on the streets | In consultation with the community, the prevention team devised various strategies including support to out of school youth and support to children identified by teachers as being at risk of dropping out; non-formal education for out of risk youth; life skills training on HIV/AIDS and reproductive health in the ‘mobile school’; sports and games for community members; medical care and advice; vocational training for out of school youth; support to parents to set up small scale businesses; counselling for children and families; individually tailored support plans (case management) for highly vulnerable children. In terms of outreach, a mobile school (minivan equipped with teaching materials and a qualified teacher and often doctor) visited community centres and local schools where they gave training on life skills, literacy and mathematics, undertook health assessments and made referrals to clinics and hospitals. Sports boxes were provided to four villages and young people were left in charge of the equipment and organizing the sports equipment. | Outreach activities reached 450 children and young people each week. Children and young people consulted in the evaluation process enjoyed the activities and valued learning to read, drawing, painting, games, sport, first aid, and hygiene awareness. Parents and village officials were also positive about these activities, particularly in terms of increasing poor children’s access to medical care and education. Most at-risk children supported by the programme returned to school after completing remedial classes with the mobile school.  |}

| Country      | Children living on the streets, child labour and | Staff visited certain locations on the street where children at risk could be found. They then tried to raise awareness and tried to treat | Results unclear in evaluation report.  |

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Results/Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Staff were invited to visit schools and churches, ran booths at exhibitions, created a fabric mural on which over 80 men suggested what fathers can do to prevent child abuse, worked with students at the local college so that they could present a play on child abuse, assisted a technical college to put on an exhibition of art and poetry by their clients, and organized a capacity building seminar for child care professionals demonstrating the use of play therapy.</td>
<td>Results unclear in evaluation report.(^{719})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child protection and child trafficking</td>
<td>Centres conducted outreach activities in the communities, making life skills training available to people outside the programme centre.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that the effectiveness of these activities needs to be measured. If indeed children and youth in more remote communities are found to be more vulnerable, outreach activities should be sufficiently funded and regularized.(^{720})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>The programme created of child-friendly play spaces in IDP camps and distributed recreation kits to help children focus on team sports and games and not on their experiences after the Tsunami.</td>
<td>200 camps countrywide received support with recreational activities, with 550 recreation kits distributed to the districts, benefitting what is estimated to be thousands of children.(^{721})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Following a baseline survey, environmental modifications were carried out in homes, public spaces in the community and at schools. In communes, environment modifications were implemented by putting up railings on small bridges and fencing off public ponds; installing traffic signs, putting up danger warning signs, providing commune road lighting; providing convex mirrors (to allow oncoming traffic to see round Environmental modifications are tangible, easily recognized and were most appreciated by stakeholders and community members who felt that they met the needs of the communes. Many people became more committed to the programme when they saw their community changing. The commune leadership organized injury prevention work. This enhanced the image of commune leaders and local organizations, and led to a greater sense of community engagement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Challenges faced when conducting outreach and general community development activities include the following:

**From knowledge to behaviour change**: Although some communities in Vietnam were aware of the risks they did not try to change the behaviour of their children or change their environments; for instance, small sized ponds were fenced and watched but active children would still swim in bigger and more dangerous lakes and rivers. Solutions were offered to communities, but many did not want to commit to activities that would imply additional effort on their part.  

**Human resources**: In the Philippines the programme struggled to find a dedicated and skilled community organizer. An ongoing challenge was the high turnover of trained staff, largely due to the mobility of urban staff. The evaluator of the programme in Jamaica stated that a full-time community development worker should be recruited to give community development higher priority.

**Risks to staff health and wellbeing**: In the programme in Thailand, the evaluator stated that the political crisis had affected the ability of staff to conduct outreach activities as protestors were occupying certain areas. In response to the safety and security concerns raised by staff, the evaluator recommended that when working on the streets, it was held that staff should always use gloves when doing first aid, and that this should be listed on equipment checklist that need to be created. Staff should also not work after dark where there are a number of safety concerns (including dogs and gang violence), they should only work in safe and lit areas and they should post rules for children (e.g. no drugs, guns and fighting) when doing community and street outreach. It was also suggested that mixed gendered teams should conduct outreach to enhance safety and ensure greater engagement with children from different sex.

**Institutional support**: Although staff may identify vulnerable children, the absence of a hotline posed a challenge as they could not encourage children to call in for support. In Sri Lanka community members started to report child abuse cases to the listening service, but there was not an adequate response from the judicial sector. In The Comoros there were not enough community development associations and other organizations to respond to the reports of abuse.

**Budgets**: Funding for outreach and materials emerged as a concern for both programmes in Thailand and Nigeria. In Nigeria, outreach activities were irregular because they were dependent on available funding. The evaluator suggested that the added value and relevance of outreach should be carefully considered.

---

727 Ibid.
729 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
If vulnerable children can only be reached through outreach activities, then these activities need to be sufficiently funded and regularized.\textsuperscript{730}

‘Hardware investments’: In order to prevent child injuries, the programme in Vietnam made modifications to children’s environments. Some people complained that the quality of items distributed in this programme was poor; for instance, medicine cabinets were too small, knife shelves were weak and stair case doors were unattractive. The evaluator stated that the provincial coordinators did not pay attention to such details.\textsuperscript{731}

Networking: The programme in the Philippines struggled to establish and maintain functional linkages with other groups and organizations working in the field of child protection and related sectors.\textsuperscript{732} A similar concern was raised by the evaluator on the programme in Jamaica, who argued that it should be linked with other community based programmes in order to integrate clients into suitable programmes, monitor their attendance and thereby develop social capital in the community.\textsuperscript{733}

Documentation, monitoring and evaluation: Although staff collects information during outreach activities, they do not systematically make notes which can be used to identify and locate vulnerable children.\textsuperscript{734} This hinders effective monitoring and information sharing activities. The evaluator of the programme in Lao PDR argued that monitoring mechanisms to effectively measure the results of community outreach activities are not in place.\textsuperscript{735}

It is also important to note that it is difficult to monitor and evaluate prevention programmes. For example, in China stakeholders told the evaluator that non-fatal injuries have declined, although this was not reflected in the statistics. This disjunction can in part be explained by the fact that awareness leads to increased reporting, so rates appear to be increasing while they are in fact declining. It is also explained by the fact that the main causes of the fatal injuries are beyond the control of the community and the programme (including drowning and traffic accidents on national roads).\textsuperscript{736}

### 3.2.3.4 Collaboration with local leaders and stakeholders

In order to elicit the support of local communities it is imperative to obtain the buy-in and cooperation of local leaders and stakeholders. Furthermore, in order to ensure relevance and appropriateness it is necessary to promote participatory programming whereby local leaders and stakeholders can exercise influence over the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of programmes. If sustainability is an objective, then local leaders are uniquely positioned to support the ongoing functioning of a programme after funding has been suspended. Table 34 discusses the strategies and results that have been used to promote this collaboration.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Positive Deviants were often ostracized because they were not doing something that the community supported. As a result, attempts were made to use of respected</td>
<td>The programme secured the support of 140 community leaders in 8 sampled communities in the 4 directorates, including natural and civic leaders, doctors, religious leaders, and health providers. At the start of the intervention 55% (153) were opposed to FGM/C and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{735} Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - 'Peuan Mit' Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR, 2006.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>The commune leadership organized injury prevention work. People come to understand that commune leaders and other local organizations can mobilize people, materials, money, and organize for the good of the community. This has enhanced the image of the commune leaders and local organizations, and has increased the effectiveness of the programme.</td>
<td>Review of the Child Injury Prevention Pilot Model Report. CECEM (Le Thi Kim Dung and John Sawdon). Vietnam. 2008. 737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>The programme developed partnerships with commune councils and village leaders. The evaluator notes that the relationship between social workers and commune councils was a key ingredient in supporting vulnerable people. The example of a commune chief who disseminated information at meetings with village leaders about child protection risks was provided. Commune chiefs and village leaders also mediated in situations of domestic violence.</td>
<td>An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayn Sammon. Cambodia. 2009. 739</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Community structures were harnessed to assist with the reintegration of children and identification of vulnerable children. Community based structures were enthusiastic about incorporating child protection work in their activities; however, the extent of their engagement depended on their capacity. Para-legal committees had the capacity to take on child reintegration issues as they are embedded in the community. School Management Committees with a strong school principal were also important sources of assistance.</td>
<td>UNICEF Programme for the reintegration of children associated with armed forces and armed groups in Nepal - Evaluation Report. Nepal. 2008. 740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The programme worked with local partners and clan leaders to facilitate the release of child combatants from militias. The evaluator stated that prominent clan leaders, previously associated with warlords influenced their clan members in order to release child combatants. This also contributed to the prevention of further recruitment of children in their respective militia forces.</td>
<td>Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan. 742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comoros</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Religious authorities supported the Hotline Anjouan in carrying out its activities. Religious leaders denounced acts of abuse during their sermons.</td>
<td>Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan. 742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Given the negative effect of Results unclear.</td>
<td>743</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

742 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
affected by armed conflict

conflict on cultural systems of leadership and community consultation, UNICEF encouraged partners to be sensitive to this and engage traditional leadership as much as possible.

Swaziland Community-based child protection

The programme forged strong linkages with traditional leaders.

Traditional leaders introduced volunteer child protection groups to the community, thereby instilling them with authority and respect. This had an effect upon levels of reporting of abuse.

Many evaluators argued for more participatory methods in order to ensure greater relevance and effectiveness in relation to specific risk behaviours prevalent in local areas (See participatory programming).

In Vietnam, the evaluator argued that community leaders should be involved in agreeing and enforcing decisions on UXO/mines. They should also be involved in developing incentives to promote behaviour change. In this particular programme, the community liaison component was found to be underused.

In Upper Egypt, community leaders assisted in mobilizing the community but they required training on communication techniques, group facilitation and FGM/C related issues. Trusted religious leaders and medical practitioners, who supported the practice, caused confusion and had a negative impact on the effectiveness of the awareness-raising campaign. In Mauritania, the evaluator of the Tostan programme stated that awareness-raising campaigns should go beyond the idea that FGM/C is only 'women's business', by targeting religious leaders.

### 3.2.3.5 Volunteers and community-based child protection committees

| Country        | Theme                     | Strategy                                                        | Findings                                                                                           |
|----------------|---------------------------|                                                                |                                                                                                    |
| Upper Egypt    | Harmful Practices         | Positive Deviance Approach: individuals in the community were trained to encourage social dialogue and act as ‘live examples’ of good practice. | The programme identified 1317 PDs, of which 560 were active. A total of 582 volunteers were mobilized, of which 263 were active participants. |
| Swaziland      | Community-based child protection | Community based child protection groups known as the LL were responsible for educating communities about abuse. Their tasks varied according to their perceptions of their roles. | 149 LLs were trained and 20 were revisited. The evaluator stated that this model has been so effective that it is arousing interest in the SADC model. This is due to the following results: increased awareness of children's rights and child |

---

748 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
Some worked on broader child abuse issues. Members were selected on the basis of their passion for children’s rights and their ability to articulate issues clearly.

Some worked on broader child abuse issues. Members were selected on the basis of their passion for children’s rights and their ability to articulate issues clearly.

Evidence in support of the strength of these linkages is the high level of reporting and referral of cases to the relevant partners. A number of challenges associated with identification, remuneration, financial and material support, support, supervision and monitoring were identified (See discussion). In terms of effectiveness, in terms of the number of children who know about child abuse the range in long established LL areas is 58.3% to 81%. In newly established areas the range is 62.2% to 77.6% and in uninitiated control areas it is 51.02% to 85.1%. Evidence suggests that in general, LL areas fair better in terms of reporting of abuse. Apart from one LL area, all have a reporting rate of above 71.4%, whereas in uninitiated control areas the range is 50%-76.5%. Qualitative results suggest that higher levels of reporting can be associated with the fact that the LL was introduced by the traditional leader and welcomed by the community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Somalia</th>
<th>Community-based child protection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In Somalia, the Child Protection Community Mobilization Model was based on CPCs and CPAs. Child Protection Committees (CPCs) were established to provide a lasting point of contact for communities to instigate change to stop harmful and exploitative practices. The CPCs used tools such as the Koranic Verses and local proverbs related to child protection to encourage communities to stop harmful practices such as FGM/C. CPCs worked closely with CPAs who spend between 14-21 days in each community in order to raise awareness and mobilize communities. At a later stage in the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The evaluator stated that with limited resources, skills and formal tools, the CPAs have developed innovative methods of engaging with communities. They stimulated the development of a few community-based interventions to protect vulnerable children such as street children or children without caregivers. CPCs referred to the ongoing support they received from CPAs and their committed presence, as a motivating factor in the initial mobilization phase. In communities where the CPAs had an ongoing presence, there were higher levels of community child protection activities facilitated by the CPCs. Despite a range of challenges (see discussion), CPCs with the assistance of CPAs demonstrated creative solutions to address protection challenges. The extent to which CPCs were active varied by community and levels of support received from CPAs. CPCs reported that they have been able</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

751 Ibid.
programme, UNICEF also introduced an integrated approach to programming through the establishment of convergence villages, whereby multi-sectoral interventions took place in a focused geographic location. In these villages, there were mixed approaches as to how the CPC worked with other sectors. In some cases, CPC committee members met regularly with members of other communities. CPCs would help other committees to spread information to the communities.

In terms of results, some of the community members interviewed in the evaluation expressed a positive response towards the information they have received about the problems that children face. They were particularly interested in information on child abuse and street children. Much of the information presented from the CPS was perceived as being relatively consistent with the communities existing concerns. The communities commonly referred to the use of Koranic verses and cultural teachings as changing perceptions and in some cases harmful practices.

In terms of referrals, for the most part CPA or CPC supervisors were responsible for making referrals on behalf of the community and conducting follow-up; however, the evaluator found that in cases where communities were assisted to make referrals themselves, communities believed that they would soon be able to take responsibility for referral and follow-up themselves, although resources for communication, transportation and service fees were identified as barriers.

Communities who refused to engage in the programme cited socio-economic needs and dissatisfaction with the absence of material, tangible benefits from participation (see discussion below).

This should be compared with the findings of ‘convergence’ sites where feedback was very positive. CPCs in these villages collaborated with health and education committees to assist in children’s access to health, education and water. There was a high level of commitment from these communities towards child protection matters, whereas communities which were not involved in the multi-sectoral approach spent extensive time lobbying the CPCs and CPAs to secure basic services. In ‘convergence sites’ community members applauded the unified
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>A community level structure called the Child Labour Prevention Team (CLPT) was created and trained on how to prevent child labour and take proactive action against employers. Membership includes the school headmaster, representatives from women’s and youths groups as well as farmers and employers (approximately 14 members). The structure has been constituted at the panchayat level that comprises 5-6 villages. CLPTs were formed in 72 out of 83 communities. Programme reports suggest that the CLPTs played an important role in educating local communities and taking proactive action to prevent girls from being employed in the cottonseed sector. However, the evaluator found that the results of the CLPTs were not as positive in the field. Out of 640 households surveyed only 57 (95) had any knowledge of the CLPT. This was supported by qualitative research. The reasons for this failure will be discussed under challenges below. On the other hand, the evaluator notes that the effectiveness of community level sensitization (conducted in part by the CLPTs) has contributed to a decrease in girl child labour and an increase in girls’ attendance of school in 4 out of 16 villages.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Relay Committees (RCs) were composed of formal and informal community leaders including the village delegate, a woman’s representative, a youth representative, and local religious leaders. Their role is to undertake household visits to informal community members of child protection problems, including FGM/C, birth registration, child migration and child trafficking. They were also responsible for reporting “suspicious situations” where children appear to be trafficked. The extent to which the RCs were active varied. The evaluator was particularly concerned by the approach used by the RCs in relation to children’s mobility: “rather than protecting youth who need to leave to earn a living, the RCs together with the VSCs participate in curtailing the child’s mobility. Child migrants should not be punished or have their mobility restricted if they need to leave their communities to improve their livelihoods or because trafficking and traffickers exist”. The same comment was made in relation to community based volunteers in Mali.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>CMCs are responsible for social mobilization at the community level. Two members of each CMC are trained. The evaluator stated that this component led to a number of negative results (see discussion below).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Program Area</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Mine Risk Education</td>
<td>Rehabilitation Task Forces (RTFs) were established at district and sub-district level in order to make the programme more community-based. This was based on the perception that community liaisons can make demining more effective and efficient. The RTFs were comprised of key stakeholders at community level namely, the local education and health representatives, members of youth, farmers and women’s associations. They were chaired by a local government representative. Their role was to develop plans for MRE, provide MRE directly, monitor MRE activities, prioritize areas for clearance and provide regular reports to ORSA.</td>
<td>The evaluator describes the RTFs as a distinct innovation of this MRE programme. As community-based initiatives, they have ensured local involvement in planning and implementation, and have shown to be more sustainable. In addition, the evaluator argued that they are more effective than communication strategies that rest primarily on the production of “expensive and largely ineffective” materials. It was argued that there has been broad agreement that the RTFs have been successful in building social capital.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Child Welfare Committees (CWCs) were developed to ensure that children are monitored and followed-up in their localities. They also lay a foundation to institutionalize community level child protection.</td>
<td>293 CWCs were formed, 217 of which were active at the time of the evaluation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Community-based structures called Child Protection Committees (CPC) were developed as a point of reference and upward referral for child protection issues.</td>
<td>An inter-agency review of the CPCs in 2007 noted the following achievements: coordination between CPCs and lead NGOs, excellent examples of grassroots advocacy and change, and effective response to individual cases.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Mine risk education</td>
<td>Focal points were identified in each district. Focal points travelled to communities in order to train community members and children, particularly when the need for emergency MRE arose.</td>
<td>In 2006 230 focal points were trained on emergency MRE. In 2008, 250 emergency MRE focal points were trained in 30 districts. By November 2009, a network of 430 focal points was working in 68 affected districts, including 58 districts most affected by ED contamination.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

They were nominated for training by members of the MAJWG and came from a variety of backgrounds. One third of focal points received pay and/or reimbursement for out-of-pocket expenses (such as travel and meals) from the MRE partner organization. The number of focal points varied in proportion to the severity and history of VAE injuries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Key Event</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Somalia     | Children affected by armed conflict | In order to enhance local ownership, community members were trained to support the successful reintegration of children formally associated with armed forces as well as to organize awareness-raising campaigns against future recruitment. The evaluator was sceptical that the programme met its objectives. “In view of UNICEF Somalia’s principle of ensuring local ownership and active community participation, we could not find documentary evidence on the ground to substantiate such a claim”. However, evidence suggests that diaspora Somalis were involved in the initial pilot phase of the programme and different actors were involved in the training process including board members, community elders, women and youth groups, Somalia professionals and business people.  

| Indonesia   | Tsunami                    | In order to increase community ownership of the child protection process and raise awareness on protection efforts, Child Protection Committees (LPAs) were established in 2006 and 2007. They were comprised of local community leaders, NGOs and CSOs. As a pilot, community based child centres were developed with support from district child protection coordination bodies, social workers and the LPAs. LPAs identify abused, neglected and exploited children, to whom they refer to social workers and other actors. A cadre of mental health volunteers were also

19 LPAs attached to Children’s Centres were established in 2006 and 2007. The evaluator described the community based child centres as ‘significant achievements’ despite concerns about capacity at the village level (see discussion)  

In terms of mental health, the mental health volunteers were found to be important factors in the improved mental health status of patients. Outreach and home visits were particularly important because mental illness was traditionally a hidden and taboo subject.  


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Community Management Committees included a person dedicated to child protection. The Committees promoted the abandonment of FGM/C and sought to strengthen capacities in various domains (democracy, human rights, conflict resolution, hygiene and health).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Community Management Committees included a person dedicated to child protection. The Committees promoted the abandonment of FGM/C and sought to strengthen capacities in various domains (democracy, human rights, conflict resolution, hygiene and health).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Challenges, constraints and gaps:**

**Membership/composition of groups:** As volunteers are drawn from the same pool of active community members, the evaluator of the Swaziland programme notes that some community members question their motives, loyalty and promises of confidentiality.\(^{763}\) In the programme on child labour in New Delhi, stakeholders raised concerns about the membership of the CLPT. They were comprised of influential local elders, many of whom control the farming activity in the villages, including cotton seed cultivation. The mandate of the CLPT (to prevent girl child labour in the cotton seed sector) was therefore in direct contradiction to members’ financial interests. Some changed their labour practices but others were resistant. Caste was also an issue which was also ignored in the formation of the CLPT committees; this had an adverse effect on programme operation. A stakeholder noted that the credentials of nominated members were neither verified nor vetted in the recruitment process.\(^{764}\)

**Roles and responsibilities:** In Swaziland, one of the challenges faced by the LL’s was distinguishing their roles and responsibilities from other child welfare initiatives, particularly since members of community-based groups were often the same. This caused confusion, duplication of activities and gaps in service provision. The evaluator recommended clarifying roles and responsibilities and forging partnerships between all people working on child welfare initiatives.\(^{765}\) In Bangladesh similar concerns were raised about defining roles and responsibilities, and task assignments of different stakeholders;\(^{766}\) The evaluator of the Ethiopian programme also recommended the revision and dissemination of appropriate terms of reference for the RTFs, which clearly sets out their responsibilities in relation to identifying and influencing risk-taking behaviour at community level.\(^{767}\)

\(^{760}\) Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.


Remuneration: According to the evaluator of the Swaziland programme, there is a high turnover of LL members due to the lack of financial support and concomitant 'volunteer fatigue'. Many LL volunteers need to supplement their income so leave the group permanently or seasonally for employment and/or cultivation opportunities. Some LL’s feel pressured to supplement the food and clothing of neglected children using their own meagre savings. On this basis, the evaluator recommends that income generation activities for the LLs and their beneficiaries be supported from the outset. The evaluator of the Gambia programme noted that community-based facilitators are paid a monthly salary which is higher than the rate of existing service providers in the same sector, partly due to having a wider set of responsibilities. As a result, staff from government and other organizations would leave their posts to join the Tostan programme. This led to institutional conflict.

Contracts and payments: Delayed issuance of contracts and payments by UNICEF led to disruption as CPAs in Somalia could not follow up with communities. It also led to high staff turnover and had an overall adverse impact on partners and the community.

Social protection and intersectoral programming: Another factor affecting the motivation of community-based volunteers was an overarching sense of hopelessness at their ability to address the underlying root causes of child protection problems, namely poverty, economic hardship, insecurity and lack of political stability. In Somalia, the CPA and CPCs constantly had to field requests for poverty alleviation and livelihood interventions. Initially they had to spend extensive time clarifying the programme’s objectives and moderating high community expectations. Some CPC members in Somalia continued to work on child protection issues out of the hope that they would be ‘rewarded’ with other assistance such as water, schools, materials etc. Failure to produce these more ‘tangible’ forms of assistance, could lead to a loss of faith in child protection interventions. The three communities which refused to engage with the programme had met numerous international and humanitarian agencies in the past but had received no assistance to meet their most urgent and basic needs:

“The main factors leading to a ‘rejection’ or lack of implementation was the lack of services being offered by the CPCM programme. Communities who rejected the programme stated that such activities were not a priority, and they were capable of looking after their children. Alternatively communities commonly stated that they had to focus on food, shelter, water and education to assist their children, and there was a perception that child protection programming was irrelevant given that the community was lacking basic services and could not provide for children in their care.”

It is interesting to note that in communities where an integrated and intersectoral approach was adopted in relation to health, education and protection, there was a higher level of commitment from the community because they could see tangible benefits to participation. The evaluator of the Liberia programme stated that the CWCs need strengthening in order to assist children and families to achieve economic security.

Identification: In Swaziland, the LL members who were introduced to the community by the traditional leader received more support from the communities, than LLs in other communities. However, the LL members still requested some form of identification that would give them easier access to individual homesteads, would increase levels of reporting to them, would increase incentives and allow for recognition of their initiative and impact. Hats and T-shirts were provided at the outset of the programme, but many of the LL members who had received such items had already left the programme.

Capacity: In Somalia, it was found that so much emphasis was placed on training and supporting the CPCs, that there was limited transfer of information on child protection from the CPC to the wider

---

771 Ibid.
community. The evaluator found that the CPC members lacked the relevant skills to be able to engage meaningfully with community members in a systematic way. In particular, they needed skills to mobilize community action to prevent and stop exploitation and abuse. It was also noted that CPAs required ongoing training particularly given that isolation, travel and challenging environments had an impact on staff retention. In New Delhi the evaluator only encountered two villages where CLPT members understood their role and reported having undertaken some activities. For the most part however, the CLPT’s were dependent on Cluster coordination. This may be attributed to the fact that as the CLPT was constituted at panchayat level (comprising 5-6 villages) training was not necessarily provided at the village level, and may have focused more on awareness-raising than building local agency and action.

The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme stated that the CMCs are not aware of their roles and activities. Their activities are limited to attending meetings and paying visits to schools. This is partly due to the fact that the one day of training they received had not yet been provided at the time of the evaluation.

Referrals: In Swaziland the evaluator observed that the referral procedure needs to be clearly and repeatedly articulated as LL members do not know the limits of their powers, do not understand the extent to which they can intervene in cases of abuse, and get demoralized when they receive no feedback on cases that they have referred. In Somalia, the evaluator noted that CPC members referred cases, but did not know how to address the problems they have learnt about in their training. Referrals in Somalia were also hindered by lack of resources for communication, transportation and service fees, as well as limited knowledge about available services. Many community members had sent letters to UN agencies but received no follow-up or results. This led to a sense of frustration as expressed by community members themselves and by CPCs/CPAs.

Logistics, material and financial support: In Swaziland, the lack of transportation and telecommunications was a concern hindering effective referrals from community members to health and law enforcement facilities.

Collaboration with government: In Swaziland, national level stakeholders criticized the programme for failing to collaborate with field office staff so that they can work hand in hand with the LLs. As a result, the evaluator recommended that stronger linkages be established between locally based government extension workers such as social workers and law enforcement authorities to allow for the pooling of resources and experience. The evaluator of the Liberian programme also stated that the CWCs need to strengthen their linkages with relevant government structures. This was reiterated in an evaluation report on the Indonesian programme, where it was noted that government engagement with village committees is limited. Greater linkages are needed between village-level committees and sub-district and district level actors.

Collaboration with other NGOs: the evaluator of the New Delhi programme stated that the CLPTs would have been strengthened by collaborating with other NGOs who have experience of working at the community level. The programme staff do not have the skills and experience to enhance community ownership, and in turn sustainability.

---

775 Ibid.
780 Ibid.
782 Ibid.
Engagement with traditional authorities: The evaluator of the Swaziland programme observed that when the support of the traditional authorities is strong, the LLS are stronger than where the traditional leaders are not fully engaged.\textsuperscript{786}

Documentation: An evaluator applauded the innovative methods and interventions that were developed by CPAs and CPCs in Somalia, but recommended that these need to be documented and shared amongst UNICEF and partners to improve community-based child protection interventions in other contexts.\textsuperscript{787}

Mentoring, supervision and monitoring: The evaluator of the Swaziland programme stated that of the 149 trained LLs, only 20 had been revisited. This lack of support and ongoing monitoring could undermine the effectiveness of training.\textsuperscript{788} In Somalia, CPCs which had ongoing contact with the CPA after the initial mobilization were far more active, engaged and motivated to engage in child protection work. They built strong relationships with the CPAs, received ongoing coaching and in some cases, hands on support in cases that the CPCs felt they could not handle. This illustrates the need for ongoing support for community-based practitioners. However, it is important to note that such an approach could lead to overreliance on external support and thereby impede longer term sustainability.\textsuperscript{789}

Sustainability: The evaluator of the Somalia programme raised concerns around information-retention and sustainability. Communities targeted in the 2003/4 programme cycle recalled the presence of UNICEF staff but could not remember the information that was shared with them two years later. There was little evidence of sustained CPC functioning or sustained child protection initiatives. This partly due to the fact that CPAs only spent 14 to 21 days in each community, which was too short to foster community ownership, capacity and motivation.\textsuperscript{790} The evaluator of the Uganda programme stated that there has been a tension over the issue of ownership and in particular, whether CPCs are being driven by external agencies or able to determine their own agenda and actions. Community ownership is essential to reduce dependency and promote sustainability.\textsuperscript{791}

Tools: In Somalia the use of Koranic verses and local proverbs was commended by community members for its relevance and appropriateness, but the absence of formal tools or visual activities in community-level activities was raised as a concern.\textsuperscript{792}

3.2.3.6 Synthesized results, lessons and recommendations

Table 48: Synthesized findings emerging from community strengthening

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public education and social dialogue</td>
<td>• Many communities were mobilized around the issue of FGM/C and community leaders were discussing it openly with the community. Reports of FGM/C declined and the majority of surveyed community members were not in favour of abandonment and would not have their daughters undergo FGM/C.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• In many countries, there was greater awareness on child abuse, exploitation and trafficking and an increased rate of detection and reporting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Parents and caretakers were more knowledgeable on how to prevent child injury.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Community members were more informed, concerned and proactive about child injury prevention.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{786} Evaluation of Lihlombe Lekukhalela (Child Protectors). Swaziland. 2005.
\textsuperscript{787} Community-based child protection programme evaluation and review. Tirana Hassan. Somalia. 2006.
\textsuperscript{790} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{792} Community-based child protection programme evaluation and review. Tirana Hassan. Somalia. 2006.
| **Engaging the media in public education** | • The media (print and radio) played a role in raising awareness on gender and child protection.  
• Newspapers encouraged social dialogue by publishing articles on residential care.  
• The media shared information on school violence with the public and sponsored events.  
• Stories on mine-action casualties and deaths were printed in the media in order to raise awareness.  
• The media implemented a campaign in partnership with government and an NGO on substance abuse. |
| **Outreach and community development** | • Children living on the streets benefited from recreational, therapeutic, basic literacy, education and health activities in numerous countries.  
• Vulnerable and marginalized children were identified by outreach teams.  
• Children were able to exercise their right to play.  
• Environmental modifications were made to communities, which were as a result, safer for children. This assisted in mobilizing local communities around injury prevention. |
| **Collaboration with local leaders** | • A large number of natural and civil leaders expressed a shift in attitudes towards FGM/C and shared these sentiments with other community members.  
• The effectiveness of the child injury programme was supported by high levels of ownership and management by commune leaders.  
• Commune chiefs and village leaders disseminated information on child protection risks.  
• Prominent clan leaders facilitated the release of children from armed forces.  
• Religious leaders denounced acts of abuse during their sermons.  
• Volunteer child protection groups were accepted by communities where they were welcomed and introduced by traditional leaders. |
Volunteers and community-based child protection committees

In a number of countries, volunteers and community-based child protection committees assisted programmes to meet their objectives. Results included:

- Increased levels of awareness among community members;
- A sense of community ownership;
- Access to health and psychosocial care;
- High levels of coordination between community groups and NGOs;
- Strong linkages with service providers (law enforcement, clinics, local schools) to whom children are referred;
- Decreased levels of child abuse, exploitation and harmful practices;
- Individual assistance rendered to vulnerable children and families;
- The stimulation of community-based programmes.

Box 16: Generalized lessons pertaining to community strengthening

Public education and social dialogue:

- Public awareness and social dialogue campaigns should be based on evidence. Evidence-based planning (e.g. research and consultation) should be included in budgets and work plans.
- These campaigns should be designed and managed by staff who have been trained in this regard. Community-based volunteers and staff should also be trained on how to transfer information and mobilize a wider audience.
- In order to increase the reach of these campaigns to outlying communities, it is necessary to invest in infrastructure, transportation and communication. This is particularly important as many vulnerable and marginalized children are ‘hidden’ in these communities with little access to services.
- Public awareness campaigns should be sufficiently budgeted to allow for printing and dissemination of materials, the development of innovative local programmes and accompanying social protection interventions, and extended or repeated phases of sensitization.
- In order to maximize impact it is necessary to coordinate behaviour change initiatives – or simply ensure alignment of key messages - which are being implemented by different organizations.
- Activities and results should be documented at the local level and shared with managers and donors.
- Supervision and monitoring is essential to ensure effective and efficient results.
- It is important to have an in-depth understanding of the risks that will be encountered in local communities, including the salience of social values and norms which could lead to resistance from community members and ostracization (and subsequent high turnover) of volunteers; beliefs and norms that might contradict programme messages; community’s perceptions of programmes as foreign and imposed interventions; ethnic, caste and class differences which could cause tensions etc. The campaign can then be designed and adapted accordingly.
- It is important to adopt an appreciative approach to communities, recognizing their strengths and resources (e.g. salience of networks). These can be harnessed to ensure programme effectiveness.
- Programmers should spend time ensuring that public education messages are relevant and appropriate in terms of issues, language, cultural and contextual references,
- Messages need to be clear, consistent and based on accurate definitions.
- It is important to develop a strategy at the outset; however, this strategy needs to be flexible to suit the changing dynamic and emerging issues on the ground.
- In order to ensure relevance and appropriateness, messages should be designed with the input of a range of stakeholders. Communities should be given an opportunity to design their own messages.
- Targeting should be based on an identification of high risk groups. Messages should be designed around their particular motives for engaging in risky behaviour. This information can be gathered from consultation or research.
- Public education campaigns were found to be particularly effective when they made a ‘tangible’ contribution to the community; for example, by addressing needs for health, education and
social protection services. This supports the need for intersectoral programming.

- Programmers should also be realistic: people may not stop engaging in risky practices unless they are provided with an alternative source of livelihood.
- When drawing up a log frame and work plan it is necessary to recognize that behaviour change is a time and resource intensive process.

**Engaging the media:**

- The capacity of journalists should be strengthened to improve the quality of reporting on child protection issues.
- The media should be encouraged to include human interest stories involving children, families and the community, instead of simply focusing on the government.
- Media interest should not influence the strategic direction of programmes.

**Community outreach and development activities:**

- These activities require dedicated and trained outreach staff and coordinators.
- The safety and security of staff should be prioritized and considered in planning.
- The effectiveness of outreach activities depends largely on the availability of institutional support. Community members will stop reporting cases of abuse if they receive no response from the relevant government agencies.
- As outreach is such a valuable way of identifying vulnerable, marginalized and hidden children, it should be sufficiently funded and regularized.
- Developmental activities should be undertaken in partnership with organizations who are undertaking similar activities.
- In order to ensure quality control, it is important to ensure that teams are adequately supervised and monitored.
- The importance of documenting activities and results needs to be emphasized.
- It is particularly difficult to measure the effectiveness of prevention interventions given the ambiguity of reporting statistics and attribution.

**Collaboration with local leaders and stakeholders:**

- In order to ensure effectiveness, relevance and sustainability it is important to go beyond informing or merely consulting local leaders, but they should be actively engaged in designing, implementing and monitoring programmes.
- Depending on their role, community leaders may also need training on activities and specific child protection issues.
- At the outset, it is important to identify the possible risks that resistant local leaders can pose for programme effectiveness and plan accordingly.

**Volunteers and community-based child protection committees:**

- Volunteers should be selected on the basis of their commitment to children’s rights, experience and skills so that the community views them as trust-worthy and reliable.
- Engaging the private sector to assume membership of child protection committees should be carefully considered, especially if their interests run contrary to the child protection programme.
- The mandate of the community-based child protection committee and the roles and responsibilities of individual members should be defined formally at the outset.
- A basic stipend should be considered for volunteers so as to reduce high staff turnover and the costs of repeat training. Alternatively, income generation activities for volunteers should be developed.
- Streamlining of procedures and payments is necessary to ensure regularity and consistency of activities at the community level.
- Community-based child protection committees are more effective in mobilizing children around child rights when ‘tangible’ forms of assistance are provided to communities. The capacity of these volunteers should be strengthened to play a role in social protection programmes.
- Some form of identification gives volunteers easier access to individual homesteads, increases levels of reporting available to them, and allows for recognition of their initiative and impact.
- There are a number of training gaps which need to be overcome to strengthen the capacity of
volunteers. They should also be equipped with formal tools and guidelines.

- Psycho-social support should be provided to volunteers who may come face to face with emotionally disturbing incidences.
- Referral procedure needs to be clearly and repeatedly articulated as volunteers do not necessarily know the limits of their powers, do not understand the extent to which they can intervene in cases of abuse, and can get demoralized when they receive no feedback on cases that they have referred.
- Referrals often involve communicating by telephone with service providers, transporting children and their parents physically so that they can access the service and providing food and immediate assistance to desperate households. Volunteers should be compensated for these expenses.
- Community-based child protection committees need to strengthen their linkages with relevant government structures and NGOs working at the community level.
- These committees need to obtain the support of traditional authorities in order to obtain some legitimacy and authority in the community.
- Innovative methods and interventions (and results) need to be documented and shared widely to improve child protection programming.
- Volunteers require ongoing mentoring, supervision and monitoring.
- These programmes may be more sustainable if they give community based child protection committees greater power and autonomy to define their own agenda and actions.

3.2.4 Child Participation

One of the basic principles underlying the CRC is that the views and experiences of children should be taken into account in developing or reforming policies, programmes and institutions that affect them. Participation is both a substantive right which entitles children to be actors of their own lives rather than passive recipients of adult decisions. It is also a procedural right through which to realize other rights, achieve justice and expose abuses of power. Article 12 of the UNCRC imposes an obligation on States and adults to enable and enforce this right. This entails providing space, time, resources and options for children to express themselves.

Meaningful child participation is based on the recognition that children are important stakeholders whose voices and perspectives need to be heard and included in all interventions, policies and procedures that affect them. It involves ensuring that children are able to express an opinion about and influence decision-making and action. Furthermore, it involves ensuring that policies and procedures provide an enabling environment for children’s voices to be heard in strategic planning and operations. Underscoring this is the importance of increasing the accountability of organizations and institutions to children’s rights, interests and perspectives. Listening to children is the first step, but actually taking their perspectives into account in policy and programming is essential to meaningful child participation.

Child participation can be consultative in that children’s views inform programmatic components, while activities are initiated by adults but implemented by and with children. Alternatively, it can be self-initiated in that children lead activities with adult support if necessary. These activities may include a situational analysis or identification of key issues, in which children articulate their concerns and/or are used as researchers to learn more about children’s needs. They may be involved in programme planning and design, whereby children are consulted on strategies and work plans. Children can also be involved in implementation in terms of managing activities or carrying out specified components of work. Lastly, children can be involved in monitoring and evaluation either in terms of identifying key indicators relevant to children, expressing how a programme has had an impact on their lives or asking other children about these issues.

General Comment No.5, 2003, para.50
### Table 49: Child participation in policy and programming by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Children were trained on safety issues at school. They participated in community hazard mapping and worked with adults to remove the hazards. Students were mobilized for safety patrols during vacations. Activities were designed to influence planners at the Ministry of Education and in the Beijing Municipal Bureau of Education.</td>
<td>Children brought back the safety knowledge and skills they had learnt to their peers, parents, caretakers and communities. Over 20,000 students participated in activities for traffic safety, playground safety, fire safety, emergency drills during natural disasters and first aid. Safety knowledge was disseminated through school radio and TV networks, bulletin boards, mobile exhibits and student competitions. 43% of communication materials were designed and produced by children themselves. On the basis of these activities, many schools located outside the programme expressed an interest in participating in the activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Children living on the streets</td>
<td>A National Committee for Child and Youth Participation was organized. The first National Street Children's Congress led to the organization of the National Network of Street Children Association and a newspaper supported by street children. Children were trained on how to mobilize community action through visual and performing arts.</td>
<td>At workshops, children drafted resolutions which were presented to the Congress and Senate. Children managed a newspaper for street children, which only existed for 2 years with UNICEF support. Children's participation in workshops in 2003 also led to the National Framework on Child and Youth Participation and a manual that was published in 2005.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>The strategy was to tap the potential of children themselves to advocate for their own rights. The forum discussed issues related to child labour, particularly the adverse impact of the cottonseed sector on girls and the use of pesticides.</td>
<td>72 child fora were formed in 72 schools with a membership of 1,996 children. According to the evaluator, children participating in these fora provided leadership not only in schools, but played an influential role in their families and communities. The child fora have “shown that children given the opportunity can be effective advocates on child rights”.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>The ‘Balika Sanghas’ evolved out of the child fora described above. The child fora failed to address issues related to gender (see discussion). As a result, a minimum</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that the formation of Balika Sanghas had an effect on child labour. Within a few years, the incidence of girls working in the cotton seed sector</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

of two groups were formed within each village with a membership of 15-20 girl children/adolescents. 154 Balika Sanghas were formed in 73 villages, with a membership of 2926 children. They met twice a week and received training on life skills, health, education, gender and child rights. A cascade approach was used so that 3 girls from each Balika Sangha received sustained inputs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Inclusion of children and youth in the planning and running of youth centres.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the approach to child participation was primarily practical and strategic rather than rights based or empowerment driven (see discussion).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Serbia    | School violence | Peer teams were established by children themselves to discuss issues related to violence in schools, to formulate school rules in discussion with teachers, to activate a trust post-box and to raise awareness of other students through theatre, sports events, play days, radio shows and other activities. | The evaluator stated that the peer teams function well. Mentors confirmed that the establishment of these teams was the greatest achievement of the programme because it stimulated a number of children and contributed to a positive atmosphere in the schools. Children were eager to participate and took responsibility for the activities. Only one out of 40 peer teams conducted no activities. 77% of teachers believed that the peer team was well implemented. 32% believed that the peer team has most contributed to the reduction of violence in schools. Apart from challenges surrounding membership and independence (see discussion), the evaluator described this as an example of ‘good practice’ because pupils use their peer teams through whom they report violence to their teachers, act for protection and play an active role in their schools. Peer teams were also said to report violence and try to resolve conflict on their own. However, when compared to the findings of baseline research no significant improvements were found as 4 out of 5 pupils state that their peers help them when they are exposed.

797 Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Children’s clubs and youth groups were formed in order to enhance child participation, address the individual development needs of children while contributing to the overall reintegration of children. In total 228 Children’s Clubs were formed, 163 were active and 193 youth groups were formed of which 35 were active.</td>
<td>The evaluator described these structures as effective. They improved children’s self-esteem and gave them an opportunity to solve daily problems. They provided opportunities for children to associate with other children and they provided them with some direction. It gave reintegrated children an opportunity to participate in decisions around whether to go to school or skills training. It also gave them an avenue to contribute to their communities. The evaluator stated that ideally the impact of these structures will be a “modified attitude of communities” and enhanced motivation for children to engage in matters that affect them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Children’s Clubs gave children an active part to play in welcoming and reintegrating their peers who were associated with an armed group. Most clubs were school-based and complemented wider community events such as speech competitions for children regardless of caste and gender.</td>
<td>According to the evaluator the clubs and events have assisted in reducing caste and gender discrimination by ensuring that children can mix with each other and with adults from different castes. They have also become a “resources” to assist in the reintegration of children associated with armed forces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Youth fora were formally established at the district level and are coordinated by a provincial level Youth Council under the Child Protection Secretariat.</td>
<td>Results unclear in evaluation report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>There were 90 active Children’s Clubs in Batticaloa and 40 active clubs in Galle in December 2008. Safe space programmes led to the revitalization of more than 170 village-based children’s clubs with nearly 200,000 child participants in Galle and Batticaloa. These clubs offered recreation and play opportunities, education from part time tutors and small scale child-led income generation projects.</td>
<td>The evaluation found that children’s clubs were addressing two or three of the top five psychosocial needs as identified by village children and adults (education, freedom to play and happy demeanour). They served as a place for children to convene, play games and receive supplementary education assistance. Sustainability was called into question, particularly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

when supported by international actors rather than local organizations (see discussion). Some children’s clubs promoted child-to-government exchanges at the divisional and district levels, thereby ensuring child participation in government planning and policy discourse.\(^{803}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Celebrations were held to which children from three pilot sites were invited. At this event the Child Reference Group gathered opinions of children from the institutions. Information about the opinions of children in institutions was used to guide policies and programmes for family reintegration.(^{804})</td>
<td><a href="#">Promoting the Deinstitutionalization Process in the Republic of Tajikistan - UNICEF Project Evaluation. UK Children’s Legal Centre. Tajikistan. 2005.</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lao PDR</td>
<td>Children living on the street</td>
<td>Children participated in the design of services and monitoring of implementation. Children were consulted in a needs assessment in 2004, a beneficiaries’ evaluation in 2005, and weekly meetings at the drop in centre. Children elected a youth representative, created a suggestions box and participated in making rules for the centre. Children’s inputs were used in drafting the new Children’s Law. The evaluator noted that the staff revealed a sincere commitment to meaningful participation. They were proactive in encouraging children to express themselves and incorporated their input in programme design. In addition, it facilitated the establishment of friendly relations between children and programme staff.(^{805})</td>
<td><a href="#">Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Mine Risk Education</td>
<td>Existing child communication teams (‘Bamboo Shoot’) in schools were harnessed to deliver messages to children through singing and drama. Based on this existing structure, the Youth Union developed an initiative to include MRE messages in their communication messages. UNICEF supported 150 of these teams. In addition, children’s teams were formed at a district level in highly contaminated areas to raise awareness through drama, dance and song. These activities were facilitated by Youth Magazine (an agency under the Central Youth Union) and Youth Unions with support from UNICEF. A child to child training manual was developed and youth trainers of trainers were trained at a central level. At the time of the evaluation, children had not yet received training.(^{806})</td>
<td><a href="#">Evaluation Report: UNICEF Vietnam Support to Mine Risk Education. Centre for Community Empowerment. 2008.</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Mine Risk Education</td>
<td>Children who attended MRE sessions were encouraged to tell their families, friends and Awareness was raised in local communities.(^{807})</td>
<td><a href="#">Evaluation of UNICEF Nepal Mine Action Activities: Victim-Activated Explosion Injury Surveillance and Mine Risk Education. International Emergency and Refugee Health Branch, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Nepal. 2010.</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


As is evident from the table, many children’s clubs or fora were established in the course of the programme, but a number of factors hindered levels of participation, consistent implementation of activities and the achievement of sustained results.

Relevance: Although it is important to consult children, interventions should also be relevant, realistic and viable. In a previous section on social protection, the example of Nepal was provided. As programmers based their decisions on children’s preferences rather than on what was viable, the activities designed for children were not fully effective. For example, boys’ requests for driving lessons were met even though they were too young to obtain drivers licenses or lived far from roads or cars. Girls participated in tailoring training, but were too young to work or set up their own businesses.

Meaningful participation: The evaluator in the Philippines notes that despite extensive child participation activities, street children have never been represented in the executive committee of the NPSC, and therefore do not have any meaningful say over policies and programmes that affect them.

Reach: In New Delhi, the evaluator argued that meaningful participation will require taking the forum beyond the village level to a higher order structure at mandal and district level: “This would provide solidarity and enable adolescent girls to use their fora to collectively raise their voice against child labour and all gender unjust practices and attitudes”.

Membership: The evaluator was concerned that peer teams were elected by teachers and not by pupils in certain schools. This hindered representativeness and the level of trust and faith that students had in the peer teams. As a result, school rules created by these peer teams were seen as imposed rather than owned by the students themselves. Membership of the peer teams in Serbia was said to be abused as some children only wanted to participate because it gives them an excuse to miss classes and receive certain privileges. In Colombia, 33.5% of respondents stated that there are children who wished to participate in the programme but were not able to. This is due to the fact that there were restrictions on the number of children who could join the teams, only certain grades were permitted, some children were not chosen and others registered too late. Age was raised as an important factor because children younger than 10 years old could not play. This was due to limited human and material resources. In addition, children who lived far away did not have easy access, although they were not purposefully excluded.

Independence: The evaluator of the peer teams in Serbia noted that independence of functioning should be improved. Instead of designing their own activities on the basis of their peer’s needs, the children carried out activities that had been determined for them. In Nepal, the evaluator notes that the tendency is to either (a) allow children to dictate the programme even when it is not in their best interests, or (b) ignore children’s views in the belief that they cannot know what is in their best interests.

Duplication: In some schools in Serbia where peer teams were created, a pupils’ parliament was already in existence. The peer teams were absorbed by these structures and failed to fulfil the specific objectives of the school violence programme.
Gender: The evaluator of the child labour mitigation programme in New Delhi argued that the child fora did not give children – both boys and girls - an opportunity to reflect on issues of gender. This is partly due to capacity as the cluster coordinator was not trained to address gender-related issues, but also partly due to gender stereotypes, whereby issues related to gender were only discussed with older girls in Balika Sanghas rather than with boys or in mixed gender groups. There should be a strong gender focus in the training and capacity building offered to the children. In Liberia, the evaluator noted that more needs to be done to encourage girls to participate in children’s clubs. Some girls are prohibited from attending by their husbands, especially when it entails long hours.

Children living with disabilities: In Liberia, the evaluator stated that the participation of children living with disabilities in Children’s Clubs is almost non-existent.

Children’s rights: in Nigeria, the evaluator stated that the programme has made significant progress in including children and youth in planning and implementation but the programme is practical and strategic rather than rights based. Staff and students did not understand what was meant by a rights based approach and how the child participation activities should empower children to claim their rights.

Activities: The trust post box which was used in the school programme in Serbia was only put into practice in certain schools. Some children lost interest in the box and used it for other purposes. In some cases, the box was mounted and never used. 16% of the pupils had never heard if this activity and only 68% of the teachers sampled in the evaluation stated that it had been a well implemented activity. The evaluator attributed this to the lack of response from adults in relation to cases of violence reported in the box and to the fact that children did not choose this mechanism of child participation but it was imposed on them.

Materials, infrastructure and logistics: Peer teams in Serbia often struggled to meet on a regular basis due to the lack space. In Liberia, children and youth reported that they faced difficulties keeping groups together due to the absence of recreational materials. In Sri Lanka the end of Tsunami funding meant that children’s clubs lacked logistical and transportation support when participating in government planning and policy-making activities.

Motivation and incentives: In Liberia, it was difficult to motivate children and youth to participate in the children’s structures. Some youth requested payment for attendance. Many would be easily discouraged by low levels of participation in meetings. Children’s attendance was adversely influenced by lack of support from adults in the community.

Scheduling: In terms of timing, regular attendance was hindered by school commitments, assignments and the onset of school holidays.

Documentation: The peer teams in Serbia did not document how many reports of violence they received and/or how many children asked for their assistance. This hinders efforts to measure the effectiveness of these structures.

818 Ibid.
821 Ibid.
824 Ibid.
Support and supervision: The evaluator of the New Delhi programme stated that the child participation strategy needs to be revisited, in particular in relation to the training of the facilitator and the support that is provided to the children’s structures. In Serbia, the evaluator noted indifference or resistance on the part of school teachers who did not understand the programme or simply lacked motivation. This pointed to the need to spend more time obtaining the buy in of teachers, training them on the programme objectives and strategy, incentivizing their active participation and support and strengthening monitoring mechanisms within the programme. In Liberia, the evaluator argued that the Children’s Clubs can only represent a resource in terms of programme implementation if they are adequately guided and supervised. Support should include strategic direction and sustainability. The evaluator of the programme in Nepal stated that limited staff capacity and time constraints hinder effective support and supervision, thereby preventing effective child participation.

Monitoring and evaluation: The evaluator of the MRE programme in Vietnam stated that children should be involved in programme monitoring and evaluation. Even young children could be used to compare pictures drawn in the past with current practices of children and adults. It was argued that this could be “illuminative and can influence future programme direction”.

Sustainability: Many activities developed and managed by children’s structures were not able to continue after funding was suspended. For example, the newspaper managed by children living on the streets in the Philippines only existed for two years with UNICEF support. In Sri Lanka the evaluator stated that children’s clubs which were supported by international organizations were less sustainable than those nurtured by local organizations. The latter have ensured that the children’s clubs have built-in sustainability strategies such as village-driven fundraising activities and mentorship from local organizations.

The following programmes were criticized for failing to adequately include a child participation component:

• The evaluator of the programme in Upper Egypt referred to comments by girls who suggested that they could be involved in spreading messages by talking to their peers or performing plays to educate people. On this basis, the evaluator recommended the development of child participation activities.
• In Somalia the evaluator of a community based child protection programme recommended that a more significant level of child participation be built into the programme: “Acknowledging girls and boys as actors in their own protection helps develop appropriate community-based interventions, and gives children a sense of control, competence and self-confidence”.
• The evaluator of a Burkina Faso programme noted that child and youth participation in the programme was largely absent. There were formalized consultation processes at the outset of the programme or annually, but meaningful child participation throughout the programme cycle was not encouraged.

---

826 Ibid.
### 3.2.4.2 Peer-to-peer counseling

Evidence suggests that children can play an active role in supporting themselves and assisting other children and adults. Furthermore, given a loss of faith and trust in adults, some children are more likely to turn to their peers for assistance, share their concerns and listen to their advice. Reference is commonly made to negative peer influence particularly among adolescents; however the examples in the table suggest that children can play a positive influential role on their peers.

**Table 50: Peer-to-peer counselling by strategy and finding**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladeshi</td>
<td>Abuse, exploitation and discrimination</td>
<td>5 children were selected as peer educators from each Recreational Centre at Market Places. They were trained for 3 days and then were asked to share their knowledge and skills with 5 additional children at each of their respective centres. The Peer Educators assisted programme staff in facilitation, management, follow-up, organizing parent’s meetings etc. In addition, they used drama and song to raise awareness in the community.</td>
<td>Peer educators were found to be highly effective in terms of raising the awareness of children and communities.837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>In 11 boarding schools teams of peer-to-peer facilitators were created with the aim of assisting children in groups to develop life skills and to influence positive changes in their environment. An adult facilitator’s team was also established in each boarding school to support the children’s groups, facilitate communication with other adults and efficiently organize their activities. In most institutions, two to three peer-to-peer facilitators worked with a class of children, where they organized on average two thematic activities each week.</td>
<td>The evaluator argued that in all boarding gymnasiuems, the teams of peer-to-peer facilitators effectively communicated within groups and cooperated in the implementation of activities. Their knowledge, skills, communication and interpersonal skills enabled the majority of facilitators to earn respect from children; many perceived them as trusted role models. Children found the information and interactive activities accessible and exciting. This method was particularly useful in transmitting information on sensitive subjects such as sexuality and inter-gender relations. It helped children feel useful, responsible and self-assured. The children stated that their gymnasium would be poorer, access to information would be limited and leisure time would be shorter if peer-to-peer facilitators were not present. An important factor in these positive results was the supportive role played by adult coordinators. Educators also forged a positive relationship with peer-to-peer facilitators with whom they</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Issue</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>The local Youth Union designed activities during the summer vacation to raise awareness of children.</td>
<td>This strategy had limited results given the timing of the activities and capacity of the youth (see discussion).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td>The JJC coordinator relied on children to identify peers who are at risk of committing crimes.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that peer-to-peer activities promoted positive peer influence and identifying vulnerable children, however there were a number of risks and ethical concerns (see discussion).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>University graduates who were fulfilling their one year duty contract for the National Youth Service Corps were employed as life skills trainers.</td>
<td>Concerns were raised about turnover of youth on effectiveness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>9th grade youths were trained as recreational therapists.</td>
<td>The evaluator argued that the youth volunteers played an important role in preventing problems that are socially relevant to young people; facilitated the development of life plans; assisted in the social organization of young people; and effectively involved parents and educators. It was held that these youths improved the psycho-social wellbeing of children and adolescents, which in turn had an impact on teachers and parents by “encouraging them to pay more attention to them and thus affecting the quality of child rearing”. The evaluator found that young volunteers were less likely to accept invitations to join armed groups because they saw themselves as leaders in the community with a responsibility towards the children and adolescents with whom they work. The youth also learned to care for themselves, share and feel united as a group – all of which served as a protective factor against...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sri Lanka Tsunami | Through the Social Protection Network Project, UNICEF and its partners trained Youth Befrienders on how to talk to children, listen to their needs and provide them with assistance in 225 affected villages. | There was greater responsiveness to children’s needs and concerns.  

| Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups'. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009. |  


| Ibid. |  


| Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups'. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009. |  


Evaluators highlighted a number of challenges and concerns with regards to the use of children as counsellors. These include the following:  

**Child or youth participation:** The evaluator in Vietnam stated that it is important to distinguish whether the initiative is based on children educating their own peers, or whether youth - who are effectively adults - are simply teaching children about children’s issues.  

**Exclusion:** The evaluator of the programme in Bangladesh noted that recruitment and training of selected children may lead to feelings of exclusion and dissatisfaction from other children.  

**Training of children and youth:** It was observed in Bangladesh that children take a long period of time to become comfortable in training workshops, particularly if they are vulnerable, such as children living on the streets. In Moldova, the evaluator stated that if peer-to-peer educators are not well trained, then the information that they transmit to other children might have a harmful effect because it is incorrect, unprofessional etc. On this basis it was recommended that the facilitators should receive ongoing training, specialization on different topics, access to information about services in the community, and special training on conflict resolution. In Vietnam, the evaluator noted that the local Youth Union does not have the capacity to design and implement fun and useful programmes for children; more training is therefore needed. In Colombia the adolescent volunteers required more support and training on how to handle cases in which children show symptoms of psycho-social distress. They also needed training on how to follow-up on these cases, meet with the family and document the symptoms and response. A professional should be on hand to provide ongoing support.  

**Turnover:** A challenge identified in Moldova was the high turnover of children and youth volunteers due in part to their age and access to other life opportunities. It is also related to short contractual periods and the limited remuneration they receive. As a result new children and youth need to be recruited and trained on a regular basis. In Nigeria, this turnover has had an impact upon stability, institutional memory and a systematic documentation of experiences.  

**Resistance from adults:** In Moldova, some adult staff was indifferent and hostile towards the activity of facilitators. They saw the youth as only present to organize games and energizers, based on traditional

---

842 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups'. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.  
846 Ibid.  
attitudes towards children and youth. Some tried to influence the approach or distort the interpretation of thematic activities organized by children. Some educators refused to provide space and time for the activities with classes of children or intervened in classes, without the consent of facilitators. In many boarding gymnasiums the rigid character of the education process reduced opportunities for them to schedule activities and use their skills. On this basis it was recommended that managers and staff of residential institutions need to be informed about the effectiveness and risks of the peer-to-peer education method.\textsuperscript{852}

*Scale up*: in Vietnam the Youth Union only run programmes during the summer vacation, which many children cannot attend if they are attending extra academic classes. They should therefore expand their activities to other occasions.\textsuperscript{853} In terms of reach, the evaluator of the Moldova programme recommended that youth facilitators should extend their activities beyond local schools to the wider community, with the aim of assisting in the social integration of children and youth from residential institutions.\textsuperscript{854} In Colombia it was also held that adolescent volunteers should start focusing on the wider community, but they should receive ongoing support from youth organizations, municipal authorities or civil society.\textsuperscript{855}

*Monitoring and evaluation*: It was argued that instead of simple observation, pre and post tests and other evaluation methods should be considered when monitoring child participation activities.\textsuperscript{856}

*Ethics*: The evaluator of the justice programme in Mongolia stated that using peers to identify vulnerable children who are in danger of committing crimes, could risk unfairly stigmatizing or marginalizing children who have not committed any offences. It could place them at greater risk of committing offences. There are also risks of increased police surveillance of these children.\textsuperscript{857}

### 3.2.4.3 Synthesized results, lessons and recommendations

#### Box 17: Synthesized findings emerging from child participation activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Children in policy-making and programming:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Children gained knowledge and skills on child injury prevention which they shared with their peers, parents, caretakers and communities. Children also influenced national and decentralized policies and plans pertaining to child injury.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Participatory activities involving children who live on the street led to draft resolutions that influenced government policies and NGO guidance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Children in the reviewed programmes started to play a leadership role in their schools and communities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• As a result of their participation in children’s groups, girls were more empowered and the incidence of girl child labour declined.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Peer teams contributed to a reduction of violence in schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Child participation enhanced the self-esteem, problem-solving abilities and social skills of children formally associated with the armed forces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Children’s clubs have assisted in reducing caste and gender discrimination by ensuring that children can mix with each other and with adults from different castes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Children’s clubs addressed psychosocial needs identified by children and adults.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Insights gained from child participation programmes have led to the development of child to child training manuals and informed capacity strengthening activities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


\textsuperscript{855} Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fafo AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.


Children as counsellors:

- Children perceived the youth facilitators as important role models and a useful source of information on sensitive subjects.
- Youth volunteers improved the psychosocial wellbeing of children by discussing problems that were relevant to them, facilitating the development of life plans, organizing young people and engaging with parents and teachers. These youth were less likely to return to the armed forces given their new responsibilities.

Box 18: Generalized lessons emerging from child participation programmes

- Child participation should be driven by a rights based approach and the objective of empowering children to claim their rights.
- It is important to ensure meaningful participation by giving children an opportunity to have a say and an impact over policies and programmes that affect them at decentralized and national levels. This should go beyond formalized consultation processes at the outset of the programme or annually, but their participation throughout the programme cycle should be encouraged.
- Independence of functioning should be improved in children’s clubs so that they can have a greater say over membership and activities; however, this needs to be carefully balanced by ongoing support and supervision.
- Children’s structures should be used as an opportunity to encourage discussion and dialogue on gender-related issues among girls and boys.
- Efforts should be made to encourage girls to participate actively in the clubs, even if it involves obtaining the buy in of their parents and/or husbands. In some contexts it may be more appropriate to run clubs divided along gendered lines.
- The participation of children with disabilities should be encouraged by the provision of transportation, equipment and additional staff where necessary.
- Children’s clubs require investments in terms of venues, materials, infrastructure and logistics in order to ensure their continued functioning.
- Children’s clubs should be embedded within the wider community so that they become a structure through which children can make a contribution to their communities and vice versa.
- Support from adults will provide added incentives for children to participate actively in these structures. It is therefore necessary to invest time in overcoming some of the adult resistance documented in the reports by educating them on the benefits that child participation will bring to children, families, schools and communities.
- Children and support staff should be trained on how to document their activities and any reports of abuse that they receive.
- Children’s clubs require extensive guidance and support; this should be factored into the work plans of staff.
- Children should be involved in monitoring and evaluation to say what impact programmes have had on their lives.
- Children’s clubs should be nurtured by local organizations which will allow for the development of in-built sustainability strategies (e.g. village driven fundraising and mentorship from local organizations).
- The recruitment and training of certain children and youth should be undertaken sensitively and transparently to avoid feelings of exclusion and dissatisfaction from other children in the community.
- Children and youth should receive adequate training and information to respond to the concerns raised by other children in the course of their counselling and education activities.
- Research should be undertaken to understand the factors behind the high turnover of youth and child volunteers. If the issue relates to remuneration, the appropriateness of a reward scheme should be considered. Rewards could include vocational training or support with income generation activities.
- A clear ethical protocol should be developed from the outset so that decisions can be made on the basis of children’s best interests.
### 3.2.5 Encouraging private sector collaboration

The private sector can play a critical role in child protection by promoting good practices, supporting corporate social responsibility initiatives and by assisting social protection programmes. Table 39 describes some of these activities by strategy and result.

#### Table 51: Private sector collaboration by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Child abuse, exploitation ad trafficking</td>
<td>Through inter-agency cooperation and advocacy, more business establishments are being engaged to contribute to the elimination of child labour. Dialogue with business establishments, business groups, plantation owners and transport groups was undertaken in order to engage them to voluntarily eliminate child labour from their establishments, agree to enforce the laws in their industries/sector and to support children in their recovery and reintegration programmes through educational assistance and skills trainings.</td>
<td>Various businesses made commitments to ensure the removal of child workers in the formal business sector and to provide funding for the healing, recovery and reintegration of children. For example, Cebu Chamber of Commerce agreed to build classrooms for child labourers and facilitate skills trainings and job placement for victims. Cooperation agreements with the Philippine Port Authority (PPA) and major shipping lines enforced port rules and regulations for counter trafficking activities and sustained counter trafficking programmes through budget and resource allocation e.g. building halfway houses and setting up women and children’s desks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Dialogue with cottonseed employers to stop employing child labour.</td>
<td>The district administration played a role in reaching out to cottonseed farmers. Some farmers gave written commitments that they would not employ child labour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour and non-formal education</td>
<td>The programme tried to convince employers about the benefits of children’s education and the importance of improving working conditions of child labour.</td>
<td>The evaluator observed that since the intervention some employers are motivated to allow children to go to school and have realized the value of literate employees. The example of a garment factory owner was provided. He was initially resistant to the idea of an NGO-run crèche on the factory premises, but once he realized the benefit in terms of increased productivity he participated fully and shared the cost.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Problem Description</th>
<th>Action Taken</th>
<th>Impact/outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Abuse, exploitation and discrimination</td>
<td>Engaging the private sector to contribute funding to the programme.</td>
<td>Market Association Leaders made financial contributions to the programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swaziland</td>
<td>Community based child protection</td>
<td>LL groups tried to form partnerships with private business in order to generate funding.</td>
<td>Specific LL groups have received support from private business (e.g. Lukhleko LL by Sappi) as a demonstration of their social responsibility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>The Ministry of Social Action contacted international and national institutions, child protection organizations and the private sector to finance and offer follow-up support to the help line.</td>
<td>Togo Cellulaire and Togo Telecommunications participated in the programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Private companies were engaged to assist with the apprenticeship programme for children formerly associated with armed forces.</td>
<td>The apprenticeship scheme offered trainees the possibility of employment in the businesses where they were trained. Many were hired to stay on based on their commitment and hard work. This experience increased the understanding of business owners about the situation of child affected by armed conflict.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>A structural linkage was set up between EPC and Elman Electricity Company in order to train and employ children affected by armed conflict.</td>
<td>A number of children were trained by the Elman Electricity Company.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Private sector companies were contracted to fulfill certain activities in the programme.</td>
<td>Private companies “Business Insight” and “Poyraz” were selected to conduct a baseline AKAP survey on the perceptions related to children in institutions and with special needs; and the design of a national awareness raising campaign.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Certain private sectors such as coffee and tobacco industries were engaged on this issue.</td>
<td>Although these sectors have engaged with the issue, little progress was made with the Superior Counsel of Private Enterprise (COSEP).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

The table above illustrates the different ways in which the private sector was engaged in child protection issues. This includes:

- Targeting the private sector to change their internal labour practices to ensure that working children’s rights are protected;
- Engaging the private sector to contribute funding to child protection programmes;
- Partnerships with the private sector on social protection programmes, specifically vocational training and apprenticeships;
- Contracting the private sector to undertake programme activities.

A number of challenges were identified when engaging with the private sector:

- **Strategic approach:** The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme stated that programmes should go beyond engaging with individual companies to developing a larger strategy for social mobilization that includes private sector targeting. Similarly in Liberia, the evaluator highlighted the absence of systematic linkages with the private sector, beyond the apprenticeship programme.

- **Leverage:** In the Philippines it was held that given its positioning, UNICEF should create more platforms for partnership with private business organizations such as Chambers of Commerce to support the implementation of programmes by partners.

- **Coordination:** In Togo, the evaluator stated that the private companies complement each other well but require more coordination.

- **Level of engagement:** Although the Bangladesh programme was successful in engaging Market Association Leaders to provide funding to BITA’s programmes, the evaluator notes that an opportunity was missed. The Market Association Leaders did not get any orientation on child rights and were not familiar with the programme. They told the evaluator that they would like to learn the programme basics and be involved in planning. They could also assist in setting up protective mechanisms for children who are exploited, harassed or abused by the buyers coming to markets. Children’s representatives on the market association could ensure that children’s concerns are addressed.

- **Transparency:** The evaluator of the Somalia programme called for clarification about the relationship between EPC and the private electricity enterprise. Questions were raised about ownership of the vocational centre, resource centre and the programme offices.

- **Appropriateness of partnerships:** The evaluator of the post-Tsunami programme in Sri Lanka stated that favouring partnerships with the private sector rather than community organizations should be re-examined, particularly since campaign messages around abuse were not culturally sensitive.

### 3.1.5.1 Synthesized results, lessons and recommendations

**Box 19: Findings of private sector engagement**

- The private sector contributed funding for the identification, assistance return and reintegration of child victims of trafficking.
- The private sector made commitments to stop employing child labour.
- Employers started to permit children to attend school and allowed for the establishment of child care facilities on site.
- The private sector contributed funding to programmes as part of their corporate social

---


responsibility programmes.

- Private telecommunications companies assisted in the establishment of a hotline.
- Children participated in apprenticeship schemes run by the private sector.
- The private sector was contracted to undertake awareness and develop awareness-raising campaigns.

Box 20: Generalized lessons emerging from private sector engagement

- Programmes should develop a larger strategy for social mobilization rather than engaging with individual companies.
- In order to advocate for change in internal labour practices, it is useful to employ sound business arguments; for example, it is important to educate child labourers because literate employers are valuable.
- The ethics of working with the private sector whose interests are often diametrically opposed to those of the child protection sector should be carefully considered. Communities may lose faith in a child protection programme that appears to collaborate with employers that recruit child labourers.
- Private partners should also receive training on child rights and where appropriate, be involved in programme design and implementation.
- All engagement with the private sector should be transparent, documented and monitored closely.
Chapter 4: Programming Principles and Cross-cutting Issues/OECD/DAC

4.1 Introduction
As discussed in the introductory chapter, Results Based Planning and Management involves the following steps:

- Agreement on the key development challenges and on the analysis of the underlying and basic causes of those priorities;
- Reaching consensus among government, civil society and development agencies on priority issues for development cooperation, and a broad distribution of roles and responsibilities;
- Formulating and agreeing on the specific results of the proposed programme of cooperation (and how to achieve them);
- Finalization of the programme design using a using a logical approach, involving all programme partners;
- Preparation of an integrated Monitoring and Evaluation Plan (IMEP);
- Focusing UNICEF human and financial resources on jointly agreed results (UNICEF 2005)

This chapter discusses each of these steps in relation to the following core programming principles: evidence-based programming, monitoring and evaluation, knowledge management, information sharing and communications, participatory programming and efficiency (time, cost and coordination). This chapter should be reviewed in conjunction with Chapter 2.1 which focused on logical programmatic frameworks.

4.2 Evidence-based Programming

4.2.1 Introduction
Evidence-based planning is an essential component of results-based planning and management. Evidence-based planning activities (e.g. research, consultation) are essential to ensure the relevance of objectives; to identify underlying or basic causes of a problem, and other contributing factors; as well as to detect and manage assumptions. Without quality data, it is very difficult for UNICEF programmers to obtain agreement on key developmental challenges and the priority issues for development cooperation. Without evidence it is impossible to design and implement a programme that is effective, relevant, and appropriate.

4.2.2 Activities and Processes
The activities that have informed evidence-based programming include literature reviews, needs assessments/situational analysis, piloting and operational research otherwise known as formative evaluations during the course of a programme. A number of lessons can be derived from these programmes.

**Participatory approaches:**
It is useful to design the research project with the participation of major institutional stakeholders and beneficiaries to obtain buy in and ensure ownership at the outset.\(^{875}\) In addition to local experts, international experts with experience in project management for children and adolescents traumatized by violence should also be consulted when designing the situational analysis/needs assessment.\(^{876}\) It is constructive to model surveys on standard UNICEF survey approaches/tools that have been utilized in other countries, but it is important to adapt them to the local context in consultation with local actors.\(^{877}\) During the research project it is important to build rapport with stakeholders, community members and children so that they are willing to open up and identify their needs, and also to ensure their commitment during the implementation phase.\(^{878}\) In addition, it is useful to recruit community members, in particular

---

youth to undertake needs assessments/situational analysis as they have an insight into the community and may facilitate access to respondents. Children can also be involved in the design of a situational analysis and can be used as researchers to gather data; for example, in Nigeria 24 adolescents from the community gathered research for the baseline study.

**Scope:**

- **Socio-cultural context:** When undertaking a needs assessment or situational analysis it is essential to include an analysis of the socio-cultural context to ensure appropriateness and relevance.
- **Interpersonal context:** It is useful to design research projects that will highlight a range of different risks and needs encountered by children. For instance, a programme seeking to assist in the psycho-social recovery of children affected by armed conflict gathered information about the impacts of acts of violence including illegal armed groups, intra family violence and conflict resolution. Although a community-based assessment informed the design of the programme in Nepal, certain interpersonal issues were neglected such as patterns of recruitment or the experience of children while associated with the armed group. As a result prevention was not prioritized from the outset of the programme.
- **Humanitarian context:** When incorporating child protection within a needs assessment that is intended to inform humanitarian responses, child protection should be adequately reflected in the initial assessment design. As it is not seen as a “life-saving” component of a humanitarian response and is less visible than material assistance, food and shelter, it often tends to be overlooked. Even in emergency and humanitarian contexts, a systematic assessment of needs must be undertaken.
- **Stakeholder analysis:** A situational analysis should be accompanied by stakeholder mapping to identify potential government and non-government partners and collaborators at the outset. This should also include an institutional capacity and training needs assessment.
- **Needs assessment:** It is necessary to distinguish between demands and needs; the former may hide the real set of needs that should be addressed in the programme: “Responding to demands emerging from the field leads to a cycle of demand-response-nonsatisfaction-more demand, since the real needs have not been attended to”. For instance, psychologists’ actual needs for support, sharing and self-confidence were translated into demands for equipment and material support. Material and equipment was relevant and timely but should have been synchronized with capacity building and support to professionals in Algeria.
- **Operational definitions:** The situational analysis should also elucidate the terminology and operational definitions that must be used in the programme.
- **Action-oriented:** In order to ensure that recommendations can easily be adapted into specific objectives and activities, it is useful to divide them into thematic areas around which the

---

882 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
programme can be structured or into institutions that are responsible for implementing them at local, regional and national levels.\textsuperscript{890}

- **Monitoring and evaluation purposes:** A situational analysis/needs assessment should be designed in a manner that will allow it to be used for monitoring and evaluation purposes. For instance, a study that was conducted in Nigeria was used both as a baseline and a community diagnostic.\textsuperscript{891}

- **Ethical considerations:** Research should (a) be informed by clear ethical considerations in terms of confidentiality, informed consent and child protection principles and (b) try to gather more information about local understandings of the best interests of the child and how this can be incorporated into the programme. This will help ensure that programmes are not inadvertently harmful to children.

**Methodology:**

- **Timing:** A situational analysis or needs assessment that is commissioned specifically to inform programme design, should take place before activities are developed and implemented. For example, in Azerbaijan a survey and awareness-raising campaign were implemented concurrently, thereby missing an opportunity to use the research findings to inform the design of the national media campaign. In addition, the attitudes and knowledge of respondents may have been influenced by the awareness-raising campaign.\textsuperscript{892} Alternatively, the programme can be designed around phases; the conclusion of each phase will include research and recommendations for revisions in the subsequent phase.\textsuperscript{893}

- **Mixed methods:** It is useful to combine qualitative and quantitative methods. For instance, in Burkina Faso a qualitative situational analysis was conducted. This then informed the development of relevant social indicators, which were included in a quantitative questionnaire. A second data collection effort was undertaken.\textsuperscript{894} Alternatively, surveys could be complemented by semi-structured interviews and case histories.

- **Participatory and ethnographic methods:** The findings of the rapid assessment and subsequent assessments undertaken in Sri Lanka were not grounded in the local socio-cultural context. More was learnt through an ongoing assessment of children’s protection and well-being needs. It was found that formal assessments do not necessarily elucidate child protection concerns, which can be better identified through participatory and ethnographic approaches that focus on local definitions of child protection and wellbeing. The lack of nuanced assessments led to a generic approach to the safe space programmes and inadequate attention to pre-existing child care practices that lead to secondary separations.\textsuperscript{895}

- **Ongoing research:** Research is not a once off event. It is necessary to undertake operational research or formative evaluations throughout the course of the programme to adapt, redirect and strengthen the programme where necessary to improve effectiveness.\textsuperscript{896} For example, regular snapshot surveys in Bangkok assist staff to identify new areas for street outreach and assist in the identification of communities that would be receptive to the programme, based on their previous experience with other NGOs.\textsuperscript{897}

- **Longitudinal studies:** It is particularly important to learn more about the changes experienced by children over time as a means of monitoring the programme on an ongoing basis. For example, in


Mali further research is needed to learn more about the situation of former child migrants who have been reintegrated in their home communities.\textsuperscript{899}

- **Control groups:** Another means of measuring change is by comparing the results of research with beneficiaries and control groups (i.e. communities and individuals who are not programme beneficiaries). Change can therefore be attributed to the effects of the programme.

- **Pilots** are essential to adapt the programme to contextual realities and to ensure that the necessary adjustments are made before implementation. The value of piloting depends largely on the documentation of the and analysis of experience (both qualitatively and quantitatively)\textsuperscript{900}

**Human resources:**

It is essential that partner agencies have the necessary skills and resources to undertake the necessary basic assessments at grass roots level. This was not the case in Senegal and Ethiopia’s mine action programme where the absence of a MRE needs assessment meant that certain issues on the ground were not addressed, such as the prevalence of unauthorized de-mining, UXO tampering and locally specific unsafe behaviours.\textsuperscript{901} In the Maldives, there was an insufficient pool of local expertise from which to draw when undertaking the rapid assessment and the more comprehensive post-Tsunami psychosocial needs assessment. As a result, international consultants undertook this research, leading to a “disconnect from island culture and realities”.\textsuperscript{902} This was also raised as an issue in Sri Lanka as protection staff lacked the methods and skills to identify risk and resilience features, incidence and prevalence in relation to the impact of the Tsunami and armed conflict on children. As a result, no formal assessment methodologies were employed and data was collected on the basis of informal conversations and observation. This had significant effects on the relevance, appropriateness and effectiveness of the programme: “In the absence of nuanced local information, international actors, by and large, assumed high levels of trauma and recycled psychosocial interventions that had been applied in other contexts”. As a result, the programme was not based on local understandings of child protection and wellbeing, it was fragmented (ranging from biomedical to community support to recreation responses), and generally was not effective or sustainable.\textsuperscript{903}

**Information sharing:**

It is essential to disseminate the findings of needs assessments/situational analysis amongst key stakeholders in the country and to local communities and youth people. Discussions that ensue will assist in the verification and validation process, but will also form the basis for a participatory approach to programme design.\textsuperscript{904} However, the sharing of findings on sensitive issues should be carefully considered. For instance, mine action agencies in Vietnam completed a common form about their area of expertise in mine action and submitted it to the Ministry of Defence in early 2008. There has been no feedback on the findings because such information is rarely shared with non-military partners.\textsuperscript{905}

**Strategic planning:**

A comprehensive situational analysis will build a clearer profile of the strategic direction of the programme.\textsuperscript{906} In other words, it could assist in the identification of objectives and strategies. It also assists in the identification of target results. For instance, in Morocco the programme did not undertake a needs assessment to identify the extent to which children were involved in the crafts industry, and as a result the programme was overambitious in identifying the number of children it could remove from this industry and integrate into schooling.\textsuperscript{907} Strategic plans should indicate a degree of flexibility and

\textsuperscript{899} Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fafo AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.


\textsuperscript{905} Community-based child protection programme evaluation and review. Tirana Hassan. Somalia. 2006.


\textsuperscript{907} Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
adaptability to facilitate rapid responses to changes in circumstances. This is evident in the examples below:

- In Upper Egypt, when partner NGOs felt that the original design which focused only on FGM/C was not appropriate, UNICEF introduced other activities such as hygiene awareness and Avian Flu awareness campaigns, which gave credibility to local NGOs working on this programme at community level.

- During vocational training in Tajikistan, it was evident that trainees were not ready for the micro-credit component. As a result, UNICEF, Mercy Corps and NABW adjusted the programme by increasing the training budget and reducing the amount set aside for credit. They also expanded the target group to include families who were at risk of institutionalizing their children in neighbouring districts. Despite this the uptake of the loans was small, so the programme tried to target businesses and offer them loans for providing employment to people from UNICEF’s target group. After work experience they would be offered credit. This was not successful as few businesses wanted to hire people from the target group and few employed people wanted to leave and start up their own business. So the programmers tried to adapt the programme further, by offering credit to families in rural areas to buy animals. However, they were concerned that they would not be able to repay their loans.

- The drop-in centre in Lao PDR was not initially designed to provide accommodation to children; however, after the police started to detain street children in November 2004, the programme started to provide temporary night shelter. Other adaptations during the course of this programme include the establishment of a motor bike repair workshop and training restaurant, the initiation of a mobile school to reduce the numbers of new children coming on to the streets, and the development of a home-based production scheme where children and parents could work together producing handicraft items.

Donors’ influence: It is essential to design programmes based on identified needs, and not on the interests and influence of the donors. For instance in Somalia, a nationwide study on child rights issues in 2004 revealed that the problem of child combatants constitutes only 5% of the total and was therefore low in comparison with countries such as Sudan, Liberia and Sierra Leone. However, UNICEF Somalia accepted the request from a donor to get engaged in a Child Soldier Rehabilitation and Reintegration Project.

4.3 Results-based Management
Results-based management (RBM) is a management strategy for ensuring that processes, products and services contribute to the achievement of desired results. It is based on clearly defined and related objectives and results, the establishment of clear accountability and reporting processes, and the existence of performance monitoring and risk mitigation strategies. To increase the likelihood of achieving the planned results, UNICEF manuals state that it is essential to ensure that the logic of programme design is internally coherent, expressed as a Logical Framework or LogFrame. A LogFrame elucidates how the development objective is to be achieved, and the causal relationship between specific strategies and intended results. This tool enables programmers to check whether interventions are sufficient to produce intended results; consider assumptions pertaining to external factors or risks that might influence success or failure; determine key monitoring indicators and strategic evaluation questions; visualize and in turn assess the quality of programme design (UNICEF 2005). It is important to note that explicit reference to a LogFrame or related management and planning tools that informed the programme was made in only nine evaluation reports.

In a number of reports, evaluators raised concerns about the absence of this tool. The evaluator of the Georgia programme highlighted the lack of a complete logical framework or use of other planning tools
(such as a SWOT analysis). As a result there were no detailed indicators of process, results and impact in programme documents. Apart from limited reference to performance indicators, there was no reference to expected quantitative outcomes. Furthermore, there was no systematic reference to activities and results, and no evidence of a risk analysis or formalized risk mitigation strategy. This hindered attempts to measure effectiveness.\footnote{Evaluation of the Family Support and Foster Care Project (FS&FC) and Prevention of Infant Abandonment and Deinstitutionalization Project (PIAD). Prepared by Development Researchers’ Network in association with the Institute for Policy Studies. Georgia. 2006.}

The programme in the Philippines used UNICEF-prescribed Work and Financial Planning (WFP) instruments. Nevertheless, annual plans were developed consultatively in an annual meeting involving Chairpersons of Local Task Forces, rather than using LogFrames and other RBM tools. As a result, there were no operational indicators that could be used by the evaluator to measure performance.\footnote{Evaluation of the roles and functions of the national network for street children and its local counterparts. Henry R. Ruiz. Philippines. 2007.} Similarly, with reference to the programme in the Gambia the evaluator stated that the programme would have been strengthened by developing a LogFrame at the outset. This plan would have linked objectives to programme areas and activities, and would have been budgeted accordingly. The absence of a log frame against which to track results and subsequent monitoring and evaluation was highlighted as a major weakness.\footnote{Process evaluation of the joint government, UNICEF and Tostan Pilot Project. Afri Consult. The Gambia. 2009.}

With reference to Nepal, the evaluator stated that planning should have been undertaken at an earlier stage so that more in-depth research could have been done, partnerships could have been forged and areas of divergence between the design of the programme and the capacity of implementing partners could have been identified.\footnote{UNICEF Programme for the reintegration of children associated with armed forces and armed groups in Nepal - Evaluation Report. Nepal. 2008.}

In some cases it is not possible to develop a LogFrame at the start of a programme. For example, in Senegal as the programme was started in an emergency context, no baseline study, strategy or LogFrame was used to guide the programme, which as a result developed gradually and expanded to include a range of activities and partnerships. The evaluation report that was reviewed was specifically commissioned so that the MRE programme could strengthen its strategic plan.\footnote{Evaluation of the Mine Risk Education (MRE) Programme in Casamance - Senegal. H. Barlevi. Senegal. 2006.} When reviewing or updating a LogFrame it is important to adopt two strategic principles as noted by UNICEF in Thailand: it is important to use existing programme approaches that are relevant, but it is also important to create new models and extend approaches adapted from existing agendas.\footnote{Children and the 2004 Indian Ocean Tsunami - Evaluation of UNICEF’s Response in Thailand (2005-2008). Thailand. 2009.}

In the 9 programmes that were said to have developed and used LogFrames, a number of weaknesses were identified, which is discussed in turn.

**Objectives:** Programmatic objectives should describe the improved situation for children to which the intervention is expected to contribute; in other words, the extent to which the lives of children, their families and communities will change as a result of the programme. According to the evaluator of the programme in Thailand, the objectives were overly ambitious. Expectations of how many children would be reached and supported were unrealistic. The evaluator suggested that the numbers for the indicators should be revised downward or phrased differently; for example, “all children who are identified as being in need of school reintegration are assisted to do so”.\footnote{External Evaluation Of Friends International - Thailand (Peuan Peuan). Karen Rasmussen. Thailand. 2006.} A similar problem was identified in relation to the Azerbaijan programme. The LogFrame was coherent in that the intervention logic was clearly defined starting from the overall objective and expected results. Objectively verifiable indicators of achievement, sources of verification and assumptions were outlined in detail. However, the challenge lay in achieving the overall objectives and programme purpose which was overly ambitious. Instead of stating that the programme would reform the child welfare system (and thereby reduce the institutionalization of children within 2 years) the LogFrame should have stated that it would ‘provide support to the initial foundation of
the reform process'. This objective would have been based on a more realistic understanding of the complex process of child welfare reform and the political context. In another example, the programme in the Maldives failed to complete a third of planned activities in 2006 and a similar proportion in 2007 due to unrealistic plans and objectives. With reference to the programme in Colombia, it was argued that the LogFrame has improved over the years of implementation with support from UNICEF; there are still weaknesses in the formulation of objectives and indicators. One of the reasons for this is that the manager changed the long-term goal/purpose of the programme in each programme. This showed a lack of focus on the orientation of the programme.

Strategy: The evaluator of the programme in Azerbaijan stated that the LogFrame focused on policy makers and service providers but does not include children as primary beneficiaries. Given the programme purpose and the three expected results, children should have been listed as the primary target group. This suggests that there is a disjunction between the overall objectives and the outputs, programme purpose and the three expected results, children should have been listed as the primary makers and service providers but does not include children as primary beneficiaries. Given the Raising". Cristina Rocella. Azerbaijan. 2007.

Risks and assumptions: The evaluator of the programme in Vietnam stated that although the design of the LogFrame worked well, it needed to be more explicit about assumptions made and inherent risks when designing the programme. Some risks such as the possibility of staff turnover were listed, but additional risks that emerged in the course of the evaluation field work were not anticipated at the programme design stage. The LogFrame for the Azerbaijan programme did not account for the challenging political context and the extent to which it impact on the ownership and management capacity of the government. Strategic thinking around these risks could have informed a strategy of damage control. The risk mitigation strategies were not formalized but should have included for example, constant and timely reactions to overcome obstacles, defining coordination and reporting mechanisms, and the delegation of various components of programme implementation to different implementing partners.

Inputs: The evaluator of the programme in Vietnam commended UNICEF and implementing partners for structuring the design around three integrated aspects of People, Organization and System. For example, in relation to inputs reference was made to capacity building of staff and management for the People aspect; the establishment of a management structure at the start of the programme was listed under the Organization component; and the technical work (including the provision of quality materials,
environmental modifications, policy development and enforcement) were included under the Systems component. These model steps unfolded sequentially so that the appropriate inputs were made before embarking on the technical aspects of the programme. The evaluator of the Burkina Faso and Mali programmes stated that limited human and financial resources were used strategically in order to achieve the objectives of the programme.

Internal logic and coherence of LogFrame: With reference to the programme implemented in Lao PDR, the evaluator stated that the programme was designed on the basis of the RBM principles and even included a logical framework illustrating the relationship between inputs, activities and different levels of results (outputs, outcomes and objectives). There was a clear and logical connection between expected results and chosen strategies that were relevant to the programme objectives. However, a number of challenges associated with internal logic and coherence were identified: statements of overall objectives were not consistent across different documents over time, outcome statements focused on processes (e.g. providing a service) rather than on impacts; and intended results were not accompanied by measurable time-bound indicators of achievement.

The evaluator of the Bosnia Herzegovina programme described the LogFrame as well-defined with realistic and relevant results that made a clear contribution to each outcome and the programme purpose. In addition, the programme purpose was realistic and relevant and made a clear contribution to the overarching goal. However, there were substantive weaknesses in the LogFrame which impacted upon the programme design. For example, the development goal and some of the indicators referred to having an impact on policy but the programme activities did not include any reference to any policy-related work or any other parallel programmes that might impact on this outcome. In some cases, the relationship between outputs and outcomes in a number of levels was unclear. The evaluator argued that the result 2 “Modified approaches to the functioning of mechanisms of child protection implemented in pilot municipalities through special focus programmes implemented by various participants” begs the question as to how small programmes are to lead to modified approaches. It could mean capacity building of local government to tender, evaluate and monitor locally developed CSO programmes, but it could also mean small programmes carried out in partnerships to fulfill the programme goal of a mixed model. Part of the problem lies in the fact that outcomes and outputs were not separately identified so indicators were mixed or disappeared between levels of the LogFrame.

The evaluator of the child labour and basic education programme in Bangladesh stated that the design was poorly conceived. In particular, the component of social mobilization and advocacy was not properly integrated into the basic education programme. It was found that the initial first three objectives were consistent with the initial three key activities but the final objective (‘increased awareness of all relevant stakeholders’) did not correspond to the final key activity (‘Capacity Building’) but seemed to correspond more with the activity ‘advocacy’ which was coupled with social mobilization and programme communication. It was held that this inconsistency was reflected in budget provisions (only 2.8% of the overall budget was allocated to advocacy and social mobilization) and programme delays because this component did not receive due priority.

Based on the 2007-2011 Country Programme Action Results Framework and interviews, it was noted that the logic of the chain of results was not clear and there was little correlation to the Juvenile Justice Committee programme. Other issues included reference to children living in rehabilitation centres, when they do not exist in Mongolia; no indication of how psychosocial wellbeing will be measured; or how indicators are intended to have a bearing on outputs.

Objectively verifiable indicators and means of verification: The LogFrame in Thailand was said to have caused confusion due to the use of terminology. Objectively verifiable indicators (OVI) were actually termed ‘Results’ which required further clarity both within UNICEF and for programme staff. There was also confusion between means of verification and indicators developed for the LogFrame in Bosnia Herzegovina. Furthermore, it was difficult to use the LogFrame to measure programme effectiveness, because indicators and means of verification were not expressed in a quantifiable way; for example, ‘number of participants included in the network’ does not list a minimum acceptable number. This was reiterated by the evaluator of programme in Bangladesh who stated that the verifiable indicators in the LogFrame were very vague such as “% of parents/guardians of learners with 85% attendance at the LC” rather than a specific percentage against which progress could be monitored. Furthermore it was held that the LogFrame fails to spell out the relationship between means of verification and objective verifiable indicators and how data will be generated. The evaluator of the programme in Jamaica and Algeria stated that indicators should have been developed at the outset of the programme and supported by these means of verification.

Gender responsive indicators: In Bangladesh indicators were not developed to assess the impact of the programme on learners and their behavioural change in relation to gender issues. It was held that the LogFrame should have contained gender responsive qualitative indicators by which progress of achieving gender equality and improving gender relations could have been measured. Examples of such indicators, include, ‘boys are helping in household works, boys and girls helping each other, girls taking decision about their marriage, boys are accompanying girls to come to school etc.’

Flexibility of LogFrame: The evaluator of the programme implemented in Thailand commended the LogFrame for changing from the first to the second year of program, thereby indicating that it was flexible and adaptable in response to changing circumstances. In contrast the evaluator of the programme in New Delhi stated that the programme design should have been more dynamic in terms of building in space and resource allocations to adapt context and time-specific interventions to the dynamic child labour situation. For example, there was a need to focus on new areas of child work such as child labour in chili plantations and the phenomena of seasonal child labour. It was argued that one weakness of the MRE programme in Senegal was its failure to adapt to changes in the programme environment, which transitioned from a conflict to a post-conflict situation and brought about a range of new issues to consider, such as the mass return of IDPs to potentially hazardous areas. In Nepal the budget was drawn up on the basis that the programme would identify eligible children. Assumptions were also made about the large scale release of children from the cantonments, rather than small groups and individually. As the LogFrame and associated budget was fixed, the programme was not able to meet the needs of children in a consistent way.

Sequencing: The evaluator of the Nepal programme stated that it was designed on the basis that children would be reintegrated once the peace agreement was signed. This sequence was reflected in the LogFrame; however, this meant that the programme did not take into account adults and children who had already returned to their communities whose opinions could have informed the design of the

reintegration component, and who may have needed assistance reintegrating successfully. In Mongolia, it was argued that outputs, targets and indicators were not SMART (specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bound) and were not linked to sequential actions to achieve results; for example, a diversion strategy can only be implemented when there has been legislative reform.

Exit strategies: It is held that the programme should be designed with a clear planned and structured exit strategy in mind. This should be reflected in their LogFrames.

Capacity: The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme attributed the lack of coherence in the LogFrame to the fact that implementing partners lacked skills and experience in using a LogFrame and that their data collection tools did not allow for the collection of data to measure achievements in relation to the LogFrame. The evaluator noted that the LogFrame failed to provide a vision and a logic to all that is done under the Project. It was held that partners need training and ongoing support on how to use this management tool effectively.

From LogFrame to Work plan: In Upper Egypt, each local NGO had to create an executive work plan that had to be approved by the partner NGO. The practical and participatory process by which work plans were formulated in the child injury programme was commended by the evaluator. A central annual planning workshop was held to balance the needs and interests expressed by government stakeholders, partners and community members. It was a lengthy process which caused significant delays in the programme. Programme staff had to wait for confirmation from UNICEF regarding the programme budget before starting the planning process. Plans then needed to be approved by UNICEF.

A gap identified in the Azerbaijan report was that the implementation plan did not define specific strategies that would be used to achieve the identified objectives. Furthermore, specific mandates and responsibilities were not identified for the key stakeholders involved, thereby hindering accountability and overall effectiveness. This was reiterated by the evaluator of the programme in Bangladesh who stated that the social mobilization implementation plan failed to define roles and responsibilities and assign tasks to different stakeholders.

The evaluator of the programme in Colombia commended the programme for formulating a cohesive strategic plan which outlined the relationship between objectives, activities and results. However, no clear work plan was developed to accompany this strategic plan. On the one hand this allowed the programme staff some flexibility to decide on the best approach “since not everybody is ‘cured’ in the same way” but it relied on staff and volunteers having the necessary skills and understanding to differentiate between prevention, early intervention and response/treatment.

Similarly, in Serbia the LogFrame was designed in a coherent and harmonious way so that various programme aspects support each other. However, implementation of this LogFrame was problematic and some programme aspects were realized more efficiently and effectively than others. For example, the programme was more successful in implementing ‘peer teams’ and ‘formulating rules of conduct’ but struggled in terms of the inclusion of parents and promotion of restitution in schools.

---

943 Ibid.
952 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
complementary nature of these activities, failure to achieve results in one component had a negative effect on the realization of results related to other components.\textsuperscript{953}

**Appraisal and support from UNICEF:** In Ethiopia, UNICEF did not feel that the initial planning process by WAB/O was up to standard. This led to a time-consuming appraisal process, which in turn caused delays in the transfer of funds for implementation. Stakeholders were not comfortable incorporating all of UNICEF’s suggestions (particularly related to reallocation, rephrasing and revising of the budgets) as they felt that it interfered with their responsibility for the planning of programme activities.\textsuperscript{954} In Vietnam implementing partners acknowledged UNICEF’s support in the programme management and planning phases. In addition to facilitating an annual planning workshop, UNICEF provided training on planning to partners at national and provincial levels.\textsuperscript{955}

The evaluator of the Mine Action programme in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao stated that the mine action strategy makes assumptions about the capacity and availability of human resources at headquarters, regional and country levels which are not always available. It was argued that the ROs have insufficient or inappropriate human resources to provide the coordination and support to country mine action programme; they are preoccupied by other organizational priorities and lack technical expertise related to mine action.\textsuperscript{956}

It is interesting to note that in Colombia, UNICEF assisted in the formulation of the LogFrame for the programme under review. However, for a recent programme UNICEF did not participate in the planning process because it was being funded by another donor. The evaluator argued that as a result, there were weaknesses in the formulation of the objectives, indicators and overall coherence of the LogFrame.\textsuperscript{957}

### 4.4 Monitoring and Evaluation

#### 4.4.1 Introduction

Monitoring is a function that uses the systematic collection of data on specific indicators to measure the extent of progress and the achievement of objectives. Further, in evaluations, relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability are assessed. This information enables programmers to make necessary revisions to the programme design and implementation strategy, and also informs management processes associated with supervision and support. This section will discuss the monitoring activities that have been used in the programme under review, and some of the challenges, constraints and gaps in monitoring and evaluation (M&E).

#### 4.4.2 Activities and Methods

**Table 52: Examples of monitoring activities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Monitoring methodology/activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The programme was based on 6 months of large scale community mobilization, followed by 6 months of close monitoring of the girls at risk of FGM/C. Monitoring included following standard criteria when moving families from an ‘active’ list to ‘surveillance’ list. Local NGOs monitored the families and submitted forms to the partner NGOs.\textsuperscript{958}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{953} Evaluation of “School Without Violence” Strategic Marketing Research. Serbia. 2009.


\textsuperscript{957} Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Forms developed by EveryChild were completed by programme staff based on quantitative process indicators. 959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>Monitoring officers in each of the cities conducted agency visits, attended meetings and led staff development sessions on a monthly or quarterly basis. Data was consolidated in agency’s progress reports in statistical and narrative forms, accompanied with photo documentation. Mid-year and end of year implementation reviews were conducted by cities and national level. A Mid-term Review was conducted at mid-point of programme implementation and Terminal Review at tail-end of programme cycle. NPSC through the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) developed indicators for monitoring programmes but this initiative was not followed through. 960</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>Meticulous records of children and parents were kept, including demographics and type of services received. Child friendly evaluation methods (smiley faces in box) were used in shelters. 961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>The programme was monitored against indicators that were developed for work performance in each sector involved in the implementation of the child injury programme. 962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Monitoring meetings were organized on a monthly basis at commune level and quarterly at district and provincial levels. UNICEF and MOH also undertook monitoring field trips to selected programme sites as they see fit. Monitoring meetings included a review of programme progress in terms of activities and budget disbursement, assessment of strengths and weaknesses of implementation, and the adoption of new measures. Reporting requirements were clear to all stakeholders in terms of reporting lines, frequency, and required data. However, activities, outputs, outcomes and results were not discussed. 963</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The Tostan Regional Office occasionally conducted joint monitoring and supervision field visits with the Women’s Bureau and NGO partners. UNICEF conducted quarterly field visits. Tostan developed an M&amp;E framework from the start of the programme. It also created a Monitoring Evaluation Research and Learning (MERL) Department at its head office in Senegal, which provided support to partners to conduct baseline studies, monitor and evaluate their work. The Gambia Indicator Chart and Results and Impacts related to the Tostan-UNICEF/Gambia Programme outlined the objectives, indicators and desired impact. 2 baseline studies and four internal evaluations were conducted and shared with staff and stakeholders. Institutionalized routine data collection and reporting systems were in place, and were supported by a database. 964</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Monitoring and report formats were developed with the support of the UNICEF programme office. Coordination Councils (CCs)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Monitoring was carried out by the various staff of PIU, BNFE the partner NGOs and by MoPME. It enabled the Project Director to take action through his Programme Officers where intervention was required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>A full time monitoring officer was hired in March 2009. He established a monitoring system by maintaining frequent contact with focal points by telephone or in person using a ‘Telephonic FAQ for MRE focal points’, introducing standard data collection forms and encouraging organizations to use them, and mapping MRE activities to avoid overlap by partner organizations. Forms were kept in hard copy and entered into a Microsoft Excel database. The same system was used to monitor emergency and regular MRE.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>High levels of monitoring by Prince of Songkhla University during the programme development stage appeared to have been effective in developing sound proposals. This input was complemented by technical input to teams on implementation, monitoring and evaluation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>A mid-term evaluation helped the programme refocus its activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comoros</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>UNICEF played an active role in monitoring the listening services. The success of the programme was attributed to this strong involvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Evaluations were conducted by several international and national institutions and informed programming with regards to changing social norms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The programme developed a system for tracking, monitoring and evaluation organized into three circuits namely the national circuit (overall effectiveness), regional/departmental circuits (effectiveness of government partners) and municipal/local circuits (effectiveness of implementation with girls and youth). Regional advisers collect and consolidate information at a national level. It is presented in a monthly report. In addition, the Technical Committee reviews programme progress every three months. The manager of the programme uses a range of instruments to monitor progress including a Registry of Information that tracks monthly progress for each child, a Plan for Comprehensive Accompaniment of Family (PLATINFA) that focuses on the child and family, a register that records...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

969 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
970 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
971 Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviors in Rural Areas of Senegal. Senegal.
demographic information, quarterly reports and daily reporting.

| DRC       | Sexual violence | Although the specific M&E methods varied across the 20 projects, there was a tendency to rely on field visits rather than using formal tools or methodologies. Field visits were however restricted by funding, as well as logistical and transportation constraints. Alternatively, in cases such as the GTZ and IRC projects, structured forms and spreadsheets were used, but were not accompanied by regular field monitoring. |

**Lessons**

- **Strategic planning:** A Monitoring and Evaluation framework should be developed from the outset of the programme. A pilot can then be used to develop detailed indicators and methods for measuring change.

- **Local ownership:** While in some cases it is important to engage the services of international experts in developing M&E frameworks, it is important to ensure that strategic documents pertaining to monitoring and evaluation are widely shared and fully owned by local staff, partners and communities (as did not occur in the Gambia programme).

- **Relevance:** Standard data collection forms, which are based on performance indicators at a regional or global level, must be adapted to suit the programming needs of the specific programme.

- **Child participation:** It is useful to encourage child participation in monitoring and evaluation activities so that information can be gathered on children’s perceptions about a programme.

- **Results:** Monitoring should not focus simply on whether activities are being implemented as planned and budget disbursements made; rather they need to look at outputs, outcomes and results in order to determine whether the programme is meeting its objectives.

- **Reporting requirements:** It is necessary to ensure that all stakeholders understand who they need to report to, how often they must report, and what content is required in reports.

- **Support:** It is essential to support partners and field staff with monitoring and evaluation. This will require a structured training programme in the beginning of the programme, to be followed by refresher training and ongoing technical support throughout the course of the programme. The strong involvement of UNICEF officials in monitoring the listening services was highly effective in Ngazidja et d’Anjouan.

- **Human resources:** The programme in Nepal revealed the extent to which having a full time monitoring officer can improve monitoring and evaluation significantly. Although standard reporting forms had been developed in 2007 they had not been used systematically. However, the personal contact offered by the monitoring and evaluation officer in the form of phone calls, visits and technical support, ensured that MRE focal points, teachers and partners completed and submitted the reports.

---

972 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
977 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
982 Ibid.
984 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
submitted forms on a regular basis leading to an effective and efficient monitoring and evaluation system.  

- **Visits:** In order to ascertain what is happening on the ground it is necessary to undertake both planned and unplanned visits to the field.  

- **Documentation:** It is necessary to document exactly what is shared during meetings, field visits and telephone calls. For instance, the monitoring officer of the Nepal programme completed a standard form every time he called or visited MRE focal points, which he then entered into a database. Practitioners and service providers (e.g. teachers) should be encouraged to complete short (2 pages max) standardized forms each time they conduct a training or awareness raising session.  

- **Knowledge management:** Monitoring and evaluation activities should be accompanied by institutionalized routine data collection and reporting systems and a monitoring and evaluation system for the compilation, analysis and storing of data.  

- **Information sharing:** Monitoring and evaluation reports should be widely shared with programme staff, partners, donors and stakeholders in order to verify findings, ensure transparency, foster a sense of local ownership, and to encourage participatory approaches to programming. Furthermore, it is important to note that the data collected from monitoring and evaluation exercises should not only be used to track what works and what does not work, but should be used for organizational learning and should therefore be shared accordingly.  

**Challenges, constraints and gaps:**  

**M&E frameworks:** In some programmes, concerns were raised about the complete absence of a monitoring and evaluation framework with accompanying indicators, baseline data and plan to establish an M&E system. It is necessary to develop clear indicators defining programme outputs (immediate results) and outcomes (long term results) as was recommended for the programme in Upper Egypt. It was found that the Georgia programme’s log framework does not allow for measurement of impact, because there are few indicators of success at each level of the intervention. The M&E framework for Cambodia was said to include indicators that are prone to subjective judgments, without identifying means and sources of verification and quantifiable indicators for effective monitoring and evaluation. The log frame which forms the basis for the M&E framework was available at Tostan International Level and in some Tostan Country Programmes, but it was not completely articulated for the Tostan Gambia Programme and hence there was lack of sufficient clarity of the relationship between the objectives, the outcomes, the outputs and the activities. Indicators and performance targets were not clearly defined before implementation, thereby hindering performance tracking and assessment of progress. The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme on basic education was very concerned that after 18 months of implementation, the programme does not have a simple set of indicators which staff at all levels can understand and seek to attain. In Thailand, monitoring efforts were focused on organizing an annual ______

987 Ibid.  
988 Ibid.  
989 Ibid.  
990 Ibid.  
meeting to review progress and share experience, rather than routine monitoring and data collection. In Mexico the director was concerned that no systematic evaluation had been undertaken to-date with indicators and tools focused on acquisition of psycho-social skills, when it is relevant to know how beneficiaries are managing a conflict and whether they are using mediation and negotiation skills.

**Process versus change indicators:** Evaluators in a number of reports stated that most monitoring relates to processes (e.g. activities) rather than changes. For example the indicators developed for the programme in Bangladesh to ensure that “540 children have access to participate in 12 recreational and cultural centres” is far removed from the objective “to improve and develop the capacity, potentialities, self-dependence and consciousness among the children who are living/working on the street and living in deprived areas.” Monitoring activities pertaining to child injury in Vietnam refer to production and broadcasting of TV programmes, rather than the impact of these programmes on people’s understanding, attitudes and behaviour. Reference is made to the successful organization and facilitation of training courses according to plan and budget, but not to the impact of this training on people’s knowledge and skills. As the evaluator of the Bangladesh programme states, the real impact will not be shown from their attendance and grades, but from how their lives and livelihoods have changed as a result of their basic education. Beyond impact on an individual child, the evaluator of the justice programme in Mongolia stated that a more thorough assessment of impact will consider how the intervention has changed the wider political and social context, although this change will take years to become apparent. The timing of evaluations should therefore be considered in relation to whether outcomes or impact can be measured.

**Qualitative and quantitative indicators:** The evaluator of the Georgia programme recommended the development of qualitative assessment procedures to assess the impact of services beyond numbers of children placed in alternative care or reintegrated; quantitative calculations do not elucidate changes in children’s wellbeing or what is in the child’s best interests. Similarly, the Mauritania programme focuses on the number of people reached or number of civil society organizations involved, but not on the changes produced among the target population. The programme on street children in the Philippines has found it difficult to quantify complex changes to children’s wellbeing; this hindered their ability to work with indicators that were developed by the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA). The evaluator of the Bangladesh report referred to these changes as “intangible” such as changes in attitudes, world views, and perceptions of self, which cannot be gauged solely in quantifiable terms. One of the challenges encountered with quantitative monitoring reports is that there is often disagreement on the development of indicators and tools focused on acquisition of psycho-social skills, when it is relevant to know how beneficiaries are managing a conflict and whether they are using mediation and negotiation skills. Evaluation of UNICEF Mongolia’s Child Protection Programme: Juvenile Justice and legislative reform. Jane S. Kim and Oyunbileg Rentsendorj. Mongolia. 2009.

---

998 Evaluation of the External Programme “Against Violence...We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”.
999 Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR.
1005 Ibid.
or confusion surrounding concepts, application and how to categorize outcomes under different titles. As a result, quantitative results are often unreliable.\textsuperscript{1009}

**Means of verification:** Section 2.1.3 discussed the importance of developing means of verification for indicators. For example, evaluators from the Bosnia Herzegovina, Bangladesh, Jamaican and Algerian programmes stated that reliable means of verification were not identified in programme documents. This makes it difficult to collect data to measure progress against indicators.

**Longitudinal studies:** In a number of evaluations, longitudinal assessments were also recommended to assess the impact of child protection interventions on long term child welfare.\textsuperscript{1010} This emerged as particularly important when monitoring the reintegration of children with their families.\textsuperscript{1011} One of the challenges in this regard, is the fact that in many countries, social workers do not give feedback to organizations about the progress of the child. At best the organization can state that the child has been returned home, but cannot state what has happened to the child at home.\textsuperscript{1012} Vocational programmes record the number of children who graduate but do not monitor and record the number of students who find employment as a consequence of their training.\textsuperscript{1013} The evaluator of the Uganda programme recommended that long-term ethnographic case studies be undertaken with a cohort of the most vulnerable families, to monitor the quality and impact of interventions.\textsuperscript{1014}

**Design:** It was held that monitoring and evaluation instruments used in the programme in Upper Egypt are too simplistic and that a more rigorous methodology for impact assessments with pre and post intervention data collection and control/intervention design is necessary.\textsuperscript{1015} The evaluator of a programme in Bangladesh also recommended the use of a ‘control’ group of urban working children so that changes in the lives of beneficiary children can be measured.\textsuperscript{1016}

**Baselines:** Many evaluators criticized the programmes under review for failing to have an adequate baseline, against which change can be measured over time.\textsuperscript{1017} To overcome the absence of a baseline for the justice programme in Mongolia, the evaluators established a retroactive baseline on juvenile crime rates.\textsuperscript{1018}

**Participatory monitoring and evaluation:** The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme recommended the involvement of children, parents and stakeholders in developing M&E tools.\textsuperscript{1019} In Vietnam it was held that monitoring meetings are formal affairs based on a report presented by the programme secretary; they are of limited value.


not facilitated to mobilize the active participation of stakeholders.\textsuperscript{1020} Despite the fact that the programme in Gambia claims to be community-led, there is little community involvement in monitoring the Tostan programme. Community indicator selection and tracking is yet to be done.\textsuperscript{1021}

\textit{Data quality:} Programmes are often forced to rely on data that is unreliable, as was argued by the evaluator of the Georgia programme in relation to data on the total number of children in institutions. This makes it difficult to measure achievements or put them in context.\textsuperscript{1022} In Lao PDR, the number of children benefitting from programme activities was based on estimates from social workers rather than systematic documentation.\textsuperscript{1022} In the Philippines it was held that data quality is poor because there is no effective mechanism to facilitate documentation and consolidation of rescues, including non-arrest options, and the removal of children from hazardous conditions.\textsuperscript{1024} In the Cambodia programme social workers did not document their cases adequately – some files were kept at home and not in the office, some only contained an NGO referral form, there were no written reports of follow-up visits, and they could not identify how many open cases they were working on. In addition to hindering case management and follow-up, this hinders monitoring and evaluation.\textsuperscript{1025} Similarly, staff in the children’s centre were not able to provide the evaluation team with a basic monthly register – or figures - of the number of children who had stayed overnight.\textsuperscript{1026} The absence of systematically compiled disaggregated data (e.g. number of trainees, disaggregated by sex, type of training or reports of early marriage, FGM/C, abduction etc.) was also raised as a challenge in the Ethiopian programme that focused explicitly on gender and child protection.\textsuperscript{1027} In Mongolia, standardized data across all three field sites was not collected; it was not disaggregated by age, sex, education, region, ethnic and social origin, services, alternative to detention at the pre-trial stage, sentencing outcomes and recidivism rates.\textsuperscript{1028}

\textit{Monitoring visits:} In Cambodia there has been confusion around who is responsible for undertaking field visits to monitor activities and how regularly this should be undertaken. In some cases, programme staff are visited by Regional Managers and in other cases the DSVY social affairs officer, but this is rare and inconsistent.\textsuperscript{1029} In Ethiopia, monitoring is conducted mainly through reports and not through field visits due to budgetary and human resource constraints.\textsuperscript{1030} In Senegal, it emerged that monitoring visits were confined to attending a MRE lesson but did not include discussions with staff or pupils.\textsuperscript{1031} A lesson emerging from the Algerian programme was that things are not usually what they seem to be and that reports – especially quantitative – do not represent what is going on in the field. On-site follow up and field supervision is therefore essential.\textsuperscript{1032}

\textit{Human resources:} The monitoring and documentation officer in Bangladesh was looking after three working areas, without having any training or orientation on the subject. None of the field staff had

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.
\item An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayan Sammon. Cambodia. 2009.
\item An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayan Sammon. Cambodia. 2009.
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
received training on monitoring and documentation. Concerns were raised about the orientation and training of cluster coordinators on the Bangladesh programme. For instance, they monitor the status of inputs but do not monitor or record instances of corporal punishment.

**Support:** The absence of support to partners and field staff in relation to monitoring and documentation emerged as gap in a number of evaluation reports. Social workers in Cambodia were told that their case files were inadequate, but they were not offered any advice on documentation and case management.

**Resistance:** According to the evaluator of the Ethiopian programme in order to overcome resistance from staff, partners and stakeholders, it is necessary to define the purpose and clarify the need for information sharing and monitoring and evaluation from the outset. This is imperative as staff and partners may view attempts to review or even criticize their work as an affront.

**Feedback:** Staff rarely receive feedback on the monitoring reports that they submit in Ethiopia. This affects their willingness to submit reports and means that they cannot use this information to strengthen their own work practices. As a result, “Monitoring seems to be exercised for formality purposes, as it is one-way communication. It did not serve as a means of exchanging skill and feedback, and tracking records.” In Gambia, it was held that information flows only upwards and is processed in Dakar and is skewed for international needs. There was no clear feedback system within the programme between the programme and its partners and communities. Information gathered in monitoring reports pertaining to MRE activities in Senegal was not shared with implementing partners, including UNICEF staff.

**Consolidation of data:** Concerns were raised that data from district and provincial level is rarely elevated for discussion and monitoring at the national levels. The lack of consolidation leads to inaccurate figures on national progress. In another example, 30 street educators and social workers completed forms pertaining to children’s needs on the streets, but there was only one, already overburdened, social worker tasked with monitoring, supervising and consolidating their reports. In Bangladesh, data was collected on attendance and learner achievement but it remained unprocessed.

**Information management:** Many of the programmes did not have a strong IMS system to support their M&E systems. Alternatively, there were gaps in the databases because programmes did not have time to consolidate data.

---

1038 Ibid.
1042 Ibid.
and manpower to update them. Challenges also included poor facilities and infrastructure (e.g. lack of internet connections).\textsuperscript{1045}

\textit{Infrastructure}: In Cambodia it was difficult to monitor field activities due to environmental and infrastructure constraints at national, provincial and district levels. This includes regular electricity failures, limited telephone access, the remoteness of communes and villages, poor road systems (especially during rainy season) and virtually no access to computer systems.\textsuperscript{1046}

\textit{Report quality}: The following concerns were raised in relation to the quality of reports received: some are too long to be digested by donors and stakeholders\textsuperscript{1047}; there is little consistency across reports; and reports are not written against strategic goals.\textsuperscript{1048} In Ngazidja et d’Anjouan it was found that reports are irregular, provide a simplistic narrative of all cases and do not respect the confidentiality of cases.\textsuperscript{1049}

\textit{Roles and responsibilities}: A number of evaluators raised concerns about who is responsible for data collection, analysis, storage, and responding to the identified changes in the situation, particularly when UNICEF is working in partnership with different government and NGO actors or as part of a larger coordination body.\textsuperscript{1050}

\textit{UNICEF’s presence}: It was recommended by evaluators that UNICEF assume a more active role in monitoring activities, for instance through quarterly field visits, accompanied and unaccompanied by local partners.\textsuperscript{1051} The evaluator of the Cambodia programme stated that donors have relied upon government monitoring and reporting and have been unsuccessful in obliging donor recipients to impose proper controls.\textsuperscript{1052} One of the challenges encountered in Vietnam was that time and human resource constraints prevented UNICEF from undertaking monitoring activities and monitoring missions that would have ensured adequate quality control on the ground.\textsuperscript{1053} Another challenge is the high turnover of staff within UNICEF Country Offices as identified in Somalia. It is held that this has led to poor documentation and monitoring, and negative consequences for the programme: “If national staff are not doing the monitoring, as expected and international staff cannot visit the project, as was the case in this project, then at least external consultants should have been contracted to undertake the task. This would not have substituted the institutional monitoring of UNICEF Somalia, but at least the project could have reacted early to a situation where the project’s target group changed unnoticed from CS demobilization and reintegration to training of an assortment of war affected children”.\textsuperscript{1054}

With regards to Algeria, it was recommended that the role of UNICEF programme staff “should be extended to reach out, see and feel the impact” through on-site visits.\textsuperscript{1055} It is held that UNICEF’s contracts with implementing partners, specify deliverables but not the quality and performance

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{1047} An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayn Sammon. Cambodia. 2009.
\item \textsuperscript{1048} Review of UNICEF support to street children activities - “Peuan Mit” Building a Sustainable Street Children Project in Lao PDR. Jethro Stern. Lao PDR. 2006.
\item \textsuperscript{1049} Evaluation of UNICEF’s Support to Mine Action. Resilience Centre, Cranfield University, Wiltshire, UK. Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan, and Laos. 2006.
\item \textsuperscript{1050} Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
\item \textsuperscript{1051} An evaluation of the mine risk education programme in Ethiopia. Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining, Switzerland. Ethiopia. 2005.
\item \textsuperscript{1052} Community-based child protection programme evaluation and review. Tirana Hassan. Somalia. 2006.
\item \textsuperscript{1053} An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayn Sammon. Cambodia. 2009.
\item \textsuperscript{1055} Evaluation of the ELMAN-UNICEF partnership in support of the reintegration and rehabilitation of children associated with militia in Somalia and recommendations for future UNICEF interventions in this field. FAKT GmbH. Somalia. 2006.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
management requirements specifically in the context of MRE. In Zimbabwe, it was found that UNICEF as a fundraising and technical partner lacked sufficient manpower to balance administrative and technical monitoring. Government technical staff could not fulfil this function given the lack of direct financial support. NGOs in turn did not have the capacity to monitor the activities of their sub-grantees, who in turn lacked the capacity to monitor their staff. As a result, the quality of outputs at NGO level was compromised. The evaluator argued that although the Programme of Support monitoring system had good indicators for monitoring outputs, equal attention should have been accorded to quality assurance and outcome level indicators. This would have required more frequent field visits by UNICEF programme staff to review progress, identify what works and doesn’t work and share these lessons.

Impartiality: The Georgia programme had no institutionalized system of independent monitoring. It was held that a formalized complaints mechanism for staff and beneficiaries was also needed in the Georgia programme.

Strategic planning: Review and monitoring mechanisms were not used in the Bangladesh programme as an occasion for revisiting strategies or to consider ways in which field processes could be improved. A lesson identified in the Algeria evaluation was that monitoring information should converge into an analysis framework at the level of project management that feeds into the planning and decision-making mechanism.

4.4.3 Development or Strengthening of Information Management Systems (IMS)

UNICEF’s work is underpinned by efforts to improve data collection, analysis and use as a means of strengthening programmes and policies in relation to child protection. This includes strengthening analytical capacities, research and diagnosis of child protection challenges and measures to improve the monitoring of child protection issues, for instance through the development of Information Management Systems. The former was discussed in the section entitled ‘evidence-based programming’. The latter will be discussed in this section. Although a detailed discussion of the IMS systems developed or supported in the 52 programmes is beyond the scope of this report, this section will discuss the challenges and gaps, as well as lessons that emerged from the evaluation reports.

Challenges, constraints and gaps:

Objectives: In Burkina Faso the objective of the database was not sufficiently conceptualized and articulated, nor was the question of where it might be best located institutionally. In terms of the purpose of the database, certain documents and sources suggest that the database will gather information on child victims of trafficking by collecting data on a case-by-case basis periodically through active agencies. Other sources, however, suggest that the database will also be used more as a project management tool to track which agencies are working where and what their activities and investments are. According to the evaluator, these two purposes suggest different kinds of databases: the first being more akin to a case management tool to be used by case workers to follow individual victims (with no access to unauthorized individuals or agencies so as to protect the victims’ identities); the second a project management tool for the Ministry to coordinate and oversee anti-child trafficking and child protection efforts; and/or the third scenario is more of a statistical tool on child trafficking and child protection issues.

---

Leadership and expertise: In Burkina Faso it was unclear which agencies should be involved in the development process. The evaluator suggested that the database be moved to the national bureau of statistics which has the relevant database skills and social science research expertise to ensure that the IMS is effective and sustainable. Delays in setting up the IMS had a negative effect on evidence-based policy making in Bosnia Herzegovina. This was partly related to institutional challenges and budgetary issues.

Infrastructure: Due to infrastructural challenges, specifically internet connectivity, data is collected and entered in Gambia but the datasets are then sent to Dakar for analysis. In Nepal, data collection and submission for entry was hindered by a disruption of communication lines during the conflict and due to weather, terrain and other infrastructural challenges (e.g. limited internet and telephone connectivity).

Design: The data collection tools for the Jamaican database were designed, piloted and revised accordingly. Similarly, indicators were derived from the data that was collected, revised and validated. However, the database has never been fully populated or functional despite three years of experimentation with data collection and indicators. The evaluator of the Jamaican programme found that the IMS consultant failed to fulfil all the objectives of the IMS system as outlined in the TOR. As a result, the IMS system could not generate a standard set of local and national summary reports, did not incorporate health GIS in the production of an inventory of maps and did not allow for the fast retrieval of client records. Some fields were qualitatively designed to capture demographic determinants, but the evaluator stated that the IMS system would benefit from more quantifiably coded data entry fields. Qualitative fields often left the data incomplete in these fields; as a result, valuable information about the number of children heading households, the number of children living in households with a parent/guardian as head of household, the number of children engaged in after-school activities (apart from those referred), the number attending church activities, or the number of children receiving benefits from PATH were missed. Some of the categories were not mutually exclusive so it was unclear whether child perpetrators would be included under the categories relating to close and distant children. Databases did not have the capacity, as programmed, to capture critical indicators such as repeat injuries, number of counselling sessions, socio-economic information on housing and so on.

Community-based approaches to data collection: In Jamaica locally active agencies participated in the data collection process, on top of their other activities. The case data was gathered in areas where these agencies were operative. Two challenges emerged: they had to be able to identify legitimate cases of trafficking (a particularly complex phenomenon to identify) and they had to practice a degree of quality control over the data. As a result, certain cases may have gone undetected or have been mistaken for child trafficking cases.

Data entry and analysis: In Jamaica, staff did not have the time, knowledge or skills to use the database effectively from data entry to analysis and reporting, which contributed to its lack of efficiency. In Burkina Faso the trained database coordinator had resigned months before the evaluation, leaving a vacant post and a backlog of data entry. In Nepal it was argued that UNICEF and partners lacked the capacity to undertake reliable data analysis with scientific rigor. The evaluator of the Bangladesh

---

1063 Ibid.
1068 Ibid.
1069 Ibid.
programme noted that the capacity for accurate data collection is low and the costs of data input and processing are very high.\textsuperscript{1074} As a result, databases are not regularly updated and checked.\textsuperscript{1075}

Data quality: Evaluators found that there is extensive data missing in databases; for instance, the evaluator of the programme in Jamaica requested 50 files for manual examination, of which 20 could not be found. It was found that 9 of the 30 cases were not visited because the information could not be allocated or the cases were in the hands of the police.\textsuperscript{1076} In the evaluation of the Jamaican programme, it was found that vital information was incorrect such as dates for receipt of cases and response times.\textsuperscript{1077} Quality control also emerged as an issue with reference to the new child protection IMS system in Mali. Information was solicited from a range of sources without much quality control.\textsuperscript{1078}

Contextualizing the data: The evaluator of the Senegal mine action programme stated that the data on mine/ERW accidents and victims, suspected dangerous areas and MRE activities is useful; however, reported figures on casualties may not reflect the true number of mine/ERW casualties in the region. This is partly due to the influence of the Islamic practice in which burials take place as soon as possible after a death, and the absence of death registries. It is therefore important to contextualize the data, and an impact survey may provide more comprehensive information than the database.\textsuperscript{1079}

Information sharing: Mine action agencies have not been informed of any data results emerging from the Information Management System for Mine Action (IMSMA) database in Vietnam.\textsuperscript{1080}

Strategic planning: The evaluators of the Ethiopian programmes were concerned that the data, even if it is successfully gathered, will not be analysed, disseminated and used for planning and evaluation purposes.\textsuperscript{1081}

Case management and referrals: In Georgia, there are separate databases on beneficiaries (at MoES) level, potential foster parents and employment opportunities (for the Employment Support Centre). It is not easy to cross-reference between these databases to follow up on particular cases.\textsuperscript{1082} In Sri Lanka, the DPCCS and the NCPA created their own separate databases This hinders referrals and the development of an integrated child protection system.

Consent, confidentiality and security concerns: The evaluator of the IMS system in Nepal discussed issues related to consent, confidentiality and security. The following measures were in place to protect mine victims: respondents were asked for their consent prior to administering the data collection form. The data collection form asked whether the injured individual or his/her family permits the publicisation of the injured individual’s name. Permission was granted in all cases. Programme staff stated that injured individuals do not face any risks as a result. In terms of confidentiality, the office computer which housed the database and the database file was password protected. The password was removed from the database file when it was sent to UNICEF via email. The database was backed up in five different locations. The evaluator argued that although no security or confidentiality concerns have arisen in the

\textsuperscript{1077} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{1078} Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fafo AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.
past, the adequacy of measures to protect the security and confidentiality of informants could not be determined.\textsuperscript{1084}

Lessons:

Development: The purpose of the IMS system needs to be defined from the outset. For example, the injury surveillance systems set up in China had the primary purpose of providing feedback to guide programme implementation, and a secondary purpose to test the feasibility of integrating injury surveillance into the existing school absence recording system and primary health care services, for children under six.\textsuperscript{1085} Prospective data users and their data needs also need to be identified before the IMS has been designed.\textsuperscript{1086} For instance, in Ethiopia it is held that the proposed Information Management System for Mine Action (IMSMA) is too complicated for the majority of programme stakeholders.\textsuperscript{1087} An evaluator commended the Nepal IMS programme for its simplicity: the structure is simple in that it contains district, regional and central levels of data transfer but all are housed within the same organization (INSEC) and activities at each step are clearly delineated; case definition is clearly defined and easy for staff and partners with little medical or technical knowledge to apply; the data collection form is clear and easy to use; follow-up is not necessary unless data elements are missing following case investigation and the system is well integrated with other surveillance systems.\textsuperscript{1088}

In order to ensure efficiency, rather than reinventing the wheel, UNICEF and partners should consider building their databases on UNDGs DevInfo system, with indicators that have been developed using PRSP and Millennium Development Goal (MDG) indicators. These databases should be flexible and adaptable to the local context.\textsuperscript{1089} It is useful to develop an IMS system on the platform of government routine information systems to make them more cost effective and sustainable.\textsuperscript{1090} For example, it may be important to integrate new child protection databases into larger government-led socio-economic databases. This will allow for the integration of information about the situation of vulnerable children and women into strategic planning and poverty reduction processes.\textsuperscript{1091} Alternatively data-bases should be interlinked or allow for cross-referencing to support case management. For instance, in programmes on residential care it is important to be able to link child beneficiaries to their parents.\textsuperscript{1092} The evaluator of the Thailand programme referred to opportunities to link the child protection monitoring system (CPMS) to school and OSCC databases. This would support integrated planning of services; e.g. case managers could meet with teachers regularly about at-risk cases in the database which would also allow teachers to refer children at risk that they see.\textsuperscript{1093}

In order to ensure political buy in and harness valuable human resources and expertise, it is useful to locate databases within National Bureau of Statistics and Information or other relevant skilled government bodies.\textsuperscript{1094} Development and population of the database should be highly participatory and involve a range of ministries and partners. For example, 17 focal points in various government departments feed

\textsuperscript{1089} Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fafo AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.
data periodically into the MaliKunafoni database in Mali. The process of establishing indicators amongst different ministries also appeared to be an important opportunity to better understand the power but also limitations of an information management system. Initially, the wish list of indicators numbered more than 500; however, through the development process, all actors came to an understanding that this number had to be reduced to make the database manageable. The number of indicators was consequently reduced to 330. Evaluation of the Mine Risk Education (MRE) Programme in Casamance - Senegal. H. Barlevi. Senegal. 2006.

In Thailand, a participatory process was used to determine which indicators were useful in identifying risk and indicators in the child protection monitoring and response system (CPMRS). UNICEF collaborated with government, partners and community members (including those who work in child protection, community volunteers and schoolchildren) to define these indicators.

**Data collection:** Standardized forms should be adapted to the local context and to the perceptions and experience of local staff who will be responsible for completing and consolidating them. Data collection tools should be piloted, indicators validated and the system revised accordingly. In Nepal, data forms were in Nepali and were then translated into English upon entry into the database. In order to overcome infrastructure constraints, forms were submitted electronically on the internet where possible, but were otherwise faxed or called in to the Regional Office personnel who filled out the paper forms and sent them to the central office by mail. Communication remained a challenge in areas without telephone access. In order to ensure quality control of data collection, field visits were built into the surveillance system to ensure that collected data was complete and accurate.

**Data cleaning:** Resources should be invested in ensuring that all data is cross-checked, in other words, verified independently. It needs to be established that the data is ‘clean’ before embarking on an analysis. Databases should be updated on an ongoing basis. In Nepal, in order to ensure that data is valid, data forms were checked at regional and central levels before being entered into the database. Personnel were called to fill in any gaps in information. To ensure consistency of data entry, only one person entered data into the database. If data needed to be updated quickly changes were sometimes made to the original reports or data entry personnel were informed immediately of the required changes. In order to ensure accuracy of data and regular updating of data, the evaluator of the Thailand programme recommended that active supervision is required to maintain the functionality of the information management system.

**Data analysis:** Programme staff should be trained on reporting, data entry, the exporting of data to Excel for graphical presentations and how to use various software packages for statistical analysis. It is important to note that when funding for research at the end of a programme is lacking, data from the IMS can be used as a data source to evaluate the programme.

**Information sharing:** Information from the database should be shared with all stakeholders. In Nepal data was analysed on a monthly basis, summarized in flash reports before being published online and disseminated in reports and the Human Rights Yearbook. Reports were disseminated electronically and

---

1095 ibid.
1096 ibid.
1098 ibid.
1101 ibid.
1102 ibid.
discussed by stakeholders in mine action coordination meetings. Concerns were raised by the evaluator that the unavailability of reports in print might limit readership.\textsuperscript{109}

**Referrals:** One of the objectives of the mine action IMS system in Nepal was to facilitate referrals. Injured individuals were referred to a range of service-providers. The evaluator stated that the programme was successful in meeting this objective. The database monitors and records the ongoing status of the injured individual throughout the referral process.\textsuperscript{110} Concerns were raised by the evaluator of the programme in Thailand that an artificial division was created between the monitoring (CPMS) and response (Case manager) elements of the system because they were situated in different departments. Of 38 tambons that engaged in CPMS work in one or more of the three phases of implementation, only 16 had engaged in the case manager/NFDS element of the model. This hindered referrals, case management and achievement of the ultimate goal of a unified, systemic approach to child protection. Nevertheless, the database was universally praised as a useful tool for identifying children at risk. Reference was made to using the data to identify children living with disabilities or children at risk for drug use, who were then referred to service providers and/or included in special preventative programmes. The presence of a case manager would, however, have improved the screening of cases and coordination of child protection efforts. Recruitment, retention and competence should be resolved in this regard.\textsuperscript{111}

4.5. Information and Communications

4.5.1 Introduction

Information and communications is a cross-cutting issue that has been discussed throughout the report. In order to obtain consensus on key development needs and the most effective, relevant and appropriate strategy it is necessary to gather information and share it widely with beneficiaries, partners, staff and stakeholders. It is also essential to support monitoring and evaluation, knowledge management and participatory programming. Activities and outputs include electronic communication, telephone calls, regular meetings, workshops, newsletters, publications, engaging with the media, multi-partner guidance tools, and so forth. This section discusses the lessons that emerged from the programmes under review.

4.5.2 Lessons

- **Planning and adaptability:** It is necessary to have a well-planned communication strategy, which is also dynamic and adaptable to the changing scenario on the ground.\textsuperscript{112}
- **Documentation:** It is essential to document experiences and lessons, standards and practices on an ongoing basis so that the information is not lost and remains timely. This recommendation is repeated in all evaluations under review.\textsuperscript{113}
- **Methods:** The content and format of meetings should be carefully considered to enable participants to learn and exchange relevant experience/ information that is applicable and/or has potential for being replicated; seek solutions to challenges; strengthen their linkages; meet regularly to exhaust discussion on technical issues.\textsuperscript{114} Informal networks at national, provincial and local levels are often more effective sources of communication and information sharing than structured meetings.\textsuperscript{115} It is therefore imperative to strengthen networks and partnerships for acquiring information and other relevant resources.\textsuperscript{116} It is useful to organize national events where local committees can share experiences and information, but this is a costly and time-
consumming exercise. Experience, lessons learnt and best practice should be shared in regional and international fora. For example, the results of the Beijing and Jiangxi injury surveys were cited in the World Report on Child Injury jointly published by WHO and UNICEF in 2008. Representatives of the programme also spoke at the international scientific conference on Injury Prevention and Safe Community Development in Vietnam in 2006 and the international safe community annual meeting in South Korea in 2010.

- **Community engagement**: It is essential to share information with the community in order to develop sustainable interventions and strategies that are culturally grounded and based on a clear understanding of children’s resilience and the community’s capacity. Such activities will help the community shape their own responses to protection issues, and build capacity.

- **Formal processes**: When communication and information sharing across agencies is not standardized, there may be delays in responding to cases as agencies work separately and do not know exactly what has happened to the child.

- **Language**: It is essential to translate programme reports into the local language. In Lao PDR some stakeholders were not fully aware of the range of programme activities and results, because programme reports were not translated into Lao. The programme in Colombia made a concerted effort to produce bilingual materials.

- **Knowledge management**: A standardized information system that can collate data from various sources and allow continuous information flow need to be adopted for analysing the progress and supporting communications. It is essential that data which is available on a database is then shared along all implementing partners, including UNICEF staff.

- **M&E**: The findings of research and monitoring activities should be shared with representatives of government, NGOs and civil society in a manner that allows for discussion and consensus-building around recommendations and the way forward.

- **Infrastructure challenges need to be addressed in order to improve communications (e.g. Internet connections and telephone access).**

- **Reporting**: UNICEF Country Office annual progress reports on the programmes do not always reflect the actual developments, achievements, challenges and solutions. The progress reports varied considerably, and evaluators found it difficult to obtain figures on the number of people

---


1121 Ibid.


1123 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.


1128 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.


assisted in a given year. As a result, it was challenging to get a clear picture of the overall programme and how it actually operated before visiting the country. Quarterly narrative reports that are submitted to UNICEF should be based on comprehensive data collection. UNICEF should facilitate cross-over or information sharing among partners, rather than support vertical reporting structures (from partners to UNICEF).

- **Internal communication:** Country Office staff in Thailand indicated a lack of clarity on issues of policy, implementation, decision-making and resourcing, suggesting that more effective transparent internal communication is necessary within and across sectors and programmes in the Country Office. The evaluator of the Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao MRE programmes stated that poor internal coordination between EMOPS (where mine action is situated), Emergency and Child Protection, Education or Communication Sections has caused a disconnect in advocacy and communication on mine action issues. This is aggravated by human and financial resource constraints in Child Protection divisions which cannot take the lead on mine action.

### 4.5.3 Multi-partner Guidance

Multi-partner guidance supports capacity strengthening exercises, facilitates coordination and cooperation across sectors, institutions and levels of governance, and generally improves responses to child protection issues. Table 42 describes the multi-partner guidance that was developed during the course of the programmes.

**Table 53: Multi-partner guidance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Psychosocial wellbeing</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Therapeutic backpacks that included manuals, printed matter and toys were distributed to volunteers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>A set of psychological guidelines was developed out of a series of psychosocial coordination meetings. These were distributed among NGOs and CBOs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Standards and guidelines for a national psychosocial policy were developed by UNICEF and partners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Two life skills training manuals were developed for the facilitators and for participants at the youth centres, with support from UNICEF Regional Office and HQ.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>A locally approved screening tool was developed drawing on elements of internationally approved instruments such as the Child Abuse Potential Inventory (CAPI) and the Trauma Assessment Protocol (TAP) and the Child Abuse Behaviour Checklist. A Training Resource Manual was developed to guide the roll out of the child abuse mitigation programme in other hospitals.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1135 Ibid.  
1138 Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographic Location</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indonesia</strong></td>
<td>Guidelines on preventing the abuse and exploitation of children were distributed to children centre staff to assist in community-level identification of cases. ¹¹⁴³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Residential care</strong></td>
<td>Students attending a Social Work Resource Course in Stockholm developed training modules for those who work at grass roots level. They visited pilot areas to deliver the modules and seminars. ¹¹⁴⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Azerbaijan</strong></td>
<td>Basic guidelines and standards for child protection in social work were prepared by the Stockholm University and endorsed by stakeholders in 2007. ¹¹⁴⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Georgia</strong></td>
<td>Standardized and comprehensive tools were developed on: case management practices, Standards of Care for Prevention of Infant Abandonment Services, Guidelines for Child and Family Needs Assessments, Foster Care Recruitment Procedures and Standards, eligibility to services and matching criteria guidance. ¹¹⁴⁶</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moldova</strong></td>
<td>The following publications were produced: Educator’s Guide; Graduate’s Guide; Journal of Human Stories; Evaluation Report: Great Games Book. Girls and boys: Partners in private and public life. ¹¹⁴⁷</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Street children</strong></td>
<td>The programme developed the Implementing Guidelines for Street Children Programme (2000) and the National Framework on Child and Youth Participation manual (2005). ¹¹⁴⁸</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Thailand</strong></td>
<td>Guidebooks on working in drop-in centres were created. ¹¹⁵⁰</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child injuries</strong></td>
<td>The programme developed standards and guidelines for “Child Safe Home”, “Safe Schools”, “Safe Kindergartens” and “Safe Communities” to identify and remove injury hazards from homes, schools and communities. In addition, a “Beijing CIP Technical Guideline” was published. This guideline laid out the CIP strategies and best practices from the programme, and provided practical tools for each steps of programme planning and implementation. ¹¹⁵¹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender mainstreaming</strong></td>
<td>The Amhara WAO developed gender-mainstreaming guidelines upon the request of line offices. ¹¹⁵²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Harmful practices</strong></td>
<td>Training modules and tools were developed by MASEF, supported by the National Commission for Information, Education and Communication and UNICEF. ¹¹⁵³</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹¹⁵³ Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
| Education | Bangladesh | Teaching and learning materials were developed with a particular focus on child-centred teaching methodologies. This includes courses on Bangla, mathematics, English, Life Skills to Grade 3.  
1154 |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Jamaica | Guidelines were developed on alternative methods of discipline and management of violence in schools.  
1155 |
| Child exploitation and trafficking | Burkina Faso | The Country Office issued a popularized booklet in French on the Convention on the Rights of the Child which includes information on the worst forms of child labour and child trafficking.  
1156 |
| Mali | UNICEF Mali also developed a simplified Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) document in French, Bambara and in a few other Malian languages.  
1157 |
| Nicaragua | 40 publications on the worst forms of child labour were produced under the auspices of ILO-IPEC, Save the Children and UNICEF.  
1158 |
| New Delhi | A handbook called Balika Sanghala Kardeepika (a training and learning manual for balika sanghas) was developed focusing on addressing child labour of adolescent girls.  
1159 |
| Vocational training and non-formal education | Somalia | A trainers’ manual was developed for non-formal education.  
1160 |
1161 |
| Emergencies | Sri Lanka | Guidelines were developed on how to provide support to Tsunami affected children for camp management and how to conduct needs assessments for people working in Tsunami affected areas.  
1162 |
| Maldives | Procedure Manual on Delivery of Services includes information on the statutory requirements of national legislation and international conventions to provide practical guidance on social work best practices and tools.  
1163 |
| Justice | Indonesia | Standard procedures and guidelines on restorative justice were developed for police officers.  
1164 |
| Violence | Mexico | Teaching kits were developed for non-violent conflict resolution, creative conflict resolution and engaging with adolescents.  
1165 |

**Challenges, constraints and gaps:**

1157 Ibid.
1165 Evaluation of the External Programme “Against Violence...We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”.
Relevance:

- Guidelines that are developed by international consultants need to be further tested and endorsed to ensure relevance.\textsuperscript{1166} They also run the risk of being too theory based, with little value for practical application.\textsuperscript{1167}
- Local experts should be involved in the development process. For example, the child abuse screening tools that were developed on the basis of internationally approved instruments for Jamaica were not accepted or implemented by doctors because of limited involvement of local expertise in the development and validation process.\textsuperscript{1168}
- Guidelines and tools need to be culturally and contextually specific. For example, the tools developed in Colombia were contextualized for each of the regions in which the programme was implemented. Specific names for grandfathers, elders and other significant persons were adapted to suit the cultural context.\textsuperscript{1169} In another example, WHO material on life skills basic education was adapted to suit the working child’s environment in Bangladesh, thereby ensuring that it was relevant to the national and local context.\textsuperscript{1170} It was held that more efforts should be made to provide technical support to UNICEF Country Offices to ensure that MRE guidance is contextually relevant.\textsuperscript{1171}
- Translation: It is essential to translate guidance into local languages to extend the reach and effectiveness of this material.\textsuperscript{1172} However, it is also important to check that the translation is accurate and appropriate. Inter-agency guidelines on unaccompanied and separated children in Sri Lanka were quickly translated into local languages, but the translated interpretation of ‘children requiring protection’ only focused on orphans and children who had lost a parent, thereby creating a protection gap for other children in need of family care.\textsuperscript{1173}

Stakeholder buy-in:

- The evaluator of the New Delhi programme stated that unless the Department of Women and Child Development designs a training programme on ‘balika sanghas’ as an integral part of their ongoing programmes, it is unlikely that the manual developed under the auspices of the programme, will be used.\textsuperscript{1174}

Dissemination:

- The value of multi-partner guidance depends on the extent to which they are shared to inform national policies and working methods.\textsuperscript{1175} For instance, guidelines on street children in the Philippines were not disseminated widely to service providers, and remain unknown in many

\textsuperscript{1169} Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
With reference to the training manual in New Delhi it was held that civil society organizations need to be engaged to disseminate the material.

**Documentation:**
- It is necessary to document many standards and practices related to child participation, life skills training, harmful practices, street children, child migration, and best practices in developing training programmes for implementing partners.

### 4.6 Participatory Programming

#### 4.6.1 Introduction
Participatory programming is when representatives of agencies, stakeholders, partners and beneficiaries work together to design, implement, monitor and evaluate programmes. Participation can range from consultation to active involvement and ownership. As this has emerged as a cross-cutting issue, the findings should be considered in relation to those presented in Section 2.2.

#### 4.6.2 Consultation of beneficiaries, partners and stakeholders

##### 4.6.2.1 Consultation of children in programming
The consultation of children in programming was discussed in depth in the section on child participation. In selected programmes, children were consulted as part of a needs assessment, they were engaged in the form of children’s clubs and other structures, or they assumed active roles in implementing awareness-raising and peer-to-peer counselling programmes. The extent to which this was meaningful participation varied across the programmes. For example, with reference to Thailand it was noted that “There is currently little evidence of engagement of children and youth in the development of plans outside of arrangements for public hearings”. In Colombia it was held that children are not involved in the design process, but their ideas and opinions are taken into account in implementation. The evaluator recommended the establishment of more explicit mechanisms to ensure child participation. Child participation has been discussed in detail in previous sections.

##### 4.6.2.2 Consultation of parents and caregivers
A number of gaps were identified in relation to the consultation of parents and caregivers in programming. In a programme targeting violence in schools in Serbia, cooperation with parents was reduced to parent-teacher meetings. This is partly because there is no active inclusion of parents in school life and there is the belief that parents shouldn’t ‘meddle’ in education. In a child labour mitigation programme in Morocco, the evaluator stated that attention is directed at the child worker and to some extent the employer, but the family is excluded. Information dissemination and awareness-raising with families did not receive as much attention as social workers, educators and partners. Group meetings were held with partners, but no regular visits to individual families were planned. It was argued that parents should be

---

1181 Ibid.
1183 Ibid.
1185 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
engaged in the design and implementation of this programme as they have such an influence over children’s engagement in labour practices.\textsuperscript{1187}

### 4.6.2.3 Consultation of community

#### Table 54: Examples of community consultation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Level of engagement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>After Positive Deviants (community volunteers) were identified, they were interviewed and the information was used to plan awareness activities. In a workshop with community-based counter- FGM/C teams, Action Plans appropriate to each community are developed.\textsuperscript{1188}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swaziland</td>
<td>Community-based child protection</td>
<td>Communities themselves have identified vulnerable children as those who are heading households, caring for the sick family members, dropped out of school, and especially those who have been exposed to and continue to be at risk of physical and sexual abuse.\textsuperscript{1189}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Community-based child protection</td>
<td>Communities and young people were involved in discussing research findings with teams of Child Protection Advocates to develop a mobilization strategy.\textsuperscript{1190}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Cluster coordinators were selected from within the programme area thereby enabling close community level interactions especially on sensitive issues such as girl child labour. A local resource group sensitive on issues of child labour and adolescent girls was created, including the children, parents and community, employers, government officials and the school system.\textsuperscript{1191}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Child protection and child trafficking</td>
<td>The Delter Centre which provided HIV/AIDS testing and counselling to children worked closely with support groups in the community known as ‘Comforters’. The centre therefore made use of existing resources within the community to plan their activities.\textsuperscript{1192}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The experiences and opinions of the communities were taken into account when planning the intervention. It was necessary to take their experiences and opinions into account to adapt the programmes to the socio-cultural context.\textsuperscript{1193}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>From the early humanitarian phase, UNICEF’s strategy in Kitgum was marked by efforts to promote community participation in identifying needs, and in planning, implementing and monitoring programmes. This is evidenced in the web of volunteer committees for health, school management, child protection, water source maintenance, etc. Given the negative effect of conflict on cultural systems of leadership and community consultation,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{1187} Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.  
\textsuperscript{1189} Evaluation of Lihombe Lekukhalela (Child Protectors). Swaziland. 2005.  
\textsuperscript{1190} Community-based child protection programme evaluation and review. Tirana Hassan. Somalia. 2006.  
\textsuperscript{1192} Evaluation of UNICEFs SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fafo AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina Faso. 2007.  
\textsuperscript{1193} Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups'. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
UNICEF encouraged partners to be sensitive to this and engage traditional leadership as much as possible. It also promoted consultation of women and youth. UNICEF also encouraged communities to have a voice in deciding which areas were safe for return.\textsuperscript{1194}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>There was extensive involvement of the Diaspora Somalis in the initial pilot phase of the programme. In addition, Somali actors from different backgrounds (including Board Members, community elders, women and youth groups, Somalia professionals and business people) were involved in various capacities during the implementation process including selection and recruitment of trainees and trainers, selection of local implementing partners and development of guiding principles and policies.\textsuperscript{1195}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>The behaviour change programme was locally owned and implemented. Its success was based on the capacities and enthusiasm of local people, with strong, coherent technical support.\textsuperscript{1196}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The programme fostered community commitment and ownership through the creation of Community Management Committees, who were responsible for mobilizing community members to engage in a human rights education programme.\textsuperscript{1197}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The evaluator found that high levels of women participate in the programme activities, and that this was an indicator of success in the community. In addition, a Community Management Committee (CGC) composed of 17 members chosen by the community themselves, assisted in the design and implementation of programme activities in the village and neighbouring villages (including literacy classes, health and hygiene, income generation activities etc.). It met twice a month to discuss progress and follow-up, and participates in a Federation of CGC in the area.\textsuperscript{1198}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Challenges, constraints and gaps:**

- The development and implementation of a local level strategy based on community participation emerged as a gap in Bangladesh.\textsuperscript{1199}
- The programme targeting violence in schools in Serbia was criticized for failing to engage with the community. Reasons for this include time and resource constraints on the side of the schools, requests by community members for payment for participation, and reluctance from the community.\textsuperscript{1200}
- The evaluator of the New Delhi programme stated that the programme should have considered developing child protection structures at the level of the village to encourage community participation. The evaluator suggested establishing an advisory group who could assist in facilitating the engagement and empowerment of the community. In addition, staff should interact

\textsuperscript{1197} Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.  
\textsuperscript{1198} Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviors in Rural Areas of Senegal. Senegal.  
\textsuperscript{1200} Evaluation of “School Without Violence” Strategic Marketing Research. Serbia. 2009.
more on a sustained basis with other organizations, individuals and empowered community level structures working on similar issues.1201  

- In another programme in Bangladesh, it was held that social mobilization and community engagement did not receive due priority. Committees were formed at the community level but many are inactive.1202  
- The evaluator of the mine action programme in Senegal castigated the programme for failing to adequately involve community representatives when MRE messages and material were developed. Instead, community members, students and teachers have assumed the role of passive recipients of educational programmes.1203  
- In Algeria, it was held that community participation in programme planning and decision making should have been encouraged in order to enhance relevance and efficiency. One of the challenges encountered was the difficult process of winning the community’s trust. At the very least, the evaluator recommended that the community should be engaged to evaluate the programmes1204  
- The programme in Uganda found it difficult to promote participation in an emergency context where many agencies are focusing exclusively on the delivery of humanitarian aid, and where many cultural systems of leadership and community consultation have broken down.1205  
- The evaluator of the Somalia programme found that there were high levels of participation in the pilot and development phase of the programme, but in general there was no documentary evidence to substantiate UNICEF’s claim that they have ensured local ownership and active community participation.1206  
- In the Maldives, it was found that there was an imbalance in national level human and financial investments compared to civil society investments. This was influenced by the absence of NGOs or competent academic institutions which could play a role in assessments and programme planning.1207  
- In Sri Lanka, it was found that government, UNICEF and NGO actors designed and implemented community programmes for beneficiaries, rather than mobilizing existing community resources to implement activities themselves. This led to low levels of community ownership of children’s clubs and other village based programmes.1208  
- In The Comoros it was found that the listening service had not engaged enough community development associations to assist in design and implementation of awareness-raising on child abuse.1209

4.6.2.4 Consultation of NGOs and CSOs

Lessons:

- It is useful to synchronize approach and strategy with other international and non-government organizations as was undertaken by the UNICEF Bangladesh Country Office with the UNCRC.1210  
  In Jamaica it was found that whilst child abuse cases are referred to other agencies, they do tend...
to operate independently of each other and a truly multi-agency approach to child protection based on a shared philosophy and inter-dependency is needed.\textsuperscript{1211}

- National coordination mechanisms which gather all government actors, NGOs and development partners are a good platform for advocacy, fundraising, harmonizing interventions, reviewing communication and training tools.\textsuperscript{1212}
- It is often better to use tools developed by another organization that service providers and children are already familiar with, than develop new tools. For example, in New Delhi it was decided to use ASER tools developed by Pratham which were being used across the country. Teachers in the selected school were also quite comfortable with the use of the ASER tools and felt they were quite appropriate. Children were enthusiastic to take the test.\textsuperscript{1213}
- When developing awareness-raising and advocacy campaigns it is essential to harmonize tools and messages with other organizations.\textsuperscript{1214}
- It is necessary to engage specialized NGOs and academic institutions who have sufficient experience and internal capacity to enhance the reach and effectiveness of the programmes.\textsuperscript{1215}
- In order to enhance community-receptiveness, it is necessary for child protection programmes to work closely with social protection and humanitarian programmes which are being implemented by other organizations. For example, in Senegal the programme worked closely with organizations distributing malaria prevention nets.\textsuperscript{1216}

4.6.2.5 Consultation of government

Gaps, challenges and constraints:
- In Morocco, the strong involvement of the delegation of the Ministry of Education led to delays in payments and cumbersome administrative management of non-formal education programmes. In addition, although the Ministry of Health was identified as the lead actor, it did not demonstrate effective involvement in the programme.\textsuperscript{1217}
- Limited institutional capacity, and in particular a shortage of financial and material resources hindered the extent to which the government could be engaged to implement certain activities, as was evident in Bangladesh, Mauritania and Zimbabwe.\textsuperscript{1218}
- In Nepal it was felt that international staff members of the Working Group were trying to push the programme into adopting an ‘African model’. This hindered constructive dialogue.\textsuperscript{1219}

Lessons:
- It is important to integrate projects and programmes into the national strategy. For example, in the Comoros child abuse services were integrated in the activities of the National Centre for Observation and for Integration of Vulnerable Children (CNOIEV), which aimed to work with organizations that deal with child protection.\textsuperscript{1220}
- It is useful to situate the management of programmes formally within government departments to ensure greater buy-in, ownership and sustainability.\textsuperscript{1221}

\textsuperscript{1211} Assessment of the Child Abuse Mitigation Project at the Bustamante Hospital for Children (C.A.M.P. Bustamante). UNICEF & The National Health Fund, Jamaica. 2008.
\textsuperscript{1212} Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
\textsuperscript{1214} Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
\textsuperscript{1215} Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
\textsuperscript{1216} Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviors in Rural Areas of Senegal. Senegal.
\textsuperscript{1217} Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
\textsuperscript{1220} Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
• It is important to use – and strengthen - existing national coordination mechanisms, working groups and consultation workshops to meet regularly in order to design, implement, monitor and evaluate programmes. However, it is important to remember that consulting all programme stakeholders with the hope of achieving consensus may lead to programme delays.

4.6.2.6 Consultation of other donors

Lessons:
• It is important to engage in dialogue with donors who are funding other child protection programmes. In Nepal it was held that there was a missed opportunity to align UNICEF’s programme with the UNDP programme for the reintegration of adults, particularly those who are not eligible to join the national security system: “Tensions are likely to arise for ‘disqualified’ cadres when some see themselves as eligible for the UNDP Programme and others for the UNICEF programme when in fact they all consider themselves (rightly) as youth. This becomes particularly acute the longer the ex-combatants are held in the cantonments and the less information they receive from the respective agencies, due to lack of access to the cantonments”.

• It is necessary to prioritize the needs and rights of children over and above fundraising. As the evaluator of the child trafficking prevention programme in Nigeria stated, “Unfortunately, donors have been reluctant to support this type of preventive programme due to their lower profile: no traumatized victims can be put on display, there is no drama. It is therefore encouraging that UNICEF Nigeria has resisted the temptation to please potential donors, and argued for an approach that is likely to be more sustainable than most rescue-and-rehabilitation programmes have turned out to be. It is also encouraging that SIDA has chosen to support this programme”.

• It is necessary to harness the advocacy role that donors can play. It was held that donors in Nepal are ‘under-utilized’. They provide financial support, but could do more in their capacity as the diplomatic community to advocate for legal policy reform.

• It is important to clarify the added value of donors funding UNICEF instead of implementing organizations they could fund directly.

• Reporting to other donors: The evaluator of the Iraq office stated that an additional person should have been assigned to the UNICEF Country Office, because donor reporting, especially to USAID, suffered as a result of inadequate staffing. With reference to Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao, it was held that most donors are satisfied with narrative performance reporting but that a more systems-based approach to effectiveness and impact will be required to justify funds.

• Donor funding coordination: The Zimbabwean Programme of Support (POS) provides a good example of how donors can work together in a ‘fragile state’ context. Fora, such as monthly meetings of the OECD-OVC Group and the Joint Annual Review (JAR) exercise, encouraged strong coordination and mutual accountability.

• Within UNICEF there should be collaboration and coordination around complementary programmes. For instance, in Nepal the CAAFAG is a protection programme with an education

1222 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
component. The Education section mainly supports the Ministry of Education, while the CAAFAG programme gives indirect support to children through individual schools. These are seen as complementary activities. However, the evaluator recommends greater collaboration between the Child Protection division and Water and Sanitation (WASH); the latter could support communities where the programme is conducting sensitization programmes or where interim care centres are based.\textsuperscript{1231}

4.7 Efficiency

4.7.1 Introduction

Efficiency refers to how economically resources or inputs can be converted into results. This section focuses on time, funding and coordination issues in relation to the programmes under review.

4.7.2 Timeliness

Delays were caused in the programmes under review due in part to poorly planned work plans. It was held that some work plans did not set out a specific timeframe with specific deadlines for each of the activities.\textsuperscript{1232} In other cases, the timeframe was unrealistic given the complexity of the various components of the programme\textsuperscript{1233} and limited institutional capacity (resource allocations, technical ability and availability).\textsuperscript{1234}

Evidence-based planning has also affected the efficiency of programme. Research and the editing process caused delays in the design and implementation of programme in Mauritania and Marrakesh.\textsuperscript{1235}

Reference was also made to procedural delays in the implementation of programme components. The identification of partners, negotiation with counterparts and the approval of contracts due to UNICEF internal procedures caused delays in Azerbaijan.\textsuperscript{1236} Contractual issues caused a delay of 18 months in the starting programme in Bangladesh, which in turn affected the timeliness of the entire programme, affected the sequence of activities, the effectiveness of the social mobilization and training component, and the extent to which the budget was fully utilized.\textsuperscript{1237}

Efficiency was also affected by human resource challenges. Evaluators referred to the limited capacity of UNICEF staff, partner NGOs and volunteers in terms of expertise, skills and time as constraints on efficiency.\textsuperscript{1238} In Colombia, it was held that only 20% of activities were implemented, 36% were in progress and 44% had not been implemented, largely because of human resource shortages and short work contracts.\textsuperscript{1239}

\textsuperscript{1235} Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions. Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakesh.
\textsuperscript{1239} Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
Delays were also caused by coordination challenges. In Tajikistan changes in the nature and composition of the Mobile Group (from government officials and stakeholders, to international students) meant that some challenges took longer than necessary to address. Defining the mandate, accountability and membership of the Coordination Council in Azerbaijan hindered the efficiency of technical components of the programme. These coordination challenges meant that it took time to approve activities. This was exacerbated by the fact that obtaining consensus in a multi-sectoral coordination forum is a timely process.

In Cambodia and the Maldives, environmental and infrastructure factors impacted on the timely completion of programme activities. In terms of the latter, logistical challenges caused delays in providing psychosocial services to the communities most affected by the Tsunami. In terms of the former, limited electricity, telephone access, poor road systems, and rainy weather made it difficult to make regular planned visits to districts or phone ahead to make sure that clients are available.

Security issues also led to irregular visits to local communities. In Vietnam social workers stated that they felt unsafe travelling long distances alone, visiting clients in overpopulated slums and using their own motorbikes which could be stolen.

Delays were also caused by financial management challenges. In Bosnia Herzegovina, delays in financing shortened the length of programmes and in turn adversely affected the quality of outputs. Late disbursement of funds from UNICEF was also highlighted as a challenge hindering the child protection programme in Gambia and Colombia. The programme in Morocco was also fraught by cumbersome administrative and financial management of the programme, and delays in disbursement. This led to reluctance from decentralized state agencies to engage with the programme and meant that the programme took an additional two years to complete.

Efficiency was also affected by external factors such as uncertainty about the release of children from cantonments in Nepal. Extensive time and resources were spent on preparing for the release of these children associated with the armed forces, but due to government resistance these efforts often amounted to nothing. This in turn affected the credibility of the programme, the availability of staff, the motivation of staff and the timing of programme activities.

The transition from an emergency to a post-emergency context also affected the efficiency of programmes. In Iraq, UNICEF staff was “slow to adjust its response” to the post-war context; this led to delays in programming for child protection. In Sri Lanka, UNICEF was able to make this transition efficiently because it had linked the dual objectives of responding to the immediate needs of vulnerable children and systems-building for all children in its log frame.

### 4.7.3 Cost

1247 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
1248 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
4.7.3.1 Costing of child protection programme and services

Strategic decisions:
Programmes that try to maximize the utilization of relatively scarce resources make strategic decisions about which objectives to achieve. As an evaluator stated, “Unless one chooses to do a little of everything, some hard choices must be considered”. Programmes that involve identification, assistance, return and reintegration activities should ensure that each phase has a clear budget to address limitations in logistics and facilities; for instance, short and long term reintegration activities are often neglected at a budgetary level. Follow-up of cases are often not included in programme budgets, thereby impacting on the provision of quality services. Activities to engage with the family were limited in Nicaragua due to limited financial resources.

In order to ensure quality services it may be necessary to focus on selected larger activities as small activities tend to increase administrative costs at the expense of results for children. On the other hand, focusing only on a few interventions poses the risk of neglecting important priorities. It was argued that the programme in Burkina Faso and Mali tried to undertake too many activities within a limited budget, with detrimental effects on programme reach and quality.

Hardware and software investments:
Fundraising around broader prevention initiatives such as eliminating urban-rural and socio-economic disparity is more difficult than fundraising for specific and more tangible activities, such as modifying the living environment to make it safer for children. This speaks to the larger point that hardware investments (e.g. in buildings, vehicles and electronic equipment) which are tangible are often preferred by aid agencies and donors to ‘software’ (e.g. communication costs to strengthen the community’s response to child protection). This explains why social mobilization components or behaviour change communication programming are often inadequately funded. In Vietnam, the evaluator recommended that district mobile teams and child participation activities in schools be stopped given their cost; these are certainly less tangible activities than training, television broadcasts, radio and IEC materials. It also suggests that social mobilization campaigns need to be reconceptualised to tap into the process of participatory community development; in Mauritania, Tostan reached 78 communities with a budget that was initially thought to reach 30 communities only.

It is important to note that in Zimbabwe, NGOs implementing softer demand-driven services such as counselling, reunification of children and provision of psychosocial support and treatment to child victims of sexual abuse had higher unit costs than supply-driven and hardware type interventions (food and nutrition, educational support). This is not surprising given that activities that involve face to face interaction need greater resources for staffing costs. For example, the street children programme in Lao PDR dedicated 40% of their total expenditure to staffing costs.

References:

1260 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
It does, however, mean that hardware activities are favoured by donors. It also means that certain approaches are selected over more effective and sustainable strategies. The centre based approach is more expensive than outreach approaches and has limited coverage, but is easier to implement because it does not require a serious, challenging and long process of social preparation and is not as heavily dependent on the presence of a dedicated, patient and skilled community organizer. For example, the Nigeria programme was structured around a centre-based model over a model that makes use of traditional training opportunities in local business. This was a costly approach for the trainees, who were isolated from networks and labour markets and as a result, could not find employment. In addition, tying up resources in the centre limited the programme from engaging in other activities like outreach.

The cost efficiency of prevention programme vis-à-vis direct assistance:
The cost efficiency of prevention versus direct assistance is a matter of debate. The evaluator of the Nigeria and Mali programmes stated that prevention activities are more cost efficient when compared to the expensive process of intercepting children and returning them home. The same amount of money would have prevented many children from ending up in a situation of vulnerability. The Nigeria programme was commended for prioritizing prevention. In contrast, the evaluator of mine action programmes in Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Laos stated that UNICEF needs to shift from prevention and MRE to victim assistance; the latter has been neglected due to a lack of traditional mine action donor interest and lack of disability experience within UNICEF. In Burkina Faso the decision was made to invest in prevention activities such as communications activities, sensitization campaigns and equipment, at the expense of quality services to child victims of abuse, exploitation and trafficking. The evaluator argued that this strategic decision should be reconsidered. In some cases, objectives pertaining to family strengthening and engagement with parents for prevention purposes are often not met because of a decision to focus on direct assistance to children. This is short sighted considering the family is an essential protective environment for children and has a significant influence over children’s decision-making, risk and resiliency.

Efforts should be made to calculate the savings that can be made from prevention programmes; for example, in Jamaica it was held that if Camp Bustamante prevents approximately 300 cases ending up in children’s homes for one year, this represents a saving to the government of J$180 million for that period. This could be used to advocate for additional funds as it suggests that an investment in child abuse mitigation programmes at hospitals will be money well spent.

Equity and fairness should be considered when advocating for additional funds. For instance, in Nigeria the evaluator argued that the 18,000 children who benefited from the vocational training programme constitute the tip of the iceberg of vulnerable children. For a government to give benefits to such a few would trigger accusations of unfairness. So in order to legitimize public spending, the target group should be as large as possible and the costs as low as possible relative to the preventative impact obtained. The evaluator of the justice programme in Mongolia stated that based on the numbers of children in conflict with the law alone, it is difficult to justify the costs of the programme; however, the demonstrable impact and outcomes of the programme and broad reach of the Juvenile Justice Committee offers a
strong justification for the structural investments to date. The programme can be described as relatively 
cost efficient because it serves as a basis for future justice reform and child protection systems. This 
therefore, the fact that this programme builds future systems (and in turn will prevent countless children 
from engaging in activities in conflict with the law and will assist countless children in conflict with the law) 
rather than assisting a small number of children in the short term, makes a stronger case for financial 
investments.

Targeting the most vulnerable may increase the preventative impact, but it is also important to note that 
targeting is an expensive activity that requires increased research and administration (e.g. setting and 
managing programme eligibility criteria). It will also require investment in outreach activities to identify 
vulnerable and marginalized children. In Nigeria, it was held that outreach activities in the communities 
are conducted on an irregular basis because they are so dependent on available funding. The evaluator 
argues that the relevance of outreach activities relative to the added value they provide in reaching the 
most vulnerable needs to be considered. If indeed children and youth in more remote communities are 
found to be more vulnerable, outreach activities should be sufficiently funded and regularized.

Human resources:
Salaries should be carefully considered, particularly when programme social workers work alongside 
government social workers. For instance, in Cambodia the salary for the former is US$60 and the latter 
US$15. On this programme a staff member at national level or working in the transit centre receives a full 
salary of up to US$120, while a social worker who provides reintegration and follow-up services receives 
only a daily subsistence allowance. This led to tension on the programme. Some evaluators noted that 
government staff resigned from their posts to join NGOs who paid higher salaries.

The decision to use international consultants and implementing agencies should be justified; in some 
cases they constitute a large portion of the total budget. For example, in Azerbaijan 60% of the total 
budget was allocated to human resources. It was argued that it was justifiable to select international 
agencies because there is little expertise in country and the intervention was planned to be highly 
innovative. In addition, it was held that international consultants with a proven track record are attributed a 
high level of authority and respect from national stakeholders.

Partnerships:
The involvement of numerous partners increases the amount of time and resources that need to be spent 
on for the administration of a programme; for instance, to ensure compliance with the management of 
contracts required by UNICEF. Sustainability requires cost sharing arrangements with donors and 
government authorities and other local stakeholders. The partnership of organizations and UNICEF 
strengthen the capacity of all parties to mobilize the support of other stakeholders for child protection; 
however, there needs to be transparency and accountability in cost sharing arrangements so that it can 
be determined whether funding has been provided and spent for the intended purpose. Even though 
programmes may spend significant portions of their budgets on coordination (e.g. investment in 
coordination meetings at community, regional and national levels), the results might not reflect this 
investment given overarching gaps in coordination mechanisms, systems and procedures, which are the 
responsibility of government and other stakeholders.

1271 Evaluation of UNICEF Mongolia’s Child Protection Programme: Juvenile Justice and legislative reform. Jane S. Kim and 
1272 Evaluation of UNICEF’s SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking programme in West Africa. Fafo AIS. Nigeria, Mali & Burkina 
Faso. 2007.
1273 Ibid.
1274 An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth 
1276 Ibid.
1278 Evaluation of the impact of rescue, recovery, healing and reintegration services for victims of child abuse and exploitation. 
Methodological challenges:
Many evaluators could not draw conclusions around cost because estimates provided by implementing agencies were not reliable; there was no data on indirect costs, societal costs, data regarding expenditures per budget line and per activity and the number of children/adults directly and indirectly affected by the programme. This hindered cost-efficiency analysis and prevented evaluators from making an estimate on the actual cost per child. Furthermore, cost efficient analysis also relies on comparisons in order to determine what approach achieves a specific desired outcome for the least possible cost. However, many evaluators did not have access to financial data from comparative programmes, thereby hindering cost efficiency analysis. In some cases, comparative programmes (e.g. alternative violence prevention programme) were not being implemented in the country. The evaluator of the Morocco programme stated that measuring investment versus results achieved is difficult because it is unknown whether the results will be sustainable, especially when it involves changing attitudes of children, families and employers.

4.7.3.2 Financial management
Challenges, constraints and gaps:
• Late entry by financial staff, resulting in late submission of reports.
• Clarity on the amount of cash on hand and on the balance of funds.
• Budget monitoring is conducted only by the Finance Manager and not by programme managers, making it difficult for them to monitor spending.
• Failure to conduct internal audits.
• Human resource challenges: for instance one manager was responsible for finance as well as HR issues and administration. Staff is occupied with routine tasks and have no capacity for financial analysis, cannot cope with the volume of transactions and the multiplicity of reports.
• Finance managers are not trained on UNICEF financial procedures and reporting.
• Narrative reports do not connect with or provide any interpretation of financial reports.
• Challenges installing and utilizing financial management software.
• Adapting a financial procedure system that was developed for another programme and donor, for a UNICEF supported programme.

1283 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
1285 Ibid.
1286 Ibid.
• Heavy demands for financial reporting, related to the fact that different formats are required by different donors.  
• Local NGO partners do not understand the funding disbursement procedures.  
• Transparency and accountability in selection of partners.  
• Disbursement of cash funds to local teams as this involved delays in fees, per diems and transportation.

4.7.3.3 Funding disbursement from donors

**Guidelines:** The absence of guidelines on how partners are expected to account and report the use of counterpart funding was raised as a challenge by the evaluator in the Philippines.  

**Funding procedures:** NGOs in Vietnam highlighted the complicated nature of financial procedures. In Bosnia Herzegovina the partners criticized UNICEF funding procedures and in particular the small size of funding (maximum of 10000KM for 6 months), which they argue would have been better spent in a smaller number of larger projects with a more realistic budget. Counterparts in certain provinces in Vietnam argued that the requirement to apply ‘bidding procedures’ for small purchases (such as buying knife shelves, well and water tank covers) was unnecessary. These procedures were negatively compared with more relaxed requirements employed by other donors such as PATH and FHA. Part of the problem lies with the fact that some partners have insufficient knowledge about accounting and financial procedures, and may for example not understand how to fill out a VAT invoice properly. Training was provided by UNICEF, but this was inadequate for participants who had no accounting and financial background. Complaints were also made about the way that UNICEF defined cost norms for selected programme activities: UNICEF took the lowest estimate as the ceiling cost for all provinces, regardless of the fact that the actual costs varied within and across provinces. Another issue that was raised as a concern pertains to procedures for the disbursement of daily subsistence allowance (DSA) and fuel; in Cambodia staff have to pay for this out of their own salaries but then have to wait for up to three months to be reimbursed. Rigidity of financing is problematic as it does not fit with an ever-changing social and economic environment. Targeted allocation of funds is crucial but should reflect the specificity of local needs rather than specific programme budget lines.

**Funding channels:** In Mali there was criticism that UNICEF support is directed largely through a government body rather than directly to civil society organizations. In Zimbabwe donor restrictions meant that direct support could only be given to civil society bodies that were in fact tasked with the role of coordinating the Programme of Support. This hindered the effectiveness of this programme. The evaluator stated that it is more expensive to use NGOs than government and it would have been better to build the capacity of government to implement programme, however, under the circumstances it was the only option available. A ‘shadow structure’ was created for resource management, which reduced the visibility of government and the donors at a time of growing international isolation of the government of Zimbabwe; however, it created an additional layer of bureaucracy and

---

1297 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.  
transaction costs, and reduced NGO accountability to government for quality programming. To overcome this, a dual accountability system was developed where NGOs were technically accountable to the government and financially accountable to UNICEF, but the latter overshadowed the former. Nevertheless, the evaluator commended the Programme of Support for becoming a ‘prototype’ for donor funding, allowing for a pooled funding arrangement for multiple donors for large-scale NGO grant management, under government leadership on policy development and programme coordination, and UNICEF technical support and leading role as fund manager.

Delays in disbursement: Delays in disbursement of funds also affected implementation in a number of programmes. In Zimbabwe this was related to hyper-inflation, unstable monetary policies and distorted exchange rates; 46% of disbursements made under the POS during the period April 2007-September 2009 were not liquidated on time (within 6 months) and this hindered further disbursements.

Procurement: The example of Zimbabwe reveals the extent to which UNICEF can adapt rigid internationally accepted procurement standards and funding procedures to ensure value for money and sound financial management in an unstable economic climate. Through centralized procurement of equipment and supplies it secured savings, but this caused major challenges as some partners only received materials and vehicles in the second year.

Infrastructure: Challenges with infrastructure also affected the disbursement of funding. For instance, in Senegal the CGC opened a savings account at the local bank. Transportation costs to visit the bank twice a month, combined with seasonal difficulties meant that the savings account was not used and activities in one village had to cease.

Reporting: Concerns were raised about the quality and timeliness of partner’s reporting to UNICEF in Ethiopia since 2000; however, UNICEF has done little to correct them. This speaks to UNICEF’s failure to provide direct support to partners to improve programme management.

Under-spent is related to limited institutional capacity to undertake an activity, lack of understanding of how to meet an objective. For example in Bangladesh only 9% of the budget for advocacy was spent because it was interpreted narrowly as the observance of national days.

Diversity of funding: Many programmes are jointly funded by UNICEF and other donors. This has caused challenges as organizations often cannot cope with different procedures for different donors for eligible expenses, conditions of engagement etc. This caused major programme delays because of the difficulties faced with administration and financial management.

Lack of resources: The Iraq CO turned down a number of proposals for additional assistance from HQ and the Regional Office. According to the evaluator this decision had an adverse impact on UNICEF’s planning and response. Decisions to suddenly reduce child protection budgets should be carefully

---

1307 Ibid.
1310 Ibid.
1311 Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviors in Rural Areas of Senegal. Senegal.
1314 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
considered in light of the devastating effects on existing child protection programmes, child protection systems development and its effect on perceptions of commitment and continuity.1316

Ownership: Given the fact that many government ministries and NGO partners are under-resourced, they are heavily dependent on UNICEF funding.1317 This leads to questions about ownership and sustainability. For example in Serbia and Mongolia the programme is generally perceived as UNICEF-owned.1318

4.7.4 Programme Coordination
In terms of programme coordination, this section focuses on UNICEF’s partnerships with NGOs and CSOs.

4.7.4.1 Partnership with NGOs and CSOs

Identification, selection and contractual arrangements

Table 55: Identification, selection and contractual arrangements with NGO partners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>The programme was implemented by 4 partner NGOs (PNGOs) working with 20 local NGOs (LNGOs) in 40 communities. Selection of LNGOs was based on the following criteria: enthusiasm for the programme; ability to implement it; credibility and standing in community; prior/current experience with health, education or other social programmes; ability to commit to a two year programme; ability to generate funds for sustainability and previous experience with CEDPA programmes.1319</td>
<td>Some concerns were raised about the selection process (see discussion)1320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>National programme partners were selected by UNICEF and international NGO partners. Selection was based on the NGO’s capacity, ability to deal with sensitive issues and establishment within the community.</td>
<td>The evaluator applauded the selection process in terms of selecting high calibre partners and staff who showed high degrees of commitment and dedication, in depth knowledge of Nepal and the impact of conflict on children and their families.1321</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1319 ibid (as footnote 1322).
### Somalia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>children affected by armed conflict</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The local partner (IIDA) was selected based on its track record, credibility and previous related work. EPC also selected a youth organization (Kanava) in Kismayu. A women-based organization (HINNA) was selected because of their reputation and influence in local communities. The NGO Somali Peace Line (SPL) was selected due to their experience in peace-related issues and their informal network of contacts with militia groups and clan based faction leaders in Mogadishu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanava extended the programme reach to Kismayu upon UNICEF’s request, despite concerns raised by EPC about the security situation and ethnic tension. HINNA managed to support EPC in releasing child combatants from several freelance militias. SPL assisted in the release of child combatants. The evaluator observed that HINNA and SPL assisted in fostering an enabling environment for this release.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Sri Lanka

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tsunami</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF capitalized on existing partnerships with child protection NGOs to identify separated and unaccompanied children, and trace family members. UNICEF identified partners from pre-existing child protection programmes in conflict-affected North and East. Within a week it established partnerships in the South.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Within two months, UNICEF developed 60 agreements with NGO partners to promote resilience and recovery. It received and reviewed 23 proposals from NGOs and mental health services. The evaluator notes that UNICEF and its partners built on existing capacity and infrastructure and thereby strengthened community interventions.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Zimbabwe

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Child protection systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF used a flood gate system for the call for concept notes. Selection was made on the basis of geographic and thematic coverage. UNICEF provided hands-on technical support to NGOs with ‘promising programmes’ during the selection process. In addition, they provided generic training on programme proposal writing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The flood gate system was well received by NGOs and perceived as transparent. The hands on support that was provided during the selection process, was appreciated by NGOs as having improved the quality of programme design.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Different methods were used in the selection of partners:

- Build on existing partnerships in different programmes;
- Develop criteria regarding the capacity, experience and commitment of partners;
- Selection based on geographic coverage;

---

1324 Ibid.
• Open flood gate system based on an open and transparent call for proposals.

Challenges and concerns with the selection methods include:

Selection criteria: In Upper Egypt, the evaluator notes that a number of NGOs were selected even though they had limited capacity, the composition of their board may have been a conflict of interest, and they were not fully committed to the issue (the example of one NGO board member practicing circumcision was provided). The evaluator attributes this to a failure to adequately specify selection criteria and the fact that PNGOs (who selected the NGOs) did not fully understand the requirements. The evaluator of the Zimbabwe programme stated that although guidelines accompanied the first call for proposals, they could have better targeted NGO competences and thematic and geographic coverage using more focused and customized selection criteria to avoid poor performing partners.

Institutional assessments: In Somalia, the evaluator stated that UNICEF had clearly defined selection criteria but had failed to conduct an institutional assessment of IIDA. The evaluator of the Zimbabwe programme applauded the hands on support provided during the selection process, but stated that this did not translate into quality interventions because many NGOs simply lacked implementation capacity, information on best practices and an internal monitoring and supervision structure. An institutional assessment would have improved the selection process.

Contractual relationship: The evaluator of the child labour programme in Bangladesh stated that partner NGOs were only seen as ‘contractors’ rather than ‘real partners’ in contractual and implementation terms. This affected levels of commitment and performance.

Role and responsibilities:

In terms of the delegation of roles and responsibilities with NGO partners, the following was observed:

Role clarity: With reference to the Tostan programme in the Gambia, the evaluator notes that the roles and responsibilities of NGO partners should be clarified and set out clearly in the Memorandum of Understanding. This was reiterated by the evaluator of the Upper Egypt programme who stated that communication and a clearer delineation of roles and responsibilities between NGOs and Partner NGOs should be undertaken. In the Philippines there was great confusion as to the role and mandate of the task forces in relation to the working committees in terms of whether they provide direct services or play a supporting role in coordination, networking and fund raising.

In Azerbaijan the lack of clarity on the responsibilities of the two key actors who were involved in coordination, had a negative effect on the technical components of the programme. This is evident in the fact that The Coordination Council met only once in 2007 and that the only activity that was implemented was the preparation of a single report on the monitoring mission in institutions. Furthermore, the 7 Technical Working Groups did not have an approved terms of reference which hindered their efficiency. In Jamaica the Technical Working Group responsible for developing the Camp Bustamante

programme did not have a terms of reference; many saw it as an advisory group while in the original programme document UNICEF perceived it to be a multi-agency programme management structure.\textsuperscript{1335}

The relationship between partners in the Comoros was strained because of a confusion of roles and missions.\textsuperscript{1336} In Morocco a number of activities were cancelled due to low levels of coordination among local partners. Reasons for this include the lack of authority and administrative/policy legitimacy of the lead partner to ensure active and consistent involvement of service providers at decentralized levels.\textsuperscript{1337}

The relationship between NGOs and government service providers was often poor. In Cambodia despite a clear delegation of roles and responsibilities, NGOs would often undertake all the activities associated with the return and reintegration process (family tracing, family assessment, reintegration and follow-up), with sub-national government authorities only stepping in during the follow-up stage.\textsuperscript{1338}

\textit{Capacity strengthening of NGO and CSO partners:}

**Table 56: Capacity strengthening of NGO partners: selected examples**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Local NGOs received training on communication and interpersonal skills.</td>
<td>The evaluator applauded the programme for creating an enabling environment where NGO staff could debate issues among themselves and then with the rest of the community. There were, however, a number of gaps in capacity building activities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child protection</td>
<td>Support was provided to Women’s Associations at all levels during the programme implementation period. Support included organized trainings for members, which integrates family law, women’s rights, family planning and access to education.</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that with this guidance, the associations started to support and act towards the protection of the rights of women and enforcement of family laws and penal codes on HTP and VAW. These associations are involved in advocating for family law and are able to provide counselling support to their members.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Gambia</td>
<td>Child protection</td>
<td>The strategy was to train and coach a local NGO to be able to implement the programme independently after the first implementation cycle. The two partner NGOs will also contribute their knowledge of communities and culture. In addition to training of one person from each of the two local NGOs</td>
<td>The evaluator raised major concerns about the capacity building component of this programme as will be discussed in the sections below.\textsuperscript{1341}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Issue</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Findings/Results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>UNICEF provided support to different local NGOs who run different but overlapping programmes for child domestic workers.</td>
<td>The financial support has enabled the NGOs to provide literacy classes and training on reproductive health.(^{1342})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>In order to strengthen the participation of civil society, a number of activities were undertaken: establishment of a forum for the networking of Somali community based organizations and local NGOs; conducting workshops in each of the three programme site cities; establishment and support of vulnerable children; establishment and support of three Resource Centres to mobilize communities and stakeholders.</td>
<td>Results unclear.(^{1343})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>The programme strengthened civil society by establishing and supporting NGOs that address child protection and wellbeing concerns; strengthening links between civil society and government at national, atoll capital and island levels.</td>
<td>As part of a return to development-focused work in 2006, UNICEF’s Child Protection programme nearly doubled its implementing partners, including government and NGOs. The evaluator found that 14 of 32 Malé-based NGOs, focused on the child and/or drug related issues. Of the 14, 4 had suspended operations at the time of the evaluation. 7 out of 14 NGOs that were formed after the Tsunami, four (57%) are not active. 14% of the NGOs outside of Malé were registered post-Tsunami. 45% of these are no longer active. Lack of internal capacity and financial support for the civil society sector led to a decrease in the number of active NGOs. In addition, there have been decreased NGO-government activities, partly due to the political transition. Child protection related.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>Child protection systems</td>
<td>In order to increase the capacity of NGO partners, UNICEF has run a programme of capacity building courses for its NGO partners since Year 1. These cover ten areas: OVC programming skills; programme cycle management; partner management and development; managerial effectiveness, governance and leadership; gender mainstreaming; child protection and participation mainstreaming; rights based approaches; information sharing; strategic planning; finance and administration; and monitoring and evaluation (M&amp;E). UNICEF has also produced an interactive DVD library of capacity development resource materials, for use by partners and others, and ran training of trainers courses.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>UNICEF strengthened the capacity of civil society organizations working with children by involving implementing partners in all phases of the programme, from planning to implementation.</td>
<td>The evaluator notes that this approach was successful in increasing the capacity of partners to deliver services and advocate for children’s rights.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Capacity development of partner NGOs through training and in-country exchanges.</td>
<td>According to the evaluator, this component was highly relevant. However, it was thwarted by delays in the programme, which meant that programme management was focusing on implementation and capacity building simultaneously – the former was neglected, leaving few</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Activity Description</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Mine risk education</td>
<td>Capacity development activities were undertaken at national, regional and local levels involving formal workshops and informal trainings. These workshops addressed programme planning, management, coordination, monitoring and evaluation.</td>
<td>Results unclear.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>One educator and one local person from each partner organization were trained.</td>
<td>Capacity building of partner organizations was successful in that it trained the educators, equipped facilities dedicated to programme activities, and expanded their outreach to children in the workplace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Staff was trained in 4 national workshops in 2008 and 2 additional training workshops in 2009.</td>
<td>The training was described as adequate but insufficient in terms of content.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Challenges, constraints and gaps:**

*Capacity:* the evaluator of the Zimbabwe programme described the multi-stakeholder institutional arrangements as effective in terms of promoting good interaction and cooperation, broad-based ownership and flexibility. However, many civil society organizations were not able to fulfil their roles and responsibilities due to capacity constraints.

*Strategic orientation:* the evaluator of a programme in Bangladesh stated that NGOs have been contracted to implement particular components of the programme but are not oriented to the broader mission of the programme. They need to develop strategies to adopt a rights-based approach and advocate for greater government responsiveness.

*Training content gaps:* The evaluator of the Upper Egypt programme noted the following training gaps as having compromised the efficiency of the programme: administrative and managerial skills; financial and accounting skills; computer skills and advocacy. In Ethiopia the training gap was lobbying on gender issues. In Bangladesh, NGO managerial skills were identified as another barrier to effectiveness. In Liberia, it was held that more efforts need to be oriented around building the capacity of organizations to

---

1348 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
1349 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
sustain the services after funding is suspended. In Ethiopia, gaps were identified in terms of programme planning, systematic monitoring of MRE activities and risk taking behaviour, coordination with other actors and the mobilization of resources for future programme interventions. In Morocco the evaluator stated that cross-cutting issues such as monitoring, communication and partnership should be addressed in training workshops. In Colombia, the gaps included gender, human rights, public policy, group facilitation, research tools, family interventions, psychosocial support to beneficiaries and staff.

**Training approaches:** In Zimbabwe, the challenge lay in cascading information from primary NGOs to their sub-grantees (SG) in a ‘training of trainers’ approach. There were a number of challenges with this: there was no quota on training courses for staff of SGs; NGOs offered few places to their SGs; many SGs were informed of the training at short notice; the training was not adapted to suit the basic needs of the SGs; the cascading approach was not systematically followed. In addition, the Programme of Support emphasized top down learning in the form of training courses rather than horizontal learning (e.g. sharing of good practices, visits to other programmes, follow-up visits to the organizations after the training). Furthermore, the evaluator stated that the capacity building programme was not tailored to the training needs of each partner organization. Mentoring and coaching was recommended. The evaluator of the Morocco programme recommended partnerships with national universities to assist in developing and implementing trainings.

**Reach:** With reference to Morocco, the evaluator noted that the reach of capacity building efforts should be expanded from individual NGOs to a network of NGOs in order to allow for continuity of services to the child, family and employer.

**Mentoring:** In Nepal NGO staff stated that they have had sufficient formal training and would prefer to move towards mentoring and ‘on the job’ learning. It was noted that information and experience of international NGOs are not always transmitted to local NGOs because of budgetary and travel constraints that hinder international staff’s ability to provide support in the field. As a result, UNICEF staff members have mentored national implementing partners of other international organizations. In Bangladesh, exchanges between different zones and cities were also recommended to facilitate the sharing of good practices.

**Human resources:** In Upper Egypt high staff turnover affected the capacity of NGOs to implement the programme. The evaluator attributed this to the movement of staff with new skills to better employment positions in other organizations. Turnover led to disruptions in the follow-up process, led to difficulty locating records and providing statistics and information on the status of target families. Similarly there was a loss of institutional memory due to high educator turn over in the Morocco programme. A lack of qualified staff and inadequate training and mentoring have also adversely affected the functioning of NGOs in the Maldives.

1357 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
1358 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
1360 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
1361 Ibid.
1365 Ibid.
1366 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
Commitment: In Upper Egypt, despite capacity building efforts, commitment varied due to the personal issues (e.g. marriage, pregnancy and migration), long working hours and harassment from community members who opposed the programme.1368

Funding issues: The evaluator of the Mali programme stated that criticism was levelled at the manner in which UNICEF’s support is directed to and through a government body (PNLE) rather than directly to support civil society organizations.1369 In Bangladesh, the evaluator stated that NGOs have not taken any initiative to start a strong advocacy programme due to the lack of financial incentives.1370 A decline of funding in post-Tsunami period contributed to reduced NGO activity in the Maldives.1371

Documentation and reporting: The evaluator of the West Africa programme stated that the extent to which NGOs supplied data varied. In some cases, they only presented a positive – rather than accurate - portrayal of their work.1372 The timeliness and quality of reporting has been identified as a concern for many years, but the evaluator notes that UNICEF in Ethiopia has done little in concrete terms to address this problem.1373

Monitoring and evaluation: In Bangladesh the evaluator notes that NGOs would perform better if there were transparent criteria against which their performance is judged. Greater accountability of NGOs is needed. The evaluator stated that ‘monitoring’ seems to be more trouble shooting than ongoing M&E.1374 Training was provided to partners on monitoring and implementing MRE activities, but the evaluator of the Ethiopian programme stated that due to poor managerial capacities and lack of understanding of data analysis methods, monitoring and evaluation has been poor.1375 With reference to the programme in the Gambia, the evaluator noted that the responsibilities of Tostan to the local NGOs were not articulated in contract documents. There was also no document that showed how Tostan was going to track the capacity building of the NGOs in the Tostan programme in terms of content, methodology and management. In terms of overall support, monitoring and evaluation there was hardly any interaction between the Tostan programme and the staff of the two local NGOs. This extended to the community level, where partnerships between the Tostan programme and the two local NGOs was not evident.1376

Evidence-based planning: The evaluator of the Bangladesh programme stated that a short-term consultant should be contracted to undertake an assessment on the capacity of NGOs and on performance indicators that can be used to monitor and evaluate their work.1377

Monitoring, mentoring and support: Partnerships: The evaluator of the Somalia programme stated that the following lessons emerged in relation to NGO partnerships. First, in a conflict or post conflict environment partnerships should only be entered into, if close monitoring and mentoring is possible. Secondly, partnerships should grow gradually and be based on a shared vision and basic principles of programme management. Third, capacity enhancement should be built into the partnership relationship.1378

Mentoring: The workload associated with reporting was heavy and exceeded the capabilities of local NGOs in Upper Egypt. As a result, partner NGOs were required to provide intensive hands on support to local NGOs. The evaluator found that the local NGOs need more than simply guidance but they require a clear system of management and administration, clear division of labour and budget to cover operating expenses. Partner NGOs felt that it was futile and time-consuming to refer issues to UNICEF and that they need greater authority and independence; for example, partner NGOs did not have the authority to change the local NGO staff and had to go via UNICEF who was not responsive.

Technical support: It was held that the change in the nature and makeup of the Mobile Group from national stakeholders to students based in Stockholm left the pilot programme in Tajikistan without effective monitoring and technical support. Staff felt that they had no one to consult at national level when problems arose. The partner implementing the programme on violence, exploitation and discrimination in Bangladesh called for improvements in coordination and technical support from UNICEF. The evaluator of the Senegal mine action programme referred to inadequate support from the UNICEF Dakar office, regional and HQ offices. Although there was little mine action capability available at the Dakar office, the existing expertise in the areas of Programme Communication, Protection and Education could have contributed to the MRE component. In Afghanistan limited technical support to the child protection sub cluster on behalf of UNICEF was attributed to human resource shortages. In Somalia, the relationship between UNICEF and the partner was described as strained. A board member described UNICEF Somalia as ‘incompetent’. Reference was made to poor communication, slow and erratic responses, and confusion and delays caused by the turnover of staff or shifting responsibilities within UNICEF. The evaluator of the Thailand programme recommended that UNICEF Thailand engage more with programme implementation over and above supervisory visits and fields visits with partners; for example, short-term attachments for staff with partner organizations would improve technical support and strengthen programming. The success of the listening services in The Comoros was attributed to the active involvement of UNICEF officials in the programme.

Institutional positioning: The Secretariat of the NNSC was lodged in the Social Technology Bureau of the Department of Social Welfare and Development (DSWD). It was felt that this positioning is misplaced as this bureau focused more on conceptualizing, developing and pilot testing social welfare and development programme. Instead it was suggested that the Secretariat be lodged at the Child Welfare Committee which is the highest policy making body for children’s concerns; however, this body only has a presence down to the regional level, which would hinder information and technical support to the cities.

Programme management at the level of partner NGOs was found to be particularly weak in many countries. In Thailand it was related to a high turnover of country directors. In Bosnia Herzegovina, resources were not invested in programme management training and study visits for partners in core municipalities and the programme management structure contained a number of reporting levels which

---

1380 Ibid.
1387 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
was too large in scale for the size of the programme budget. In Somalia, programme managers did not have a terms of reference. In Cambodia, the evaluator referred to a confusion of Senior Management responsibilities, leading to cases of corruption. Similarly in Azerbaijan, the absence of specific mandates and responsibilities for senior managers had an adverse impact on accountability, time efficiency and overall effectiveness. In contrast, in China the programme management system was found to be very effective in terms of coordination because it was put in place at the start of the programme and is supported by annual work plans, quarterly inter-agency coordination meetings, a programme newsletter, field monitoring, feedback and a midterm evaluation.

Ownership: The lack of clarity regarding the ownership and leadership of the Juvenile Justice Committee (JJC) in Mongolia had an impact on programme management. This was often attributed to UNICEF and due to the vacuum of ownership and direction by designated government entities, UNICEF’s legal reform officer served as a de facto supervisor of two JJC Coordinators, even though it was not a UNICEF programme.

Decentralization: The lack of programme management and coordination at decentralized levels was noted in a few reports.

4.8 Sustainability

4.8.1 Introduction

This section reviews the factors that affect sustainability, or, in other words, the programmes’ ability to continue benefits after development assistance has been completed. Some programmes are not sustainable because they do not have the support of local communities, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and key government institutions. This, in turn, will affect the extent to which programme principles and activities can be expanded/scaled-up to other contexts and beneficiaries (OECD/DAC 2000, 1991). This section will highlight issues related to exit strategies, funding, community ownership and commitment, and government ownership.

4.8.2 Exit strategies

The evaluator of the Gambia programme stated that it did not have a clearly articulated exit strategy which affected the programme. The staff and participants had no clear knowledge of when the activities would cease and there were no proactive plans for the exit of the partner organization. Similarly, in Mongolia, the evaluator stated that there were no UNICEF exit strategies for existing locations. The evaluator of the Colombia programme recommended that UNICEF should plan an exit strategy with clear roles and responsibilities for each activity with engagement with local partners, so that there are clear.

---

1400 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
Exit strategies need to be clearly communicated with partners and beneficiaries to avoid confusion. In Thailand many partners and stakeholders raised concerns that UNICEF was withdrawing from its work without clear reason; these reports caused distress to the UNICEF Country Office who was planning to expand its activities. It was recommended that the communication capacities of UNICEF quite explicitly clarify these messages to those on the ground.  

4.8.3 Funding

In a number of reports, it was held that partner NGOs and community based organizations expressed a desire to continue working on the programme after funding has been completed, but indicated that financial constraints would prevent this. This was echoed by staff on the Tostan programme in the Gambia where it was held that the local NGOs would not have the financial resources to hire key staff such as community-based facilitators should funding cease. Respondents believed that the community-based child protection groups upon which the programme is largely based, were financially weak and had no or poor linkage with other donors to fund their infrastructural programmes.

In the Philippines, reference was made to a culture of dependency on UNICEF support; for example, a children’s newspaper only existed for two years with UNICEF support. Similarly, virtually every activity in Mali is executed with UNICEF funds. The evaluator of the Cambodian programme stated that some responsibility must lie with donor organizations that in the absence of government authority set up protective systems which were visibly donor supported leading to confusion about management and ownership.

Evaluators of a number of programmes referred to the need for a fundraising strategy supported by a longer term vision in order to ensure sustainability. In the Philippines the evaluator referred to NGOs high degree of competence in securing funds to support their programmes and activities, and on this basis felt that it was highly probable that NGO partners can sustain their activities when UNICEF is no longer able to provide financial assistance. This was reiterated by the evaluator of the Azerbaijan programme who stated that there are positive signs that the programme will continue to generate donor support, although there will be a need to diversify donor support, for instance to include the European Commission, the Department of International Cooperation of the Italian Government and the World Bank. In Sri Lanka sustainability has been ensured by the programmes’ success in advocating for greater government budgetary allocations to child welfare and protection. This is evident in the fact that total government budget allocations for this sector have increased by over 1000% from 2005 to 2008.

There will also need to be an assessment of costs in order to ensure financial sustainability; for instance, it was held that the MRE programme in Nepal would not be able to continue the current magnitude and scope of activities without external support. In Colombia the evaluator recommended that in order to ensure that some MRE activities continue after funding has been suspended, it is useful to equip partners

with basic IEC materials so that they can continue their work on the ground. It is therefore important to invest in hardware materials.\textsuperscript{1412}

### 4.8.4 Community commitment and ownership

In addition to fundraising, securing the commitment of the community and fostering a sense of ownership is essential for sustainability.

In China’s child injury programme it was held by the evaluator that participating communities are capable of sustaining the programme impact given their positive attitudes, high level of awareness of the issue and their knowledge and skills to modify the environment.\textsuperscript{1413} However, in programme seeking to have an impact on norms that support harmful practices, a concrete sustainability plan is needed. For instance in Upper Egypt, over time hesitant families would waver towards FGM/C. The evaluator found that sustained efforts at the community level yields better results, as is evident by the fact that communities that had earlier interventions against FGM/C were more receptive of the message.\textsuperscript{1414} The length of a programme has an impact upon sustainability at village level. In terms of child labour in New Delhi, the evaluator argued that four years of programme implementation is not a sufficient period to embed perspectives, processes and outcomes. A second phase of community mobilization is therefore needed to change attitudes and beliefs.\textsuperscript{1415}

There has been a tendency for government, UNICEF and NGO actors to design and implement community programmes for beneficiaries rather than mobilizing existing community resources to implement these activities themselves. For instance, it was suggested that village-based Tsunami programmes in Sri Lanka may not be sustainable because of insufficient consultation, participation and community ownership.\textsuperscript{1416} Even though many programmes invest in community-based child protection committees under the guise of increasing community ownership, sustainability is still questionable. In the Gambia concerns were raised about continued dynamism of community-based volunteer groups, as experience has found these specific structures only exist and are functional during the life time of the programme. It was recommended that these structures be integrated into existing government structures.\textsuperscript{1417} In New Delhi it was held that the community based committee would require substantial inputs to be able to work independently. It was argued that if ownership is the objective then the capacity building inputs to these community structures should reflect this. In addition it was also argued that these committees need to be integrated into existing education committees supported by government and NGOs.\textsuperscript{1418} Alternatively schools can be engaged to spear head the programme so that the programme can generate stable local networks through the school, for instance by working closely with parents and youth. The evaluator of the Colombia programme found that it continues to function in two or three communities, based on the involvement of trained adolescent volunteers that are willing to continue working with children in schools. In this example, one prerequisite for sustainability was the involvement of the education community and youth from the outset of the programme. These young people have been involved in writing proposals for additional funding and materials and many have continued it on their own.\textsuperscript{1419} Members of community-based committees also need to remain motivated to continue their work after funding has been suspended. For example, the Task Forces and Working Committees in the Philippines have managed to sustain their activities as a result of the strong commitment of members, the

\textsuperscript{1419} Members of community-based committees also need to remain motivated to continue their work after funding has been suspended. For example, the Task Forces and Working Committees in the Philippines have managed to sustain their activities as a result of the strong commitment of members, the
strong sense of volunteerism, the camaraderie among members, strong leadership, and recognition from local authorities.\textsuperscript{1420}

In Bangladesh it was argued that the community-based committees can be sustained if the community can be mobilized to raise funds to support their functioning.\textsuperscript{1421} However, this in turn depends on the extent to which poverty and livelihood imperatives have been addressed.\textsuperscript{1422} Elsewhere in this report it was argued that child protection programmes are more effective when they are integrated into social protection or intersectoral programmes that address communities’ immediate needs. The same can be said for sustainability.

Communities need to view the objectives of the programme in a positive light. In Colombia for instance, generally the prevention of children’s recruitment by illegal armed groups is viewed positively.\textsuperscript{1423} However, in other programmes targeting harmful practices, communities view these as Western impositions as they do not address basic needs.\textsuperscript{1424} Child labour awareness and MRE were found not to be effective when they don’t address why children are forced to work, or why people are forced to collect scrap mine metal to survive. Community members and civil society must also understand the activities of the programme and the tasks of the implementing partners. This is why the listening service in The Comoros was described as not sustainable.\textsuperscript{1425}

Furthermore, it was argued that sustainability is enhanced when community leaders give their backing to the programme. This will only occur if the programmes are found to be respectful of their traditions and culture. This is one reason why the evaluator argues that the programme in Colombia will be sustainable.\textsuperscript{1426} In Sri Lanka, it was found that lack of insight into local understandings of child protection and well-being have hampered effectiveness and sustainability. As a result, children’s clubs started by UNICEF’s partners have collapsed due to the suspension of funding and lack of built-in mechanisms for sustainability.\textsuperscript{1427}

\textbf{4.8.5 Government ownership}

In Vietnam the fact that a number of activities at national and provincial level are part of a wider mine action program, has ensured some degree of sustainability; however, many activities at district and commune level would stop or scale down if UNICEF reduced its funding.\textsuperscript{1428} Hence, institutionalizing the programme within national programme is an important component of sustainability. This is also evident in The Comoros where the programme was taken into account in developing the National Strategy for the Protection of Vulnerable Children.\textsuperscript{1429} In terms of sustainability, the MRE programme in Nepal was commended for developing a supportive relationship with government, engaging in regional meetings with government staff, using national staff with input from nationally and locally-based organizations to run the MRE activities and mainstreaming MRE messages in the school curricula.\textsuperscript{1430} It was held that the programme in Georgia is now sustainable because government has assumed responsibility for its

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{1421} Final Report for Mid-Term Evaluation of the Basic Education for hard to Reach Urban Working Children’s Project (2nd Phase). Bureau of Non-Formal Education, Bangladesh. 2008.
\item \textsuperscript{1423} Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
\item \textsuperscript{1425} Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
\item \textsuperscript{1426} Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
\item \textsuperscript{1429} Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
services, staff salaries, office space and payment of utility bills.\(^\text{1431}\) Similarly in Azerbaijan, the government has endorsed the programme, there has been a socio-cultural shift in the attitude of policy makers towards residential care, and the government has made a commitment to reform child welfare services.\(^\text{1432}\)

A number of evaluators recommended forming partnership with government institutions and forming provincial and national level committees to assume responsibility for the programme.\(^\text{1433}\) Initially this will require some form of risk/cost sharing with municipalities and NGOs to ensure that the instruments and models from the programme are supported.\(^\text{1434}\) Unfortunately, the evaluator of the programme in Nepal found that government is not prepared to take on some of the financial burden of the programmes in future, thereby ensuring that children who are released from the cantonments will not be supported with reintegration interventions at a later date.\(^\text{1435}\)

Sustainability will also require capacity building of government. For instance, it was found that the partnerships developed with key ministries are not strong enough for sustainability. Rather the capacity of government needs to be strengthened to design and implement child-oriented policies and programme through which the reintegration programme could be sustained.\(^\text{1436}\) It was argued that local staff and management of the Tostan programme in the Gambia do not have the knowledge and skills to implement the programme independently.\(^\text{1437}\) The child injury prevention programme in China was said to be sustainable because of the investments made in strengthening the prevention capacity of local government staff and ensuring the buy-in of national government. As a result, injury prevention has been integrated into the annual work plans of government agencies and even into the school curricula in certain municipalities.\(^\text{1438}\)

Setting the programme up permanently within government structures is also essential for sustainability.\(^\text{1439}\) The evaluator of the Moldova programme states that this strategy can only if the programme is implemented within a single structure that then coordinates activities that will be implemented within district structures. In addition, this process of ‘taking over’ will require consideration into financial, technical and human investments so as to maximize the use of human resources that have already been trained and have experience with implementation.\(^\text{1440}\) For example, in Mongolia there is the notion that the Juvenile Justice Committee will become official, formally headed by the local governor and paid out of the state budget, but concerns have been raised about its integration into existing structure, its links to the social welfare system, and payment of salaries, infrastructure, transportation and equipment in a context facing financial crisis and severe budget cuts.\(^\text{1441}\) In Colombia, it was found that the Department of Education has the ability to sustain MRE and to expand it in schools, but the issue remains political will. Despite the strong engagement of schools, there was a low level of active participation by local and municipal education and health authorities. The evaluator recommended that more efforts should be made to involve the Department of Education in all decision-making processes on MRE.\(^\text{1442}\)

\(^\text{1442}\) Evaluation of the 'return to happiness' methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
One of the challenges to sustainability is the centralization of services, as was found in Algeria. Even if the government takes the lead on a programme, it will not be sustainable if networking and coordination of services across sectors at all levels of governance, are not undertaken effectively. In Mauritania weak commitment from the government meant that regional and departmental committees were not allocated sufficient human, material and financial resources to sustain implementation on the ground. In contrast in Indonesia, government decentralization has meant that there has been increased government budgetary commitments to child protection programmes and strengthened national, provincial and district-level policy and coordinating mechanisms. The evaluator stated that these developments will enhance the sustainability of the child protection programme.

In one evaluation it was emphasized that the main aim of sustainability should be sustainability of the model/methodology rather than sustainability of individual programmes. The benefits – both social and fiscal – of such an approach should be widely publicized so that good practices are sustained and replicated in other areas.

4.9 Equity

4.9.1 Introduction

In the UN CRC (1989) a number of articles support equity. Article 2 obliges States Parties to respect the rights of all children, irrespective of race, colour, sex, language, political affiliation, national, ethnic or social origin, property, disability, birth or other status. Article 30 refers to the rights of children from ethnic, religious or linguistic minorities, and Article 23 refers to the rights of children living with disabilities (UN CRC). UNICEF has also committed itself to the promotion of equity as affirmed in the Child Protection Strategy (2008) and other concept papers (e.g. ‘Equity and the Whole Child’, 2010). This section discusses the manner in which the programmes have adopted an equity-focused approach in relation to gender, disabilities and a range of other vulnerability factors. As equity is a cross-cutting theme, it has been discussed in other sections of this report.

It has been found that more needs to be done to fulfil UNICEF’s commitment to ensuring that the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children have access to services and protection. Targeting has been found to be problematic. For instance, in some programmes those who were participating were not vulnerable or marginalized and therefore not the intended beneficiaries. Outreach was found to be more effective in identifying ‘hidden’ children but this is resource-intensive in terms of labour, financial and material resources. As a result, some staff failed to actively seek out and encourage vulnerable children to participate in the programme. In other examples, programmes failed to develop clear criteria to define which vulnerable and marginalized children should be selected in programmes or failed to undertake research to identify which groups are the most vulnerable and marginalized.

It was also evident that equity has been narrowly understood as facilitating the access of vulnerable and marginalized children to programmes, rather than addressing the root causes behind their marginalization.

At a strategic level, the evaluator of the programme in Uganda stated that UNICEF has started to move away from vertical emergency responses for identified categories of children (e.g., child mothers or former child combatants) towards a more holistic approach to vulnerability. This move was described in positive terms because it will support interventions that address the underlying root causes of a range of child protection issues. The evaluator further argued not to lose sight of particular risks and specific responses that may be needed. For instance, girls who are abandoned single mothers, child headed households, child combatants or former child combatants.

\[1444\] Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.
and children in households with elderly grandparents are at particular risk in Uganda.\textsuperscript{1447} In Liberia, it was argued that efforts to target the most vulnerable should be considered in light of the perceptions of non-beneficiaries, as perceptions of injustice or unfairness could hinder successful reintegration efforts for children.\textsuperscript{1448}

4.9.2. Gender Equity

Table 57: Gender equity by strategy and finding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper Egypt</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Small groups, plays and home visits were used to reach women and girls.</td>
<td>This strategy was effective in reaching women and girls. However, the evaluator stated that the programme needs to equally address and target men particularly since men seem more resistant to their awareness-raising messages and are more vocal about religious arguments for continuation.\textsuperscript{1449}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Adult learning techniques and applied non-directive but highly interactive communication processes were used to ensure the participation of women in local communities.</td>
<td>One constraint was that there was reduced participation of women in programme activities due to heavy domestic chores. Nevertheless, women and girls constitute 80% of participants in programme activities and overall 56.5% of Community Management Committees are women. 56 of 80 Community Coordinators were women. Women were therefore included as participants and leaders. The evaluator concluded that the programme enabled women to gain new knowledge and increased mastery over their rights, health and hygiene issues. The evaluator did however recommend that more efforts need to be made to encourage the active participation of men in programme intervention activities.\textsuperscript{1450}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>Case management and follow-up/reintegration skills</td>
<td>The evaluator noted that social workers need training on the reintegration of boys with their families.\textsuperscript{1451}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Girl Child labour</td>
<td>Child fora</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the child fora have not been used optimally to sensitize children on issues of gender. For example, gender biases with regards to household chores are unchallenged.\textsuperscript{1452}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Bicycles were provided to girls to prevent them from dropping out after primary level so that they could travel to upper primary or high school. Girls who had completed 10th class were given higher education support.</td>
<td>1200 girls who completed class VII were given bicycles. They are a symbol of ‘movement, speed, freedom and convenience’. In 2009-2010 92 children were given higher education support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia Herzegovina</td>
<td>Child protection systems</td>
<td>A programme addressed violence in school and at home</td>
<td>The evaluator stated that the small programmes only addressed gender issues indirectly and it was not clearly listed in the programme LogFrame or programme memorandum. There needs to be greater linkages between priority concerns and gender.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>The reintegration model does not address gender issues</td>
<td>Social affairs staff state that the current system does not meet the specific needs of women in their areas. In addition there were few social work officials which is a concern given that they come into close contact with vulnerable women and girls and have little training on gender-based violence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Vocational training and a start-up grant was offered to child migrants in the Sourou province.</td>
<td>Given the history of female migration, only girls were eligible to participate in this programme. It is unclear how many received vocational training but 7 start-up grants were awarded in the Sourou province.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Programmes are implemented for girl domestic workers including literacy classes and reproductive health. One programme offers residence to girls who become pregnant or fall ill; they are assisted with medical care and acquiring a birth certificate.</td>
<td>These programmes were responsive to the rights and needs of vulnerable girls.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child protection</td>
<td>Mainstreaming of gender issues within government structures through the development of policies and national guidelines; capacity building to government, partners and</td>
<td>On the whole the programme was described as effective; however, it needs to empower women economically, engage in stronger lobbying and follow-up to ensure mainstreaming at national and decentralized levels, and extend the</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1456 Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Affirmative action towards girls in the selection of learners. The majority of teachers are female. The majority of supervisors are male. The materials reveal bias in illustrations and portrayal of roles in society. The teacher’s curriculum has not addressed gender issues. Retention of girls is a challenge as parents are often illiterate and cannot see the long term value of educating girls and may decide to early marriage. In the programme there is low gender sensitivity. A ‘Gender Equality Strategy’ was drafted but gender mainstreaming was not a priority.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>The programme tried to address the needs of vulnerable groups, including girls. In addition, in-depth qualitative research was undertaken on the reasons for girls’ participation in the fighting. Female participation in the DD programme was low, partly due to lack of awareness about the programme and on who was regarded as CAAFAG. 31% of the total demobilized children are girls. Girl dropout rates are higher than boys for a number of reasons: they are pregnant or have young babies; they engage in transactional or commercial sex to ensure their survival and that of their babies; their education levels are lower than boys which may lead to poor performance in school or in the theoretical component of the vocational training programme. There were more girls in skills training as it was a means to earn an income quickly. Most chose traditional female dominated trades like cosmetology and pastry making. The evaluator stated that most girls need special psychosocial care given that they were subject to sexual violence during the conflict. More efforts need to be made to encourage the participation of girls in children’s clubs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Event</td>
<td>Gender-Related Issues</td>
<td>Observations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Girls and boys were targeted in the reintegration programme.</td>
<td>The evaluator was concerned about the absence of gender analysis and tools. This ensured that gender was not adequately mainstreamed into the vocational training component. Partners expressed a sense of helplessness in terms of dealing with issues such as early marriage or young girls who had children while in the armed groups. More capacity building is necessary to ensure that staff undertake all activities with a ‘gender lens’. Furthermore, it is important to consider the psycho-social needs of boys.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>The programme integrated a gender perspective in the programme. Targets were set for female participation in training and obtaining a degree of gender equity.</td>
<td>There was a lack of data disaggregated by gender which made it impossible for the evaluator to determine effectiveness. However, with regards to vocational training it was found that girls were directed into gender-biased and predetermined training sessions, such as secretarial science. They were not given the chance to opt out of these courses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>The programme addressed gender-specific vulnerabilities among children.</td>
<td>The programme failed to undertake a social, cultural and gender analysis in order to effectively address gender disparities. This had an impact on programme targeting and coherence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF was committed to gender mainstreaming and a female gender perspective was evident in all phases of the child protection programme. There was an inter-agency initiative to ensure disaggregated data collection. Work plans included components to ensure women’s right to safe motherhood and efforts were made to address gender-based violence.</td>
<td>The programme failed to address gender disparities, inequities and abuses of power systematically. Furthermore, the integration of male gender issues into the child protection strategy was weak; e.g. how to address the primary perpetrators of violence who are mainly males.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>UNICEF has started to develop plans that include a greater focus on gender</td>
<td>There was little evidence of awareness of gender issues in programming materials, stakeholders’ feedback, data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[^{1461}\text{Evaluation of the ELMAN-UNICEF partnership in support of the reintegration and rehabilitation of children associated with militia in Somalia and recommendations for future UNICEF interventions in this field. FAKT GmbH. Somalia. 2006.}\]
including training materials and the support for a government ‘Master plan on Gender’. management etc. The evaluator was informed that ‘gender is not an issue here’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Finding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao</td>
<td>Mine action</td>
<td>The UN Inter-agency Policy’ and mine action strategy state that the rights of all at risk groups and survivors, irrespective of age or gender should be promoted.</td>
<td>According to the evaluator, UNICEF is facing a paradox i.e. women and children are not necessarily the groups most at-risk from landmine/UXO injury but their mandate is to protect women and children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>Violence</td>
<td>The programme promotes equity in relationships between women and men.</td>
<td>The evaluator was concerned that the materials present women and men in traditional gendered roles and thereby reinforce them e.g. women minding children, cleaning and cooking, while men are responsible for work and playing football. In addition, it was argued that the focus should be on everyday relationships and how constructions of gender affect the lives of participants on a daily basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>The programme is designed to address all forms of discrimination, including gender and socio-economic status.</td>
<td>This approach was found to be highly relevant particularly in the context of formal and non-formal education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>A gender perspective was adopted at the level of design, planning and implementation in one programme. In the other programme, no explicit reference was made to gender in training modules and guidelines.</td>
<td>Although qualitative information was gathered, no quantitative research was undertaken on the situation of girls. This hindered efforts to create a baseline to measure progress in terms of gender equity.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In spite of significant progress in terms of promoting gender equity in child protection programmes, a number of challenges, constraints and gaps emerged, which have been summarized below.

Challenges, constraints and gaps:

- **Gaps:** In some programmes, evaluators noted that gender issues are not addressed adequately in planning and implementation (Bosnia Herzegovina, Thailand). In some evaluations concerns were raised that programmes were not using their programmes to raise awareness around gender and/or stimulate discussion in this regard (India).

- **Knowledge management:** Failure to adequately conduct an in-depth analysis of gender issues at the outset, hindered programmes from effectively ensuring gender equity (Nepal, Maldives).

---

1466 Evaluation of the External Programme, “Against Violence….We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”; Evaluacion del Proyecto “Contra la Violencia, Eduquemos para la Paz, por Ti, por Mi y por Todo el Mundo”. Mexico.
1468 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
Indonesia, Sri Lanka, and Colombia). The absence of data disaggregated by gender also affected programming (Somalia).

- **Barriers to regular and continued participation**: In some programmes women could not participate regularly in programme activities because of their heavy domestic chores (Gambia). Retention of girls in programmes was also challenging as their parents failed to see the long term benefits of their participation when culturally they should be married at an early age (Bangladesh). In other cases, dropout rates were high because they were pregnant, were engaging in transactional or commercial sex and their education levels were lower which affected their performance (Liberia).

- **Male gender perspective**: As men are often the perpetrators of violence and are supportive of harmful practices, evaluators argued that a male gender perspective needs to be included in programmes, which tend for the most part to focus on women. This component should look at the manner in which constructions of masculinity contribute to the vulnerability of boys and/or their engagement in violent behaviour. It should also equip service providers and practitioners to meet the unique psychosocial needs of boys (Upper Egypt, Gambia, Thailand, Indonesia, Sri Lanka)

- **Human resources**: Particularly when dealing with matters pertaining to child abuse and sexual violence, evaluators argued that programmes have failed to adequately ensure that women are in contact with girl victims and/or that men have received adequate training in this regard (Cambodia).

- **Gendered materials**: It was held that despite commitments to promote gender equity, the materials used in some programmes continue to reflect a gender bias in terms of the way that roles and responsibilities were portrayed (Bangladesh, Mexico)

- **Gendered activities**: In two programmes it was held that girls were directed into traditionally female dominated trades, thereby reinforcing gender roles in society (Liberia, Somalia)

- **Complex issues**: It was held that partners need support responding to issues such as early marriage or ‘young mothers’ (Nepal)

- **Mainstreaming** within government institutions at national and decentralized levels was identified as a challenge that requires stronger advocacy, technical assistance and follow-up (Ethiopia, Bangladesh)

- **Capacity building** of staff was recommended so as to mainstream gender into their child protection programmes (Nepal)

- **Organizational mandate**: Mine action programmes found it difficult to reconcile their mandates to (a) protect women and children in accordance with UNICEF’s principles and (b) ensure the protection of at risk groups, who might not be women and children (Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao)

### 4.9.3 Children Living with Disabilities

**Table 58: Children living with disabilities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>In Tajikistan, staff working on the de-institutionalization programme would focus first on children who were deemed ‘easy’ to reintegrate and then moved on to more complex cases, such as children living with disabilities. In Tajikistan, UNICEF also supported a gate-keeping scheme focused on children with disabilities. The PMP Consultation in</td>
<td>Staff believe that they have reduced the number of children with disabilities going into institutional care by 30-35%. In the last 6 months they have only referred 25% of the children they have assessed to institutions, including both day schools and boarding schools.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1470 Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Service Type</th>
<th>Strategy/Approach</th>
<th>Observations/Conclusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>No specific strategy</td>
<td>In Georgia more than 50% of the programme users in the evaluation sample had a child who was living with a disability. However, the evaluator noted that the programme does not provide an appropriate response to their needs. As prevention of child abandonment and institutionalization is an objective of this programme, it needs specialized centres and services for children living with disabilities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Support is provided to the institute for children with disabilities of the Mardakai district, through the presence of a physiotherapist.</td>
<td>Unknown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Violence, abuse, exploitation and discrimination</td>
<td>No specific strategy</td>
<td>Referrals are made to organizations that provide welfare support to children living with disabilities. Few child beneficiaries were found to be living with a disability, so the evaluator concluded that a strategy is not necessary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Mine Action</td>
<td>Referrals are made to the Mekele Centre for a prosthesis and supporting physiotherapy.</td>
<td>The evaluator argued that the needs of people living with disabilities remain unmet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Training was provided to partner staff on how to address the needs of vulnerable groups, including children living with disabilities.</td>
<td>The reintegration programme did not assist many children living with disabilities. The following reasons were provided: there are</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A number of challenges, constraints and gaps were identified in relation to efforts to ensure that children living with disabilities can participate in - and benefit from - programmes with equity.

- **Gaps**: Some programmes failed to respond adequately to the needs (medical, psychosocial, educational) of children living with disabilities, even though they were in their direct target group (Georgia, Ethiopia, Uganda, Cambodia, Ethiopia, Sudan and Lao).
- **Barriers to access** included transportation and logistics constraints, exclusion/marginalization by other children and teachers, fear of being stigmatized, shame associated with the way that disabilities are socially perceived, and gatekeepers (e.g. caregivers who are very protective) (Liberia, Thailand).

---

1479 Evaluation of the External Programme “Agstain Violence...We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World” (Evaluacion del Proyecto “Contra la Violencia, Eduquemos para la Paz, por Ti, por Mi y por Todo el Mundo”). Mexico.
• **Evidence**: Evaluators recommended that more research needs to be undertaken into the needs of children living with disabilities in particular socio-cultural contexts (Thailand).

• **Multi-partner guidance** failed to explicitly focus on the unique needs of children living with disabilities (Mexico).

### 4.9.4 Geographic Barriers to Access

Geography has been identified as a barrier to access and equity in a number of programmes. Efforts have been made to overcome these barriers in a number of ways, with varying degrees of success.

In Colombia the programme targeted indigenous, rural peasant and Afro-descent youths, who accordingly to the evaluator “have experienced an unexpected process of personal and social change in themselves and their environment, helping them to become aware of their role in defining their own life plans”. In Jamaica, GIS mapping allowed the evaluator to identify areas with the highest number of injuries in children, namely inner city communities many of which were classified as political garrisons. These communities have a low socio-economic status, overcrowding and sub-standard housing, which are risk factors in the context of intimate partner violence. The programme has targeted these areas accordingly.

Children and youth in Burkina Faso who were living in remote communities had little or no access to the vocational programme, unless they were able to board in the district town. Generally the evaluator raised concerns that there was no plan for a systematic follow up with any of the returned children or youth to these outlying communities. This was related to human resource and transportation constraints, and few capacitated local partners who could assist in the communities of origin. Similarly in Mali, given limited local resources children who are returned to distant villages are not visited as part of a formalized follow-up process.

The Bangladesh programme was composed of a programme aiming to educate hard-to-reach urban working children, and a ROSC project catering for rural out-of-school children. The latter includes a bridging course so that they are able to attend grade 8. Safety and security issues related to the travel of children to these sites emerged as an issue of concern in Nepal. In India, girls in the rural areas were given bicycles so that they could attend high school.

In China, surveillance data suggests that child injury is more prevalent in rural areas. The evaluation found that the programme efforts to tap into local resources in these rural areas require a longer term programme to bring about significant change. Lack of facilities in the rural areas (e.g. absence of swimming pools in rural schools) is a constraint, especially since drowning is a leading cause of death in school aged children.

The evaluator of the Togo programme stated that little work has been done in the rural areas. In the DRC, a major barrier to access was the fact that medical and psychosocial services were largely available.

---

1480 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.


1483 Ibid.


in the urban areas, which meant that victims of sexual violence were often not able to access this support due to logistics and transportation constraints and/or arrived too late for the effective administration of the PEP kit.\textsuperscript{1489}

### 4.9.5 Children from Migrant Communities

In a number of programmes, children from migrant families were found to be particularly vulnerable. For example, in New Delhi the evaluator’s assessment of the Households Survey (Sept-Oct 2010) found that the most critical vulnerability indicator was migration, with nearly 74% of the sample being migrant families.\textsuperscript{1490}

In Thailand, the evaluator stated that the programme has appropriately targeted migrant communities given heightened child vulnerability. As a result, behaviour change programmes have included migrant children, with one specifically targeting Moken children. However, it was argued that there has been little follow-up on identified concerns in many tambons or efforts to specifically include these vulnerable children in education programmes. He recommended that UNICEF strategically target partners such as the International Organization for Migration (IOM) for its work with migrant children and the Muslim Youth Council for its work on HIV programme in the South.\textsuperscript{1491}

In Burkina Faso, Sourou province has a long history of girls and young women migrating to the urban centres in search of work as domestic labourers. Due to the gendered nature of this migration, only girls were eligible to participate in vocational training and to apply for a start-up grant upon completing the programme, as this programme explicitly targeted child migration and trafficking. The team was unable to ascertain how many girls and young women had been able to receive vocational training or return to school. Seven start-up grants were awarded in the province; however, it was not clear what the criteria for issuing these start-up grants was, nor whether in fact any returned child victims of trafficking received any of them.\textsuperscript{1492}

In post-conflict settings such as Uganda, Nepal and Somalia the heightened vulnerability of IDPs was discussed.

### 4.9.6 Children from Poverty Stricken Communities

Children with poor literacy skills could not use the written material for the life skills course in Nigeria. The administrators at the centres said that there was little or no structured approach to handling this problem, and the issue was handled case-by-case. The centre had invited students to a basic reading and writing course but none were interested in participating, partly due to fear of stigma. It was recommended that visual training materials be developed for remote and destitute areas and basic literacy classes be offered. The following barriers to access were highlighted among poorer students: the need to pay for registration and vocational training materials, distance to the centres, limited literacy, low self-confidence and ambition and limited parental/guardian goodwill.\textsuperscript{1493} In addition, concerns were raised that less deprived students would ‘crowd out’ children from the originally intended target groups, for example use of the computer department.\textsuperscript{1494}

In Liberia, the evaluator stated that children from poor families were not attending the programme’s activities regularly because they need to work to ensure the livelihood of their families. It was recommended that income generation support be provided to those families in return for the child’s school attendance.\textsuperscript{1494}

\textsuperscript{1493} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{1494} Ibid.
The evaluator of the Morocco programme stated that the programme did not offer viable and sustainable alternatives to the most vulnerable families who needed a means of income generation.

**4.9.7 Children Affected by HIV and AIDS**

In Nigeria, trafficking victims and HIV positive students were integrated in some vocational training centres. It was held that other students were aware of the special status of certain students at the centres, but details about their background were kept confidential.

The evaluator of the Uganda programme stated that UNICEF should promote the full participation of people living with HIV in the planning, delivery and monitoring of activities. UNICEF has focused more on children affected by HIV and AIDS, but programmes should also promote the participation of parents living with HIV. More efforts need to be made to monitor the efficacy of this programme to ensure that the most vulnerable groups are able to access and benefit from all interventions.

The Programme of Support was explicitly focused on OVC (Orphans and Vulnerable Children). This was found to be highly relevant given that these children are not being serviced by government services.

**4.9.8 Age-related Vulnerabilities (Early Childhood and Adolescence)**

The evaluator of the Jamaica programme stated that it is appropriate to focus on children aged 0-12 years because of the 1,256 recorded injuries, the majority (52.7%) took place in the 8-11 age group, followed by 30.7% (4-7 years), 16.1% (0-3 years), and 0.5% (12-15 years).

The evaluator of the programme in Colombia stated that support to children younger than 10 years of age was a gap. Due to financial and human resource constraints, the programme could not include them in its sporting activities.

The evaluator of the Serbia programme found that adolescents (8th grade) were more likely resort to aggression and violence in the face of a bully or dispute, when compared to those in 5th grade who are more likely to be passive, report to adults or suffer in silence. On this basis, the programme decided to focus on peer-to-peer education for adolescents who do not seek out adult support.

In Uganda it was held that the programme’s inclusive approach has meant that the youth actively participate in the programme. They are particularly vulnerable if they do not have life opportunities. Reference was also made to adolescent mothers who require strengthened adolescent sexual and reproductive health interventions. With reference to Somalia it was also argued that adolescents should be considered as a category on their own when developing disaggregated and age appropriate programmes.

---

1496 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.
1501 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
In terms of age, it was held that the elderly remain vulnerable especially since many may be caring for orphaned grandchildren in Uganda. This is a gap in UNICEF programming.1505

4.9.8 Children Out of School

A number of the school-based programmes were criticized for neglecting children who are out of school. For example, the evaluator of the Colombia programme stated that it had failed to adequately reach adolescents who are out of school. In Nicaragua a special remedial plan for matriculation was directed to children who had been outside of the school system, achieving the entry of 3,455 boys and 2,742 girls to primary school that year. In 2006, over 50,000 children entered the school through this special programme. According to information from MECID, most of them are workers, which will assist in the process of eradicating hazardous child labour. In addition, for children and young workers who had left school or who did not enter his proper age, the MECID facilitated access to the school by expanding the Primary Average age. During the 2006 school year, more than eleven thousand children and teenagers, of whom the majority were workers, were being assisted in this programme.1507 In order to enhance the access of out of school youth, outreach programmes in different programmes targeting child workers and children living on the streets, included an education component. For instance, through the use of mobile schools, bridging courses, literacy class and so forth.

4.10 Ethical soundness
4.10.1 Introduction

All programmes should be based on a clear ethical protocol in order to ensure the wellbeing, safety and security of children and staff. This issue was not covered adequately in the 52 evaluations reviewed. Nevertheless, this section discusses internal child protection efforts, otherwise known as ‘child safeguarding’ policies, to ensure the safety and security of child beneficiaries, and the safety and security of staff.

4.10.2 Child Protection/safeguarding Policies

The programme focusing on children living on the streets in Lao PDR developed a detailed child protection code for programme staff and visitors to the drop in centres, and a separate code of conduct for journalists and photographers.1508

The evaluator of the programme in Thailand suggests that the Child Protection Policy and Child Rights training manual needs to be reviewed and strengthened. The Child Protection Code of Conduct and reporting procedures need to be revised in a child friendly manner and posted at the drop in centres and disseminated during outreach activities. Staff should also participate in the government’s Child Protection Competency Training so that are qualified to intervene immediately in child protection emergency cases. Some of the shelters did not have a child protection policy and children in one shelter, reported being hit by staff. It was recommended that UNICEF ensures that all drop-in centres have these policies in place and that staff are trained in this regard.1509

The programme in Colombia had developed a clear ethical code, which included the following: Inclusion and participation of all involved differentiated according to the role of each; respect and protection of

---

1506 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
sources; independence of the evaluation team in relation to those involved; a developmental and rights based perspective; and accuracy and objectivity of the information.\textsuperscript{1510}

No reference was made to organizational child protection/safeguarding focal points, referral protocols and ‘whistle blowing’ policies.

\textbf{4.10.3 Safety and Security of Child Beneficiaries}

A few evaluations made observations about stigma. In Mongolia, the name of the committee was unofficially changed from “Juvenile Justice Committee” to “Child Protection Committee” due to concerns expressed by children that the committee name led to discrimination and stigma.\textsuperscript{1511} Low levels of female participation in the vocational training programme in Liberia were attributed to stigma.\textsuperscript{1512} Reference was made to the impact of cash transfers on the social acceptance of demobilized girls; some community people may feel that they engaged in inappropriate activities in the armed conflict. Stigma was also described in relation to children living with disabilities as was discussed above.

Security concerns were raised in selected reports. The evaluator of the Burkina Faso programme was concerned about the manner in which a transit centre for victims of trafficking was identified with signage. She was concerned about the fact that the transit centres house both girls and boys. While separate rooms are available for girls and boys, in one centre, there was no door which could be closed and locked to separate the girls’ quarters from the boys.\textsuperscript{1513}

The evaluator of the Thailand programme referred to the example of a mother who crosses the border without documentation in order to look for recycled material for the Home Based Production. She put herself and often her children at risk in the process.\textsuperscript{1514} In Nepal, girls would have to travel “long distances to access vocational training which was provided outside of their communities (often up to 2 hours).”\textsuperscript{1515}

\textbf{4.10.4 Safety and Security of Staff}

In Cambodia social workers often did not feel comfortable making visits to communities and families as they had to travel long distances alone and return after dark, or they had to visit overpopulated slum areas where they did not feel safe.\textsuperscript{1516}

In Somalia, UNICEF staff did not visit the programme for three years due to travel restrictions for security reasons. This had had a negative impact upon levels of monitoring and support.\textsuperscript{1517}

The evaluator in Colombia stated that apart from a few visibility measures (e.g. caps and shirts), not enough support was provided to staff tocope with potential threats.\textsuperscript{1518}

\textbf{4.10.5. Safety and Security of Evaluators and Respondents}

\textsuperscript{1510} Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.


\textsuperscript{1516} An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation. Elayn Sammon. Cambodia. 2009.


\textsuperscript{1518} Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
Safety and security concerns restricted data collection during some evaluations, particularly in transition countries. In Ethiopia the evaluators could not obtain security clearance from the United Nations to travel to selected field sites. Evaluators in Nepal met with serious security and logistical challenges due to the tense conflict environment. As a result, they were not able to conduct field work in certain communities. In Somalia, the team encountered similar challenges related to security and found information collection in this context to be severely restricted.

Some evaluators faced ethical dilemmas in the field. For instance, a social worker had set up an interview with a 13 year old girl victim of trafficking who had recently been repatriated from Thailand to Cambodia. She was living alone at home and no responsible adult had been appointed to represent the child. Under these circumstances the evaluator rescinded the request to interview the child. On another occasion, the evaluator interviewed three unaccompanied children who had been repatriated, in the presence of a recognized and reputable NGO. The evaluator applied the UN guiding principles on what to do when coming into contact with victims of trafficking. An access agency conducted most of the interviews with adult victims. Only a few reports explicitly discuss the ethical protocol used in field work. Confidentiality was referred to in two reports. The Somalia report referred to the ‘do no harm’ principle i.e. do not conduct evaluation activities at the risk of the team’s security and well-being of respondents.

Summary of Chapter 4

This chapter has argued that effective programmes are based on a set of core programming principles. First, in order to be relevant and appropriate, these programmes should be based on evidence, in other words, information that will inform the programmes’ focus, scope and strategic approach. Second, effective programmes should be based on sound results based management principles and practices, which include monitoring and evaluation, knowledge management, information sharing and communications. Third, effective programmes should be designed, implemented and monitored according to participatory principles and methods that encourage beneficiaries and stakeholders to have a say over the direction of the programmes. Fourth, programmes can rarely be effective when they are not efficient, in terms of time, cost and coordination. Fifth, in order to ensure that programmes can continue to function when funding has been suspended sustainability and/or scale up should be encouraged. Sixth, in addition to ethical principles, effective child protection programmes should promote equity by targeting the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children. Detailed lessons and recommendations have been included in Chapter 5’s Recommendations and Conclusions.

Chapter 5: Conclusions and Recommendations

5.1. General Conclusions

- The programmes under review have tended to focus on one or more component of ecological/protective environment, without recognizing the complex interplay of risk and resiliency factors at individual, interpersonal and macro levels. Further, emphasis has been placed on building child protection systems at national levels without recognizing the extent to which effectiveness is, in part, contingent on communities’, families’ and children’s experience with and perception of the legal policy frameworks, institutions, and service-providers.

- Programmers require conceptual clarity and leadership in relation to a number of child protection issues (e.g., ‘justice for children’, ‘deinstitutionalization’, ‘children on the move’ and ‘social protection’) and, more generally, the systems approach. There has been a tendency to use a vertical perspective on specific programmatic issues, rather than to adopt a holistic view and consider the underlying ‘root causes’ (at macro, interpersonal and individual levels) that enhance children’s vulnerability (or resilience); children may experience multiple forms of violence and/or their situation may change over time. Despite the type of violence they are subjected to, children have access to a very limited pool of service providers, institutions and other forms of support. Although it is essential to identify the unique needs of vulnerable children and target programmes accordingly, it is also too simplistic and rather inefficient to focus only on one issue (e.g., children in conflict with the law or child trafficking), when this category overlaps with a number of other categories of vulnerable children.

- There is a tendency to neglect prevention and early intervention in favour of immediate assistance or interim care and/or to adopt a narrow view of prevention centred almost exclusively on awareness-raising or life skills development. For example, a few programmes provided information or skills training to children without recognizing the extent to which their decisions are influenced by the interpersonal context within which they are embedded, thereby neglecting family strengthening and parental support.

- Despite a growing recognition of children’s agency, the findings suggest that this concept is still difficult for programmers to grapple with, particularly when it is used within the context of, or results in, children’s victimization. By understanding why children make certain decisions that put themselves at risk and how they cope with adversity, programmers will be able to effectively prevent violence from occurring or intervene at an early stage in risky situations.

- To strengthen legal policies and institutions, more needs to be done, by way of advocacy and technical assistance, to translate government commitments into services and programmes on the ground and/or to oversee and monitor this implementation, as was found in the 2008 meta-evaluation (Sheeran 2008).

- Although there were a number of successes in capacity building, overall more attention to the capacity building of professionals is required. This strategy needs to be made more systematic across programmes to ensure that it positively affects services on the ground.

- Interventions aiming to promote social change have achieved numerous successes in terms of changing knowledge and in some cases, attitudes. However, far more needs to be done to translate knowledge into behaviour change and to measure these changes over time. The findings also suggest that response and prevention programmes are more effective when they offer some form of ‘tangible’ and ‘visible’ assistance that fulfils the pressing needs of communities.

- Evidence suggests that social protection measures are effective in many programmes seeking to improve outcomes for children; however, the extent to which these have been designed and implemented in a child-sensitive and community-responsive manner was questioned. Further, social protection programmes were found to be problematic; instead, integrated and intersectoral programmes that rest on coordinated responses within and across UNICEF and partner programmes are more successful in addressing child protection issues.

- Child participation has been widely promoted in the context of child protection; however, in the programmes under review, the tendency has been to either allow children to direct programmes in a manner that it is not realistic, viable and sustainable or to override children’s opinions completely on the basis that they are not aware of their best interests or those around them. Thus, on the one hand, programmes have made tokenistic gestures under the guise of ‘meaningful participation’ or, on the other hand, have failed to understand the limits, parameters and constraints of child participation.

- In some cases, the programme design was found to be lacking in relevance and appropriateness, partly due to gaps in evidence-based planning, results-based management and participatory
programming. As a result, some interventions and concepts were ‘recycled’ from other contexts and imposed on communities, rather than being locally grounded, embedded in local practices and existing programmes.

- Some of the greatest challenges encountered by the evaluators were design gaps and implementation challenges in results-based management and monitoring and evaluation across the programmes under review. This hindered the extent to which change could be measured, impact identified and issues of attribution addressed.
- The extent to which equity has been prioritized at a global level is not reflected in the programmes in this meta-synthesis. Either evaluators have failed to include this as an area of investigation or UNICEF Country Offices and partners do not have the capacity to adequately incorporate equity into their programmes. Equity is narrowly viewed as increasing the access of particularly vulnerable and marginalized children to programmes, rather than addressing the underlying root causes of this marginalization.
- Ethical soundness and child safeguarding policies were rarely considered in the evaluations. This is of particular concern because some child protection programmes have inadvertently placed children and staff at risk of harm.

### 5.2 Recommendations

This section provides a set of general recommendations for future programming. These should be considered in light of the detailed and practical lessons that were included in the main body of the report and consolidated in Appendix 4 of this report.

#### 5.2.1 Overall child protection programme design/strategies

- Programmes should adopt a two-tiered strategy in relation to child protection, targeting both systems strengthening and social change, while recognizing the overlapping nature of these two strategic areas.
- The positioning of programmes within the continuum of care should be considered to ensure that children have access to comprehensive services and that essential components such as prevention and family reintegration are not overlooked in favour of ‘band aid approaches’ centred exclusively on interim care.
- Programmes should be informed by an ecological framework that considers a child within the context of the family, community and broader country. Such holistic programmes are more effective in addressing the range of causes of violence and, in turn, the impact of this violence on children, families and communities.
- The child protection sector should better incorporate integrated, multi-disciplinary and intersectoral programming principles; doing so will require forging functional partnerships between different sectors within UNICEF and with other development partners.
- Holistic as opposed to vertical approaches to child protection should be encouraged in order to move beyond the silos of issue-specific programming to more comprehensive and mainstreamed systems approaches.
- Child protection systems strengthening should be factored into emergency programming to ensure that UNICEF is able to transition efficiently and effectively into a recovery and early development phases of programming.

#### 5.2.2 Cross-cutting issues:

- Evidence-based planning and meaningful participatory programming should be prioritized in programme design to ensure greater relevance, appropriateness and flexibility to changing circumstances.
- Comprehensive monitoring and evaluation (M&E) frameworks should be developed at the outset of programmes based on clear indicators that do not simply focus on processes but on outcomes and impact. This should be accompanied by comprehensive information management systems for the documentation, compilation, analysis, and storing of disaggregated quantitative and qualitative data.
• To ensure that programmes are appropriately designed, implemented and monitored in relation to their objectives and intended results (outputs and impacts), logical frameworks or related tools should also be utilized across the programming cycle based on evidence, realistic objectives, logical coherence, and a sound, holistic strategy.

• UNICEF should facilitate internal communication (for intersectoral programming) and information sharing between partners, stakeholders and communities, rather than support vertical reporting structures alone.

• Beyond tokenistic gestures of consultation, meaningful participatory programming should be encouraged to improve levels of ownership and, thereby, effectiveness and sustainability.

• To improve efficiency in coordination, partners should be selected using transparent and rigorous procedures; clearly delineated roles and responsibilities should be formalized; and training, mentoring and support should be improved, particularly in relation to programme management.

• Sustainability should be included in programme design, with focus on exit strategies, long term fundraising strategies, community commitment, government buy-in, and institutional positioning.

• An inclusive approach to equity should be used that emphasizes ‘vulnerable children’ in the context of their families and wider community, in order to address the root causes of marginalization and moderate any unintended effects of equity-focused programming. From a practical perspective, this requires in-depth qualitative and ethnographic research, disaggregated data, multi-partner guidance, and capacity strengthening of UNICEF and partners.

• It is essential that UNICEF and partners develop and adhere to a strict child safeguarding policy that includes background checks for prospective partners, employees and volunteers; a code of conduct; initial and refresher training; the identification of emergency focal points; internal referral protocols; whistle blowing policies; and guidance on the collection, use and storing of sensitive data. Funding for partners should be contingent on the development of these policies and mechanisms. The safety and security of beneficiaries (adults and children), staff, and even evaluators should be prioritized at all times.

5.2.3 Headquarters / Regional Office guidance and support to Country Offices

• Headquarters and Regional Offices have started to shift the scope of their work; however, more work is needed on providing Country Offices with conceptual clarity about specific child protection issues and broader strategic areas including the continuum of care, child protection systems, ecological systems approaches, multi-disciplinary and intersectoral programming, mainstreaming, and equity.

• At a strategic level, UNICEF’s Child Protection Division at Headquarter and Regional Office levels should engage with other sectors in UNICEF to forge partnerships, develop principles, and define the parameters of intersectoral programming.

• In addition to guidance on specific child protection issues, Headquarters and Regional Offices should support internal capacity development exercises in relation to the cross-cutting issues identified in the report (evidence-based planning, results-based programming, participatory programming, knowledge management, monitoring and evaluation, equity and ethics). UNICEF Country Offices should then take responsibility for extending this capacity building to partners.

• The staffing of the child protection sector at Country Office level should be carefully considered to ensure that UNICEF has the human resource capacity to adequately support partners and effectively implement programmes.

• At Headquarter, Regional Office, and Country Office levels, procedures (administrative, financial management, funding disbursement, procurement and contractual) should be streamlined.

• Country Offices should assume a greater role in managing and overseeing the implementation of government and Nongovernmental Organisation (NGO) partner commitments at national and decentralized levels.

5.2.4 Future evaluations

• The profile and selection of evaluators should be carefully considered so that evaluations reflect a balanced perspective of local and international knowledge and expertise.

• Evaluations should be designed to focus more on outcomes and impact. This may require greater knowledge of what are often unexplored methodologies such as mixed methods, ethnography,
quasi-experimental approaches, and longitudinal studies; funding for such evaluations should be allocated accordingly.

- Beyond a desk review of key programmatic documents, evaluators should be required to (a) undertake research, or consult with UNICEF, on the key concepts underlying child protection programmes and (b) conduct research on the context in which child protection programmes are implemented. This will allow for more comprehensive and relevant analyses.

- Although evaluators should be encouraged to capture highly contextual information, efforts should be made to standardize the structure and content of evaluation reports to allow for country, programmatic, or temporal comparisons. Similarly, the criteria used by evaluators should be consistent across child protection issues and include both quantitative scores and qualitative descriptions.

- It is important to conduct global evaluations on children and violence programming or to integrate children and violence themes into related large-scale evaluations.

This synthesis report should be tailored to the findings of different target groups at Regional Office and Country Office level. The possibility of restructuring the synthesis report by child protection issue or geographical location should be explored.
Bibliography


Laupacis, L and Sharon Straus, S., “Systematic Reviews: time to address clinical and policy relevance as well as methodological rigor.” Annual Intern Med. 2007: 273-274

Lemmer, B., Grellier, R and Steven, J., “Systematic review of non-random and qualitative research literature: exploring and uncovering an evidence base for health visiting and decision making” Qualitative Health Research. 1999. (9): 315-328


OECD, Development Cooperation Directorate Website. Criteria for Evaluating Development Assistance. http://www.oecd.org/document/22/0,2340,en_2649_34435_2086550_1_1_1_1,00.html

Sandelowski, M., Barroso, J., Voils, C.I. “Using qualitative metasummary to synthesize qualitative and quantitative descriptive findings”. Research in Nursing and Health, 2007, 30, 99-111

Sandelowski, M. "To be of use": enhancing the utility of qualitative research. Nursing Outlook, 45(3), 1997: 125-32.


Thorne, S., Jensen, L., Kearney, M.H., Noblit, G. and Sandelowski, M. “Qualitative metasynthesis: reflections on methodological orientation and ideological agenda”. *Qualitative Health Research*. 2004 (14) 1342-1365


United Nations General Assembly Human Rights Council (15 June 2009), Guidelines for the alternative care of children (A/HRC/11/L13)


3IE Criteria for systematic reviews. The International Initiative for Impact Evaluations Website: http://www.3ieimpact.org/userfiles/doc/3ie_systematic_reviews_criteria_2011.pdf

Campbell Collaboration, “What is a systematic review?” http://www.campbellcollaboration.org/what_is_a_systematic_review/index.php

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Title and author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Impact du Changement de Normes Sociales sur les Comportements en Milieu Rural au Sénégal. Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviours in Rural Areas of Senegal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Mauritania</td>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation du Programme de promotion de l’abandon des MGF mis en œuvre par le MASEF dans 3 régions à haute prévalence. Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Process evaluation of the joint government, UNICEF and Tostan Pilot Programme. Afri Consult, the Gambia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Evaluation of the child and family in risk situations in Ungheni district project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Post-conflict</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post-conflict</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Post-conflict</td>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Evaluation of the ELMAN-UNICEF partnership in support of the reintegration and rehabilitation of children associated with militia in Somalia and recommendations for future UNICEF interventions in this field. FAKT GmbH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Post-conflict</td>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>Evaluación multi-proyecto para la prevención de la vinculación de niños, niñas y adolescentes a grupos armados ilegales y la atención de niños, niñas y adolescentes desvinculados de los grupos armados ilegales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Multi-project Evaluation for the Prevention of the Connection of Children, Adolescents to Illegal Armed Groups and Attention of Children and Adolescents Dissociated from Illegally Armed Groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Assessment of the child abuse mitigation project at the Bustamante Hospital for Children (CAMP Bustamante). Jennifer Jones and Audrey Brown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Final mid-term evaluation report of 'The Basic Education for hard to reach urban working children's project' (2nd phase).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>An evaluation of the anti-trafficking and reintegration Programme of the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation, Cambodia. Elayn Sammon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>West Africa</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Evaluation of UNICEF’s SIDA-funded child protection/trafficking Programme in West Africa. FAFO.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Street children</td>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Evaluation report of 'Protection of children on the street from Violence, Abuse, Exploitation and Discrimination Project' with Bangladesh Institute of Theatre Arts (BITA).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>School</td>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Evaluation of programme ‘School without violence’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Violence</strong> (school programme)</td>
<td><strong>Mexico</strong></td>
<td><strong>2006</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>45</strong></td>
<td>EVALUACIÓN DEL PROYECTO “CONTRA LA VIOLENCIA, EDUQUEMOS PARA LA PAZ, POR TI, POR MI Y POR TODO EL MUNDO”</td>
<td>Evaluation of the External Programme, “Against Violence….We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>46</strong></td>
<td><strong>Sexual violence</strong></td>
<td><strong>Democratic Republic of Congo</strong></td>
<td><strong>2006</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation Strategie et Projets de Lutte Contre les Violences Sexuelles en RDC</td>
<td>Evaluation of Strategies and Projects in the Fight Against Sexual Violence in the DRC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>47</strong></td>
<td><strong>Child injury</strong></td>
<td><strong>China</strong></td>
<td><strong>2010</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summary report and evaluation: Child injury prevention project (2005-2010). Huan Linnan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>48</strong></td>
<td><strong>Child injury</strong></td>
<td><strong>Vietnam</strong></td>
<td><strong>2008</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>49</strong></td>
<td><strong>National CP systems</strong></td>
<td><strong>Bosnia-Herzegovina</strong></td>
<td><strong>2004</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation of the programme ‘improved mechanisms of child protection’ (draft). Promente</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>50</strong></td>
<td><strong>National CP systems</strong></td>
<td><strong>Zimbabwe</strong></td>
<td><strong>2010</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>51</strong></td>
<td><strong>Community based CP</strong></td>
<td><strong>Somalia</strong></td>
<td><strong>2006</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community-based child protection programme evaluation and review. Tirana Hassan, Independent child protection consultant.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>52</strong></td>
<td><strong>Community based CP</strong></td>
<td><strong>Swaziland</strong></td>
<td><strong>2005</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation of Lihlombe Lekukhalela (child protectors).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2: Terms of Reference

META-Analysis of Evaluation Findings Addressing Violence Against Children
Terms of Reference
Evaluation Office and Child Protection Section, PD
UNICEF, New York

Background
UNICEF works for a protective environment for children, where girls and boys are free from violence, exploitation and abuse. Working with a variety of partners, UNICEF supports countries in their efforts to develop comprehensive strategies to prevent and respond to all forms of violence against children, in all contexts (development, transition and humanitarian situations –both conflict and natural disaster). According to the Child Protection Strategy (2008), the primary focus is placed on strengthening child protection systems at national and local levels (e.g. legal and policy frameworks, standards, guidelines and comprehensive services for children), and promoting changes in norms, attitudes and behaviours that are harmful to children and violate their right to protection.

A strong knowledge and evidence base is critical for effective advocacy, planning and programme support for preventing and addressing violence against children. This is also essential for the organization’s equity focus, which focuses on reaching the most disadvantaged and marginalized. However, given the hidden and often sensitive nature of violence against children, accurate information on the issue is often scarce and inconsistent, which poses a formidable challenge in framing an accurate picture on the true extent/nature of the problem. In addition, there is limited systematic documentation of what works and what does not in preventing and responding to violence against children, although the evidence base –including research and evaluation knowledge -is growing.

Over the past decade, UNICEF and its partners engaged in efforts to address violence against children have produced a number of evaluations assessing their work. This body of data has the potential to serve as a wellspring of critical knowledge and evidence which can be used to help fill the knowledge gap around violence against children and, importantly, to provide evidence of the results being achieved for children and lessons learned as a result of UNICEF-supported interventions. To effectively utilize this resource, the UNICEF Child Protection Section, at the Headquarters level, together with the UNICEF Evaluation Office, is undertaking a comprehensive meta-analysis of internal (UNICEF programming) evaluations to date that assess interventions addressing child violence in development and transition contexts.

The initial phase of the data collection and mapping has resulted in the collection of 38 evaluations that examine UNICEF’s work on child protection specifically addressing violence. The current sample of evaluations has been limited to those published in English during 2005-2010 and have been uploaded by various UNICEF offices into the Research and Evaluation Database (ERD) which the Evaluation Office maintains. The sample may be expanded to include evaluations published in Spanish and French as well, dependent on the availability of resources. The sample includes evaluations commissioned at the global level as well as regional and country level. The current phase of this work involves identifying additional evaluations from the field that might not have been posted in the ERD. It is expected that this process will lead to an identification and synthesis of basic findings from 50-60 evaluations that have examined violence related programme or projects which UNICEF has supported over this period (2005-2010).

“Violence” is a broad issue with many overlapping features and characteristics. Accordingly, the evaluations included in the first phase work have focused on a wide variety of interventions, namely those addressing sexual abuse and exploitation (2); trafficking (2); hazardous labour; violence (6); living or working on the street (2); impact of armed conflict on children (12); harmful traditional practices (3); and unnecessary institutionalization (5); and interventions addressing more than one issue (6). The next phase of this work involves a well-structured meta-analysis of the findings from the evaluations in order to distil the knowledge and evidence contained in them for use by UNICEF and its partners. This meta-analysis will serve to build on and complement the knowledge generated from the UNICEF Child
Protection Meta-Evaluation, published in May 2008, which assessed how the “Protective Environment Framework” (PEF) is understood and addressed in the field by UNICEF and others (Reference to be added).

Objectives and Scope of the Meta-Analysis
The proposed meta-analysis aims to contribute to the knowledge and evidence base on programming for violence against children by analysing and distilling evaluation findings, lessons and recommendations for easy reference and use by those who need such knowledge the most, UNICEF staff, policy makers, planners, programme managers in government and NGOs, donors, and a variety of other stakeholders. Specific objectives of the meta-analysis are to:

a) Provide an overview of available evaluation-based evidence of UNICEF-supported work addressing violence against children;

b) Distil results, lessons learned and good practices by analysing what works and what does not work (and why) in various aspects related to planning, management and implementation of child protection interventions that address violence against children, including identifying and reaching the most vulnerable children.

The meta-analysis will include evaluations that are already identified and which focus on programme and projects aimed at protecting children against violence. The framework for the meta-analysis will consist of several components:

a) Providing an analysis of the programme and project strategies and interventions that have been evaluated and deriving conclusions regarding their effectiveness. This will involve analysing and synthesizing evaluation findings in terms of what works and what does not work in overall programme/project logic and in implementing various components of the CP systems and social norms strategies such as strengthening national systems and capacity building, supporting policy and legislation, supporting social change to end harmful practices and norms, generating and using knowledge and data/information, working with NGOs and civil society organizations, strengthening monitoring and reporting measures, and use of specific advocacy, communication and social mobilization tools and strategies.

b) Providing an analysis of a number of cross-cutting issues such as targeting and reaching the most vulnerable and disadvantaged/marginalized children and communities; expansion and scaling up of programme/projects; sustainability in terms of costs incurred and phasing out; ethical considerations; participation of local communities, parents and children themselves at various strategies of the project/programme cycle; coordination, ownership and programme management at the national and decentralized levels and working with a multitude of sectors / actors for preventing and responding to violence against children.

c) The scope of the meta-analysis covers both development and recovery/transition programme. There will be a need to document humanitarian response issues explicitly in relation to the regular programme issues.

d) Throughout the review, a concerted effort will be made to identify examples of both good programming and ‘what is not known’ in CP programming that can guide inquiry into the next phase of this assessment.

Approach and Deliverables
The meta analysis will be based mainly on UNICEF supported evaluations that are already identified and summarized during the first phase of the exercise. The process will involve internalization of the Terms of Reference and the scope of work involved, meetings with key stakeholders within UNICEF NYHQ and amongst its partners to discuss ways in which the meta-analysis can be made most useful and responsive to the information need, and substantive desk work leading to writing of the meta-analysis report. There may be a need to conceptualize pathways to change, which guide violence programming and inform capacity building endeavours to assess what the evaluation findings indicate in terms of relevance and adequacy of programme logic and results. The work may also entail written communication or interview with selected staff/offices in UNICEF who commissioned the evaluation on queries that may need to be clarified.

Key deliverables include:
- A detailed work-plan / inception report explaining the overall organization of the meta-analysis, detailed
work scope and methods and draft report outline, based on first round review of a sample of evaluation reports and consultation with various stakeholders (7 person days).
- Draft meta-analysis report (35 person days)
- Report revision and finalization (8 days) (final report to include a summary analysis of what works and what does not; distilled results achieved for children from these interventions; recommendations for future programming of this kind; lessons learned ‘check list’)

Management arrangements
The proposed work will be conducted by a consultant who will be recruited by the Evaluation Office. Supervised by a task manager, the consultant will be supported by an Advisory Committee (4-5 members) who will stay in close contact with the consultant through the assignment and who will also review and comment on each deliverable, including the main findings before the draft report is submitted.

Qualifications
The consultant should have the following qualifications:
- Master’s or higher level degree preferably with some multi-disciplinary course work and research in social sciences.
- Broad-based work experience in child protection (at least 8 years) with experience in programming, research and evaluations
- Good understanding of UNICEF’s programme strategies in child protection
### Table 59: Evaluation methodology adopted in the 52 reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Upper Egypt | Harmful practices | • Literature review  
• Review of programme documents  
• Field work in 2 communities in each of the 4 directorates (includes in-depth interviews, case studies, and focus group discussions with stakeholders, community members, girls at risk and ‘positive deviants’.  
1524 |
| Tajikistan  | Residential care | Unclear                                                                                                                                     |
| Georgia     | Residential care | • Desk review  
• 34 semi-structured interviews with programme managers, staff, stakeholders, donors and beneficiaries  
• 5 focus group discussions with social workers  
• Questionnaire administered to 47 mothers targeted by the programme.  
1525 |
| Philippines | Street children | • Desk review  
• 26 key informant interviews  
• 1 day national consultation workshop  
• Participatory, interactive and appreciative methods.  
1526 |
| Lao PDR     | Street children | • Desk review  
• Field work (individual interviews, focus group discussions and self-administered check-list surveys) with 100 child beneficiaries, staff and 65 key stakeholders  
1527 |
| Bangladesh  | Street children | • Participatory approach using PRA Tools  
• Sample: 42 children, 34 stakeholders, 28 parents, 10 programme staff.  
1528 |
| Thailand    | Street children | • Desk review  
• Field visits to programmes in Bangkok and Aramyapraphet.  
1529 |
| Moldova     | Residential care | • 3 visits at initial, intermediary and final stages  
• Observation and informal discussion during training course with children, peer-to-peer facilitators, educators, administration  
• Group discussions, interviews and questionnaires with programme beneficiaries  
• Interviews with government stakeholders.  
1530 |
| Philippines | Child abuse     | • Desk review                                                                                                                                |

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Desk review, Semi-structured interviews with programme management and staff, stakeholders and beneficiaries, Focus group and observation.1532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Desk review, Interviews with programme managers, Field observation (in homes, schools and community), Small scale KAP surveys among students and teachers, Analyses of school and community based surveillance data, Government stakeholders and 31 community committees were interviewed, Pre- and post-tests conducted among 20,000 students, SPSS 12.0 was used for statistical analysis.1533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia Herzegovina</td>
<td>Child protection</td>
<td>Focus group discussions were held with service providers and beneficiaries before the programme started and one year after it was implemented, Interviews (by telephone and in person) were also conducted with key personnel at the 5 core municipalities.1534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Child injury</td>
<td>Desk review, Semi-structured, qualitative interviews with programme participants and stakeholders at provincial, district and commune levels.1535, Focus group discussions with teachers, parents and school students, Control groups: two communes were selected for review in each programme province (one beneficiary and one control commune) with a total of 12 communes across 6 provinces.1536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swaziland</td>
<td>Community based child protection</td>
<td>Sampling strategy: communities were stratified into 3 (communities with LLs were established early; recently mobilized LLs; and no LLs). 20 communities were selected over 4 regions, Interviews with stakeholders, partners, practitioners and volunteers, 968 children were interviewed, Focus groups with LLs.1537</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Programme Area</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Desk review, 56 adult key informants were interviewed, An access agency collated adult victim statements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Gender and child protection</td>
<td>Desk review, Visits to WAB/O offices in 9 towns, Focus group discussions and interviews with staff, stakeholders and community members.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gambia</td>
<td>Harmful practices</td>
<td>Desk review, Stratified cluster sampling methodology (direct and indirect intervention villages in two ethnic intervention areas), A total of 400 interviews were held in 40 villages were visited, 20 focus group discussions, Key informant interviews with community leaders and officials at central and regional levels, Participant observation in programme activities, Case studies, 4 teams of 4 researchers, Epi-Info and SPSS for quantitative data analysis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>Residential care</td>
<td>Desk review including newspaper review, 21 semi-structured interviews with stakeholders, 5 structured focus groups with 30 representatives from NGOs, media, government, service providers, children living in residential care, Presentation of findings to government stakeholders, Qualitative methods.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Desk review, Household survey of 640 households across 16 programme villages (includes 1376 children), Qualitative interactions in 8 villages including interviews, observation and interaction with children and teachers and 3 focus group discussions, Testing of 160 children across 8 villages to assess learning levels, Interviews with staff, stakeholders and donor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamaica</td>
<td>Child abuse</td>
<td>Desk review, Analysis of client records on the database, Interviews with 19 staff from 11 child care and protection agencies, 19 parents/caregivers from 18 randomly selected cases, 6 school staff members from 3 schools, 2 focus group discussions involving 43 persons from 2 communities with the highest incidence of child abuse cases.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1544 Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Methodologies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria, Mali and Burkina Faso</td>
<td>Child trafficking</td>
<td>Desk review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Key informant interviews (in person and telephone).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>School violence</td>
<td>First phase:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Random sampling of schools and then stratified by region, type of settlement, school size, and receipt of a school certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Questionnaire for teachers and pupils using same format as the baseline survey to allow for comparison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>120-150 pupils from 3rd-8th grade were interviewed using self-administered questionnaires</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Structured interviews with mentors and teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Second phase:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Schools were divided into 4 segments according to effects and successfulness of programme implementation. 2 schools were selected for deeper analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qualitative survey was then conducted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>Child labour</td>
<td>Desk review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>Children in conflict with the law</td>
<td>Desk review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Legal policy analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Interviews and focus groups with 100 stakeholders in 4 locations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Site observation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senegal</td>
<td>Mine Action</td>
<td>Desk review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Key informant interviews including staff and stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Ethnography and participant observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Semi-structured interviews, focus groups and observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Community assemblies involving 60 or more participants (including volunteers, teachers, parents and children)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Structured sessions with community and government leaders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Desk review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A Knowledge, Attitude, Practice and Beliefs (KAPB) survey administered to 1060 people including 352 adults and 708 children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In-depth interviews and focus group discussions with more than 1000 children and adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SPSS was used for quantitative analysis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>Children affected by</td>
<td>Desk review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Online survey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1551 Evaluation of the ‘return to happiness’ methodology as a strategy for psychosocial recovery and a component of the strategy for preventing the recruitment of children and adolescents by illegal armed groups’. Oscar Solano Ferero. Colombia. 2009.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Children affected by armed conflict</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Algeria</td>
<td>Desk review, Review of databases and records available, Interviews with stakeholders, Focus group with community representatives, mental health workers and paraprofessionals, Participatory observation of groups of children and adolescents, interviews (performed by professionals) and role plays, Qualitative and quantitative analysis.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Desk review, Three field missions to different regions, Findings were discussed at a workshop.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>Field sites were selected using criteria such as concentration of former child combatants, location, economic activity, programme experience; Desk review, Observation, Key informant interviews, Focus group discussions with children, parents, local leaders, service providers, officials and donor, Interviews with children associated with armed forces.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Desk review, Interviews, focus group discussions and observation with children, staff, stakeholders and donors, Qualitative.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>Desk review, Consultation with UNICEF staff, Semi-structured interviews with district level stakeholders, Field visits to three camps, three transit settlements and a return site, Observation, semi structured interviews and focus group discussions with camp leaders, health volunteers, child protection groups, teachers, adults, adolescents and children, 3 in-depth case studies of vulnerable families.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>Desk review, 80 interviews, A 2 day workshop in Istanbul, No field trip to Iraq could be included.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>Desk review, Consultation with MA specialists at regional and HQ level, Key informant interviews in Nepal, Follow-up interviews by telephone and email</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>Children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Presentation of findings at a national workshop. (^{1560}) Desk review  &lt;br&gt; Semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions with beneficiaries, stakeholders, staff and resource persons. (^{1561})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Desk review  &lt;br&gt; Phased sampling: initially sites outside of Malé were randomly selected, and then islands within the atolls were selected through convenience sampling. Outer island research was also conducted.  &lt;br&gt; Interviews were held with key informants, community members and children (aged 13-17 years). A total of 213 people participated including 133 community members (60 children and 73 parents), 26 staff of CBOs, NGOs and INGOs, and 54 government staff.  &lt;br&gt; Control communities were used with reference to UNICEF-supported substance abuse programme.  &lt;br&gt; A retrospective baseline approach was used to examine community perspectives on psychosocial wellbeing immediately after the Tsunami as compared to 2008. (^{1562})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Desk review  &lt;br&gt; Sequential mixed method approach in three districts to compare results between Tsunami and conflict affected districts  &lt;br&gt; Methodology is similar to the one used in the Maldives. (^{1563})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>Tsunami and children affected by armed conflict</td>
<td>Desk review  &lt;br&gt; Review of probation officer records  &lt;br&gt; Ethnographic participatory methods with 335 children and 48 mothers affiliated with the children’s clubs  &lt;br&gt; Interviews were conducted at 17 schools from both districts involving students (60), 17 guidance teachers and 17 principals  &lt;br&gt; Interviews were held with service providers and staff at 10 Social Care Centres  &lt;br&gt; Data was collected from 8 Divisional Secretariat divisions  &lt;br&gt; 200 people were interviewed from 7 locations on their perceptions of child rights  &lt;br&gt; Sequential mixed method approach in three districts to compare results between Tsunami and conflict affected districts. (^{1564})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>Tsunami</td>
<td>Desk review  &lt;br&gt; 30 key informant interviews in person and by telephone  &lt;br&gt; Field work was conducted in 6 Tsunami affected provinces  &lt;br&gt; Focus group discussions (19), group interviews (17) and one-on-one interviews (4) were conducted across 40 tambons. (^{1565})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cambodia, Ethiopia</td>
<td>Mine Action</td>
<td>Desk review  &lt;br&gt; Scoping study  &lt;br&gt; Field visits to 2 Regional Offices (Thailand and Kenya) and 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country Office</th>
<th>Relevant Issues</th>
<th>Research Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Sudan and Lao | Child protection systems | • Desk review  
• Interviews with key stakeholders in Harare  
• Field research in 10 districts and 15 wards involving interviews with 1,326 children (926 ‘treatment’ and 400 ‘control’) and household heads, which were randomly selected  
• SPSS and discourse analysis was used. |
| Zimbabwe | Child protection systems | • Desk review  
• Quantitative interviews with 913 individuals in 4 out of 7 wilayas (of whom 7% are adolescents)  
• Group discussions and interviews. |
| Mauritania | Harmful practices | • Desk review  
• 2 focus group discussions with key stakeholders, partners and programme beneficiaries  
• Interviews and ad hoc surveys. |
| Togo | Child abuse | • Desk review  
• Interviews and focus group discussions with children, women, staff, partners, and stakeholders  
• KAPS survey. |
| The Comoros | Child abuse | • Desk review  
• 2 focus group discussions with key stakeholders, partners and programme beneficiaries  
• Interviews and ad hoc surveys. |
| Morocco | Child labour | • Desk review  
• Semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions. |
| Senegal | Harmful practices | • Desk review  
• 2 interventions and 1 control village. |
| Morocco | Child labour | • Desk review  
• Focus groups and interviews with practitioners, stakeholders, parents and children  
• Evaluation of educational toolkits;  
• The control group-experimental group design was applied in a sample of schools in five educational levels but this was hindered by the absence of a diagnostic pre- and post-test tool. |
| Nicaragua | Child labour | • Desk review  
• More than 500 stakeholders, practitioners and beneficiaries were consulted, of whom 15% were children and adolescents through interviews, focus groups, workshops and surveys. |
| Colombia | Children affected by armed conflict | • Desk review  
• Visits were made to 8 departments and 22 municipalities. 346 interviews were conducted involving 364 people. |

1568 Final Evaluation Report of the Programme Promoting the Abandonment of FGM/C Conducted by the Mauritania Ministry of Health and Promotion of Women (MASEF) and Tostan in Mauritania in 3 high prevalence regions.  
1570 Evaluation of Support for Child Victims of Abuse from Ngazidja and Anjouan.  
1571 Evaluation of the pilot project “Fight Against Child Labour in the Artisan Sector” in Marrakech.  
1572 Impact of the Changing Social Norms on the Behaviors in Rural Areas of Senegal. Senegal.  
1573 Evaluation of the External Programme, “Against Violence….We Educate for Peace for You, for Me and for All the World”.  
1575 Multi-project evaluation for the prevention of linking children and adolescents into armed groups and illegal care of children and adolescents demobilized from illegal armed groups. Colombia. 2010.
Appendix 4: Summary of Lessons Learnt

Child Protection Strategies

Advocacy:
- It is important to undertake stakeholder mapping in order to identify targets, influential actors and potential allies;
- It is necessary to forge partnerships with key government actors around a particular child protection issue;
- Advocacy campaigns should targeted regional, national and decentralized level stakeholders;
- Coordination structures and activities are an important vehicle for advocacy;
- Advocacy should be based on sound evidence pertaining to the root causes, incidence and impact of child protection violations;
- Advocacy should be combined with large scale awareness-raising campaigns targeting government, civil society and local communities simultaneously;
- It is useful to forge partnerships with influential local leaders (e.g. religious leaders and health professionals) to put pressure on government to reform laws and policies.
- Advocacy activities should be systematically planned;
- All advocacy activities and outcomes should be systematically documented and shared with stakeholders;
- Advocacy messages should be clear and consistent, and based on an in-depth understanding of the context and legal policy framework. They should therefore be developed in consultation with a wide range of stakeholders.
- Advocacy messages should be based on the basic rights of the child and should use international child rights instruments as their foundation.
- Strategic decisions should be made around the scope of advocacy campaigns; for instance, is it worthwhile to target a specific piece of legislation or expand to include other laws and policies related to a specific issue? Is it worthwhile to move beyond advocacy around a specific child protection issue to advocacy for wider systemic reform?
- Advocacy requires time, resources and a particular set of skills. Implementing partners’ work plans, budgets and human resource capacity should reflect these inputs.
- In order to increase advocacy leverage, it is important to coordinate advocacy activities with other humanitarian and donor agencies.
- Advocacy may be successful in terms of producing revised legislative, policy and budgetary outputs. The impact, however, may be limited because government does not have the capacity to implement these adequately.
- Advocacy should be coupled with long term development strategies so as to increase government buy-in and community-support. It should also be undertaken with activities that seek to mobilize the community, empower children and improve the quality of service provision.

Technical assistance for legal policy reform:
- In order to strengthen leverage and influence, it is necessary to consider the positioning of the technical support teams.
- Although a technical unit may be based within one government institution, advocacy and technical support should not be directed to one sector alone.
- Scope should also be considered in relation to whether technical assistance around a specific child protection issue will be effective if it is undertaken in isolation from broader systems change.
- Technical assistance in terms of legal policy reform should be coupled with implementation plans.

---

DRC Sexual violence

- Interviews with programme leaders and visits to programme sites.

---

and capacity building interventions.

- External factors that may pose a threat to the programme should be identified in the planning phase.

**Strengthening decentralized levels of governance:**

- It is essential to provide support to both central and decentralized levels of governance in order to strengthen the protective environment for children.
- It is necessary to clarify the concept ‘decentralization’ at the outset in order to ensure that all stakeholders and partners’ expectations are in alignment.
- Local plans for child protection need to be adapted to the local context.
- Quality control measures should be put in place to ensure that local plans are effective, appropriate, relevant and sustainable.
- The capacity of district, provincial and central governments should be considered when developing local plans.
- Investments should be made in strengthening coordination and communication between levels of governance (central to local) and across sectors.
- A cost analysis of the provision of child protection services should be undertaken at decentralized levels. This can be used to advocate for additional budget allocations.
- It is essential to obtain the buy-in and increase the capacity of policy makers and managers at decentralized levels.
- Support should be provided to local level government staff in terms of resources, training and psycho-social support.
- Participatory programming should be encouraged in local level planning. The involvement of community members, families and children will enable local planners to develop targeted, effective and relevant plans.

**Strengthening the social welfare sector**

**Capacity building:**

- It is essential to have an in-depth understanding of social workers’ approach and needs within the broader child protection system before designing training modules to build or strengthen their capacity.
- Strategic decisions should be made around which individuals and institutions should be trained in order to generate the greatest impact on children.
- A needs assessment would elucidate the scope and content required in the training modules.
- In order to ensure that trainees have the skills and confidence to turn their newly acquired knowledge into practice, follow-up and ongoing support is needed.
- Formal training by means of workshops is only the first step in capacity building. Evidence suggests that these courses and workshops might have an impact upon levels of knowledge but it will take time and substantial on-the-job support, to turn this knowledge into skills.
- Capacity building exercises must be monitored to ensure that objectives, targets and standards are being met adequately.
- It is necessary to document the activities, lessons and outcomes of all capacity building exercises, ranging from study visits to training workshops. This information is essential for future learning, the development of strategic plans and monitoring and evaluation purposes.
- Despite the training they have received and new skills that have been developed, many social workers cannot implement what they have learned. Investments should be made in strengthening social welfare institutions and child protection systems more generally.
- The decision to provide materials, infrastructure and transportation to social workers should rest on an identified need and demonstrable proof that these investments will lead to positive changes for children.

**Strengthening social welfare response services:**

- A rights-based approach to social welfare should form the basis of advocacy, legal policy reform and programming. Capacity strengthening should aim to ensure that children’s right to care and protection is ensured and that their best interests are fulfilled by quality service provision.
• In order to identify vulnerable children, it is very important to come up with contextually specific understandings of vulnerability and a sound strategy for identifying and engaging these children. This strategy needs to be based on the principle of the best interests of the child while also recognizing children’s own agency i.e. decision-making ability. In order to secure children’s consent to being removed from a risky situation, it is imperative that children are informed of the risk, explained the procedures and treated in a respectful and child-friendly manner.

• Programmes must live up to UNICEF’s commitment to ensure that the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children have access to services and protection. Outreach activities may be more effective in identifying and assisting these children.

• In order to make decisions about what is in the best interests of children, it is imperative that social workers and practitioners in related professions have been trained on how to conduct assessment/in-take interviews in a child-friendly manner using age-appropriate participatory methods (e.g. art, music and role play) where necessary. In addition, they need tools and guidelines on how to conduct – and document - a comprehensive interview so that children do not need to go through the trauma of being interviewed multiple times by different service providers.

• Decisions around the length of time that children spend in shelters should be based once again on ‘best interests of the child’ considerations. Children’s right to grow up in the protective environment of the family must be prioritized.

• While it is argued that efforts should be made to reach the most vulnerable children, some shelters do not have the capacity to provide assistance to them. This commitment should be followed through with a clear implementation strategy, budget and implementation plan.

• It is essential that shelters are manned by trained social workers who receive adequate supervision and support.

• In order to ensure that vulnerable children are identified by social workers and/or that they can access a full range of services, including medical, psychosocial, justice and education in a timely manner, a practical intersectoral referral protocol and case management system is needed.

Social protection:

• An effective social protection programme centred on vocational training, job and income generation counselling must be based on an in depth assessment of the labour market to ensure that the skills that are being taught are relevant, marketable and will increase employment opportunities.

• It is necessary to consult a wide range of actors when designing a programme, including stakeholders, community members, families and children; however this needs to be balanced against what is realistic, feasible and sustainable.

• Social protection programmes should take into account the socio-economic context and ensure alignment with broader poverty-alleviation efforts.

• Social protection initiatives should be relevant and age-appropriate for children in both the short and long term.

• It is not effective or appropriate to provide children with a set of skills that they cannot use in future. Social protection programmes should be specifically designed with the objective of alleviating poverty, increasing children’s opportunities and facilitating their access to a means of livelihood and survival, thereby addressing some of the underlying causes of violence.

• It was held that vocational training is only the first step, resources should be directed at following up on those children and parents who have received assistance, for instance after they have graduated in order to provide them with support to enter the labour market or sell commercial products.

• Social protection programmes should develop creative strategies to reach the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children.

• While it is extremely important to target the most vulnerable, attention should also be given to other children in the community. Perceptions of bias or injustice are likely to hinder reintegration efforts.

• Social protection programmes should take into consideration gender issues when selecting trainees and designing vocational training and income generating activities.
• Like all child protection programmes, social protection must not promote activities that jeopardize adults and children’s safety and wellbeing. Ethics should be given primacy.
• It is essential to be transparent about a programme’s objectives from the outset, so as not to raise expectations.
• Guidance material that is developed for trainers and trainees must be sensitive to the socio-cultural and linguistic context.
• In order to monitor the effectiveness of social protection programmes, make necessary adjustments to the programme and share information about its activities and outcomes, documentation and clear monitoring and evaluation strategy is very important.
• In order to strengthen social protection it is necessary to forge partnerships between different stakeholders, including government, NGOs, CSOs and private sector. These partners can assist by providing training or livelihood opportunities.
• Budgetary needs should be calculated at the outset so that the programme can be efficient, effective and sustainable.
• Micro-credit may not be appropriate in certain contexts as the uptake of loans was found to be low in impoverished communities.
• The appropriateness of unconditional cash transfers need to be considered in light of the socio-economic and cultural context, as well as in light of the range of children’s needs that must to be met. Children and families may need a more integrated package of services than a cash handout; however, an integrated package of services that does not meet their economic needs might hinder children’s access to services.
• The decision to use cash transfers should be considered in terms of what this cash would mean to communities, families and children themselves.
• In order to be effective, clear and transparent targeting criteria, selection mechanisms and disbursement processes should be established at the outset.
• In order to prevent the misuse of funds, investments should be made in administration, verification, documentation, monitoring and evaluation activities.
• In order to ensure positive changes for children, programmers and policy-makers should consider the inclusion of social protection within broader child protection strategies, or the incorporation of child protection outcomes in social protection strategies.

**Strengthening the justice and security sectors**

• Children’s inalienable right to protection and respect for their dignity and self-worth as witnesses, victims and offenders should form the basis upon which interventions related to the justice and security sectors are advocated, designed, implemented, monitored and evaluated.
• The mandate of structures established in the justice sector need to be clearly developed from the outset in consultation with a range of stakeholders.
• The roles and responsibilities of relevant stakeholders at national and decentralized levels should be delegated, documented and monitored.
• A relevant and practical intersectoral referral protocol should be developed at national and decentralized levels.
• Given the intersectoral nature of child protection, partnerships, coordination mechanisms and clear lines of accountability are essential.
• Justice initiatives should be based on strategic plans and associated budgetary frameworks to ensure effectiveness and sustainability.
• UNICEF and partners should advocate for the inclusion of prevention in justice and law enforcement responses; this will require a change in mind-set about child protection rights, ‘root causes’ of juvenile justice issues, the scope of prevention interventions, and the importance of intersectoral programming.
• Child participation and empowerment should be enabled through individual legal guarantees and services in judicial and administrative proceedings, but also in protocols, rules and programmes in collective settings and activities. However, the ethics of encouraging child participation in law enforcement responses (e.g. as informants) should be carefully considered.
• Investments should be made in empowering children, families and communities to improve their access to justice.
• The cultural, practical and logistical challenges of birth registration should be considered in strategic planning.
• Government agencies should be strengthened in terms of human resources, materials and financing to fulfil their international and national obligations around birth registration.
• Investments should be made in raising awareness of parents and communities about the value of birth registration and the process by which necessary documentation can be obtained.

**Strengthening the education sector**

• In order to overcome resistance from teachers and school principals, it is necessary to involve them in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the programme. It is necessary to educate them on the value of the programme, adopt an appreciative approach to their current work practices, promote their roles as agents of change, re-instil their confidence in the role that the education sector can play in child protection, incentivize their participation so that it is not seen as a burden, take into account their heavy workloads and personal commitments, and encourage their engagement with parents and members of the community.
• Training courses should be designed on the basis of identified needs, consultation with key stakeholders, a comprehensive mapping of existing programmes, structures and role players, and in-depth research into power dynamics, current practices, norms and values.
• Results-based management requires careful consideration of assumptions and risks. In the context of training, it is important not to make assumptions about the existing capacity of teachers and schools.
• Training should be followed by practical in service training and support in order to ensure that newly acquired knowledge and skills are being implemented properly.
• Many teachers and/or their predecessors need refresher training to reinforce the knowledge and skills gained in the first round of training, and to ensure that their teaching methods and content remains relevant and in line with child protection principles.
• In order to scale up training programmes, the trainer of trainers model can be used if it is undertaken in a comprehensive and systematic manner, bearing in mind the budgetary and human resources implications of such an approach.
• The institutional context should be taken into account when designing training courses for teachers from both a practical and normative perspective; wider institutional change may be more effective than teacher training.
• In order to ensure that teachers can implement what they have learnt, it is necessary to obtain the buy in of managers and supervisors.
• In order to ensure the training methods are successful in producing changes in the lives of children, a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation plan with highly specific indicators and data collection methods should be developed at the outset.
• The community should be engaged in education strengthening activities.
• The decision to make ‘hardware’ investments (e.g. materials, infrastructure) in schools should be based on identified needs, consultation with staff and stakeholders, training of staff on the use of such materials, and systematic monitoring to ensure that they are used appropriately.
• The safety and security of beneficiaries, teachers and implementing partners should be prioritized.
• Some children who are being reintegrated in the school environment may need bridging classes to improve their performance, ongoing psycho-social support and assistance to interact socially with the peer group.

**Strengthening health and mental health/psychosocial sectors**

• Children’s right to access quality health services and attain the highest standard of health should inform policy and programming in this sector.
• In order to ensure that training modules are relevant and appropriate, it is essential to conduct a needs assessment and undertake piloting before they are rolled out. Adaptations should then be made to levels of difficulty; language, terminology and concepts; and local understandings of trauma and child protection.
• In service training and supervision, the development of professional terms of references, ongoing
monitoring and evaluation, formalized communication channels, information sharing and coordination with other psychologists and professions should be included in strategic plans.

- Training on psychosocial counselling should also be provided to other professionals and paraprofessionals who interact with children.
- Psychologists and counsellors should also be provided with psycho-social support, particularly in post-conflict and post-emergency settings.
- Training on health care methods should be practical and demonstrable.
- In addition to first aid training, health care professionals and civil society representatives need training on programme management (including data collection, needs assessments, communication and advocacy) so as to ensure the sustainability of interventions.
- All health care professionals should receive training on how to identify and respond to child abuse and harmful practices.

Direct health and psychosocial services to children:

- Partnerships should be forged with academic institutions to undertake research on highly contextual socio-cultural constructions of psychosocial wellbeing in order to ensure that strategies are relevant, comprehensive and systematic.
- Participatory activities should be used to understand what these concepts meant to adolescents themselves, so as to ensure that activities are more targeted and effective.
- It is essential to adapt psycho-social counselling techniques to the local culture, for example by using traditional cleansing ceremonies and/or by adapting therapeutic materials to the linguistic and socio-cultural context.
- Innovative participatory, highly interactive and age-appropriate psychosocial methods were found to be particularly effective.
- Child protection programmes should try to ensure the inclusion of the most marginalized, vulnerable and ‘hidden’ children by designing activities to identify these children (e.g. outreach) and by finding creative solutions to challenges such as geography, logistics and cost that inhibits access.
- In addition to the most vulnerable children the needs of other children in the community should also be considered so as to ensure that perceptions of unfairness and injustice do not undermine the effectiveness of the programme or affect the reintegration and wellbeing of child beneficiaries. Targeting should therefore be undertaken very sensitively, transparently and in a highly participatory manner.
- The capacity of professionals to implement training courses should be considered when designing participatory and interactive interventions so as to ensure that they have the background and basic foundational knowledge to understand and implement new concepts and techniques.
- Investments should be made in developing referral protocols on the one hand, but also in strengthening the capacity of institutions and staff to identify, refer and respond to such cases.
- Gender issues should be considered when providing psycho-social assistance. It is important to recognize the vulnerability of girls and boys in different contexts.
- In order to measure the impact of psychosocial interventions it is necessary to invest in monitoring and evaluation, including baselines, indicator setting, documentation, information management, and qualitative and quantitative monitoring mechanisms.
- Health education should provide children with practical skills to engage in alternative, safer and more productive activities.
- The medical and psychosocial needs of mine survivors should be addressed within mine action programmes and/or programmes directed to children living with disabilities.
- Standardized referral mechanisms should be established at local and district levels to promote efficient and effective responses to children’s health problems.
- The cost of laboratory and other medical fees should also be considered when budgeting for health care provision.

Strengthening coordination structures and mechanisms:

- The mandate of the coordination structure must be defined at the outset in a participatory manner.
involving all key stakeholders. This should be formalized in a highly context specific terms of reference (TOR) and used as the basis against which members are appointed and strategic plans developed.

- In addition to defining the mandate of the coordination structure, it is essential to delegate specific roles and responsibilities - and corresponding accountability mechanisms - for each member. These should be widely disseminated to stakeholders and beneficiaries to ensure effectiveness and transparency.
- Time-bound and budgeted strategic plans should be developed for coordination structures on the basis of evidence and in consultation with other key stakeholders.
- The institutional positioning of a coordination structure should be carefully considered in order to obtain government buy-in, facilitate access to human and financial resources, streamline decision-making and encourage the active participation of representatives from other sectors.
- In order to ensure that members of coordination structures deliver, it is important that they have an institution or individual to report to using a structured format and mechanism.
- The minutes of meetings and workshops should be documented with clear actions for different members.
- Reporting should be accompanied by follow up to ensure that coordination structures are action and results-oriented.
- Information management, data collection and monitoring activities should be prioritized by coordination structures to assist in planning and quality control.
- Vertical and horizontal information sharing between beneficiaries, partners and stakeholders should be encouraged.
- Strategic plans and work plans should account for delays associated with collaborative and consensus-building exercises within coordination structures.
- UNICEF should carefully consider its ongoing support to coordination structures that have become politicized bodies with vested political interests.
- Coordination structures should be appropriately funded so that they are able to fulfil what is often a labour and resource intensive mandate.
- In addition to strengthening coordination structures, it is essential to strengthen the capacity (institutional, financial, material and human resources) of individual members so that they can fulfil their roles and responsibilities.
- It is important to institutionalize/ formalize cooperation and coordination with government structures and partners as the level of engagement is often inconsistent and based on personal interest rather than institutional commitment.
- Referral systems should be regulated and include a legal obligation to exchange information among relevant actors in timely manner.
- National referral systems and case management procedures should include assessment, follow-up and regular communication, but should also take into account the varied capacity of service providers across the country to respond to such referrals.

Conceptual frameworks to support social change programmes:

- It is essential to develop a holistic programme that focuses on the child, family, community and government in order to promote social change;
- A developmental perspective to child protection is needed that recognizes children’s resilience, local strengths and contextually and culturally specific child rearing practices.
- The family and extended family should be strengthened to create a protective environment and promote social change within the community.
- It is necessary to ensure that theoretical/conceptual approaches developed elsewhere are adapted to the local context.
- It is useful to identify respected individuals within the community who can promote social change either because they are refraining from carrying out a harmful practice or because they are promoting positive practices.
- Programmes working at the level of the community need to adopt a participatory and culturally sensitive approach.
- Community-based approaches should encourage the engagement of all individuals and families
in order to promote changes in social norms.

- Efforts should be made to move beyond the village level to inter-village relations and the wider geographical area in order to stimulate the sharing of information and dialogue.
- It is imperative to understand the impact of social norms on the effectiveness of a programme. This may require programmers to consider working at multiple levels (e.g. at the level of the community and the school), in multiple phases (e.g. at the level of the community first and then the school) or extending the life of a programme.

**Strengthening the protective environment of the family:**

*Prevention and response:*

- A rights-based perspective to family preservation should inform all child protection interventions. This should not be seen as a ‘nice to have’ or ‘add on’ to existing programmes, but should be at the core of all child protection activities, as children have a fundamental and inalienable right to grow up in the protective environment of the family. This is also imperative from a developmental perspective.
- Although family preservation activities are essential, programmes should also focus on alternative care, particularly when it is not in children’s best interest to be cared for by their parents;
- Parents of child victims of abuse and violence, need far more intensive programmes with multiple sessions and visits from case workers; they may also need psychosocial counselling in order to create a protective environment for their children;
- In order to ensure meaningful parental participation, logistics (e.g. cost of transportation), compensation and scheduling should be carefully considered;
- It is essential to communicate and follow-up with parents, but the necessary infrastructure (e.g. telephones), time and human resources should also be in place;
- Some parents remain resistant to children’s participation in programmes. More efforts should be made to raise awareness of the benefits of attendance by bringing them on board at the outset of the programme;
- Programmes that seek to enhance the psycho-social wellbeing of children, should also consider that of parents;
- Intra-household violence can affect the wellbeing of child beneficiaries. Family preservation and dispute mediation activities should also be developed.

*Return and reintegration*

- As return and reintegration activities involve a number of different stakeholders often operating in different communities and countries, it is imperative to establish coordination structures and mechanisms. It will also require partnerships with counterparts in different countries and communities based on clear standard operating procedures for returning children who may be undocumented, separated and unaccompanied.
- It is important to build the capacity of local service providers and civil society organizations so that they can undertake family assessments in a timely manner and effectively monitor and provide support services for children and their families in their places of origin. In addition to funding, communication and transportation, these actors need training on case management. One institution and/or responsible party should be held responsible and accountable for managing a particular case in the short and long term.
- Structured tools and feedback mechanisms should be developed and widely disseminated.
- In ‘deinstitutionalization’ programmes it is useful to obtain the support of residential staff and management who could obstruct progress and effectiveness. It is imperative to ensure that residential staff and management understand why it is necessary for children to live with their parents. It may be useful to incentivize their participation for example by providing them with training, employment counselling, and other opportunities after the institutions have been closed.
- The decision to return a child home should be based on a best interests and the determination of those interests should rest on a comprehensive assessment of the child’s wellbeing and the situation of the family at home. These assessments should include an analysis of the child’s psychosocial and physical wellbeing. In addition to socio-economic assessments, it is necessary
to assess relationships and power dynamics within the family.

- Children’s consent must be given primacy. If they do not want to return home, child-centred techniques can be used to find out the reasons why and on this basis develop solutions or come up with alternatives. Ethically child protection agencies cannot return children home to an environment where they are being abused, exploited or harmed in another way.
- Simply removing children from institutions and returning the child home will not produce positive results, unless it is combined with activities that strengthen the family and enhance its protective potential. Families should be prepared in advance for their children’s return and should be provided with parenting skills training and support, family mediation, counselling etc.
- An important component of reintegration is awareness raising so as to change norms and misconceptions that institutions are a safer and better environment or that it is better for a child to live in another community or country.
- Family strengthening activities should include a social protection component, as poverty and economic insecurity is one of the main reasons why parents feel their children’s best interests would be served in an institution and/or why decisions are made about their migration abroad.
- In addition to family strengthening, reintegration involves working closely with individuals, groups and institutions in the community. For example, elsewhere in the report reference was made to the pivotal role that schools can play in children’s reintegration.
- Longitudinal assessments will provide a clearer picture of the impact of these interventions on children. The evaluations under review were not able to provide information about the situation of children once they have returned home.

**Alternative care:**

- Programmers should carefully consider the appropriateness of formal guardianship given the salience of the extended family in certain communities.
- Family preservation and social protection interventions should also be directed to foster care parents, grandparents and other relatives who have assumed responsibility for the child so as to prevent secondary separation in the face of high socio-economic deprivation.

**Strengthening the protective environment of the community:**

**Public education and social dialogue:**

- Public awareness and social dialogue campaigns should be based on an in-depth knowledge of the local context. Evidence-based planning (e.g. research and consultation) should be included in budgets and work plans.
- These campaigns should be designed and managed by staff who has been trained in this regard. Community based volunteers and staff should also be trained on how to transfer information and mobilize a wider audience.
- In order to increase the reach of these campaigns to outlying communities, it is necessary to invest in infrastructure, transportation and communication. This is particularly important as many vulnerable and marginalized children are ‘hidden’ in these communities with little access to services.
- Public awareness campaigns should be sufficiently budgeted to allow for printing and dissemination of materials, the development of innovative local programmes and accompanying social protection interventions, and extended or repeated phases of sensitization.
- In order to maximize impact it is necessary to coordinate behaviour change initiatives – or simply ensure alignment of key messages - which are being implemented by different organizations.
- Activities and results should be documented at the local level and shared with managers and donors.
- Supervision and monitoring is essential to ensure effective and efficient results.
- It is important to have an in-depth understanding of the risks that will be encountered in local communities, including the salience of social values and norms which could lead to resistance from community members and ostracization (and subsequent high turnover) of volunteers; beliefs and norms that might contradict programme messages; community’s perceptions of programmes as foreign and imposed interventions; ethnic, caste and class differences which could cause tensions etc. The campaign can then be designed and adapted accordingly.
It is important to adopt an appreciative approach to communities, recognizing their strengths and resources (e.g. salience of networks). These can be harnessed to ensure programme effectiveness.

Programmers should spend time ensuring that public education messages are relevant and appropriate in terms of issues, language, cultural and contextual references.

Messages need to be clear, consistent and based on accurate definitions.

It is important to develop a strategy at the outset; however, this strategy needs to be flexible to suit the changing dynamic and emerging issues on the ground.

In order to ensure relevance and appropriateness, messages should be designed with the input of a range of stakeholders. Communities should be given an opportunity to design their own messages.

Targeting should be based on an identification of high risk groups. Messages should be designed around their particular motives for engaging in risky behaviour. This information can be gathered from consultation or research.

Public education campaigns were found to be particularly effective when they made a ‘tangible’ contribution to the community; for example, by addressing needs for health, education and social protection services. This supports the importance of inter-programming.

Programmers should also be realistic: people may not stop engaging in risky practices unless they are provided with an alternative source of livelihood.

When drawing up a LogFrame and work plan it is necessary to recognize that behaviour change is a time and resource intensive process.

Engaging the media:

- The capacity of journalists should be strengthened to improve the quality, accuracy and ethics of reporting on child protection issues.
- The media should be encouraged to include human interest stories involving children, families and the community.
- Media interest should not influence the strategic direction of programmes.

Community outreach and development activities:

- These activities require dedicated and trained outreach staff and coordinators.
- The safety and security of staff should be prioritized and considered in planning.
- The effectiveness of outreach activities depends largely on the availability of institutional support. Community members will stop reporting cases of abuse if they receive no response from the relevant government agencies.
- As outreach is such a valuable way of identifying vulnerable, marginalized and hidden children, it should be sufficiently funded and regularized.
- Developmental activities should be undertaken in partnership with organizations who are undertaking similar activities.
- In order to ensure quality control, it is important to ensure that teams are adequately supervised and monitored.
- The importance of documenting activities and results needs to be emphasized.
- It is particularly difficult to measure the effectiveness of prevention interventions given the ambiguity of reporting statistics and attribution.

Collaboration with local leaders and stakeholders:

- In order to ensure effectiveness, relevance and sustainability it is important to go beyond informing or merely consulting local leaders, but they should be actively engaged in designing, implementing and monitoring programmes.
- Depending on their role, community leaders may also need training on activities and specific child protection issues.
- At the outset, it is important to identify the possible risks that resistant local leaders can pose for programme effectiveness and plan accordingly.

Volunteers and community-based child protection committees:
• Volunteers should be selected on the basis of their commitment to children’s rights, experience and skills to ensure that the community views them as trust-worthy and reliable.
• Engaging the private sector to assume membership of child protection committees should be carefully considered, especially if their interests run contrary to the child protection programme.
• The mandate of the community-based child protection committee and the roles and responsibilities of individual members should be defined formally at the outset.
• A basic stipend should be considered for volunteers so as to reduce high staff turnover and the costs of repeat training. Alternatively, income generation activities for volunteers should be developed.
• Streamlining of procedures and payments is necessary to ensure regularity and consistency of activities at the community level.
• Community-based child protection committees are more effective in mobilizing children around child rights when ‘tangible’ forms of assistance are provided to communities. The capacity of these volunteers should be strengthened to play a role in social protection programmes.
• Some form of identification gives volunteers easier access to individual homesteads, increases levels of reporting available to them, and allows for recognition of their initiative and impact.
• There are a number of training gaps which need to be overcome to strengthen the capacity of volunteers. They should also be equipped with formal tools and guidelines.
• Psycho-social support should be provided to volunteers who may come face to face with emotionally disturbing incidences.
• Referral procedures needs to be clearly and repeatedly articulated as many volunteers do not know the limits of their powers, do not understand the extent to which they can intervene in cases of abuse, and get demoralized when they receive no feedback on cases that they have referred.
• Referrals often involve communicating by telephone with service providers, transporting children and their parents so that they can access a service, and providing food and immediate assistance to desperate households. Volunteers should be compensated for these expenses in a timely manner.
• Community-based child protection committees need to strengthen their linkages with relevant government structures and NGOs working at the community level.
• These committees need to obtain the support of traditional authorities in order to obtain some legitimacy and authority in the community.
• Innovative methods and interventions (and results) need to be documented and shared widely to improve child protection programming.
• Volunteers require ongoing mentoring, supervision and monitoring.
• Programmes may be more sustainable if they give community-based child protection committees greater power and autonomy to define their own agenda and actions.

Child participation:
• Child participation should be driven by a rights-based approach and the overarching objective of empowering children to claim their rights and become more resilient.
• It is important to ensure meaningful participation by giving children an opportunity to have a say and an impact over policies and programmes that affect them at decentralized and national levels. This should go beyond formalized consultation processes at the outset of the programme or annually, but their participation throughout the programme cycle should be encouraged.
• Independence of functioning should be improved in children’s clubs so that they can have a greater say over membership and activities; however, this needs to be carefully balanced by ongoing support and supervision.
• Children’s structures should be used as an opportunity to encourage discussion and dialogue on gender-related issues among girls and boys.
• Efforts should be made to encourage girls to participate actively in the clubs, even if it involves obtaining the buy in of their parents and/or husbands. In some contexts it may be more appropriate to run clubs divided along gendered lines.
• The participation of children living with disabilities should be encouraged by the provision of transportation, equipment and additional staff where necessary.
• Children’s clubs require investments in terms of venues, materials, infrastructure and logistics in
order to ensure their continued functioning.

- Children’s clubs should be embedded within the wider community so that they become a structure through which children can make a contribution to their communities and vice versa. They should not be seen as empowering children at the expense of adults or giving children power to act out and disobey their parents and elders. Involving parents and community members in child participation activities will help overcome some of these misconceptions. Support from adults will provide added incentives for children to participate actively and regularly in these structures. It is therefore necessary to invest time in overcoming some of the adult resistance documented in the reports by educating them on the benefits that child participation will bring to children, families, schools and communities.

- Children and support staff should be trained on how to document their activities, as well as record and refer cases of abuse.

- Children’s clubs require extensive guidance and support; this should be factored into the work plans of staff.

- Children should be involved in monitoring and evaluation as they are best placed to say what impact programmes have had on their lives.

- Children’s clubs should be nurtured by local organizations which will allow for the development of in-built sustainability strategies (e.g. village driven fundraising and mentorship from local organizations).

- The recruitment and training of certain children and youth should be undertaken sensitively and transparently to avoid feelings of exclusion and dissatisfaction from other children in the community.

- Children and youth should receive adequate training and information to respond to the concerns raised by other children in the course of their counselling and education activities.

- Research should be undertaken to understand the factors behind the high turnover of youth and child volunteers. If the issue relates to remuneration, the appropriateness of a reward scheme should be considered. Rewards could include access to education, vocational training or support with income generation activities.

- A clear ethical protocol should be developed from the outset so that decisions can be made on the basis of children’s best interests.

**Engaging the private sector:**

- Programmes should develop a larger strategy for social mobilization rather than simply engaging with individual companies.

- In order to advocate for change in internal labour practices, it is useful to employ sound business arguments; for example, it is important to educate child labourers because literate employers are valuable.

- The ethics of working with the private sector whose interests are often diametrically opposed to those of the child protection sector should be carefully considered. For instance, communities may lose faith in a child protection programme that appears to collaborate with employers who recruit child labourers.

- Private partners should also receive training on child rights and where appropriate, be involved in programme design and implementation.

- All engagement with the private sector should be transparent, documented and monitored closely.

**Overall Cross-cutting Principles and OECD/DAC Criteria**

**Logical frameworks:**

- It is essential that programmers use LogFrames or similar planning tools that will allow them to decide what strategies will elicit the results needed to meet an objective.

- These tools should be used at the outset of a programme and be based on an in-depth understanding of the local context, the issue at hand, clarity of vision, realistic objectives and a sound, holistic strategy.

- Programmers need to invest time and resources into mapping risks and assumptions so that they
can be explicitly listed in the LogFrame and inform contingency strategies.

- Inputs such as human and financial resources should be carefully considered when developing strategic plans. Many of the programmes in this evaluation were not efficient due to human resource and funding constraints. These need to be accounted for at the outset so that the strategy can be adapted accordingly.

- It is essential that LogFrames are internally logical and coherent in terms of the relationship between objectives, inputs, strategies and results, and sequencing of activities. Emphasis should be placed on outcomes and impacts, rather than on processes. Intended results should be accompanied by measurable time-bound indicators which are clear, concrete and objectively verifiable. Means of verification for each indicator needs to be defined at the outset. LogFrames also need to be adaptable to the dynamic and changing context, while being consistent in terms of overall goals and approach.

- LogFrames should be accompanied by a detailed implementation plan that defines tasks, roles and responsibilities for all stakeholders involved.

- As is evident in this evaluation, partners require capacity strengthening, supervision and support during this planning process.

Relevance and appropriateness:

- Objectives must be based on an identifiable need at national and community levels, as can be ascertained by a review of previous literature, a needs assessment or situational analysis, mapping of related programmes, and consultation with stakeholders and potential beneficiaries (adults and children). Efforts should be made to ensure that these activities are undertaken by local partners who are familiar with the economic, political, social and cultural context.

- The programmes must be designed in consultation with local stakeholders, often with guidance from external experts. This will involve a detailed analysis of risks and assumptions, as well as consultative – and potentially time-consuming – planning processes.

- The objectives and approach should be consistent with national priorities, legal policy frameworks and international obligations, as well as with UNICEF’s country, regional and global child protection strategies.

- The programmes should be implemented in partnership with local actors and in alignment with existing programmes, so as to avoid duplication and ensure complementary approaches.

- The programmes should be flexible and adaptable to changing local circumstances.

- All interventions and materials need to be culturally sensitive.

Evidence-based planning

The following should be considered with embarking on activities such as a needs assessment, situational assessment, piloting and operational research:

- The design and implementation of these activities should be based on the participation of stakeholders (local and international), community members and children;

- In terms of scope, research should consider the individual, interpersonal and macro socio-economic, political and cultural context. In addition it should be accompanied by a stakeholder analysis and institutional assessments when looking for targets, partners and allies. The research should clarify operational definitions, be action-oriented and facilitate future monitoring and evaluation activities.

- It is imperative to choose a methodology that can look at ‘change’ i.e. the extent to which the lives of children, families, communities and child protection systems have been affected by a programme. A few options should be considered including mixed methods approaches, participatory and ethnographic methods, longitudinal studies and the use of control groups.

- The timing of research should also be carefully considered. It need not be a once off event but can be undertaken throughout the course of the programmes to adapt, redirect and strengthen programmes.

- Piloting of programmes and documentation of results is essential so as to ensure the necessary adaptations are made to contextual realities.

- Local partners and stakeholders should be trained on how to undertake the necessary basic assessments at grass roots level, instead of relying on international consultants who are not familiar with the local context.

- It is essential to disseminate the findings of research widely to verify findings and to develop
recommendations; this can form the basis for a participatory approach to programme design.

- Evidence should be used to inform the strategic direction of a programme. Strategic plans should indicate a degree of flexibility and adaptability to changing circumstances.
- Identified needs - over and above the interests of donors - should inform programme design.

**Monitoring and evaluation:**

- Comprehensive monitoring and evaluation (M&E) frameworks should be developed at the start of a programme based on clear indicators to measure change and systematic collection of data. It should focus not only on activities, processes and budgets but on results to determine whether a programme is meeting its objectives. Qualitative and quantitative indicators should be used depending on the change to be measured.
- It is imperative that local stakeholders be involved in the development of M&E frameworks, encouraged to provide input into M&E exercises and should have access to documents and findings.
- If data collection forms are developed at a regional or global level, they must be adapted to suit the specific context.
- The methodology that is selected should allow for measurements of ‘change’; for instance, the use of baselines, pre- and post- intervention studies and longitudinal studies.
- When appropriate, child participation in monitoring and evaluation activities should be encouraged. Children are best positioned to comment on how a programme has affected them. Similarly, parents and communities should be encouraged to participate as beneficiaries or key informants.
- Roles and responsibilities for data collection, analysis, storage and supervision should be clearly and transparently allocated at the start of the programme.
- Staff, and ideally a dedicated monitoring officer, should receive comprehensive training on the M&E framework, reporting and documentation requirements. Ongoing support which includes field visits (planned and unplanned) will be required.
- Risks including infrastructural and environmental constraints should be identified at the outset so that the M&E framework can make the necessary adaptations.
- M&E depends largely on documentation, systematically compiled and disaggregated data collection and clear reporting systems, as well as information management systems for compilation, analysis and storing of data.
- Monitoring and evaluation reports should be widely shared with programme staff, partners, donors and stakeholders in order to encourage learning, verify findings, ensure transparency, foster a sense of local ownership, and to encourage participatory approaches to programming.
- UNICEF should assume a more active role in monitoring activities and supporting partners to address their M&E concerns.
- M&E outputs must contribute to planning and decision-making processes.

**Knowledge management: Information Management System (IMS)**

- The objective of the IMS should be defined and articulated at the outset i.e. is it a national planning and coordination tool, case management tool or a programme management tool?
- The development of the IMS should be undertaken in consultation with key stakeholders.
- The institutional positioning of the IMS should be carefully considered to ensure local ownership and make efficient use of existing infrastructure and skills.
- During the development phase, potential infrastructural challenges should be considered.
- The IMS should be designed with the potential users, data type (e.g. qualitative or quantitative), clear terminology/categories and overarching objectives of the programmes in mind.
- Programmers should consider adapting IMS systems and tools developed in other contexts, or building them on government run information systems to make them more cost effective and sustainable.
- Community-based approaches to data collection are valuable but do require substantial training, support and supervision around key concepts, methods and ethics.
- Adequate resources should be allocated to data entry and analysis to ensure that databases are accurate, regularly updated and cross-checked.
• Quality control and data cleaning is essential to ensure the validity of data.
• Staff and partners should be trained on reporting, data entry and analysis.
• Analysis should consider the local context when interpreting the data and deriving conclusions. Quantitative figures may be misleading and provide a false impression of the situation on the ground.
• Data results should be shared widely with staff, partners and stakeholders.
• Results emerging out of an IMS must be used for strategic planning purposes.
• Databases can be used for case management and referrals. Linking or integrating databases across sectors and organizations would support this purpose, although it should be clear who is responsible for managing and following up on the progress of a particular case.

**Information and communications:**
• A well planned communication strategy should be dynamic and adaptable.
• Documentation of all experiences and lessons should be prioritized so that information remains comprehensive, accurate and timely.
• Methods include structured meetings, engagement with formal networks, workshops and conferences. The meaningful participation of a wide range of stakeholders in different sectors and across levels of governance should be encouraged.
• It is essential to share information with the community in order to develop sustainable interventions and strategies that are culturally grounded and based on a clear understanding of children’s resilience and the community’s capacity. Such activities will help the community shape their own responses to protection issues, and build capacity.
• In order to improve case management, formal communication channels across agencies should be developed.
• Language considerations should be taken into account when disseminating printed materials and reports.
• Information and communications should be streamlined so as to support M&E, knowledge management, results-based management and participatory programming.
• The quality of reporting should be strengthened by supervision and capacity building exercises.
• UNICEF should facilitate cross-over of information sharing among partners, rather than support vertical reporting structures.
• Internal communication within UNICEF should be strengthened to allow for intersectoral and integrated programming.

**Multi-partner guidance:**
• To ensure relevance, guidelines need to be developed locally and/or adapted to the local context. They need to be linguistically, culturally and contextually specific.
• The buy-in of key stakeholders is necessary to ensure that the guidelines will be used and disseminated.
• Guidelines are only valuable in so far as they are accessible and widely available to practitioners and service providers.
• There are still gaps in documentation related to specific child protection issues, which need to be overcome.

**Participatory programming:**
• Participatory programming should rest on an appreciative approach. In other words, it is necessary to recognize and harness existing strengths at the level of the child, family, community and child protection systems.
• Participation is potentially empowering if it is undertaken appropriately and meaningfully.
• Apart from involving children in public events, it is necessary to engage them in the development of programme plans using child-appropriate methods.
• There were few examples involving the active participation of parents in programme design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. This should be addressed in future programme.
• Although a number of programmes engaged with the community in different capacities, involving
the community in design remained a gap in many programme. This should be improved to ensure
greater levels of ownership and sustainability.

- In addition to ad hoc consultation of NGOs and CSOs, it is useful to share tools, harmonize
messages, harness resources and expertise, and collaborate on programmes and management
of specific cases in a truly multi-agency approach to child protection.
- In terms of consultation of government, it is important to integrate programmes and programmes
into the national strategy, situate the management of programmes formally within government
deptments and strengthen national coordination mechanisms.
- It is important to engage in dialogue with donors who are funding other child-protection
programmes, harness the advocacy role that donors can play, improve reporting to donors and
coordinate donor funding.
- Within UNICEF there should be collaboration and coordination around complementary
programmes.

**Efficiency: timeliness**

- Delays can be overcome by strengthening work plans, streamlining procedures and financial
management, strengthening capacity, improving coordination, and accounting for possible delays
associated with logistics, infrastructure, geography, security and other external factors in the
programme development phase.

**Efficiency: cost**

- Programmers should ensure that strategic decisions to maximize the utilization of relatively
scarce resources are not made at the expense of quality programming across the continuum of
care (prevention, early intervention, response, reintegration and follow-up).
- The decision to fund ‘hardware’ or ‘software’ should not be based on economic considerations
alone. Some hardware driven interventions may have lower unit costs, be more ‘tangible’ and
appear to be more efficient than software, but they may not be as effective and sustainable in
terms of meeting the short and long term needs of children, families and communities.
- Similarly, the decision to focus on prevention or direct assistance, outreach or centre based
activities should not be based on cost alone but on what will make the biggest difference in the
lives of vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children.
- Gathering data on expenditure and undertaking cost analysis are priorities in improve budgeting,
monitoring and evaluation, and overall efficiency and effectiveness.
- A number of challenges, constraints and gaps were identified in relation to financial management
and funding disbursement. It is evident that capacity building and streamlining of procedures
within UNICEF and partner institutions is essential to improve efficiency and effectiveness.

**Efficiency: coordination**

- Selection criteria of NGO and CSO partners need to be defined at the outset to ensure
transparency. This should include institutional assessments and careful consideration of
contractual relationships.
- Roles and responsibilities of NGO and CSO partners should be clarified and formalized.
- Training, mentoring and support of NGO and CSO partners should be improved, particularly in
the area of programme management.

**Sustainability:**

- Exit strategies need to be clearly communicated with partners and beneficiaries to avoid
confusion.
- There is a need for a fundraising strategy supported by a longer term vision in order to ensure
sustainability.
- Securing the commitment of the community and fostering a sense of ownership is essential to
sustainability.
- Communities need to appreciate the value of the programmes in responding to their needs; this
may mean that child protection programmes become more multi-sectoral and/or include a social
protection component.
• Communities need to regard the programmes as respectful of their traditions and culture, in order to ensure sustained commitment.
• Government ownership is essential for sustainability. Measures to enhance sustainability include: forming partnerships at national and decentralized levels, cost sharing, capacity strengthening, positioning programmes within government structures, developing multi-partner guidance for the scale up and sustainability of the model (as opposed to the specific programme) and encouraging the incorporation of child protection in decentralized levels of governance.

Equity:
• Equity should be prioritized in all child protection programmes.
• Strategically, consideration should be given to the importance of balancing a mainstreaming approach to child protection versus focusing on the vulnerability of specific groups of children. In addition, strategies should be developed around how to target the most vulnerable, marginalized and ‘hidden’ children without alienating non-beneficiaries.
• Progress has been made in terms of gender equity but more effort and resources should be invested in addressing gender in planning and implementation. This will require the collection of gender disaggregated data, measures to enhance girls’ participation from both a practical and normative perspective, the use of gender-sensitive materials and activities, gender-sensitive recruitment and capacity building of staff, guidance on how to address complex issues such as early marriage and ‘young mothers’, advocacy and technical support for gender mainstreaming within government and NGO partners, and a balanced gender perspective that addresses constructions of femininity and masculinity, and encourages the inclusion of both girls and boys.
• Extensive work still needs to be done to ensure the needs and rights of children living with disabilities are met. Further in-depth research on the manner in which disabilities are socially constructed is also required to understand how this impacts upon children’s agency, identity and vulnerability/resilience. Multi-partner guidance should be developed to assist partners, and measures should be put in place to address barriers to access, some of which are logistical and material, but others relate to social norms that shroud this issue with stigma, shame and superstition.
• Interventions should also ensure that other vulnerable and marginalized children can adequately participate and benefit from programmes. These children include those in rural and outlying areas, children from migrant communities, children from poverty stricken communities, child affected by HIV and AIDS, children out of school, young children and adolescents.

Ethical soundness:
• It is essential that all partners develop and adhere to a strict child protection/safeguarding policy that includes background checks for prospective employees and volunteers, a code of conduct (including staff conduct, safety and security, child and parental consent, confidentiality, payments/rewards, how to manage expectations, age-appropriate methods of communication etc.), training and refresher training, the identification of focal points (who can respond to an emergency), internal referral protocols, guidance on the collection, use and storing of sensitive data, and whistle blowing policies. Funding should be contingent on the development of these policies and mechanisms.
• The safety and security of beneficiaries (adults and children), staff and even evaluators should be prioritized at all times, under the ‘do no harm’ principle.